

Attachment A

Phoenix City Council Public Safety and Justice (PSJ) Subcommittee Summary Minutes Wednesday, March 6, 2024

City Council Chambers
200 W. Jefferson St.
Phoenix, Ariz.

Subcommittee Members Present
Councilwoman Ann O'Brien, Chair
Councilman Kevin Robinson
Councilman Jim Waring
Councilwoman Guardado

Subcommittee Members Absent

CALL TO ORDER

Chairwoman O'Brien called the Public Safety and Justice (PSJ) Subcommittee to order at 10:04 a.m. with Councilwoman Guardado, Councilman Kevin Robinson and Councilman Jim Waring present.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

MINUTES OF MEETINGS

1. Minutes of the Public Safety and Justice Subcommittee Meeting

Councilman Waring made a motion to approve the minutes of the Feb. 7, 2024, Public Safety and Justice Subcommittee meeting. Councilman Robinson seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 2)

2. Parks Safety Update

Chairwoman O'Brien introduced Parks and Recreation Director Cynthia Aguilar, Parks and Recreation Assistant Director Martin Whitfield, Parks and Recreation Deputy Director Jarod Rogers, and Police Executive Assistant Chief Sean Connolly to present on this item.

Ms. Aguilar provided background on the requests from the Dec. 4 PSJ Subcommittee meeting including information on trespass authority, park rangers, and security services. She confirmed Phoenix Police are permitted to trespass individuals without the presence of a Parks and Recreation employee.

Councilman Waring asked how this issue was a source of confusion.

Ms. Aguilar stated there was confusion regarding what the practice had been. She stated Phoenix Police has already been trespassing people in parks, but there were circumstances where Phoenix Police would reach out to park rangers to obtain more information.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated there was a City code section related to the granting of authority to Parks and Recreation staff, but there was a letter sent by the Parks and Recreation Director to clear up any authority confusion. He provided statistics on calls for service and arrests within parks and made it clear Phoenix Police has authority to trespass individuals within a park.

Councilman Waring asked what afterhours calls look like.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated calls are often from the community, and very few of the calls are from park rangers.

Councilman Waring asked for further clarification about who typically calls afterhours.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated the calls are often from residents from the surrounding communities that border parks. He stated the number of calls is encouraging because the community is vigilant.

Councilman Waring asked if the behavior of subjects during afterhours calls is worse because more of these calls resulted in an arrest.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated there is a higher volume of calls afterhours, but his assessment is fair.

Councilman Waring stated there must be afterhours calls where Phoenix Police show up and find nothing.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated that is correct.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked what a CLD is.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated a Citation in Lieu of Detention (CLD) is used for misdemeanor crimes. He provided data for trespass calls for service and arrests.

Councilman Waring asked why the 237 after hour bookings only resulted in 177 people being trespassed.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated that people should not be trespassed in all instances and it depends on the specific situation, but trespasses are often a component of arrests in parks. He stated there is the ability for Parks and Recreation staff to communicate with Police, and this will result in streamlining the trespassing process.

Councilman Waring asked for clarification on whether everyone is trespassed from a park even if they are arrested for another crime.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated it is important to understand the criteria for being trespassed at a park. He mentioned this process requires the responsible party to issue a warning.

Councilman Waring asked of the 237 people who were arrested, if the 177 individuals who were trespassed had been previously issued a warning.

Assistant Chief Connolly answered yes.

Councilman Waring asked if this meant the City would not trespass someone who was shooting in the park.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated Phoenix Police would not necessarily include a trespass for someone who was charged with a crime like shooting in the park but focus on the severe criminal charges related to such an incident. He mentioned if they were later spotted in the park after getting out of prison, then officers would trespass them.

Mr. Rogers explained park rangers work under the Department's code of conduct and enforce this code when appropriate. He provided information on current staffing levels and explained the plan for filling current vacancies. He explained shift coverage and provided data on the average number of unique park visits rangers make every month and every day. He noted third shift park rangers have been able to make over 2,500 contacts with residents. He introduced the Answering Service Pilot Program residents can use to report activity in parks.

Mr. Whitfield discussed the responsibilities of security services in parks and their shift details. He shared that over the past year, security personnel made over 16,250 contacts with residents. He stated there has been a positive impact in decreasing negative behavior in parks.

Councilman Waring asked if the presence of security has impacted issues of trash and vandalism in parks.

Ms. Aguilar stated it is difficult to monetarily track the value of these services in this context, but staff has noted the parks are cleaner when they arrive in the mornings.

Councilman Waring stated he supports this program, and he is glad the City instituted this program.

Mr. Whitfield discussed the differences between the security service providers and key contract differences. He noted Windom Security Strategies offers body-worn cameras for no additional costs and a higher number of minimum training hours.

Ms. Aguilar outlined the next steps for continuing these security strategies including transitioning security services to Windom Security Strategies, reviewing current trespass thresholds, and Master Plan efforts.

Councilman Waring asked about the reason for why bodies have been found in the park and if they had anything to do with suicides.

Ms. Aguilar stated there are no deaths listed as suicides, but there are some listed as unknown causes of death.

Councilman Waring noted he did not believe any of these bodies found were connected to people out hiking in the preserves, and he listed the other causes of death. He stated there have been instances where park rangers have been able to save people they have come across in the parks. He asked for data regarding when a park ranger has called Emergency Medical Services (EMS) and saved a life.

Ms. Aguilar stated she did not have those statistics but would provide that information.

Councilman Waring asked how many residents found dead bodies in the park.

Ms. Aguilar stated 10 of the instances where a dead body was found, a resident discovered them.

Councilman Waring expressed concern for residents who have discovered dead bodies and how that might impact residents long-term. He stated he believes as the presence of security and park rangers increase, these occurrences will decrease.

Councilman Robinson asked if Phoenix Police were called for criminal activity in a park, if the subject would be charged with the crime committed and not necessarily be trespassed.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated that was correct.

Councilman Robinson stated it is important to note subjects are usually charged with the most severe crime committed. He also stated unfortunately dead bodies have always been found in parks, and he was glad the City has additional park rangers.

Councilwoman Guardado thanked staff for their hard work and noted their swift implementation of the third shift for park rangers. She asked for data to be provided on the reason behind these arrests in the parks.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated he could provide that data.

Councilwoman Guardado asked for a breakdown of the 14 bodies found in parks and for a comparison with the number of calls park rangers have made and the number of calls security personnel have made.

Councilman Waring asked what situation would cause an officer to spontaneously self-dispatch to a park.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated this is due to planning by Phoenix police to reduce crime, and officers being assigned to the statistically most violent areas.

Councilman Waring asked if instances are only logged as calls if an officer comes across something concerning while patrolling a park.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated that is correct.

Councilman Waring emphasized the importance of these programs and stated there should be more resources to continue these programs.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked why Wednesday is the overlap day for park ranger shifts.

Mr. Rogers stated park rangers work four 10-hour shifts and one weekend day per week.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked why people must be given a warning before they can be trespassed.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated this is due to the obligation to the trespassing law, as they must have the opportunity to leave.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked if two individuals were fighting in the park, and they have not been previously given a warning if they cannot be trespassed from the park.

Assistant Chief Connolly stated Phoenix Police would only issue a warning in that instance, but the subjects would be charged with the appropriate crime committed.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked if Phoenix Police can trespass people from the park if it is appropriate, even if the individual is not charged with trespassing.

Ms. Aguilar stated this would be a concern staff would need to address with the Law Department, but this is something they could pursue.

Chairwoman O'Brien stated if someone has been shooting or fighting in a park, she would hope they could be trespassed based on that behavior. She asked when the Answering Service Pilot Program will be starting.

Mr. Rogers stated the program will start during the summertime.

Chairwoman O'Brien stated her excitement for the pilot program. She asked if the security data over the past year was made up of unique contacts.

Ms. Aguilar stated the contacts are not unique, and there could be duplicates.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked for future data to differentiate overall contacts and unique contacts. She thanked staff for looking into the differences in what the security providers can offer the City. She asked what the vacancy rate is for the security company,

Ms. Aguilar stated the security company is required to provide enough personnel for each shift, so there is no true vacancy rate.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked if there have been any attendance issues.

Ms. Aguilar stated there have not been.

Chairwoman O'Brien asked that any data provided to Councilmembers in response to their requests be sent to all Committee members.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 3)

3. 2024 NCAA Final Four Events

Chairwoman O'Brien introduced Deputy City Manager John Chan, Emergency Management Director Commander Brian Lee, and Deputy Fire Chief Justin Alexander to present on item.

Mr. Chan provided a preview of the Final Four events being held in the City including Fan Fest, the music festival, and the Final Four Dribble. He discussed each event in detail and shared a video that highlighted the work of Downtown Phoenix Ambassadors and the Clean and Green Team.

Commander Lee stated the City of Phoenix Public Safety Planning Team have developed a staffing model to support the upcoming Final Four events. He stated the team is focused on safety, security, and support while planning these events.

Deputy Chief Alexander described safety procedures for Phoenix Fire in relation to all Final Four events hosted in the City.

Commander Lee described the efforts Police have implemented to ensure enough staff will be available for routine duties and Final Four events. He explained Emergency Management staff's efforts in mass care preparedness and emergency alert messaging. He stated the Incident Management Team will conduct all public safety operations from the Tactical Operations Center.

Chairwoman O'Brien thanked the presenters and staff for their efforts.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEMS 4-5)

4. Police Hiring, Recruitment, and Attrition Update

Chairwoman O'Brien introduced Police Commander Sara Garza and Darren Higgs with ON Advertising to present on this item.

Commander Garza provided data on staffing levels, application averages per month, and process improvements. She discussed the strategy updates the department has implemented including eliminating the written test, changing timing for applications, and implementing more in-person contacts. She described the Success with Effort and Training (SWET) program and its positive outcomes. She provided an update on the 30 by 30 initiative workgroup projects on recruiting female police officers.

Councilman Waring stated a recent article included a quote stating Phoenix Police needed more diversity, and expressed it is important to advertise the efforts being made to diversify.

Commander Garza stated their recruitment team has made a serious effort to attend multi-cultural events as often as possible. She also stated Phoenix Police take all qualified candidates.

Councilman Waring stated he was not criticizing the article, but the specific quote insinuating there have been no efforts to diversify Phoenix Police.

Commander Garza described the multi-cultural events Phoenix Police have recruited at recently.

Councilwoman Guardado invited Phoenix Police to the District 5 resource fair hosted at the Maryvale Community Center.

Commander Garza stated the recruitment team will ensure someone is there. She described recruiting unit strategies and provided updates on new marketing strategies.

She noted new marketing partnerships with the Arizona Diamondbacks, Pat's Run, and University of Arizona Athletics.

Mr. Higgs described marketing campaign objectives, provided highlights of the new website launched last month, detailed new social media campaigns, and explained targeted online advertisements. He noted they are currently conducting a community survey about reactions to the website and provided some preliminary results.

Commander Garza provided next steps for these strategies.

Councilman Robinson asked how successful other communities ON advertising has worked with have been in increasing their diversity.

Mr. Higgs noted ON Advertising tries to showcase individual stories so people can connect with them. They often interview a sworn person and utilize it on social media.

Councilman Robinson asked if there was an increase in African American or Hispanic individuals within the Police Departments they worked with.

Mr. Higgs stated yes, most recently in the city of Nashville.

Councilman Robinson stated concern regarding the lack of African American officers when compared to the last few decades.

Chairwoman O'Brien thanked staff for the presentation.

5. Opioid Response Planning: Environmental Scan Results

This item was continued to the April 3 PSJ Subcommittee meeting.

6. Fire Staffing and Response Time Update

Chairwoman O'Brien opened the floor to public comment.

Ben Lindquist, Vice President of the Firefighters Union, stated concern regarding achieving required response times with current resources. He stated support for raising sales tax for additional funding.

7. CAP Hiring, Recruitment and Metric Report

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

None.

FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

None.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairwoman O'Brien adjourned the meeting at 12:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Chloe Baldwin
Management Fellow