



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary Z-138-E-83-5

Date of VPC Meeting	October 13, 2021
Request From	PUD PCD
Request To	PUD PCD
Proposed Use	Major Amendment to the DC Ranch PCD to allow an amendment to the Aldea Centre PUD to allow Recreational Vehicle Sales, Service and Showroom
Location	Approximately 368 feet south and 365 feet west of the southwest corner of 99th Avenue and the Bethany Home Road alignment
VPC Recommendation	Approval per the staff recommendation with an additional stipulation
VPC Vote	6-4

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

Committee members Alvin Battle and Mike Weber joined the meeting at this time, bringing quorum to 10.

Sarah Stockham, staff, reviewed the surrounding zoning, land uses, site history, proposed stipulations and displayed aerial images and the proposed site plan.

David Richert, applicant and representative with Richert & Associates, reviewed the existing zoning and general plan land use map, site history and the proposal to add recreational vehicle sales to the use list in the Aldea Centre PUD. Mr. Richert explained that he tried to add this use through an interpretation with the Zoning Administrator, but the PUD Major Amendment process was the correct process to add this use. Mr. Richert showed a proposed site plan at the southwest corner of 99th Avenue and Montebello Avenue and elevations for La Mesa RV, noting the enhanced landscaping around the site with some four-inch caliper trees and sharing that this will be one of the most beautiful buildings in the area and will add sales tax revenue, and that Tim Wright with John F. Long Properties, the property owner, is supportive of this request. Mr. Richert added that he believes it will be a great addition to the area given its location to the freeways, enhanced architecture and track record of the company, La Mesa RV, who has a location at 75th Avenue and McDowell Road. Mr. Richert added that they sent out notices to residences within 1,200 feet of the site (the minimum is 600 feet), conducted a neighborhood meeting and did not have any members of the public in attendance, which displays that there is no opposition to the proposal.

Questions from the Committee:

Chair Gene Derie asked staff to confirm if the PCD stipulations will still apply, and whether the 1,868 unit maximum has been reached. **Ms. Stockham** replied that the PCD stipulations will apply and that she believes there are only 2 units left out of the 1,868 unit maximum.

Sandra Cole asked if this request, which will bring large vehicles along 101st Avenue, will interrupt the school south of the subject site or access to the nearby school. **Mr. Richert** replied that there is a gate along 101st Avenue and access will be limited as that is an alternative access gate for the Fire Department should they need to access the site. Mr. Richert added that he is open to talking about and exploring, traffic mitigation measures, noting that the school is open from around 7:30 AM to 3:30 PM, and the sales floor will close later at around 6:00 PM to 7:00 PM. Mr. Richert explained that they have mailed the school notices three times and have not received a response, there are no residences north of the site along 101st Avenue so there should not be anyone driving north of the school, and to the south the sidewalks are detached and planted with shade trees.

Chair Gene Derie asked the applicant to confirm that the entry points to the subject site along 101st Avenue are for safety vehicles and will be gated unless those emergency vehicles need to access the site, that access points along Montebello Avenue and 99th Avenue will be the main entries, and that if someone was going to buy an RV or come in for maintenance, they would access the site from 99th Avenue or Montebello Avenue. **Mr. Richert** replied affirmatively.

Vice Chair Viri Hernandez shared that she does not agree that a lack of response or participation from the public means that neighbors are ok with the request, people are still prioritizing their needs in the pandemic. Vice Chair Hernandez then asked how many jobs would be generated with this use and what type (commission-based sales jobs or other types of jobs), and if there was an overall number of new employees expected with this new use. **Mr. Richert** replied that there will be many types of new jobs in areas such as sales, finance, and maintenance, and that the mechanics and technicians are highly trained. **Mike Kellis**, with La Mesa RV, added that they anticipate this location will be a flagship location and their new headquarters, so they expect a significant number of new jobs including the C-Suite executives and support staff, and they try to make all jobs available and accessible to young people and they do try to promote internally. Vice Chair Hernandez asked if La Mesa RV has a commitment to providing a living wage, which is around \$20 an hour, for the lower positions and if there is a commitment to filling those jobs with residents within the Maryvale Village. Mr. Kellis replied that La Mesa RV is not a publicly traded company, they are looking at what they can do in terms of supporting those in lower positions whether through increased benefits or wages, and they have to compete with other businesses that are largely indoor jobs with benefits and higher wages, they want to provide the best opportunities for their workers and that it is easiest to recruit people who live locally. Vice Chair Hernandez shared that there is a 96 percent occupancy rate in Arizona, the number of unsheltered people is rising, and having a job is one thing but making enough to live on and thrive is another, and that this proposal is adding a use on a site that could have been a mix of uses that are already approved by the PUD, and she doubts the benefit to the Maryvale community as no one in her family has ever bought a RV. Mr. Richert shared that he did not mean any offense when he mentioned that they did their

outreach and did not receive any feedback from the community which correlated to the public not having any concerns.

Chris Demarest asked the applicant to confirm that La Mesa RV's headquarters will be moving from San Diego to the subject site and asked how many spaces will be available for outdoor display vehicles. **Mr. Kellis** replied that yes, the headquarters will be moving, and the sales will mainly be indoors but there will be some RVs that will be parked outside, but the vast majority will be inside the indoor showroom.

Sandra Oviedo shared that she agreed with Vice Chair Hernandez's comments and asked what the recruitment practices are to reach those in the community. **Mr. Kellis** replied that the use internet job postings like Indeed and job boards, for master technicians they use a specialized recruiter to get interest and that word of mouth is also successful. Ms. Oviedo asked if they would make a commitment to hiring a majority of their staff from Maryvale. Mr. Kellis responded that they prefer to have employees who live close by and they will focus their recruiting to attract locals. Ms. Oviedo shared a concern with employment in Maryvale and jobs being filled by those outside the village. Mr. Kellis replied that they will be as responsive as they can to community members. Ms. Oviedo asked about the company's commitment to safety and traffic, as this site is near a freeway and a school. **Mr. Richert** replied that traffic will be routed on 99th Ave to the freeway interchanges, if the committee wants the applicant to work with the city on a plan regarding traffic mitigation measures like speed humps they are open to working on that, that plan goes out to the community and then there has to be a commitment to fund them and the city has a process for how that is handled, and a traffic study is stipulated which will provide additional review of 101st Avenue however he believes that the amount of traffic generated from this use is minimal so it is doubtful they would be required to install traffic calming measures, but if the committee wants them to investigate traffic calming measures on 101st Avenue they can do so, and they will be taken into account for the traffic study. Ms. Oviedo commented that city streets are not safe, and she wants the site to be walkable and safe. Mr. Richert responded that there is existing landscape and attached and detached sidewalks along the subject site, and they are required to provide enhanced landscaping above Ordinance standards so it will be walkable. Ms. Oviedo clarified that she was referencing the Bethany Home Road alignment and 99th Avenue and asked where the SRP exchange is. **Chair Derie** commented that there is no road for west of 99th Avenue and Bethany Home Road east of 99th Avenue is Glendale, the SRP exchange is at the southwest corner of 99th Avenue and the Bethany Home Road alignment, Montebello Avenue is aligned at the traffic signal that heads into the America Furniture Store Warehouse and that 99th Avenue on the City side has detached sidewalks and trees. Ms. Oviedo asked what is happening on the west side of 99th Avenue. Chair Derie replied that it is a vacant lot north of the subject site and north of the Bethany Home Road alignment. Ms. Oviedo asked for clarification regarding the request, and if the committee was making a decision for the entire PUD area or if it is just for the RV sales use addition. Ms. Stockham, staff, confirmed that the request to amend the PUD to allow RV sales throughout the PUD area subject to performance standards, and that this applicant is proposing to place that use at the southwest corner of 99th Avenue and Montebello Avenue. Ms. Stockham explained that she showed the site plan for the proposed location to give the committee context, but the request in front of the committee is whether they would approve adding RV sales as an allowable use in the PUD area and the associated performance standards for that use. Chair Derie added that the request is to amend the Aldea Centre PUD to allow RV sales as an allowable use with

performance standards for a maximum of 40 acres of the PUD area, and this site is 40 acres within the 125 acres of the PUD area. Ms. Oviedo asked if the committee is going to have a meeting for the other acres of the PUD. Chair Derie responded that no, this request is just to add another allowable use to the use list and asked staff to confirm. Ms. Stockham confirmed that this request is to allow one more permitted use to the use list for RV sales and that the use is subject to performance standards like setbacks, screening, and an acreage maximum and that all other standards for the other uses as written prior to this major amendment remain unchanged.

Mike Weber shared that he is happy to see a retail giant coming in, it provides a lot of job opportunities and that he is pleased that the proposal is not for more housing, and that has an issue with seeing palm trees on the tree list on page 56 of the narrative.

Chair Gene Derie shared that he was happy to see a commercial use and not multifamily residential, and that this will bring more employment opportunities and will be a sizeable addition to the area which already has the American Furniture Store Warehouse, Top Golf and a new water park (all in the City of Glendale).

Vice Chair Viri Hernandez shared that Maryvale has million dollar blocks regarding people who have been incarcerated, shared a concern with the commitment to hiring locally as locals might be denied jobs, and that RV sales are not being marketed to people to live in the Village and that the new headquarters will bring more people and we are already in a housing crisis, and that adding more cars increases the potential for pedestrian accidents and deaths.

Ken DuBose shared that when there are no football games, there are RV sales and events at Cardinals Stadium every month and that has been going on a long time. **Mr. Kellis** replied that this location is perfect due to the proximity to the freeway and to the dealership shows at Cardinals Stadium.

Sandra Oviedo agreed with the comments made by Vice Chair Hernandez and shared that is unclear how La Mesa's employment will benefit Maryvale and that she doesn't think many residents will be buying RVs. **Mr. Kellis** replied that they will have many job openings for service and the showroom, they hope to make a place for local employees, it makes sense to hire people who live nearby and they anticipate some of them will live in Maryvale, and some people have the desire to have a job that turns wrenches and if they do, they hope that they will come from Maryvale. Ms. Oviedo shared that she is still skeptical due to not hearing any concrete employment numbers.

Sandra Cole commented that this is an opportunity to have higher wages and it is positive to have people getting employed and getting proper businesses in the area, and this could bring in more business with higher paying jobs. Ms. Cole added that she believes in fair wages and affordable housing, and this project could jumpstart a change in the area.

Sandra Oviedo commented that without clear numbers for employment, she remains skeptical.

Public Comment:

None.

Motion:

Mike Weber motioned to approve Z-138-E-83 per the staff recommendation with an additional stipulation to remove “date palm” and “Mediterranean fan palm” from the plant material list on Page 56 of the narrative. **Zeke Valenzuela** seconded the motion.

Sandra Oviedo made a substitute motion to approve Z-138-E-83 per the staff recommendation with an additional stipulation to remove “date palm” and “Mediterranean fan palm” from the plant material list on Page 56 of the narrative and to modify stipulation number 4 to add direction that the traffic study shall address parking protected bike lanes and traffic calming devices such as roundabouts. **Vice Chair Viri Hernandez** seconded the motion.

Vote on substitute motion:

2-6-2, motion to recommend approval of Z-138-E-83 with an additional stipulation and a modified stipulation fails with committee members Oviedo and Hernandez in favor, committee members Battle, Cole, Demarest, DuBose, Valenzuela and Derie opposed and committee members Garcia and Weber abstaining.

Discussion on original motion:

Vice Chair Hernandez shared that she will be voting no, and it is ridiculous that the committee is not adding direction about pedestrian safety as mentioned in the substitute motion.

Denise Garcia shared that she challenges the ethics and transparency of the committee.

Chris Demarest commented that he is in favor of the project but not of the restriction to remove the palm trees from the approved tree list.

Vote on original motion:

6-4, motion to recommend approval of Z-138-E-83 with an additional stipulation passes with committee members Battle, Cole, DuBose, Valenzuela, Weber and Derie in favor and committee members Demarest, Garcia, Oviedo, and Hernandez opposed.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:

None, the modified stipulations are as follows:

1. An updated Development Narrative for the Aldea Centre PUD reflecting the changes approved through this request shall be submitted to the Planning and Development Department within 30 days of City Council approval of this request. The updated Development Narrative shall be consistent with the Development Narrative date stamped September 2, 2021, as modified by the following stipulations:
 - a. Front cover: Revise the date information on the cover page to the following:

Major Amendment Z-183-E-83
Submitted: March 18, 2021
2nd Submittal: June 30, 2021

- b. Page 35, Performance Standards for Recreational Vehicle and Towable Trailer Sales, Standard No. 3: Update the minimum caliper size to 50% 2-inch caliper and 50% 3-inch caliper for the landscape setback.
 - c. Page 36, Performance Standards for Recreational Vehicle and Towable Trailer Sales, add the following language as Standard No. 8: Where pedestrian pathways cross drive aisles, they shall be constructed of decorative pavers, stamped or colored concrete, or other pavement treatments that visually contrast with the adjacent parking and drive aisle surfaces, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
 - d. PAGE 56, APPROVED PLANT MATERIAL LIST: REMOVE "DATE PALM" AND "MEDITERRANEAN FAN PALM" FROM THE TREE AND ACCENTS CATEGORIES
2. The developer shall dedicate right-of-way and construct a bus stop pad along southbound 99th Avenue south of Montebello Avenue. The bus stop pad shall be constructed according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1260 with a minimum depth of 10 feet. The bus stop pad shall be spaced from the intersection according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1258. Trees shall be placed to provide 50 percent shade coverage to the bus stop pad at full maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
 3. The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping and other incidentals, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
 4. A traffic impact study shall be reviewed and approved by the Street Transportation Department prior to preliminary site plan approval. The applicant shall be responsible for any dedications and required improvements as recommended by the approved study, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
 5. A Master Street Plan showing all public arterial and collector streets shall be submitted to the Street Transportation and Planning and Development Departments for review and approval.
 6. The developer shall record a Notice to Prospective Purchasers of Proximity to Airport in order to disclose the existence and operational characteristics of Glendale Municipal Airport (GEU) to future owners or tenants of the property.
 7. The developer shall provide a No Hazard Determination for the proposed development from the FAA pursuant to the FAA's Form-7460 obstruction analysis review process, prior to construction permit approval, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department.

8. In the event archaeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33- foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archaeologist, and allow time for the Archaeology Office to properly assess the materials.

PCD Stipulations

9. The total number of residential units within the DC Ranch (East) PCD shall not exceed 1,868 units.
10. The DC Ranch PCD master plans for the PCD shall be updated to reflect approval of this amendment if applicable, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.