

ATTACHMENT I

Sarah Stockham

From: Paul Franckowiak <paul.franckowiak@outlook.com>
Sent: Monday, February 19, 2024 7:08 PM
To: PDD Laveen VPC; Nayeli Sanchez Luna
Cc: Cyd Manning
Subject: Auto-mall and Hospital. Last Monday's Meeting

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Laveen Planning Commission-

I was one of the 150 + people at last Monday's meeting who registered their opposition to the ridiculously out of character development proposed for the area around the new freeway in Laveen. (Items 4 and 5 from that meeting's agenda).

I am writing to reiterate my opposition to the plan and to let you know your responses to audience questions did not really make any sense to many in the room. Further, any average poker player watching could guess how each of you are going to vote based on how you all reacted to the developer and the community speakers. Many of you lean in and smile when the developer is talking and tune out into sidebar conversations when a community member is addressing you. I am disappointed in that because you are supposed to be neutral arbiters of public interests in the development of Laveen. The overwhelming opposition to the proposal is not "beating a dead horse" as our chairwoman characterized it, but rather an indicator of just how against this development the community is. You are quick to respond with talking points to opposition from the community and quick to establish thresholds for compromise when doing so favors high-density development.

After climbing South Mountain this weekend and viewing the property slated for development from above, I understand why a 5 story parking garage and a 10 story hospital are being proposed. That property is way too small for all that is being proposed. Why else would a builder incur the extra expense of building upward when they could build outward?

The only justifications I heard for building both a tall hospital and an auto-mall on that parcel are:

1. We need a hospital on this side of the river because a flood 15 years ago didn't wash out all of the bridges. Besides their being a new freeway over the river now, this does not seem like strong justification for putting a hospital so far South.
2. We need an auto-mall here because car companies have restrictions on their proximity to other dealerships. It seems that hospitals and resorts would also have concerns for their proximity to other like providers. I didn't hear any consideration of that in the community discussion.

The increased sales tax justification we heard was laughed at prior to meeting's end so I will not address that here.

Most hospitals do not have auto-malls and I question the need to couple these two things in the proposed development. If there is only room for one without vastly changing elevation restrictions, most Laveen residents would rather have a hospital than an auto-mall. Without the auto-mall, the hospital will have room to be a five story level one trauma center like the ones the one council member cited at last Monday's meeting.

The proposed resort area is very close to the Gila River Casino. Also, the proposed trailhead will be a homeless person magnet if it is at all close to commercial development. Further, we have little used trailheads at 35th and 43rd avenues already.

Without any serious justification for why this has to happen as proposed, it seems we are seeing more developer sleight of hand.

"Keep your eye on the hospital and trailhead while we slip an auto-mall and high-density housing into your neighborhood." is the trick.

Folks at last Monday's meeting are not buying the chicanery we are seeing here and I hope you guys do not fall for it either.

You guys really need to be better. The community you represent on the planning commission needs you to be better.

Sincerely,

Paul Franckowiak

Nayeli Sanchez Luna

Subject: FW: Gila Foothills

From: Steven Ramirez <paintfourlife@gmail.com>

Sent: Sunday, February 25, 2024 11:51 AM

To: PDD Laveen VPC <laveenvpc@phoenix.gov>; Council District 1 PCC <council.district.1@phoenix.gov>; Council District 2 PCC <council.district.2@phoenix.gov>; Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>; Council District 4 <council.district.4@phoenix.gov>; Council District 5 PCC <council.district.5@phoenix.gov>; Council District 6 PCC <District6@phoenix.gov>; Council District 7 PCC <council.district.7@phoenix.gov>; Council District 8 PCC <council.district.8@phoenix.gov>; Mayor Gallego <mayor.gallego@phoenix.gov>; Nayeli Sanchez Luna <nayeli.sanchez.luna@phoenix.gov>

Subject: Gila Foothills

Dear Mayor and Council members,

I am writing to express my concerns regarding the proposed zoning changes for the Gila Foothills PUD. While I understand the importance of development and progress, I believe that the current proposal may not be in the best interest of our community.

Firstly, I would like to address the issue of the proposed 150ft tall hospital. While I appreciate the need for medical facilities in our area, I am concerned that such a tall building would obstruct the scenic views of our local mountains and disrupt the aesthetic harmony of our neighborhood.

Additionally, considering that there are other hospitals nearby that are not as tall, I believe that a shorter hospital would be a more suitable compromise that meets the needs of the community without compromising our natural surroundings.

Moving the hospital on the south side of Estrella, would not only be beneficial for the Tierra Montana neighborhood but also to first responders trying to enter the hospital from the 202 (they would only have to turn right instead of crossing traffic to turn left).

Secondly, I would like to express my distaste and concerns for an auto mall. If the developer truly wanted to help create something innovative they would have done more research about the automotive industry. Being EV focused is cool and hip, but it is also about 5 years too late. Although automakers are still coming out with Electric vehicles, that is not where their focus is on. Over the past few years EV's have proven that they are not the wave of the future but more or less a stepping stone to more efficient and truly zero emissions vehicles. Here is a article about just a few automakers who are looking towards the future with Hydrogen. [https://carboncredits.com/revving-up-for-the-hydrogen-fuel-cell-era-bmw-and-toyota-lead-the-way-to-zero-emission-vehicles-fhyd/#:~:text=Leading%20automakers%20are%20investing%20heavily,warm%20air%20as%20a%20byproduct.\[carboncredits.com\]](https://carboncredits.com/revving-up-for-the-hydrogen-fuel-cell-era-bmw-and-toyota-lead-the-way-to-zero-emission-vehicles-fhyd/#:~:text=Leading%20automakers%20are%20investing%20heavily,warm%20air%20as%20a%20byproduct.[carboncredits.com])

Another concern of mine comes with the increase of EV sales, more automakers are following suit of Tesla, Lucid and Rivian where they are selling direct to consumers and eliminating the middle man of the dealership which eliminates hefty price gouging and over production of vehicles. That being said Arizona is one of the states that allow direct to customer sales.

My concern is what will happen with this massive auto complex if and when automakers choose to do direct sales, that no one will be able to afford?

I would suggest a smaller footprint for the Automall which would allow a future sale of the property more financially feasible for a future investor/buyer, which would also allow to relocate the hospital on the south side of Estrella as well. More are articles supporting my concerns

<https://www.capitalone.com/cars/learn/getting-a-good-deal/car-dealership-vs-directtoconsumer-heres-the-difference/2270> [capitalone.com]
[\[caranddriver.com\]](#)

https://www.caranddriver.com/news/a41472587/sympathy-for-the-dealer-november-2022/?fbclid=IwAR1RV3IV5XIAVpQBKQz9WvRYEjGyEngygLLazAUdHU71_9iovIzAt-112k4_aem_AaSM4E_U_z7mrUXmCYcU5muF_-sjsmM2zcZsybTo8UbVPZqa2esuJnnqSvB2KZ1KkLw [caranddriver.com]

Thirdly, I would like to challenge the assertion that our area lacks the income to support sit-down restaurants.

As a resident of the Tierra Montana neighborhood, also along the 202 and Elliot Road, I can attest to the fact that we have a diverse range of households with varying income levels, including homes valued between \$500,000 and \$1,000,000+ in close proximity to the proposed development site.

Therefore, I believe that the data indicating insufficient income may be outdated and does not accurately reflect the current economic landscape of our community.

This brings me to the proposed apartments and high density multi family housing. Not only does the current plan have height restrictions in place for this current land that these do not follow, where in all of the valley do you see apartments, a hospital and a auto mall next to \$500,000 - \$1,000,000+ homes?

The Laveen Planning Commission has already expressed their distaste for more high density multi family apartments, our suggestion is to make the North side of Estrella rezoned to R1-6 to still allow high to medium density housing without effecting views that the already established neighborhoods already enjoy. Also it would help force the hand of the developer to create a 55 and older community that Laveen doesn't currently have. If they had amenities they could still potentially bring higher price tags.

We would also like to see the north side frontage of Estrella zoned to commercial to allow retail shops and restaurants that would truly benefit our community and contribute to the growth and prosperity of Laveen.

A smaller-scale version of the popular local shopping center, Tempe Marketplace, would be an ideal addition to our neighborhood, providing residents with convenient access to amenities and fostering a sense of community engagement.

Lastly, I am concerned about the potential economic impact of establishing all of this commercial significant tax revenue will be generated and I am troubled by the fact that these tax dollars may not be reinvested back into Laveen but rather directed towards Phoenix proper.

Without mechanisms in place to ensure that tax revenue benefits our community directly, I believe that we should prioritize developments that have a tangible and sustainable positive impact on the residents of Laveen.

In conclusion, I want to emphasize that my opposition to the proposed zoning changes stems from a genuine concern for the well-being and prosperity of our community.

I am open to dialogue and compromise, and I believe that together, we can find a solution that balances the needs of development with the preservation of our neighborhood's character and quality of life.

Thank you for considering my perspective on this matter. I look forward to hearing your thoughts and working together towards a mutually beneficial outcome.

Sincerely,

Steven Ramirez

5349 W. Farmhand Dr.

Laveen, AZ 85339

Paintfourlife@gmail.com

Nayeli Sanchez Luna

From: Robert Chappell <robci01@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, February 26, 2024 8:54 PM
To: Council District 8 PCC; support@phxazdistrict8.zendesk.com
Cc: Mayor Gallego; PDD Laveen VPC; Nayeli Sanchez Luna
Subject: Gila Foothills PUD on 202 near Elliot Road

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Dear Ms. Kesha Hodge Washington,

I hope this email finds you well. I am writing to express my concerns regarding the proposed zoning changes for the Gila Foothills PUD on 202 near Elliot Road. While I understand the importance of development and progress, I believe that the current proposal may not be in the best interest of our community.

Firstly, I would like to address the issue of the proposed 150ft tall hospital, (applicant stated willingness to decrease to 120ft at Laveen Planning meeting on February 12th). While I appreciate the need for additional medical facilities in Laveen, I am concerned that such a tall building would disrupt the aesthetic harmony of our neighborhood. The applicant has stated to secure a level one trauma center the height is required. I believe this to be a misrepresentation as typically businesses are concerned with usable square footage, which they can adjust by updating their proposed building plan to bring the facility's height to match more closely with the surrounding areas and not compromise our natural surroundings.

As a homeowner in the Passage community of the Tierra Montana neighborhood I would also like to see the planned site moved further south, closer to the highway, and out of the Tierra Montana neighborhood's backyard. At minimum there should be at least a 1500 ft setback if the proposed development area cannot be pushed further south.

Secondly, I would like to challenge the assertion that our area lacks the income to support sit-down restaurants. As a homeowner of the Tierra Montana neighborhood, also along the 202 and Elliot Road, I can attest to the fact that we have a diverse range of households with varying income levels, including homes valued between \$500,000 and \$1,000,000 near the proposed development site. Therefore, I believe that the data indicating insufficient income may be outdated and does not accurately reflect the current economic landscape of our community. In the area south of Dobbins there has been an influx of individuals that are earning incomes higher than what is considered "middle class" (In Maricopa County \$51,015 - \$153,046 is the range according to Nov 22nd, 2023, article "Are you middle class in Arizona? Here's what the middle, top 10%, and top 1% makes" From Azcentral.com).

Furthermore, I would like to express our desire for retail shops and restaurants that truly benefit our community and contribute to the growth and prosperity of Laveen. A smaller-scale version of the popular local shopping center, Tempe Marketplace, would be an ideal addition to our neighborhood, providing residents with convenient access to amenities and fostering a sense of community engagement.

I am concerned about the potential economic impact of establishing a car dealership on the proposed lot. While it is true that car dealerships generate significant tax revenue, I am troubled by the fact that these tax dollars may not be reinvested back into Laveen but rather directed towards other areas of the city.

Large dealerships are becoming less of a trend as companies such as Tesla are pushing for a direct-to-consumer approach. The applicant proposed a 5-story facility that can be shared, but it appears to be a large parking garage. While searching for my last vehicle I found car manufacturers and dealerships building smaller store fronts to create a “luxury” experience while storing cars off site. I’d prefer not to have a large 5-story car storage facility in my backyard.

Lastly, the proposed development plans for transition from the surrounding single family residential lots to high density residential. While housing is continually needed, the infrastructure and city services are not available in the area. The applicant provided estimated traffic numbers and proposed road improvements, but when asked about how they were calculated they did not provide a clear answer, as they referred to a MAG equation which they stated the City of Phoenix accepted. Upon further research the latest publicly available MAG study in the South Mountain area was completed in December 2020 (Laveen South Mountain Transportation Study). This study had a southern border of W Elliot Rd, which is well north of the currently proposed project. With the proposed rezoning to high density comes a need for City Services such as Police & Fire. Laveen currently does not have a Police substation anywhere in the village, plus Phoenix Police is still short almost 500 officers on the force. Again, a large concern for the surrounding area, especially with the current challenges at the corner of S. 51st Ave & W. Baseline Rd.

In conclusion, I have been a homeowner in the South Mountain & Laveen area for over 14 years and I want to emphasize that my opposition to the proposed zoning changes stems from a genuine concern for the well-being and prosperity of our community. I am open to dialogue and compromise, and I believe that together, we can find a solution that balances the needs of development with the preservation of our neighborhood's character and quality of life.

Thank you for considering my perspective on this matter. I look forward to hearing your thoughts and working together towards a mutually beneficial outcome.

Sincerely,

Robert Chappell
623-628-7208
5118 W Sweet Pea Terrace
Laveen Village, AZ 85339

Sarah Stockham

From: Jen Leitch <jen.leitch@hotmail.com>
Sent: Monday, March 4, 2024 8:15 PM
To: Nayeli Sanchez Luna; PDD Laveen VPC
Subject: GPA-LV-3-22-8 (General Plan Amendment) and Z-53-22-8 (Zoning)

Follow Up Flag: Follow up
Flag Status: Flagged

Hello and wishing you a pleasant day or evening,

I am writing to express my strong opposition to GPA-LV-3-22-8 (General Plan Amendment) and Z-53-22-8 (Zoning). I have had a chance to look over the plan and the site and I truly believe this is the wrong development for that site. There are places further north on the 202 where this development would be appropriate, but this is a very sensitive area right near Laveen's best feature - South Mountain Park. I love this area and I love it's proximity to the park. I ask you where near South Mountain Park or any other large mountain park there is a development like this. There isn't - because people naturally understand that there needs to be a buffer between a heavy use space like an auto mall and a park recreation space. I know that the developer is dangling all types of other goodies in front of the committee - hospital, resort, etc. But these are all "maybes". The "for sure" seems to be an auto mall. This will negatively impact the park, its dark skies, and the movement of wild animals. The same is true of a 15 story hospital. The reason all this height is being proposed is that the site is too small to accommodate both uses without the height. Please don't lessen the beauty of Laveen and South Mountain park by allowing this site to be overbuilt because the developer wants an auto mall. Laveen does not need or want an auto mall and your job is to represent the interests of the community. There are plenty of other uses for this site that would a better transition from city to park and preserve the views, dark skies and sense of peace currently experienced by the folks using the park and would enhance the ability of Laveen's residents to enjoy this area.

I am also opposed to the three billboards for the same reason.

Finally I am very concerned about the impact on Carver Road between 51st and 35 Aves. I do not see that this road can be safely widened due to the canal and electrical lines. A high volume of traffic here is sure to increase accidents.

Please encourage this development in an area further north. I could support this development in Laveen if it were not in this location.

Thank you for your time!

Jen Leitch
602-525-9912

Nayeli Sanchez Luna

From: Gina Abbott <abbogina0@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, March 15, 2024 4:14 PM
To: Nayeli Sanchez Luna; PDD Laveen VPC
Subject: LVPC Meeting

Dear Ms Luna and all Concerned,

I oppose GPA-LV-3-22-8 (General Plan Amendment) and Z-53-22-8 (Zoning) as currently proposed.

Like most of my neighbors, I do not want to see tall buildings i.e: parking garages, a hospital and more apartments that are currently proposed, blocking our beautiful views of the mountains. However, I am ok with a hospital that is two or three floors tall. It can be built as two separate buildings if they want it to be a full operational hospital. There is plenty of room for that. I also very much oppose the auto mall. Like LPC Vice chair Stephanie Hurd suggested, I would like to see some nice sit down restaurants and maybe a Costco instead. I am not against developing our area, I would just like it to benefit all of us.

I attended the LVPC meeting last month and I agree with madam chair, when she said she would like to see an assisted living place built in Laveen. We too, have a family member who will be needing assisted living in the future and all the places now are so far away. It will be difficult visiting them and caring for them.

I am asking you to please oppose the two plans as they are proposed right now and let's all work towards a compromise! Let's preserve the Rural atmosphere in Laveen! That is why I moved here.

Thank you!

Regina Abbott
3832 W Fox Road
Laveen AZ 85339