

**Phoenix City Council  
Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee  
Summary Minutes  
Wednesday, October 2, 2019**

City Council Subcommittee Room  
Phoenix City Hall, Assembly Rooms A, B and C  
200 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona

Subcommittee Members Present

Councilwoman Thelda Williams, Chair  
Councilwoman Debra Stark  
Councilwoman Laura Pastor  
Councilwoman Betty Guardado

Subcommittee Members Absent

**Call to Order**

Chairwoman Williams called the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee to order at 9:00 a.m. with Councilmembers Stark and Guardado present.

**Call to the Public**

None.

**1. For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee Meeting on Sept. 4, 2019**

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve the minutes of the Sept. 4, 2019 Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee. Councilwoman Guardado seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 3-0.

Items 2-6 were for consent action. No presentations were planned but staff was available to answer questions.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve consent items 2-6. Councilwoman Guardado seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 3-0.

**2. Authorization to Amend Lease to Extend Term for the Transit Center and Park-and-Ride at Metrocenter Mall**

**3. Acquisition of Real Property for South Central Extension/Downtown Hub (SCE/DH) and Northwest Phase II (NWEII) Light Rail Extension Projects**

**4. Pedestrian Safety Improvements**

**5. Planning, Zoning, Plan Review, Permitting and Inspections Application – Shape PHX Contact Award**

## **6. Air National Guard Joint Use Agreement**

## **7. Metro, Regional Public Transportation Authority, and Maricopa Association of Government Meetings**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

## **8. Citizens Transportation Commission Meetings**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

## **9. Freeway Program Update**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

Councilwoman Pastor joined the meeting.

## **10. South Central Extension/Downtown Hub Project Funding Agreement Amendment**

## **11. Northwest Extension Phase II Funding, Design, and Construction Agreement Amendment**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Light Rail Administrator Markus Coleman to present on items 10 and 11. Mr. Coleman stated that due to Valley Metro Rail (VMR) managing the design and construction contracts for both the South Central Extension/Downtown Hub (SCE/DH) and the Northwest Extension Phase II (NWEII) projects, the funding agreements will continue to be amended as the projects meet milestones.

Mr. Coleman provided an overview of the SCE/DH project which extends the light rail five-and-a-half-miles south from Jefferson Street to Baseline Road. This route will include: nine passenger stations, two park-and-rides, five traction power substations (TPSS) and two signal buildings. One of the park-and-ride stations will be located at the Ed Pastor Transit Center and the other will be built on the northwest corner of Central Avenue and Baseline Road.

Mr. Coleman continued by sharing the unique features of the Downtown Hub, which includes creating a two-line center to simplify transferring from the north/south line to east/west line. Construction is planned to start in October 2019.

Mr. Coleman then provided an overview of the NWEII project. This project is a one-and-a-half-mile extension from 19th Avenue and Dunlap Avenue with two bridges crossing the I-17 to end at Metrocenter Mall. This route will include: three passenger stations, one park-and-ride facility, two TPSS, one signal building and a Metrocenter Bus Transit Center.

Chairwoman Williams asked if there would be artwork incorporated into the bridges. Mr. Coleman responded there would be art on the bridges and in the stations.

Mr. Coleman shared the transit center on the west side of the mall will be relocated to the new rail line to create a transit hub for both bus and rail that has its own parking structure. Chairwoman Williams questioned whether riders will have to pay for parking. Mr. Coleman responded that parking will be free.

Mr. Coleman emphasized this will be the first elevated platform within the City which will allow for future expansion in either direction. Construction is targeted to start in 2020 and be completed in 2024.

Chairwoman Williams asked if pedestrians would be able to use the bridge. Mr. Coleman responded that currently pedestrians would not have access to the bridge, but they are working with VMR to see whether there is any way this can be incorporated into the design.

Mr. Coleman requested that the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee recommend approval to the City Council an amendment to the current funding agreement with VMR for an additional amount not-to-exceed \$159 million for the SCE/DH project and \$79.4 million for the NEWII project to fund continued progress toward final design and construction activities.

Councilwoman Pastor questioned what is being done about people on the platform who do not have a ticket and requested that as the development continues, staff considers how this can be managed. She requested the City and Valley Metro look into installing physical barriers at light rail platforms to ensure only those with paid fare can proceed into the stations.

Councilwoman Guardado inquired about security as she is concerned about bridge safety. Mr. Coleman responded that security has been a priority with a focus on the end of lines, platforms and parking areas.

Chairwoman Williams asked that the parking structure be well-lit inside and on the perimeter. Councilwoman Pastor followed-up by asking if there is a technology that will only allow those who have fare tickets to enter the parking structure. Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua said they could investigate this type of technology.

Regarding the SCE/DH project, Councilwoman Pastor inquired if the City has started communicating with residents about construction starting in October 2019. Mr. Coleman responded that communication has already started, and they have hosted four public meetings, distributed flyers, installed signage and conducted door-to-door canvassing.

Councilwoman Pastor made a motion to approve both items 10 and 11. Councilwoman Guardado seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

## **12. City Code Amendment Related to Commercial Ground Transportation Trip Fees, Parking Rate Cap, and Unattended Vehicle Civil Penalties**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Aviation Director James Bennett to present on requested amendments to the City Code, including: changes to the commercial ground transportation fee schedule, adjustments to the parking rate cap and increases to unattended vehicle sanctions. Mr. Bennett shared these recommendations were unanimously approved by the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board.

Mr. Bennett explained the airlines, air service providers, rental car companies, parking, shops, restaurants and ground transportation providers all pay cost recovery fees to utilize airport facilities. The revenue from these activities allows the airport to be self-sustaining, invest in its facilities, meet its bond holder conveyance and to support the Phoenix economy. If adopted, these recommendations will begin to eliminate subsidies provided to the commercial ground transportation industry.

Mr. Bennett introduced Deputy Aviation Director of Planning and Environmental Jordan Feld and Deputy Aviation Director of Finance Jay DeWitt. Mr. Feld shared that currently ground transportation revenue only covers one-third of ground transportation costs. After conducting a peer-airport fee review, they found the biggest discrepancy was in Transportation Network Company (TNC) fees.

The Aviation Department utilized a stakeholder collaboration process to determine the new fee schedule. Key points that emerged from this process included: an implementation partnership, remote pick-up/drop-off incentive, fee predictability, fair curb-share, TNC modernization and TNC fee phase-in. Mr. Feld emphasized that agreements with stakeholders not included in the code update would be formally communicated through a written letter from the Aviation Director.

Mr. Feld shared that TNC fees would start at \$4.00 in 2020 and incrementally rise to \$5.00 by 2024. There would also be a 30 percent reduction in fees for remote pick-up and drop-off, as well as the implementation of enhanced signage and technology.

Councilwoman Stark asked for clarification regarding the purpose of TNC fees. Mr. Feld clarified that they would incentivize travelers to use other methods of transportation outside of the terminal roadways to reduce congestion.

Chairwoman Williams inquired about how soon the 24th Street Station will be available via Sky Train. Mr. Bennett responded it will become operational in the second quarter of 2022.

Councilwoman Guardado asked for clarification on how the presented rates were established. Mr. Feld explained the Aviation Department evaluated the cost of ground transportation and what was needed for cost-recovery. Mr. DeWitt supplemented this by explaining that quantitative and qualitative measures were used, such as the amount of curb space, public safety resources, staff resources and technology, to determine the rates presented.

Mr. Feld continued to share the proposed non-TNC's fee schedule. In 2020, these fees would range from \$1.75 to \$5.00 depending on the passenger size of the vehicles and would increase by three percent or the consumer price index (CPI) annually. The non-TNCs would also receive a 30 percent reduction in fees for remote pick-up and drop-off.

Next, Mr. Feld recommended an increase in the rate cap, an increase in the cap annually and the ability to provide a flat rate for parking. He also recommended an increase in fees for owner and operator liable for civil sanctions to \$250 and unattended vehicle is deemed a nuisance to \$500.

Chairwoman Williams asked if this was the maximum the City could charge for an abandoned vehicle. Mr. Feld responded yes, however added that this would allow the airport to deem an abandoned vehicle a nuisance and have it immediately towed.

Mr. Feld requested that the Subcommittee recommend to Council that the City Code be amended to: increase commercial ground transportation trip fees and parking rate caps consistent with market and industry norms, establish future amendment processes for trip fee and rate cap setting, clarify short-term parking rates and increase civil penalties for vehicles left unattended on the curb of any terminal.

Chair of the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board Leezie Kim spoke in support of the recommendations.

Piper Overstreet with Uber spoke in opposition to the recommended TNC fees.

George Kivork with Lyft spoke in opposition to the recommended TNC fees and requested the agreement letter for non-code items be provided before the code is amended.

Joe Dibazar, owner of Yellow Cab AZ, spoke in support of this recommendation.

Claude Mattox spoke in support of staff's recommendation.

Patrick Barrett with HighGround Public Affairs, representing the Fair Fees Coalition which consists of off-site parking providers, spoke in support.

Chris Nickle, Gregory Torrez and Bryan Amarel were present and in favor of the recommendations.

In response to public comments, Councilwoman Pastor asked if Mr. Bennett could speak to the agreement letter for non-code items and when it would be sent. Mr. Bennett clarified that if Council chooses to amend the code, the agreement letter would then be sent. Councilwoman Guardado followed-up by asking if there is a letter explaining this process. Mr. Feld explained that these agreements are documented in the meeting minutes, as well as in emails with stakeholders.

Councilwoman Pastor also asked if staff could clarify how the fee setting process and information was communicated with stakeholders. Mr. Feld explained this process

started in November 2018 and included a number of stakeholder meetings. In July, when the study concluded, staff shared the proposed fee schedule with all ground transportation stakeholders. The only change since August was an update to the fee table which was shared with all stakeholders as quickly as possible.

Councilwoman Stark asked for clarification about what percentage of ground transportation costs the TNCs would pay. Mr. Feld explained that most peer airports have higher fees for TNCs due to the heightened demands they put on the airports.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if staff could confirm that the benchmarking analysis was used to determine fees. Mr. Bennett explained the benchmarking analysis was used to see how Phoenix Sky Harbor fees compare to peer airports. This information showed that Phoenix Sky Harbor is below average and encouraged the team to determine new fees. Once the fees were determined, the benchmarking was used to ensure the new rates were reasonable.

Councilwoman Pastor requested Mr. Bennett provide an explanation on how TNCs came to the airport. Mr. Bennett explained that in 2016, before the TNC model was introduced, taxi companies had to participate in a competitive process to be authorized to conduct business, so the fair market value of utilizing the airport was determined. The introduction of TNCs eliminated this process and resulted in the Council rewriting the code to change the fee structure. Within this code update, it was required that a benchmarking study be completed and implemented prior to Jan. 1, 2020.

Councilwoman Stark asked if in the benchmarking analysis, airports with similar transportation modes were used. Mr. Feld confirmed airports with similar transportation modes and usage were used.

Chairwoman Williams questioned why the rate cap was originally implemented. Mr. Bennett responded that he cannot speak to why, however there is not a technical need for a cap as accessing the airport is a competitive market. As the operator of airport parking, Phoenix Sky Harbor is not going to price itself out of the market as it is a major revenue source. Mr. Bennett shared that currently Phoenix Sky Harbor does not charge up to the current cap.

Councilwoman Guardado made a motion to approve the item. Councilwoman Pastor requested that a letter be sent to the stakeholders outlining what was approved. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

### **13. Water Services Department Drought Resiliency Infrastructure Program Update**

Water Services Director Kathryn Sorensen introduced Assistant Water Services Director Troy Hayes and Deputy Water Services Director Darlene Helm to provide an update on the Drought Resiliency Infrastructure Program.

Ms. Helm began by providing an overview of the City's water supply. She shared that 50 percent comes from the Salt and Verde Rivers, 47 percent comes from the Colorado

River and 3 percent is from local groundwater. North Phoenix's water supply is dependent on the Colorado River. Ms. Helms explained to build resiliency in our water system, we are building infrastructure to move local water supplies north during Colorado River shortages.

Implementing this infrastructure requires three projects. Project one involves installing a 66" transmission main and replacing a 48" transition main from the 24th Street Water Treatment Plant (WTP) from January 2020 to fall 2022. Project two involves an extension of the 66" pipeline from 32nd Street and 31st Street from Shea Boulevard to Bell Road from fall 2020 to fall 2022. Project three involves removing a 36" main and replacing it with a 42" pipeline on 35th Avenue from Thunderbird Road to Grovers Avenue from fall 2020 to fall 2022.

The Water Services Department is also working on four booster stations at the 24th Street WTP, Deer Valley WTP, Central and Deer Valley Road, and 32nd Street and Bell Road. These stations will move water north. Construction will run from fall 2020 to fall 2022.

Ms. Helm explained due to the significance of this program and its impact to the community, there has been a large public outreach effort. Some of these efforts include: mailings, project hotline phone number and email, door hangers, signage, e-newsletters and the capital improvement website. Her team has also met with staff from schools in the project areas and presented to the Phoenix Sonoran Preserve and Mountain Parks / Preserve Committee. In the upcoming weeks, they are meeting with the Phoenix Mountains Preservation Council and hosting a public meeting.

Councilwoman Stark suggested the Water Services Department partner with the Street Transportation Department to represent their infrastructure projects at upcoming GAIN events.

### **Call to the Public**

None.

### **Future Agenda Items**

None.

### **Adjournment**

Chairwoman Williams adjourned the meeting at 10:30 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,  
Jennifer Hackelman  
Management Intern

PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL  
 Transportation, Infrastructure & Innovation Subcommittee  
 Wednesday, October 2, 2019  
 Assembly Rooms A, B, C  
**PLEASE SIGN-IN**

	Name	Title	Department / Organization
1.	Charles Regalado	Asst Aviation Dir	Aviation
2.	Angela D'Amico	Asst Aviation Dir	Aviation
3.	Pearl Meza	ASST	AVN
4.	Dana Lopez	MSA	WSP
5.	Chris Ewell	Deputy Dir	STC
6.	Tom Sawyer	AVN Intern	AVN
7.	Kim Brown	ANN operations	AVN
8.	Mike O'Shughely	ANN operations	AVN
9.	Mike Hutchins	VP of Public Affairs	GPC
10.	Heather Howard	WAF	GWJ
11.	Shannon Telle	Technology Manager	PDD
12.	Melanie Hawks	IT PM - PDD	PDD
13.	Christina Jimadi	Sr Director - Gannett	Gannett
14.	Robert Kidd	Associate Director	Gannett
15.	Lezue Kim	Board Member	Aviation Board
16.	Tracy Moraca	Director	Brown and Caldwell
17.	Elizabeth Atkinson	Sr. Cons. <del>Staff</del>	Gannett
18.	DAVE Goss	AZTEC Eng. PM	AZTEC Eng.
19.	Ryndie C. Agee	Prop. Specialist	City of Phx.
20.	Joe Dibrager	Ann	Arizona
21.	Van means	Dir	AAA Tucson
22.	Felicita Mendoza		WSD
23.	JESUS SANCHEZ	PTO DIRECTOR	PTD
24.	Piper Christman	User Tech	Pally

Chris Hinkle ~~EUT~~ EUT  
 M. Carley



PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL  
 Transportation, Infrastructure & Innovation Subcommittee  
 Wednesday, October 2, 2019  
 Assembly Rooms A, B, C  
PLEASE SIGN-IN

	Name	Title	Department / Organization
25.	TIM McBRIDE	Spec. Proj. Admin.	COP - FLOW
26.	DAN CLEVENBERG	DEPUTY DIRECTOR - CORRIDOR DEVELOPMENT	VALLEY METRO
27.	Darlene Helm	Deputy Water Services Dir.	WSD
28.	Clayton Froed	Civil Eng. 3	WSP
29.	ALAN GILBERTSON	C.M.	SUPERINTENDENT
30.	OCARINA AULIA	PROD. Dep. Director	PRD
31.	Maureen Mahoney		
32.	Julie Padgett	<del>CORPORATE</del> DIR. AV. DIV.	COPAVN
33.	BRYAN ANAGIEL	OPERATIONS MANAGER	HENSEL PHELPS
34.	Chris Garcia	Business Development Mgr.	Uber
35.	Joe Bohar	COP Public Involvement	Deputy Director
36.	Joel Waggoner	Account Supervisor	Aviation COP
37.	Shaun Rieve	Associate Director	Vasidus / Uber
38.	Lauren Kile	<del>S.P.A.</del>	Tricollucator
39.	George Kwikke	<del>top of</del> Public Policy	lyft
40.	Ken Kessler	Deputy Director	OPTD
41.	Sophiane Cherry	HAAS	3 COP STR
42.	KIMI FURUSON	DIRECTOR	
43.	Pat Barnett	Account Exec	High Ground
44.	CAROLAN R-TANIZ	PROD. MGR.	TRANE
45.			
46.			
47.			