

ATTACHMENT A



City of Phoenix

Minutes

Meeting Location:
City Council Chambers
200 W. Jefferson St.
Phoenix, Arizona 85003

City Council Policy Session

Tuesday, September 24, 2024

2:30 PM

phoenix.gov

CALL TO ORDER

The Phoenix City Council convened in Policy Session on Tuesday, September 24, 2024, at 2:33 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

Present: 9 - Councilman Carlos Galindo-Elvira, Councilwoman Betty Guardado, Councilwoman Kesha Hodge Washington, Councilwoman Ann O'Brien, Councilwoman Laura Pastor, Councilman Kevin Robinson, Councilman Jim Waring, Vice Mayor Debra Stark and Mayor Kate Gallego

COUNCIL INFORMATION AND FOLLOW-UP REQUESTS

Councilwoman Hodge Washington highlighted the Advancing Home Ownership Fair hosted by Wells Fargo, aimed at assisting first-time homebuyers in understanding the homebuying process. She then expressed gratitude to Director Spencer Self and the Neighborhood Services Department for hosting the 2024 Synergy Awards, which recognized neighborhood leaders. She mentioned the ribbon-cutting ceremony for the Archwood at East Lake, held at the restored Pickle House. She discussed her ongoing Energize 8 Community Meetings, designed to address local issues with City leaders. The last meeting in the series was scheduled for September 25.

Councilwoman Pastor honored Officer Zane Coolidge, who was fatally injured in the line of duty on September 6. Councilwoman Pastor invited the community to her next Coffee Chat on October 2 at Create Tea Room, where topics like bulk trash, historic preservation grants, and crime updates will be discussed. She thanked the Neighborhood Services Department for hosting the 2nd Synergy Conference and shared her participation in the Dance for One in Ten Competition, representing Phoenix Fast Track cities, where her team raised over \$144,000 to support LGBTQ+ youth. She announced the opening of Be

Well Health at Walgreens on Central and Osborn, which offers comprehensive health services, including STD testing and treatment. Councilwoman Pastor highlighted her team's participation in National Voter Registration Day at Carl Hayden High School and encouraged voter registration before October 7. She expressed pride in the contributions of Latinos and encouraged supporting local Latino-owned businesses in celebration of Hispanic Heritage Month. She announced, that the 2nd International District Night Market would be held on October 26.

Councilwoman Guardado provided comments on the Royal Inn seizure. Councilwoman Guardado thanked the Phoenix Police Heat Unit, Commander Steve Martos, the Neighborhood Services Department, the Berkeley Square Neighborhood Association, Rancho Solano Block Watch, and the VIP Coalition for their efforts in ensuring safer living conditions for the community. Councilwoman Guardado also highlighted the 3rd Annual El Grito Celebration, held on September 15 to kickoff Hispanic Heritage Month. Councilwoman Guardado discussed the 9/11 Memorial Day of Service environmental project co-hosted by her office and SUA International on September 7.

Vice Mayor Stark thanked City employees for stepping up and forming the new employee group Disabled Employees, Allies, and Leaders (DEAL).

Councilwoman O'Brien acknowledged the passing of Police Officer Zane Coolidge and encouraged the community to keep Officer Matthew Haney in their prayers as he was also shot in the incident and is recovering. Councilwoman O'Brien invited the community to the 3rd Annual Double Ten Celebration at the Arizona State University West Campus on October 5.

Councilman Robinson paid tribute to Richard de Uriarte, a longtime community figure who recently passed away.

CONSENT ACTION

This item is scheduled to allow the City Council to act on the Mayor's recommendations on the Consent Agenda. There is no Consent Agenda for this meeting.

CALL FOR AN EXECUTIVE SESSION

A vote may be held to call an Executive Session for a future date.

REPORTS AND BUDGET UPDATES BY THE CITY MANAGER

This item is scheduled to allow the City Manager to provide brief informational reports on topics of interest to the City Council. The City Council may discuss these reports but no action will be taken.

INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEM 1)**1 Homelessness, Accountability and Transparency, and Public Safety Update**

This report provides an overview of the City's efforts to address homelessness, an update on the Office of Accountability and Transparency (OAT) and information on the City's continued efforts to improve public safety and address concerns raised by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ).

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION.

Mayor Kate Gallego introduced today's meeting and stated it included topics related to the City's efforts to improve and reevaluate public safety.

Assistant City Manager Lori Bays provided background on the Office of Homeless Solutions, the Office of Accountability and Transparency, as well as City efforts to improve public safety overall and addressing concerns from the Department of Justice. She noted the presentations included progress on City initiatives addressing homelessness, accountability and transparency, and public safety. She added the concerns highlighted in the Department of Justice report are being addressed through improving data collection and reporting to the community.

Office of Homeless Solutions (OHS) Director Rachel Milne provided an overview of accomplishments and initiatives since its formation in July 2022. She stated the Point In Time (PIT) count conducted on January 23 showed a small decrease of two percent in the total number of unhoused people counted on that day, the number of unsheltered individuals went down by 17 percent for the region, and the sheltered count included a 13 percent increase for the region. Ms. Milne compared the region growth rate indicators to the City showing the total PIT count at a four

percent decrease, the unsheltered count at a 13 percent decrease, and a seven percent increase for the sheltered count. She described the major initiatives for OHS within the last two years including increasing shelter capacity throughout the City, creating a Safe Outdoor Space, addressing the area outside of the Key Campus, creating the Community Court, working with sister departments to enhance heat response throughout the City, formalizing property storage procedures, and housing.

Office of Accountability and Transparency (OAT) Director Shannon Johanni provided an overview of how the Office of Accountability and Transparency has improved policing and about the progress within the Office since February 2024. Ms. Johanni discussed the three focus areas of the Office including reviewing department administrative investigations, mediating community complaints, and increasing community engagement. She summarized the 17 recommendations across the 13 reports to date. She noted OAT has conducted three department mediations since February and discussed community engagement efforts.

Police Chief Michael Sullivan stated the Department of Justice (DOJ) report has been a valuable opportunity to make improvements in the Department and stresses the importance of being a self-assessing, self-correcting agency.

Executive Assistant Police Chief Officer Dennis Orender discussed the major improvement initiatives which began prior to the DOJ investigation. Assistant Chief Orender discussed the utilization of the City's Community Assistance Program (CAP) in conjunction with the Police to answer behavior health related calls.

Police Chief Sullivan discussed the revisions made to the Use of Force policy and the implementation of Active Bystanders for Law Enforcement (ABLE) training, which all employees have completed and repeat annually. He discussed the Integrating Communications, Assessment and Tactics (ICAT) training, which helps officers with deescalating situations in which a citizen is holding a weapon that is not a firearm. He noted the creation of the Crisis Intervention Review Committee, which analyzes body camera videos and assess the response to behavioral health calls for service,

staffed by community partners. He added the Department mandated search and seizure training to all employees.

Police Chief Sullivan summarized the 37 remedial measures to improve public safety provided by the DOJ report. He stated the department conducted a comprehensive two-month review of the DOJ report and identified 10 projects aligned with the areas of investigation. Police Chief Sullivan explained the Phoenix Police Department Continuous Improvement Process and discussed the Community Engagement Plan, which will include community meetings, resident written feedback, and department work groups.

Ms. Bays discussed policy recommendations for City Council approval which included procuring an early intervention system, launching cultural competency training and the First Amendment Facilitation and Management policy, developing a biennial training plan for Crisis Intervention Team (CIT) officers, exploring youth prevention programming, exploring additional services that will be provided by civilian staff, and conducting a community engagement process to assist in developing a continuous improvement plan.

Ms. Bays added the recommendations for approval including creating four new analyst positions within the Phoenix Police Department, and converting 14 temporary, full-time positions in the Office of Homeless Solutions to ongoing status. Ms. Bays stated the ongoing staff costs are approximately \$2.5 million annually and will be incorporated into the proposed FY2025-26 Budget.

Mayor Gallego thanked all of the presenters.

Councilman Robinson moved to approve staff's recommendation and Councilwoman Hodge Washington seconded the motion. Councilman Robinson acknowledged staff's work with the Navigation Center and other Office of Homeless Solutions sites that serve the City's most vulnerable populations. He acknowledged staff's work with the Office of Accountability and Transparency and the Police Department.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington thanked the Office of Homeless

Solutions for their quick responses to community concerns around Phoenix. She thanked the Office of Accountability and Transparency for their work, and thanked Police for their plan to address DOJ concerns.

Councilwoman O'Brien introduced a substitute motion to include Items 2-4, and a directive for staff to return on October 22, 2024, with a proposal to implement new technology such as a voice-activated intelligence system for Crime Stop no later than the end of the first quarter of 2025.

Vice Mayor Stark seconded the substitute motion and acknowledged staff's work in the community.

Councilwoman Guardado emphasized the Council's commitment to justice and civil rights, noting ongoing efforts to introduce reforms addressing the concerns raised. She stressed the need for a comprehensive approach to the unhoused community crisis and called for housing solutions, support services, and community engagement.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if the Office of Homeless Solutions shelters, the Navigation Center, and Safe Outdoor Space will be included in the General Budget for the future.

Mr. Barton explained most programming is currently funded through temporary American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) dollars. He explained the City has been reallocating these funds every six months and is now working to identify sustainable funding for the next fiscal year.

Mr. Barton emphasized if additional funding is not secured, the City will need to transition these programs into the General Fund to ensure their continuation once the grant funding is exhausted.

Councilwoman Pastor discussed the major improvement initiatives in place prior to the DOJ's investigation, specifically highlighting the Community and Police Trust Initiative. She emphasized the need for true prevention programs that go beyond after-school activities, highlighting the social struggles young people face, particularly those in poverty, and the need for accessible, affordable healthcare. Councilwoman Pastor

sought clarification on a key strategy mentioned to address DOJ infractions about reducing police interactions with residents and replacing them with services provided by civilian staff.

Mayor Gallego acknowledged the importance of the Office of Accountability and Transparency reports, noting their utility in responding to key issues. She highlighted the response to the DOJ report and referenced a recent memo addressing the concerns outlined in it.

Councilman Galindo-Elvira stressed the seriousness of the DOJ report, stating the City must take responsibility to act and that reform is an ongoing, continuous process. He commended the inclusion of the community in all aspects of implementation, from the Office of Homeless Solutions to the Police Department.

Mayor Gallego opened the floor to public comment.

Shannon McBride discussed crime in her community and praised the City for its collaborative efforts in addressing public safety issues.

Craig Tribken praised the City and staff for their exceptional work in implementing the Phoenix Homeless Task Force's comprehensive plan and expressed pride in their progress and urged the staff and the public to seek legislative funding for these essential services, stating that the City cannot tackle this issue alone.

Anna Hernandez urged the Council to focus on meaningful changes to break the cycle of challenges facing the community.

Martha Winkler emphasized the need for a consent decree and shared her personal experience interacting with the Police Department.

Denise Viner expressed support for Police, and noted the community is at risk when staffing levels are low.

Anne Ender expressed support for the Police Department.

Amy Schwabenlender commended the City for its dignified response to

large encampments. She stressed the need for collaboration with local government to co-create effective strategies and solutions. She praised OHS as a vital bridge connecting services, clients, law enforcement, and other City departments, enabling collaboration and client-centered input.

Elizabeth Venable stated the Fund for Empowerment has played a pivotal role in engaging the unhoused community. She stressed the need for quality improvement within the services offered by the Office of Homeless Solutions.

Jessica Berg highlighted the efficient and compassionate cleanup efforts around the Key Campus. Ms. Berg emphasized the importance of partnerships and collaborations with nonprofits, faith-based organizations, municipalities, businesses, and the philanthropic community.

Melina Fonseca highlighted the ineffectiveness of police interventions in mental health crises.

Shawanna Chamber expressed concern about the disconnect between the Council Members and the communities they serve. She shared concerns about the Police Department.

John Maxwell emphasized the staff's commitment to self-assessment and improvement and spoke against a consent decree.

Betty Jo Hawley expressed concern regarding the recent changes to the bus pass program.

Estela Varela expressed concern about the Police Department and the City's ability to supervise and comply with community needs.

Stephani Gonzales spoke in opposition to Items 2-4. She asked Council to not approve new positions for the Police Department and instead invest in the right to counsel, housing for all, and mental healthcare services.

Frank Urban recounted personal experiences with officers and expressed distrust with the Police Department.

Eric Nielsen discussed an initiative to create a program aimed at attracting skilled detectives to improve homicide solving rates.

Roland Harris shared his experience as a grieving parent and stated there is a funding disparity with Police Department receiving \$785 million and only \$2 million allocated for housing.

Richard Southee expressed support for the Office of Homeless Solutions.

Jose Aguirre expressed concern about transparency and accountability within the Police Department.

Sharmarke Ahmed expressed concern with the Police Department.

Ben Laughlin expressed concern with the Police Department and the need for reform.

Miros Mejia expressed opposition to agenda Items 2-4. She urged the Council to remove police from homeless and mental health services, suggesting funds earmarked for compliance analyst positions could be redirected to support homelessness and mental health services instead.

Percy Christian expressed concern for vulnerable community members who need public health support and are often victims of violence due to the inexperience of the Police Department.

Jill Angelina expressed concerns regarding the training and responsibilities of the Police Department and emphasized the need for budget allocations that support community resources rather than solely increasing police funding.

Isabel Garcia urged the Council to stop investing resources in the Police Department. Ms. Garcia advocated against adding any new positions within the department and proposed that officers should be removed from handling homeless and mental health services, as well as minor traffic enforcement. She requested funding be redirected to support the right to counsel, housing, and high-quality mental healthcare.

Olivia Light expressed concerns with the Police Department.

Cappy Maatsch shared her experience with the Police Department.

Robb Olivieri expressed his support for the Office of Homeless Solutions, and emphasized the importance of having City partners to assist residents and businesses,

Rebecca Denis expressed opposition for Items 2, 3, and 4.

Elsa Gebreyohanes expressed opposition for Items 2, 3, and 4. Christine

Reiss discussed past experiences with the Police Department.

Robert Williams discussed personal struggles for the past 15 years.

Debra Reece stated the importance of accepting the DOJ consent decree.

Mark Klym emphasized the need for impartial oversight and strongly supports the consent decree, voicing concern over rising violence and militarism.

Russell Facente criticized the allocation of \$700 million for Police training and expressed concern with current policies.

Faith Kearns expressed support for the consent decree.

Jeremy Helfgot expressed concern with the Police Department.

Viri Hernandez expressed concern with the Police Department and urged Council to remove officers from homelessness services and mental health crises.

Teresa Hill commended the Office of Homeless Solutions and the Police

Department.

Heather Edwards expressed concern about the renewed drug prevention programs in schools.

Mayor Gallego expressed gratitude for the public comment. She noted the City's prioritized funding for homelessness and housing.

Councilman Waring highlighted the City's ongoing efforts to address community issues. He noted recent progress in reducing homelessness, and expressed gratitude to officers for their dedication amidst resource challenges.

Councilwoman O'Brien thanked staff for their hard work. She commented on the DOJ's findings on police conduct and expressed confidence in the City's ability to implement necessary changes without federal oversight.

Councilwoman Pastor asked staff if Items 1-7 are items that can be implemented in the status quo.

Ms. Bays responded some items could be actionable within the next six months, while others would require more extensive exploration before implementation.

Councilwoman Pastor asked for clarification on the source of the \$500,000 allocation in Item 3.

Mr. Barton responded the \$2.5 million mentioned in Item 3 was not funded by ARPA and intended to be incorporated into the base budget. He stated the \$500,000 allocated for Police positions would come from the general fund.

Councilwoman Pastor asked why the positions cannot be included in OAT.

Ms. Bays explained the proposed positions are designed to serve as an internal verification or audit function for the Police Department.

Mr. Barton added as the framework for continuous improvement is developed, the associated data, metrics, processes, and procedures will be integrated into the City's internal audit plan.

Councilwoman Pastor stated she hoped the DOJ and the City could collaborate on an agreement to include monitoring and accountability timelines.

Councilman Kevin Robinson stated while inappropriate actions can occur within the Police Department, existing accountability mechanisms are effective and improvements are possible. Councilman Robinson highlighted the challenges officers face in making split-second decisions and defended their commitment to public safety.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington asked why certain functions discussed could not be under OAT authority.

Ms. Bays responded while the new positions could theoretically exist in any department, the intended purpose is to serve as an internal function for the Police Department.

City Attorney Julie Kreigh added staff would review the existing ordinance to determine if a code change is necessary. She highlighted potential challenges related to confidentiality and the certification of certain positions.

Mr. Barton added the positions would also not be able to reside in the City Auditor's Office due to the Audit Department then not being able to help the Police Department establish a framework and would lose their independence.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington acknowledged the complexity of the ongoing discussions regarding police-community interactions. She clarified Council's intentions are not to serve as the sole response to the DOJ but to initiate improvements while continuing negotiations. She highlighted the need for community feedback in articulating policies, viewing this engagement as essential for rebuilding trust.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 2)**2 Policy Recommendations to Continue Addressing Homelessness, Increasing Accountability and Transparency, and Improving Public Safety**

This report requests City Council approval of policy recommendations to support the City's continued efforts to address homelessness, increase accountability and transparency, improve public safety, and address concerns raised by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ).

THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.

For discussion on Item 2, refer to discussion on Item 1.

ORDINANCES, RESOLUTIONS, AND FORMAL ACTION (ITEM 3)

Roll Call and City Clerk Reads 24-Hour Paragraph

3 Request to Convert 14 Temporary Full-Time Positions to Regular Full-Time Positions in the Office of Homeless Solutions and Create Four Positions for the Phoenix Police Department (Ordinance S-51282)

This report provides recommendations to address homelessness, increase accountability and transparency, improve public safety, and address concerns raised by the U.S. Department of Justice (DOJ).

THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.

For discussion on Item 3, refer to discussion on Item 1.

DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 4)**4 Consideration of Proposals to Improve Public Safety**

On September 20, 2024, Mayor Kate Gallego, Councilman Kevin Robinson and Councilwoman Kesha Hodge Washington submitted a memo requesting City Council provide additional direction to enhance, not replace, staff recommendations. The memo states the Mayor and Councilmembers are committed "to ensuring that Phoenix has the most professional, highly regarded public safety agencies in the nation."

The recommendations are detailed in the attached memo (**Attachment A**) for consideration on the September 24, 2024, Policy Session Agenda. This item permits the City Council to discuss the proposal submitted by Mayor Gallego, Councilman Robinson and Councilwoman Hodge Washington. The attached proposed direction to staff can be used to continue the City's efforts to address homelessness, increase accountability and transparency, and improve public safety.

THIS ITEM IS FOR DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION.

For discussion on Item 4, refer to discussion on Item 1.

A motion was made by Councilwoman O'Brien, seconded by Vice Mayor Stark to approve Items 2 through 4, adding a directive for staff to return on October 22, 2024, with a proposal to implement new technology such as a voice-activated intelligence system for Crime Stop no later than the end of the first quarter of 2025.

Yes: 9 - Councilman Galindo-Elvira, Councilwoman Guardado, Councilwoman Hodge Washington, Councilwoman O'Brien, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilman Robinson, Councilman Waring, Vice Mayor Stark and Mayor Gallego

No: 0

ADJOURN

There being no further business to come before the Council, Mayor Gallego declared the meeting adjourned at 6:36 p.m.