Attachment H

From:	Fred Jones
То:	Enrique A Bojorquez-Gaxiola; PDD South Mountain VPC
Subject:	Negative reviews of Dominium properties
Date:	Monday, June 8, 2020 1:38:47 PM
Attachments:	negative reviews of dominium.doc

Enrique,

Can you please add the attached to the file in opposition to the dominium project for 19th avenue and Southern.

These are examples of the many negative comments and complaints against Dominium and its properties.

Thank you,

Fred Jones, III 2113 W Hidalgo Ave, Phoenix, AZ 85041

HUE97 Apartment complex PLACE DETAILS Moriaha Hampton

11 months ago

The new management is terrible, both companies - which is part of the problem, there are two companies. The pools have been closed for a year with no sign that the green pools will open in the following year. They raised the rent to luxury rent ranges despite it being in a low income neighborhood with high crime and a day shelter for homeless across the street. The walls are thin, the robberies often, the construction constant, and the gasoline siphoned from your car regularly. I knew the area was dangerous when I moved in but for 500-900 rent, it was tolerable. Then the new place came in with talk of all the ammenties this place may one day have, meanwhile they took away the couple we actually did have, including the laundry matt. They raised the the rent to \$1300-\$2000! Because allegedly one day this will be gated, and have working pools, and a fitness center, but meanwhile we have literally no ammenties, and constant construction to deal with. Instead of a pardon our inconvenience discount they wanted us to pretend this ghetto place is luxurious. All the new paint and palm trees can not fix bad location, bad management, scorpion, roach and termite infestations, and never being able to sleep with the super thin walls, floors, and single pain windows letting the sound of tractors and people running around. Renter be warned, if you want to pay luxury rent prices, go to a luxury property, not a promise of what this might be one day..... as long as everyone keeps giving them all the money to pay for those big ideas. I moved out in May and have kept in touch with my former neighbors, not only has nothing improved, things are worse. They stopped trying to fix the pools under rumor of improper permits. The field they wanted to turn from dirt to grass unearthed a scorpion nest that infested buildings nearby, and the management has been harassing tenants with kids. Best thing I did was move.

Excerpt from SOUTH PARKER PRESERVATION COMMITTEE RESPONSE TO TOWN OF PARKER PROJECT: SP16-108 DOMINIUM DEVELOPMENT PLANS FOR LOT INSIDE STROH RANCH ALONG J. MORGAN BOULEVARD.

The South Parker Preservation Committee is in complete opposition to the planned Dominium development.

Although Dominium prides itself on managing its own properties and claims "Through the years Dominium has never lost sight of its commitment to people," the actual tenants who live in Dominium properties attracted by the lower rents tell a very different story.

Their horror stories, as documented online in their own words on Yelp and ApartmentRatings.com, reveal shoddy buildings with thin walls, broken cabinets and falling-apart closet doors, a lack of heat, defective plumbing, and more. These substandard living conditions are compounded by neglect and even mistreatment by Dominium corporate and management who disdain and ignore tenants complaints and may also engage in financial fraud as revenge.

These shocking first-person accounts from tenants are not few and far between; rather, they form a disturbing pattern of unconscionable mistreatment toward tenants living in these affordable housing developments from the early 2000's all the way to 2015 and 2016.

HIGHLANDS RANCH DOMINIUM TENANTS (Traditions Apartments) http://www.apartmentratings.com/co/littleton/traditions-apartments_303771290080126/ ----I do not recommend this property PREJUDICED MANAGERS,WILL NOT HIRE THE NEEDED CERTIFIED REPAIR PERSONNEL THAT IS REQUIRED TO FIX THE PROBLEMS IN THE UNITS.THIS, WE BELIEVE IS DUE TO THE FACT THAT THEY DO NOT WANT TO PUT UP THE MONEY NEEDED TO HIRE THESE PROFESSIONALS!IN THE MEANTIME THE TENANTS SUFFER WITH EXTREMELY COLD UNITS AND FAULTY ELECTRICAL WIRING THROUGHOUT THE UNIT.THE UTILITY COST IS HIGH.FOR NORMAL REPAIRS TO EVEN GET SEEN TO TAKES MONTHS AND EVEN THEN THE PROBLEM ISN'T FIXED.ONLY ONE HANDY MAN FOR THE ENTIRE COMPLEX. EXTREMELY UNPROFESSIONAL MANAGEMENT!!! WASHER /DRYER IN UNIT HOWEVER YOU PAY EXTRA EACH MONTH SEPARATELY FROM YOUR RENT FOR THIS CONVENIENCE.ALSO BE PREPARED TO PAY FOR WATER,TRASH,AND SEWAGE IN ADDITION TO YOUR RENT.

----I do not recommend this property

Like many others, we signed for the reasonable pricing. However after getting settled in, management personnel was never consistent for more than a month. They could not hold on to ANY maintenance staff of ANY kind. Mildew, mold, dysfunctional plumbing and appliances, spider infestations, general filth upon move-in, and flooding are just to name a few of the constant, unattended-to maintenance problems that are rampant through the units. Extremely poor management response to occurrences. The construction is cheap with walls so thin you can hear snoring from the unit above!! If another unit showers or flushes, the sound WILL wake you and sounds like Krakow during the second world war. Renting from this property would be a shame for anyone.

----I do not recommend this property

I have to say I lived in this complex for some time. Due to the area and the price for the 3/2 units. However the management has changed and their is absolutely the worst maintenance of the property and it's units on the property. They have leaks weekly that will wreck havoc on your everyday lives. It takes them forever to get any maintenance fixed and they have to have mold and mildew behind the walls due to all the improper care. If you ask for the corporate number to voice your concerns as a resident you will have to get a private detective to locate it. Also I have come to find out they receive Sec 8 so they have let the worst traffic move in to keep the units rented. So if you are in a situation where you need a nice dump at a affordable price this is what you will get-along with mental anxiety and emotional grief as to when you come home from work or school as to what has been done to fix your place or what annoyances you will find on the property. The hallways are all dirty unless you clean them yourselves daily and good luck trying to get out of here in the winter as they not maintain the sidewalks or parking either. Sad place to live and you will regret it moving here!!!! I AM OUT AS SOON AS MY LEASE IS UP WHICH YOU HAVE TO GIVE ALMOST A 3 MONTH NOTICE TO VACATE!

----I do not recommend this property

These apartments seem nice for the money, but you will seriously regret it. There seems to be a very poor screening process for residents. I have never lived in a complex that had such disrespectful people as your neighbors. The music and partying in apartments is absolutely ridiculous and you can complain all you wants it does not stop. You can hear everything from the other apartments because of poor construction, (showers, toilets flushing, etc.....) regular everyday noises are acceptable, but bass blasting from the other apartments and all night partying because the other tenants are disrespectful is completely unreasonable, and you will just have to wait it out until their lease is up. You will regret it if you move in. also there are no assigned parking spots and trying to get a garage is impossible.

Resident

----I do not recommend this property

The price for our two bedroom, two bath is originally what made us sign the lease. Unfortunately, extra space doesn't mean much when the place sucks. We heard EVERY toilet flush, every shower, every argument, you name it! The walls are like tissue paper. Our neighbors have/had some of the worst behaved kids I've ever seen and don't give a damn about keeping them in line. Last night we got our final "settlement" letter in the mail. We knew we wouldn't get our full deposit back (who does?) but instead of getting ANYTHING back, we now owe them \$200 for additional cleaning costs AND a late fee for our last month's rent. Last I checked, turning rent in on Friday the 1st doeesn't constitute late when they cash the check Monday the 4th. All in all, I would sinply say that there are way better apartments out there for the money. Don't bother with this place.

----I do not recommend this property

I would certainly NOT recommend anyone live here. The staff is nice enough, but they avoid dealing with any and all problems in person. You just get notes on your door. No basic communication. I wasn't able to take more than a 10 minute shower the whole time I lived there because on four requests they wouldn't fix the fact that my hot water ran out faster and faster. Basically, I felt the niceness of the staff was

nothing more than a way to avoid conflict, not as a genuine way of being.

Secondly, and my biggest problem with this apartment (aside from my neighbor), was the fact that someone with the staff was in my apartment on several occasions for which I did not give permission and when I raised concerns about this, the staff assured me no one had been there. Well, then, Casper came in and opened the door to the heating filters and left. Nothing was ever missing, but it was unsettling nonetheless. And even without these unannounced intrusions... these people are in your apartment ALL THE TIME for "inspections." And the funny thing is, even then they don't bother fixing anything while they're inside.

br>In short, despite the reasonable pricing for an apartment of its size, the problems you will encounter would make \$1 too much to pay.

----I do not recommend this property

We moved in here because of the very cheap price (\$625 for 1 br/1 bath with garage). You really get what you pay for in terms of the actual apartment. The ground floor units are constructed so that if you open your drapes at any time, your whole unit (including the bathroom) is visible to anyone and everyone else - not good if you enjoy living in the light. The bathroom fixtures break constantly and the

toilet hardly ever clears totally with only one flush. The fixtures in the kitchen smell all the time and the fridge cools unevenly (melting at front, frozen solid in rear). The worst part though is that the walls and ceiling are paper thin. The walls in the bathroom especially are so thin that when the person in the unit behind you takes a shower, the pipes are loud enough that it will easily wake up a light/medium sleeper. The walls are so thin that we hear car stereos from inside our unit at night. Radios, Tv s, and voices above a normal level easily carry over from the next unit. You'd better be "smoker friendly" if you move in here, because I think 90 percent of the residents are. There is supposed to be a monetary fine every time you are 'caught' tossing a cigarette on the property, but there are still butts all over and there is constant cigarette smell. We do not smoke, but our neighbors constantly toss their butts onto our porch and grass.we have complained but it still happens.
The good part - the staff is very nice (all 2 of them). They seem to try very hard to get the broken things fixed as soon as possible. They do respond to the emergency pager, but as maintenance does not live on site they usually can't do anything about it until the next business day. The rental staff will help as much as

they can to get you into cheap rent, which is nice if you are strapped for rent money. The staff is great, but be warned that you do get what you pay for with the cheap rent. To be content here you should be an exhibitionist smoker who loves to fix things around the house and is a very heavy sleeper.

----I do not recommend this property

The Traditions Apartments might seem like a good deal: big rooms, vaulted ceilings - However, you can tell that they are VERY cheaply made and maintained. The floors are drafty, the walls are paper-thin, the toilets clog daily, and the disposal ALWAYS smells. The water also tastes like blood and is undrinkable, so be prepared to buy bottled water. Don't believe them when they tell you that the apartments are outfitted with new carpet and new paint on the walls. No way! Ours was disgusting when we moved in!!! The power and water frequently goes out for a couple of hours. Look elsewhere and look intensely when visiting.

DENVER DOMINIUM TENANTS (PARK AVENUE WEST)

https://www.yelp.com/biz/park-avenue-west-residences-denver

----These apartments are run and managed by one of the worst companies in the business. I begin my experience in August 2014 when I moved into the apartments, at first I was content with my apartment until I began to notice how cheap everything was in my place, plastic counters , terrible appliances, and garbage bin cabinets. For 6 of the 8 month stay here at park ave, the "secure" garage door was broken and management didnt feel it was a priority to fix. My bike was stolen and was welcome to human excrement from the thousands of bums who surround the area. The tenants here are at liberty to leave their trash at the end of the hallway and then housekeeping will vacuum around it until the smell is so repulsive you cave in to take it out yourself. When you try to get out of this hellish living situation they will tell you that they are going to refund you some rent and then send you a bill for 2000 dollars with bogus charges they cant even do the math for. The goons who run this place don't care about the residents or quality of life in their complex. Save yourself the trouble and pay an extra 100 dollars for an apartment in a better neighborhood with capable management. Cheers!

---This apartment is located in downtown Denver. Great walking distance to nearby park and just get a fresh breeze of air. This review is a reflection of my experience with this community. Pros: Downtown, garage parking, all utilities are included with rent. So no utility bill which is huge. You are allowed to have satelitte dish. Elevator and mailboxes are inside of security building. Need an access code to get inside building. Cons: The staff is HORRIBLE. It took me 3 1/2 weeks to get approved. I had to make constant trips to the office to check status on my application. They would not answer the phone nor return phone calls or emails. The people in that office would be texting on their phones or on their personal phone on company time when I called the office as I walked in. They lose documents and VERY unorganized. Parking is scarce. They said they enforced parking but that was a lie. One time the garage door did not open so everyone who had vehicles parked could not get their vehicles out that day. The place looks nice on the outside but very outdated on the inside. The walls are very thin so people who smoke, party, argue or cook. You can hear, smell and feel everything. There is NO storage and nothing is spacious. The model apartment they show is not what you get. They will not show you your place until after you sign the lease. The staff made up charges as you go along which is horrible. I had to call the Vice President of the company and he basically looked into a lot of things with my records and fired the staff. I don't know much about the new staff. This place is HORRIBLE and overly priced. The homeless people find their way into the building to sleep which is scary. This apartment approves low-income for tax credit purposes but still is overly priced. I will not recommend this apartment.

3/8/2015

---I thankfully moved from this place about six months ago, but thought it would be helpful to post the review I started in December of 2013.

My heat has been out for a month. It's December in Denver. I have repeatedly notified the office the heat is not working, and now they have started making appointments for which they do not show.

They made three appointments to clean our carpets after we renewed our lease, and never showed for one. They made no follow-up calls and I eventually got tired of dealing with these incompetent fools.

The disposal has been out for over a month. Nothing has been done.

I have made over ten requests for the corporate office to call me and even called the corporate office in Minnesota to complain, but they have never returned my calls.

--Zero help, outstandingly rude, and clueless make for a solid combination. Not to mention their incompetent maintenance folks, who removed our fire alarms because they were beeping every night and then never came back to replace them even after work orders were placed and phone calls were made. Also, since these block head maintenance guys live on site we had to hide his creep ass girlfriend in our apartment after she found us in the parking garage where she was

hiding because she was afraid his cracked out ass was going to kill her. yet, he was employed by this place?!

All the above is nothing compared to what this Dominium Properties owned apartment building is now scamming us with after we moved out. We paid rent on time, in full, every single month. We moved out on our scheduled date that was stated on our lease. We had a group of five people help us clean the entire apartment from the balcony, to the crapper, to under the stove vent. We even vacuumed and washed the carpets. We left a mattress in the unit and expected that to be taken from our deposit as it would be a large item removal cost for them. We provided our forwarding address even though we expected to get nothing back of our measly \$185 deposit. Three months later I received a phone call from Dominium stating I had a \$307 late charge that was being sent to collections. They then sent a letter that stated they had to replace all the carpets and kitchen floor due to severe grease stains, which is hilarious because in the year that I lived there, NOTHING was spilled!!!! Now that we've had to fall victim to this scam the ladies at the front office will not help us out whatsoever! The collection agency states we never paid a deposit and the women at the front office will do nothing to assist in showing the \$185 deposit was paid, which I have bank statements showing it was paid.

NEVER will I recommend living anywhere near this place for all of the above reasons and not to mention all the hobos that hang around and take dumps outside the parking garage! CLASSY!! I Hope that place collapses.

http://www.citypages.com/news/dominium-shows-how-to-strike-it-rich-via-affordable-housingwelfare/388553202

For a decade, the Pillsbury A-Mill, a National Historic Landmark situated on prime real estate along St. Anthony Falls, sat dormant.

But developer Dominium saw possibilities. It bought the distressed property from BNC Bank in 2013 for a song.

That same year Dominium scored approval for a \$100 million renovation plan to transform the old workhorse into a 251-unit paradise of affordable housing lofts for artists, complete with a yoga studio, rooftop deck, and other amenities.

The Plymouth developer trumpets itself "for creative solutions to unique and challenging development projects." It would do just that when it came to getting funds to pay for the massive rehab baby.

Because the project involved a historic property that was being reconfigured under the affordable housing umbrella, Dominium amassed a treasure chest of public monies. Grants from the Minnesota Department of Employment and Economic Development, Hennepin County, and the Metropolitan Council. Federal and state tax credits. Low-interest construction financing from the city of Minneapolis.

The A-Mill Lofts cost \$665,000 per unit to build, or about \$400,000 more than the average affordable housing unit, according to a report from the University of Minnesota's Institute on Metropolitan Opportunity.

The originally pitched \$100 million project price tag was more like \$170 million. Yet it cost the developer next to nothing.

In addition to what Dominium paid for the property, the company's investment totals just \$500,000, according to previous testimony from Dominium's Owen Metz to the Minneapolis City Council.

County tax records today show the three-plus-acre A-Mill is assessed at almost \$42 million.

Rents start at \$900 for a one-person household. About 85 percent of all residents are white with an average yearly income of just below \$30,000. Contrast these numbers with other low-income housing in the Twin Cities, which is made up of 80 percent minorities with an income mean of \$17,000.

A-Mill tenants don't have to earn a living as artists, but residents have to be able "to demonstrate a commitment to the arts," according to the company.

"The poverty housing industry in the Twin Cities is a \$300-million-a-year industry that's highly profitable to big development firms like Dominium," says University of Minnesota professor Myron Orfield. "These people are experts at assembling all sorts of different kinds of subsidies. On this project I think they realized what a payday it was going to be."

Founded in 1972, Dominium operates in 23 states, making it the nation's second largest owner of affordable housing. It properties are valued at more than \$2 billion.

Private firms like Dominium, Orfield argues, have "captured" what's become known as "Politically Opportune Subsidized Housing," or POSH developments. "One of the reasons a project like this costs so much and nobody says anything about it is because there's so many sources of funding available. These sources are only paying attention to their own budgets and not how the big picture fits together.

"The sad part about it is for the same money you could build a few thousand affordable housing units."

The good part for Dominium, on the other hand, is pretty much everything.

It can build housing tailored for artists because a 2008 federal law exempts artists' housing from tax rules requiring credits be used only for units open to "the general public."

Dominium's rent caps can end after 13 years, which means \$900-a-month rents become \$3,000-per-month rents. Over the same period, Dominium owns the building free and clear. Suddenly, a \$170 million rehab becomes valued "at \$300, \$350 million, or whatever someone is willing to pay," says Orfield.

"And we what find often is it's not single working moms with two kids living there or even struggling artists, but like this one guy who owns a sailboat dealership and likes to paint."

Dominium's Owen Metz did not respond to repeated messages seeking comment.

- 1. <u>Home</u>
- 2. <u>Minnesota</u>
- 3. <u>Plymouth</u>
- 4. <u>Property Management</u>
- 5. Dominium Management Services

HEADQUARTERS LOCATION

Dominium Management Services

Property Management

According to information supplied by the company, Dominium Management Services offers Apartment Management Company. This is a multi-location business. Find a location 2905 Northwest Blvd STE 150 Plymouth, MN 55441-2644 <u>http://www.dominiumapartments.com</u> Email this Business (763) 354-5500

Accreditation

THIS BUSINESS IS NOT BBB ACCREDITED

Years in Business: 48 BBB Rating

Customer Reviews are not used in the calculation of BBB Rating Overview of BBB Ratings

Customer Reviews

★★ Average of 12 Customer Reviews

Leave a Review

Customer Complaints

43 complaints closed in last 3 years 26 complaints closed in last 12 months <u>View Complaints Summary</u> File a Complaint

Accreditation

THIS BUSINESS IS NOT BBB ACCREDITED Years in Business: 48 BBB Rating



Customer Reviews are not used in the calculation of BBB Rating **Overview of BBB Ratings**

Ecarrion



08/01/2019

I lived in a apartment complex managed by Dominium for 5 years in Deland, FI. Always on time and we were great loyal residents. Me and husband worked hard to support our children in which I have one with Disabilities. I lost my job in January due to health problems and high risk pregnancy. My lease was due for renewal and we were honest with the office management and told them of our financial hardship about to come and we couldn't possibly renew. Little humane care was given and they hit us with a months rent owed plus kept our deposit stating the apartment wasn't clean enough. The lease manager by the name Maria had a personal problem with my husband due to the fact she was real nasty once and my husband complained on her. She lied even though the whole maintenance crew saw her punching my door early in the morning. We were kicked in the floor when we were already down. I had sent an email to Dominium never to get a response. I can't say they care in anyway about their residents. People are not valued or viewed anymore as just and simply human, we're just another dollar in companies pockets.

Joan J

 \star

02/28/2019

Thr bnew manager is "fining" tenants for breaking rules the tenants know nothing about. They are seniors on a fixed income.

Margaret M

$\star\star\star\star\star$

02/09/2019

I have lived in a dominium property for 5 years & the management team is great. The community rules and policies keep out the chaos. From my own experience in customer service most negative reviewers likely are those not following these policies and upset over the consequences. Without these policies in place where i live the place would fall apart (believe me l've lived in a property like that not managed by dominium). Dominium's properties are extremely high quality too! Pay your rent on time and read your lease...it's easy.

Susan R.

 \star

11/13/2018

I moved my elderly mother from her home of 40+ years to a senior living community in Sherman TX where the majority of the tenants are elderly, veterans or both. Local property manager was/is dismissive, rude and insolent towards the tenants. Maintenance issues are ignored and apartments remain in disrepair. Dominium Corporate management is inaccessible, unresponsive and consistently demonstrates disregard to the needs and well being of the tenants. I moved her out after 5 months due to health reasons related to her living conditions. It is appalling that our seniors and veterans are treated with such disrespect and disdain.

Holly P

\star

11/05/2018

Horrendous experience. We were mutually released from our lease due to heavy mold smell which turned into a moldy wall in my daughters room I The fox river reserve area in yorkville il. Their 24 hour maintenance was a lie and they didn't come to take care of the problem for days after the request was put in. Stuff in my daughters room was getting moldy from even being near the wall. Maintenandidnt correctly handle the problem and every time we would go tothe office to speak to someone about it, no one would there or there would be someone inside who wouldnt open the door. They eventually hired a water restoration company whose meters were blinkingred in everywall ofthe apartment, yet dominium said it was fine and yet wouldnt furnish a report from the company. The regiomanager agreed to release us from our lease. We got out in the time agreed to. Now, Dominium has an inaccurate balance that is owed to them of \$1294 that has been sitting on my credit for 1.5 years, yet when i contacted the regional manager who had released us from our lease, she says we only owe damages for 2 doors in the home for 550. When I called collections, they said the cost of 2 doors is \$200, which is the amount deposit

was. Yet, he told me we owed \$490. They told me they would update the credit bureau or send me an actual legitimate invoice which they have yet to do. Bunch of lies and filth within this company.

Brennetta K.

 \star

09/28/2018

In March of 2018 Dominium Management Services started managing what was Turnberry Village Apartments in Bloomington, II. I have been ready to move every since. I moved to Turnberry in 2009. I am currently in my third unit in the complex. I moved into this last apartment Dec. 1 of 2017. I used to love living out here. The first incident that aggravated me was there was a noticed sent to residents saying they would be coming into our units to install energy saving shower heads and faucets. They were coming in my unit on a Wednesday. So while the maintenance man was in my unit the Monday before fixing my kitchen sink sprayer, I asked him if I should remove the two shower heads and faucets that I purchased and installed myself and put the old ones back on. He told me "No, they won't remove them if they yours." Well. needless to say that Wednesday my 15 y.o. was calling me at work freaking out about our light up shower heads and faucets being gone. I immediately called the office to advise them of what happened. Only be guestioned as if I was lying to them. I was told that they would have to investigate the situation. That took a month of unsuccessful phone calls and at least 3 trips to office to be told that I need to find receipts from a Christmas gift to my girls 3 months previously and one for me just because I wanted it. Pissed off is an understatement. So because I purchased one with cash and did not keep the receipt, I only received credit for one. However, I took them two exact boxes with their equipment in the boxes. From the first week of June 2018 until July 11, 2018 my apartment was flooded. I made 5 maintenance calls. Every time they would leave telling me the problem is fixed. Guess what... the problem was coming from the upstairs unit. Did I mention that it ruined a \$200 bookshelf that my kids got me for Christmas in 2016, which left over 100 books on our dining room floor for weeks. The fact that I have been told that the Bloomington,IL office has emailed corporate twice in regards to my bookshelf and a deep allergen removal carpet shampoo and has not yet gotten a response on something that happened months ago confirmed that this is the last lease I will sign with them. I had to get rid of some of my Daughters shoes and toys that were in her closet on the floor. Had to send my youngest to my mothers for a week because she kept wheezing from an asthma flare up and caught a cold. Why because there was mold on the baseboards that I was told was dust and our floors were soaking wet. (It's a good thing that I documented this thru video and photos) My home smelled horrible. I had to borrow a shop vac at 11 p.m. on a Sunday because the smell had gotten so bad. There was water filling up inside the glass light fixture in the hallway while i had the light on. How dangerous is that? Yeah, they came back in the next day for another 2 hours and "fixed" the problem again. My electric bill was \$50.00 higher in July due to them placing those industrial dehumidifiers and fans in my apartment that was to dry carpet in 3 days which turned into 3 weeks. A disgusting way to even try to live. It was such a nuisance. The worst. I had to cancel the 4th of July family gathering at my house. All because of the inexperience of the maintenance crew. They tried to tell us tenants that we had to take the washer and dryers they

were putting in units. I had just purchased this one in December 2017 when I moved. I was advised to sell it or put it in storage. I advised them then I won't be staying. Did not appreciate the fact that they were just determined to make me do what they wanted me to. I haven't had these appliances 5 months at that time. Last month I came home to a notice telling me that my lease is up 10/31/18. Wait, I am in a 12 month lease under Turnberry Village Apartments. I did not move in to this unit until 12/01/17. I ignored it. Then 2 weeks ago I receive another notice saying that my lease was up 09/30/18 and that I need to come and do my recertification or they will start charging me month to month starting 10/01/18. I am starting to get real frustrated at this point. The lack of communication is horrible. But the straw that broke the camel's back A few months ago as I walking in to the office I see Brittany and her sister Aleesha *********. Aleesha is my youngest daughter's biological mother. She lost her rights to Tamia in January of 2017. I adopted her May 17, 2017. I have had to get an emergency order of protection against both of them at one time. I have had to have them removed from the McLean county fair in 2016. I had to remove Tamia from her daycare center because Brittany enrolled her son there. She also gave her sister Aleesha access into the daycare facility and took her into my daughters classroom where the photographed her and told her they would be back to get her. Of course I have reason for concern. I immediately tell Chelsea in office who they were. I also tell her that I know I can't tell them who to move in and out of the complex but I won't feel safe knowing that they will be that close to us. Her response was, "Ms. ******** you have nothing to worry about. She doesn't have credentials to move in. So, coming home early one day to get my baby off of the bus and who the hell do I see getting her son off the bus but Brittany. I was like where the hell did she come from. I looked around and seen not only her car but the car of Aleesha. My heart started beating so fast. I was so upset. My feelings were crushed. We are now basically prisoners in our own home. We can't even utilize the convenience of the parks here. I dare not let her sit on the patio. I fear for my daughter's safety living here. But of course Chelsea in the office doesn't remember this. She said she did not remember the name. Her selective memory and hearing isn't anything new to me. I told them on Mon. 9/24/18 that I can not live under the "Dominium" conditions. I will no longer rent from a company that I feel I can not trust! A company that every single time I have a concern or question I'm getting a different answer from everyone in the office. Not to mention the lack of customer service from the staff. I have been a customer service rep for years. I would advise them to get some more training. They have dry, rude attitudes. No one is ever smiling in there. I pray that I find something very soon!! You would think that after living here for nine years that you be treated with some respect. I won't be referring anyone I to apply here.

TJONES

*

07/12/2018

THIS COMPANY IS AWFUL. I AM TRYING TO GET RENTAL VERIFICATION AND NO ONE IN THE OFFICE CAN DO IT WHILE THE LEASING MANAGER IS OUT ON VACATION. SO I ASKED FOR CORPORATE NUMBER WHO CUT ME OFF TWICE AND TRANSFERRED ME TO PEOPLE WHO ARE OUT ON VACATION AS WELL. IVE CALLED MY LEASING OFFICE AND CORPORATE MULTIPLY TIMES WITH NO ANSWER. NOT TO MENTION AFTER THEY RENOVATED THE APARTMENTS THEY LEFT MY FLOOR NASTY LEFT NAILS AROUND FOR MY 2 YEAR OLD SON TO POSSIBLE GRAB, MY LIGHTS FLICKER ON AND OFF BECAUSE OF AN ELECTRICAL ISSUE AND THE UPSTAIRS APARTMENT HAS CONTINUED TO LEAK INTO MY HOME. I HAVE SAID SOMETHING MULTIPLY TIMES AND THE LEASING MANAGER STATED SHE HAS THE SAME PROBLEM AS IF THAT MADE THE SITUATION BETTER. IM FED UP AT THIS POINT AND WILL PROCEED WITH OTHER LEGAL MATTERS IF NOTHING IS DONE!!!!

Rebecca



05/30/2018

I rent at Dove Tree in Elk River. I have lived here for 2 years before the new assistant community manager, Angie came here and I had a first bad impression that she keeps telling me I owe money to this complex. I have not felt so harassed by any management where I lived ever than I do with her. She sends me letters with no explanation why I owe them. I don't even like to live here anymore, I can't afford to pay a lot of money. I feel that my privacy is invaded.

ray g.

 \star

03/12/2018

Poor mgt will don't fix nothing. Contact is not explained to the older people . U have to restore the appt so it's ready for the next. You pay for professional carpet cleaning u have to pay for a garbage dep the changes you for everything. And most of all if you break your lease do to health due the building is in poor conditions due to black mold .eleven poor electric wiring is bad common areas dirty carpet has **** on it .smell of garbage smoke

CP61

 \star

02/07/2018

If I could give them less than one star, I would I could never, ever recommend any properties that these people own to someone else. We lived in the same apartment for 2 years and the first year was fine but during our second lease term, everything went downhill. First, our leasing office went through a lot of staffing changes and when they finally promoted our previous leasing agent to leasing manager, she didn't care about concerns or complaints anymore. Second, the quality of living there was terrible in the second year. In one case, I saw cops outside and blood and no one even mentioned this to us, I only saw it because I just happened to be home at the time. When I found an unopened alcohol container outside where children could get to it, I expressed concern and was brushed off. We had a particular neighbor below us that would play music loud enough to make rattling noises in our apartment and they would yell so loud that we could hear them with all of our doors and windows shut. When I talked to our leasing manager about that, nothing was done either. Now, we live somewhere else and I'm trying to get in contact with the main office that manages my previous apartment and many, many others. I talked to someone once, and they quickly pushed me off to a voicemail. I left a message but was never called back. I have since tried to call for the past two days and it has gone to voicemail every time. I'm fed up with this place and don't know who to talk to about them not answering me.

https://g.co/kgs/SMJBqi https://g.co/kgs/U7ucbi https://g.co/kgs/Lpxyry https://g.co/kgs/Xx1QKW https://g.co/kgs/S9cLZD https://g.co/kgs/WTJyBf

There are very many negative reviews of the Dominiuim Apartments.

From:	<u>K J CARR</u>
То:	Enrique A Bojorquez-Gaxiola
Subject:	19th Ave and Southern Apartments
Date:	Monday, June 8, 2020 2:27:20 PM

Hello,

This message is to voice my opinion regarding the subject of building apartments on the 19th ave and Southern site. I believe it would not be profitable in this area and it would just depreciate the value of my property. I have lived in this area for more than 45 years and putting this type of structure in this neighborhood is not suitable for our future growth. Apartments built just west of the 19th and Southern is a perfect example. It's an eye sore and crime infested. So my vote for such a structure would be a NO. Sincerely yours, Katherine Carr

Get Outlook for iOS [aka.ms]

South Mountain Village,

Attn: Enrique Bojorquez-Gaxiola City of Phoenix Planning &Development Department 200 W. Washington Street, Phoenix 85003

Case (Z-49-19-8)

This is a motivational story I like to repeat. It is someone else's story. But I like to repeat the story. If you have not read this parable- here is your chance-

Gloria Steinem, the writer and leader in the feminist movement, once learned an important political lesson as a student on a geology field trip.

"I took geology because I thought it was the least scientific of the sciences," she told an audience at Smith College.

"On a field trip, while everyone else was off looking at the meandering Connecticut River, I was paying no attention whatsoever. Instead, I had a found a giant, GIANT turtle that had climbed out of the river, crawled up a dirt road, and was in the mud on the embankment of another road, seemingly about to crawl up on it and get squashed by a car. "So, being a good codependent with the world, I tugged and pushed and pulled until I managed to carry this huge, heavy, angry snapping turtle off the embankment and down the road.

"I was just putting it back into the river when my geology professor arrived and said, 'You know, that turtle probably spent a month crawling up that dirt road to lay its eggs in the mud by the side of the road, and you just put it back in the river.'

"Well, I felt terrible. But in later years, I realized that this was the most important political lesson I learned, one that cautioned me about the authoritarian impulse of both left and right.

"Always ask the turtle."

Gloria Steinem

Don't build a three hundred unit apartment low income apartment. The community is speaking.

Listen to the turtle.

Respectfully,

Ruben Henderson III

South Mountain Village,

Attn: Enrique Bojorquez-Gaxiola City of Phoenix Planning &Development Department 200 W. Washington Street, Phoenix 85003

Case (Z-49-19-8)

I am writing this letter in opposition to the three story planed low income monstrosity to be built on the Northwest corner of 19th Avenue and Southern. I'm the president of the Anderson Farms Homeowners Association, I vote, and I have standing in this matter. I want the Zoning Commission to reject this inappropriate project.

There is no need for public housing on this corner or in our community. This is a government backed project to make money. It is as simple as that. Money. "This is a government subsidized housing development with relatively low rents". This brings to communities struggling with other endemic issues more problems unforeseen an unplanned. The claim that this project is for a social good and will provide housing for low income members of the community. Is Nonsense. This is a subterfuge/camouflage for making money supported by our tax dollars.

The arguments that a retail option for this location is not a realistic option and that this is the last chance to get something good on this comer and that this is in the best for the community so- you need to settle for this mediocre project. I do not accept these arguments nor should you.

The Village zoning board and the city zoning board should support the desires of the communities located in that area. Did you ask the community? Are you listening to the community? Vote no on this project.

The City of Phoenix, the Zoning board and the Village board should establish a community committee to take the time to search for a 21st century " collaborative enterprise that is carefully planned and designed to achieve a" community based solution agreed upon as opposed to a hammered- imposed solution. Give our community a chance to come up with a better option. Give the community a chance to seek, search and reach out and bring to the community positive business that will add to the human capital of our community and provide engaging opportunities for our youth.

Respectfully,

Ruben Henderson III 2339 W. St. Catherine

Racelle Escolar

From:	A N <maricopaaln@gmail.com></maricopaaln@gmail.com>
Sent:	Monday, August 3, 2020 1:25 PM
To: Subject:	Mayor Gallego; Lisa Fernandez; Samantha Keating; Enrique A Bojorquez-Gaxiola; Racelle Escolar; Ed Zuercher; Joshua Bednarek; Council District 8 PCC; Carlos D Garcia; Adriana Garcia Maximiliano; Nicole R Hale; Council District 1 PCC; Council District 2 PCC; Council District 3 PCC; Council District 4; Council District 5 PCC; Council District 6 PCC; Council District 7 PCC; Sina Matthes; Andrea Gaston; Thelda Williams; Jim Waring; brian.schnitt@phoenix.gov; nicholas.comcappellini@phoenix.gov; Debra W Stark; Raquel Estupinan; Adam Grant; Dulce G Rivas; Betty S Guardado; maria.lopez- corona@phoenix.gov; Andrew J Wunder; Emmanuel Gallardo-Sanidad; Laura Pastor; Sal DiCiccio; Jaimie L Kleshock; Erin A Morris; michael.nowakowski@phoenix.gov; Tannia M Ruiz; uber.gutierrez- estrada@phoenix.gov; Sam G Stone CoPhxAppCaseZ-49-19-8.pdf; Community Letter Opposition and Peition Signature
Attachments:	CoPhxAppCaseZ-49-19-8.pdf

Dear City of Phoenix Mayor Kate Gallego; Planning and Development Councilmen/Councilwomen and Others,

Please see attached Letter from Lindo Park/Muriel Smith Community Center. This letter and peition signatures oppossing rezoning number Z-49-19-8; 19th Ave, & Southern Avenue, NW Corner.

Thank you, Community Members Lindo Park/Muriel Smith Community Center

*

- To: City of Phoenix Planning and Development Dept.
- Re: Application Case No. Z-49-19-8

Since September of 2019 the residents of the Lindo Park Community have been in united opposition to the approval of rezoning, waivers and construction of the project proposed by Dominium. Yet it seems that our voices are not being heard and most definitely our faces of dissatisfaction have not been seen.

We are very disappointed with the vote of approval for this project by the South Mountain Village Committee. More than 150 residents of this community signed a letter of petition in opposition to the approval of this project, yet those who were to be considered our representatives ignored our pleas to see the error of placing such an invasion in to the stream of our daily fives.

If the rezoning requests and waivers are granted by your Department it will open the door to another corporation that speaks about trying to meet the needs of the community, when really their intent is purely driven by the profit they project to make; they have said as much in previous meetings, just check the video of the meetings.

From day one we have vehemently expressed our displeasure with the intrusion and disruption this massive complex would be in this neighborhood. Have any of you been out to the site and stood in the back yards of the homes this project would be erected behind and gained an idea of the site lines and privacy it will produce? Dominium says they have made some accommodations and moved a few buildings and lowered one or two to give the appearance of meeting the requests of the residents. But, still it is a smoke screen that they are still seeking to place 300+ units into a dense area with the one thought being to their profitability. A Two Story project is just not feasible for the profit margin that they are desiring. The residents of this community are tired of hearing the excuse of *what about our bottom line our corporate profits*. Dominium's corporate profits mean nothing to us and provide no benefit to us and not much of a benefit to the city of Phoenix other than throwing a few hundred units at an overwhelming shortage of housing. Are we supposed to just go along to meet that need and show no care for the needs of the residents, the constituents of this district? If so that is a true disconnect between the city and its residents.

In the meetings that have proceeded residents have expressed that the best compromise that we feel would be of service is a 2 story development; no height or density waivers as being sought by Dominium. We believe that 22 units per acre is excessive and lends more to overcrowding and a further disconnect between the current residents and the future residents, if any. We who have lived in this neighborhood and area for over 50 years are still looking for proper Shopping and economic development to enhance the infrastructure and vitality of this community. Why not give incentive to Fry's Food Stores to relocate the store on Baseline and Seventh Street to this lot and bring in small businesses to be a part of the anchor this area needs for improved shopping, goods and services. A complex of this size will expose that lack and need of services, further pushing into a desert with lack of resources.

Living in this neighborhood we are keenly aware of the stress of transportation on Southern Avenue in the morning commutes. There are many instances of traffic bypassing the 19th Avenue and Southern intersection because of the back up to divert down 21st avenue and Hidalgo to connect to 19th avenue. There are many that speed through the neighborhood at a time when children would normally be catching buses to school. However, with the advent of the Covid-19 Pandemic, these things are not recordable or evident. This does not lend to an accurate accounting for the traffic that this will produce with an additional 300 living spaces and approximately 900 additional individuals into the community and the minimum 300 vehicles owned by those new residents. With so much congestion on Southern Avenue, we know they will make the choice to avoid the delays and speed through our neighborhood as an alternate route: that is not acceptable.

With the crisis of covid-19 permeating throughout our city, county and state, this is not the time for husiness as usual The voices of the people are not truly being heard. Many of the residents of the neighborhood have not had much success getting on the Video and conference calls to have their voices heard. But, the real tragedy is that they are not PHYSICALLY being seen. What we have learned throughout history and even now with the protest against police brutality and the murder in the streets for petty crimes, is that action would not be taken except that the people were able to be SEEN in protest! Covid-19 does not afford that privilege for the vast opposition to be seen in its physical form and that is a detriment to our outcry. We feel that is all the more reason that this project should not be approved for rezoning until you can hear our voices and look us in the eye and tell us we do not have a right to a better space of living within compromise. We have been taught to, "Let everyone be quick to **hear** [*be a careful, thoughtful listener*], slow to speak [a speaker of carefully chosen words and], slow to anger [patient, reflective, forgiving]". My question, are you **Hearing** us?

Additionally, the community has some concerns that we would like to have addressed.

Research by our neighbor suggests Dominium has Characteristics not appropriate for our neighborhood.

- Discriminatory Practices
- Civil Right infringements
- Rent Hikes contrary to stated agreements
- Landlord/Slumlord Practices
- Employee discriminatory Practices
- Unseemly Federal, State and County Tax Practices

With the current state of our country because of this pandemic many jobs have been losted and unemployment may take several years to get back to a more reasonable level. Where does dominium expect to get the residents they claim to be building this project for? Median income has dropped due to the unemployment and there is a possibility of mass evictions and foreclosures because covid-19 may not be at a tolerable rate until late in the winter for business to try and rebounded and employment to start to inch back up. This is just the wrong time for this development and the wrong way for the City of Phoenix to be conducting business of this magnitude without the ability to see and hear the full throated opposition to the approval of this project.

We the residents of Lindo Park strongly admonish you to either place the project on hold until we can safely discuss and debate this in person or flatly deny the approval of this project.

Sincerely,

Lindo Park community See the attached signatures for the residents

			>		
	Petition Opposing Rezoning		the Northwest Corner of 19th Ave	& Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	se #Z-49-19-8)
	Name	Address	Email	Signature	Date
Mrs.Wilda	a Parker	56095, John S	1425	worker Suntall	SCOL & ITZ
(HSMIND	(lo het)	hiddaody	Can	Same all	515 Bran
Katasha -	Thues	56215. Wride	Taske Thethether	The Million	Althe Long N
Mr. Davel	Reagan-	Acada HU. Hida Card	14 9.	AtraOlogender	5718/2020
MAS Willie	redlae. Ko acon	+1 (1) bloc	140	W. W. Wald	12/2/ m20
~	Vangu Dela Cru	12035W Huda 194		E. DelaChue 7	2020
5]	Jan What Hinerasa	and adobit, cit that	Phy	Prost ANAL	S11817676
4	Aartan Wini Pole	106/10 A. A. O. 120K	he	(Curry)	5/18/2020
	NON CAN	WW2216, JOHNAN	5		Stoin/8/12
	awaliteda Bag	XB315, 30/21/24	3	Hin Lake D	5/18/20
	Non int	Swart S zuerlan		Entra 1 a.	C1 1210
Ţ	Blievillians	11		ANNINAL DUNAL	KIIQIQD
} ,	Marcus Wesley	SCALS 200 Dive		Wares appealing	5118120
	5	5		1 avil	Sliviza
+	Sula	1. t)	- Cat	5/18/20
V	Stew Putho	7. h. way	e.	LACK HUN	8/18/20
<u> </u>	Durrant Claric	3 507 10. [Davia	NVILP. Stephi MOR	Stori mertanan gurai Loons	2012/20
	Tala a Calte	2024 N. Pern No.	all is range with	Law R. M. al.	15 17 18 17 D
Salve	it is thay a	ENIGS. JUNKAW		B. Counter	075,-61 7.8
GUDO	Value A tougo of	SYIDS. 21 WHUC	Z 1054	watches Cluar	· \$ 5-17-20
Ellia	1	5709 1.21 21 24 AV		E lise modere	5/19/30
JURA	Na dero	X7105.21 AM	2	Furth Madde	11.1
Derle	Mader			Uner Made	1. 5-270-2d

Page 1

12020 Ent

		Par	30 2		
Detition	n Onnosina	Rezoning the	Northwest Corner of 19th Ave	& Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	se #Z-49-19-8)
		6			
Name		Address	Email	Signature	Date
ALL.	10 1 2 11)	1204120 AND VIX A 28041	MI AN DUICERE OUN	1 Michlind Barby	5717/20
A LUM LA INTIMICA		Mage NEDITE PHY A7	Ren und	M. O. Y. Contrat	5/17/20
the Co		ACA DAID, DAY A	geon -	hour bear	SIM120
	\$	ARNIN WIN 43	KUD	tou	
V	いかっと	UN N		South Dunity	5/17/20
3		2001 10 Caller VSa	H	O.D.K.	5-17.8020
Horn wy www.	A CC D	And a star	of aviannesticales	128 Jamil Dan Con	5/11/20
A CLAND ON A LANDAR	120200	CONTROL DA		1 m	5/11/20
MANN		CALL X LA LATA		A.	6-17.20
	1	200 2010	1. 10.	Kalal R	5-17, 20
	16		tritan tow 240 and	Over Mutoc Fer	5-17-20
NTDN Faw		1 10 1 21 1	corelined (and	HIV C IA	5-18-20
LHDAN	1828 (1). 1004	VUAL / D. C.	ANT HAL ALLENED CAN	1 multit	5.18-20
MNCIAL ALLEY	v 202/07	Luddin	Nohe	Why then all and	515 20
A La	5 C	afrat a	2	Months Farlas	5-18-20
and 50	18 S. 20Th)	/JOSHWAFISCOM! 16	S-18-20
V milau	0 56125.	and the we		Jessie Roverno	5-18-20
M ~ Irlelling In May 19140	NV0 56125.	20th Drive	1	OU DU Equal Douvare	5-1,5-25
1			1	Mr. Ale	
		5602 51 204 UM	ll .	DA	ac /2/2/
MARCH A GOUCIO	5600-5	HOMINAILE		210G M 1	2
Maragen Hallukins	1002018	7867	momornal + 219 29 mai	1.con buy que to tout	0/10/00
Tannin Drinkou	LIG0-262-4119	4119	Jauds 41 Quelion	10W / 10	07/21/0
C C				,	

1.E.

	ase #Z-49-19-8)		× K/Wa/20	11/1/30	KI WAR	34/14/28	5/0/2	0 5/19/2020	5/19/2020	5/19/2020	511912030	41,912070	ec/ 6//25	5/19/200	5/20/2020	5/20/202n	5/2012020	662/2020	[e/2/2620	0202/210	- 21 h JU	202/201	12/20-	6-2120	6-2-20
	e Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	Signature	MULTING This 15	Patter Buter	Phendar Thinter	Christerka Hente	Orathe H. the	Sardla Prince	aline they 0	8×1711	SHARER WY	I ANDON RODO HAVIEW	teration 1 1 4 mill to	Mind on	typy a	Willie Brow der	ARE GREEN ON BUNCH	Fultres "	Lender he	Korl	IN		Carbonel. >	Clouder Kin	$\left\{ \right\}$
De M	the Northwest Corner of 19th Ave	Email					1	the -	Are -	a AVE	A AVE	11 · ·)	hann 0		<u></u> <i>K</i>			Q. MX. A. 55041	A		JANUNIX	C DAUCHIA	Phonis	Phenic	Phoenix
ð		Address	5113 5. 24 Ave				98015.71MM	2133W H2/212.	2133 IN Hidalgo	2122. W. Widely	12129. W. Hida	2 E.Weith	W 937 W. BUNGESMIN	GOSS 25th St	6409 W. Carsson A	1280 w Burges Ln	1880 W BW Secs LA	2113 W. H. DALG	STASS JIPHA	SUSSIST Are	2.5	STOUS NStAK	Struc. 25+ MC	MA HUC STOLLS	57225215t AVE
	Petition Opposing Rezoning	Name	dired Hyphy	ESther Hurton	KINDUNDA H.M.W.	Jessicka Hinth	Keby Halead	5a Ma Vinizan	PANIS Flether	Monda Mosta	Shawn Pathalan	Kool Marcurs	TYPENE Harm (BUSP)	Worthout Cantel	Sec. 21	MICHAEL BENEWICHZ	Angel Annuelic	Frid Sond	Achdia Neal	a Neal	Violeta . Pallear	resmin Paleur	Pubrial Dulars		[COSSONDralmyre]
																		E puesday	a capito						

Petition Opposing R	Petition Opposing Rezoning the Northwest Corner of 19th Ave	t Corner of 19th Ave	a & Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	lse #Z-49-19-8)
Namo	Addraes	Email	Signature	Date
volu Johnson	all w. Hidalgeave		Cheele Jahnson	5/27/2020
			000	
UNIRON APPRON	2257 W. Waylandal		allon Kegan	5/25/20
A Verman	2257 W. Waylond Rd		Diarde Pres	N 1
Redan	1.1.7		Sprean Beagon	12S12C
2000 an	7 WW War	5	David Margan	5/25/20
e Looder	aphobily. UIPSOC		TYOGE - LUNN	05/25/20
ľ	Dose W. Michael	2 rathe ward	A WAY WAY	125/25/20
(14MARCPAN	A 269 W. HIM NG	When hards	Alma CUBIC	12125 ZW
C. Lanks C.	ARMIT IN 1898	1 a same	Marley Class	08/18/180
1.0 John Strates	2754 W CUNNAND	0	MAC	5-26-21
TAN OS	1254 11 Suntand		Kost Jan	5-26-20
A Carl	oris is the low		Chine Chart	5-26-20
0	O.Ch		Althonic Care	5-26-30
	2	\$	The LLARR	
The latence	1 cha		thatte	62.2.9
leer Sogth	NA. 1039	R	the cult	6-2-30
In and the	21440 And as AUC	,	Jern Worksen	bliers
non tarana	122	/has-can/	Thursday Ania Bar	ac-ro
altiller Roode 5601 5.2	PC	r	Whiley bedy	6-3-20
	1 5/1 01 5. 2046 LK	5	Weber Georges	0208-5-7+
VI aca A Lea Ini	Plubero	GOV	Murent Code of	6.3.7070
		1		and a h

1

>

Petition Opposing Rezoning		t Corner of 19th	the Northwest Corner of 19th Ave & Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	ase #Z-49-19-8)
Name	Address	Email	Signature	Date
Sharra Wilborn	5622 S. Rotal A		UNX .	5/18/20
dlic	567		RENTA CUMPA	5/18/20
margavitulilute	5622		Three Mulline	5-48-2020
	56 20 5. Visto 6 rand		to the lot and a	5-20-2220
Clark Ande	56205 Virta Crud)	TOKENIZY	5-20-20
al	95. USSA		Current colice	5/20/20
Cran () Core	Scots S. Visha Controld		Nor X	May - 20: 20
7 due	S. Uisha		()) lose land	4 May . 20.20
10	7/14 5 11/2 ar		with M Course	1 max 20-20
Melsin Colbar	5610 5. ViSTA 62	MUDE	IN, Celpint	5-20-20
Anad the of Longr	SOUTSN'ISTER Grand		Verse and	5.20-20
Tone Barton	SU025 VISTACINAL	nde	O Hand Which The	6.20-20
	810 Sur CH		Kondoleta A	520 20
DI BICUMANDER	100 MUMM		Berg W Paper	5-20-20
OD OX SACh	2 ON VIO CHANNER		U-71-7-U	5-20-20
Tomas long z	2034 WChambers		man.	06-08-5
Armando Eastriguez	2134 W W011		Armande . L	5-20-20
Portionian Protie	- JIZA W MARY DA		Deterrite, R.	5.20 20
1-3	4713U		at a rest of the	t. 70,20
-	2135 W 3		Witherestawiew	K.20120
Caluri Ch-	ca w		de not	5.20.20
Porenda Colom	2202 W. Wed		BARR Colo	5.20 - 2020
Xrn Mr M H L			UN UN NB S	5-2-2020

Petition Oppo	Petition Opposing Rezoning th	le Northwest	the Northwest Corner of 19th Ave &	& Southern Avenue (Case #Z-49-19-8)	ase #Z-49-19-8
Mame	Addrace		Email	Signature	Date
0.01	1	ON CON D	1 Dividalet build		05/00/20
N .	Adval 1	11 11 11	La r No In The	a sund Parts	
Marcord A	4		AN LAN	manuel y arrive	12/2/
Man'es Delech	ren 2163 av	1LOCS ENU		11/11/11/11	105

To: City of Phoenix Planning and Development Dept.

City of Phoenix Mayor and Council

Re: Application Case No. Z-49-19-8

This letter is submitted to Voice my OPPOSITION to the building of a 312 unit, 3 story Apartment complex at the Northwest corner of 19th Avenue and southern by Dominium. This property defined as an affordable multifamily residential community is not a welcome addition to this already established community.

From the meetings that have proceeded in Sept 2019, Jan 2020, May 2020 and July 2020 It is very the developer is on a time schedule and is more concerned about the profits to be lost if the deal is not completed soon. It is apparent that Dominium has had very minimal engagement with the community where this complex is to be built. There have been a few attempts and sending mailers or leaving pamphlets, but no real community outreach. But, I guess we can blame that on the Covid-19 pandemic we find ourselves in. However, if that is to be used as an excuse it should be all the more reason for denying this project. If the intention is to build a property that will be inclusive of the surrounding neighborhood and the current residents, then this should be postponed until we can truly be represented in a face to face manor.

Dominium has made it clear on numerous occasions that if they cannot build this project with a minimum of 300 units it is not profitable for them. I and many like me are tired of being set aside in the name of progress; which is truly about profits. I and many of the residents are longing for the development of what was promised to our parents and to us, a viable shopping center, a grocery store or restaurants and small business shops that would enhance the value of the area and bring much needed economic growth to the area. Dominium's project provides none of that. It will bring much more traffic to an area that has a high volume of traffic that flows down southern Avenue in the mornings and evening during rush hours as it is a main artery to residents living in Laveen. We have seen over the years this traffic migrates through our neighborhood as commuters use Hidalgo, 21st and 23rd avenues as shortcuts to get onto 19the avenue north bound. This property would only exacerbate that problem with the influx of so many more vehicles with the new residents.

When you take into account the sheer size of the project it just does not mesh into the continuity of this community. This neighborhood and the surrounding neighborhoods are single family homes. We like the feel of the openness of our community. There have got to be better options for the use of this property that would more ideally fit the nature of this area. Nothing in the area from Central avenue on the east to 35th avenue on the west, Baseline road on the south and Broadway road on the north, reflect this type of proposed property. It will change the aesthetics and views of the mountains to the south and the skyline of Phoenix to the North and Northeast. There is nothing like the site of the moonrise over south mountain; that view would be gone!

One thing that this pandemic has exposed is that the low income employee is grossly underpaid. It begs tha question of what is the median rent going to be and who will be able to afford it? Even with the increase of the minimum wage that Arizona voters instituted it is still not comparable to the excessive rents that are being assessed to the Phoenix residents. This project claims it will be catering to low income workers, yet many articles have pointed to the rents being hiked indiscriminately by Dominium at their other locations in Phoenix metro as well as across the country. I do not believe they can provide the true low income housing that Phoenix desperately needs and this is not the area to make that experiment.

I believe this project should be tabled until this meeting on approval for rezoning can be held in a face to face manner and right now in the middle of this pandemic we cannot do that. Dominium doesn't care about that because it is in their favor not to have bodies standing in opposition that can be counted. There is nothing more powerful than the visual of a men and women standing in solidarity of joined ideals. Virtual meetings do not allow you to see the faces and truly feel the passions of the people. We see this in the power of the protests against police brutality, government over reach on sovereign native lands, the stands against the squelching of voters rights and voter suppression. By pressing forward with this rezoning during this pandemic it is also a form of suppression at the hands of the city of Phoenix. This is too important a vote for this community and its future that can never be regained if it is not heard. I admonish you to hear our voices and lean into your better selves.

Too many of the local residents will be disenfranchised because they are not very tech savvy and have experienced problems in the past being able to login to the video meetings or via the audio calls. They deserve to be heard and be seen by those who hold the power to reshape their homes and the quality of their lives. It is time to change the concept of business as usual; this is not a time that is usual.

Sincerely, Rev. Fred Jones, III 2113 W Hidalgo Avenue

Phoenix, AZ 85041

Racelle Escolar

From:	Ruben Henderson III <lightink@msn.com></lightink@msn.com>
Sent:	Thursday, August 6, 2020 8:07 AM
То:	PDD Planning Commission
Subject:	Case (Z-49-19-8)

Case (Z-49-19-8)

I stand in opposition to the three story planed low income housing planned for the Northwest corner of 19th Avenue and Southern.

This project adds nothing to our community. The traffic will be horrible. You put the potential of as many as 5000 people in a confined area next to single family homes is an obvious mistake. Why would the City of Phoenix do that?

This is a mediocre project. The City of Phoenix can do better. Don't settle for the first shinny project that comes along. You need to support the communities located in that area. Did you ask the community? Are you listening to the community? Vote no on this project.

Respectfully,

Ruben Henderson III 2339 W. St. Catherine 602-899-1843

Sent from Mail [go.microsoft.com] for Windows 10

Rose Jones

2254 west Sunland

Phoenix, Arizona 85041

Home number 602-276-7119

Cell number 602-478-0619

Case number Z-49-19-8 Rezoning case

ATT: Planning Commission,

I am writing this letter because I strongly oppose the apartment complex scheduled to be built on 19th Ave and Southern. I have lived in this area for almost 50 years.

We have been promised so many positive plans in our area. We were shown pictures of this beautiful apartment complex. Well if you have time drive by and look at it. Broken down cars, property not kept up, trash on the grounds, taped up windows and much more. Located on 23rd Ave and Southern. Please go on any Saturday evening so you can meet our police arresting drug dealers or gang bangers. When people are referring to south Phoenix They say " DOWN THERE " Well we have more sex offenders Down THERE Section 8 housing DOWN THERE .

Well in our area we get all the garbage people UP THERE don't want.

Should use the purished because we live in a predominantly black reightionhood. Black builds matter Ule matter DOWN HERE Rose Jone