

## **Attachment A**

### **Phoenix City Council Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee Summary Minutes Wednesday, Jan. 6, 2021**

City Council Chambers  
200 W. Jefferson St.  
Phoenix, Ariz.

#### **Subcommittee Members Present**

Councilwoman Thelda Williams, Chair  
Councilwoman Debra Stark  
Councilwoman Laura Pastor  
Vice Mayor Betty Guardado

#### **Subcommittee Members Absent**

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairwoman Williams called the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee to order at 9:02 a.m. with Vice Mayor Guardado and Councilwomen Pastor and Stark present.

#### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

None.

#### **MINUTES OF MEETINGS**

##### **1. For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee Meeting on Dec. 2, 2020**

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve the minutes of the Dec. 2, 2020 Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

Items 2-7 were for consent action. No presentations were planned, but staff was available to answer questions.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve consent items 2-7. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

#### **CONSENT ACTION (ITEMS 2-7)**

##### **2. Airport Luggage Cart Service - Request to Issue Revenue Contract Solicitation**

##### **3. April 2021 Proposed Bus Service Improvements**

- 4. Transportation 2050 Five-Year Pavement Maintenance Program Update**
- 5. Transportation 2050 New and Expanded Major Streets Program Update**
- 6. Transportation 2050 Mobility Improvements Program Update**
- 7. Transportation 2050 Streets Technology Enhancements Five-Year Program Update**

#### **INFORMATION ONLY (ITEMS 8-10)**

**8. Metro, Regional Public Transportation Authority, and Maricopa Association of Governments Meetings**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

**9. Citizens Transportation Commission Meetings**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

**10. 2020 ACEEE City Clean Energy Scorecard Ranking**

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

#### **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 11)**

**11. Airport Concessions Relief - Consideration of Contract Term Extensions**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua explained this item would deal with contract terms and requests for extensions. He introduced Interim Aviation Director Charlene Reynolds to present on Airport Concessions Relief and the Consideration of Contract Term Extensions.

Ms. Reynolds began by explaining staff had received a request for contract term extensions of three years from Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport's Airport Concession Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (ACDBE) partners. She provided an overview of the Prime Operator Model, explaining primes operated most locations and would enter joint venture partnerships or sublease to local small businesses to meet ACDBE goals.

Ms. Reynolds discussed the capital investment and outstanding debt for concessions in Terminals 3 and 4. She explained the next steps would be further discussion regarding legal issues related to contract extensions at the Jan. 12, 2021 Executive Session of the City Council.

Vice Mayor Guardado asked when the leases in Terminal 3 would expire.

Ms. Reynolds explained that contracts for Terminal 3 food and beverage concessions were relatively new and would expire in 2030, with contract terms of 10 years.

Vice Mayor Guardado recalled the federal Coronavirus Response and Relief Supplemental provided additional economic relief for airports and concession, and that the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) established the Coronavirus Response Grant. She asked how much money would be coming to Phoenix.

Ms. Reynolds stated staff and consultants for the Aviation Department would be reviewing the bill and that nationally \$2 billion was estimated for airport relief, which included an estimated \$200 million for airport concessions relief. Charlene stated that for Phoenix additional concessions relief was estimated to be in the \$1 to 2 million range. She mentioned this was a small percentage of the original amount requested from airport concessions associations.

Vice Mayor Guardado asked if concessions companies that had asked for contract extensions would be eligible for economic relief under those programs.

Ms. Reynolds stated all airports that had provided rent relief would receive the funding and must pass it on to concession partners. She further explained staff anticipated receiving guidance from the FAA in a few weeks and the funds would have to be applied to a large pool of partners including terminal concessions, advertising, car rental, and parking concessions.

Councilwoman Pastor requested clarification on Capital Investment and Debt profiles that reflected as "No Data Reported" for Outstanding Debt.

Ms. Reynolds explained staff had requested information from the companies prior to the holidays and advised them of a deadline of Jan. 5, 2021 at 10 a.m. She explained that "No Data Reported" meant that the company did not meet the deadline and offered to send additional information she receives to the councilmembers.

Councilwoman Pastor referred to Casa Unlimited, which was listed with no ACDBE partners and "No Data Reported" for Outstanding ACDBE Debt. She asked if this meant there was no debt.

Ms. Reynolds stated Joya Kizer was the 100 percent ACDBE partner, with no additional partners. She explained her capital investment was \$1.6 million and staff did not have the amount of outstanding debt.

Councilwoman Pastor requested additional clarification about In Motion Entertainment and Xpres Spa.

Ms. Reynolds explained In Motion Entertainment was the prime concessionaire whose ACDBE partner was Joya Kizer, reporting \$48,000 of the outstanding debt. She further explained Xpres Spa was a prime concessionaire, with Joya Kizer as the partner, and no reported debt. She confirmed that staff had verified the information with the partners.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if the City had contracts with the primes and if the ACDBE partners were dependent on those primes.

Ms. Reynolds confirmed the City held contracts with the prime concessionaires, who established separate contractual relationships with their ACDBE and small business partners.

Councilwoman Pastor explained she had been hearing extensions would be needed for ACDBE businesses to refinance and wanted to know if the primes had plans to help their ACDBE partners in the process.

Ms. Reynolds stated the prime concessionaires requested an extension on the behalf of their ACDBE partners. She stated staff could request information from the primes about assisting their partners.

Councilwoman Pastor confirmed that she would like to pursue that course of action.

Chairwoman Williams suggested it could be discussed at the next Executive Session meeting.

Vice Mayor Guardado requested a comparison of prior year numbers from 2014 onward, as well as the monthly reports showing the performance of businesses who benefitted from rent relief. She explained she would need these numbers to make her decision on rent relief and extensions.

Mr. Paniagua stated he had received a request for comparison of prior year numbers and staff is working to pull it together and would deliver it to members of the subcommittee once it is available. Ms. Reynolds committed to providing the weekly reports, which have been in arrears, as well as data to compare numbers prior to 2019.

Chairwoman Williams asked if staff could review businesses' debt relative to construction.

Ms. Reynolds stated staff could conduct a review to compare investment and outstanding debt. She explained there was \$30 million in investment in Terminal 3 and several concepts had closed just after opening.

Councilwoman Pastor asked for an update on health insurance for concessions employees.

Ms. Reynolds stated she would reach out to all prime concessionaires regarding employee health coverage and follow up with the subcommittee.

Chairwoman Williams thanked the concessionaires who submitted financial information.

Chairwoman Williams opened the floor for public comment.

Tracy Gunderson, who had worked as a server for HMSHost, thanked members of the subcommittee for their support at the last City Council meeting and advocated for recall rights and immediate coverage of health coverage upon return to work. Ms. Gunderson spoke about her experience of age discrimination in the workplace and the complaints she had filed with the U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) and the Equal Opportunity Department. She reiterated her prior requests to not grant HMSHost any additional relief and an extension.

Debra Rutkowski stated she had worked for HMSHost as a bartender for 13 years and spoke about her experience of age discrimination by her supervisors at Blanco Taco. She reiterated her request that the City investigate this issue.

Janelle Weaver stated she had worked as a server for HMSHost for more than 25 years and recounted her experience of age discrimination by her supervisors. She reiterated her request for an investigation and advocated that the City not grant an extension or further relief to HMSHost.

Vivien Lavelly expressed her gratitude to the subcommittee members for listening to the grievances of HMSHost employees. Ms. Lavelly spoke in support of the women who filed an EEOC complaint against the company and requested that their request for a contract extension not be considered until an investigation is completed.

Cheryl Grant stated she had worked for HMSHost for more than 19 years and spoke of her experience of age discrimination by her supervisors. Ms. Grant advocated for a full investigation and spoke in opposition to a contract extension for the company.

Hiwet Kidane shared that she had worked for HMSHost for 14 years and stressed the need for access to health insurance.

Carmen Quintana, assisted by an interpreter, stated she that she worked for HMSHost for 33 years and expressed her need for health insurance.

Lieryn Jacobs, representing SSP America, expressed the company's gratitude for financial relief provided by the City.

Chairwoman Williams asked staff to provide an update on the investigation prior to upcoming Executive Session.

Mr. Paniagua stated he would provide an update from the Equal Opportunity Department on the status of the investigation.

Vice Mayor Guardado requested a briefing on the investigative process and following up on complaints. She thanked the members of the public who shared their experiences and SSP America for being available to answer questions.

Councilwoman Stark requested a briefing on the investigative process. She asked if the airport would receive the rent relief CARES funding.

Ms. Reynolds confirmed the funding would be distributed to airports, not the primes or ACDBE partners. She explained staff would follow FAA guidelines for passing on relief.

Councilwoman Stark asked if the funds were still being analyzed.

Ms. Reynolds stated staff awaited guidance and final interpretations of the legislation from consultants as well as national airport advisory councils and other groups.

Councilwoman Stark requested staff to report back to the subcommittee once the analysis is complete.

Chairwoman Williams stated the item would go to Executive Session on Jan. 12, 2021 and expressed her belief that it should go to the full City Council for a final decision to ensure ACDBE companies are not left in turmoil. She acknowledged the complexity and difficulties in understanding the different groups but stressed the importance of providing relief to concessions operators and giving them the opportunity to get out of debt.

Chairwoman Williams asked Vice Mayor Guardado if she was satisfied that the item would be going to Executive Session.

Vice Mayor Guardado confirmed she was satisfied with the decision because she had many questions and stated it would help her make an informed decision.

Councilwoman Pastor requested clarification that this item would not return to the subcommittee.

Chairwoman Williams confirmed the item would go to Executive Session, then the full City Council, and would not return to the subcommittee.

## **INFORMATION AND DISCUSSION (ITEMS 12-14)**

### **12. Freeway Program Update**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Freeway Coordination Manager Tom Remes to present a Freeway Program Update.

Mr. Remes began by highlighting key freeway projects, including the widening of Arizona State Route 101 (Loop 101) from the Interstate 17 (I-17) to 75th Avenue, widening Interstate 10 (I-10) from the I-17 interchange to 19th Avenue, and repairs to the I-10 Deck Park Tunnel in partnership with the Parks and Recreation Department.

Mr. Remes discussed the projects along I-17 at Pinnacle Peak and Happy Valley Roads, which include a new bridge and improved bicycle and pedestrian amenities on Pinnacle Peak Road, as well as a new diverging diamond interchange and bridge artwork at Happy Valley Road.

Mr. Remes explained Loop 101 was in the process of being widened from I-17 to Pima Road by adding one general purpose lane and auxiliary lanes in each direction. He stated other improvements included new sound walls and quiet pavement. He shared that work had progressed quickly because of decreased traffic due to the pandemic and that the project would be on schedule for completion in mid-2021.

Mr. Remes discussed drainage work on the I-17 frontage road between Peoria and Greenway Roads. He explained work on Peoria Road was nearing completion and would begin at Cactus Road, replacing old pump stations that drain water into the Arizona Canal.

Mr. Remes spoke about the I-17 bridge reconstruction at Central Avenue. He explained the bridge was more than 50 years old and had to be replaced to accommodate the South Central Light Rail extension. He stated staff was working closely with Valley Metro Rail to coordinate closures and the reconstruction was scheduled for completion in Fall 2021.

Mr. Remes discussed the temporary hold at the 30 percent design stage on the I-17 Indian School Road interchange project. He stated the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) had completed their environmental study and the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) was conducting a bottleneck study to look at Indian School Road as a corridor for various modes of transportation. He explained MAG requested that ADOT conduct additional community meetings and construction would not start until 2022.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if bus rapid transit (BRT) could be considered as an option for Indian School Road since MAG was completing their bottleneck study about various transportation modes there.

Mr. Remes stated he would work with Public Transit staff to look at the option and report back to the councilwoman.

Chairwoman Williams expressed her support for Councilwoman Pastor's suggestion.

Mr. Remes discussed improvements to the Broadway Curve, the I-10 near Broadway Road and State Route 143 (SR-143) by the Phoenix-Tempe border, scheduled to begin in Fall 2021. He explained traffic on the Broadway Curve exceeded 250,000 vehicles per day and it would be the longest construction project in the region. He stated the improvements included two high occupancy vehicle (HOV) lanes, six general purpose

lanes, auxiliary lanes, improved connections to U.S. Route 60 (U.S. 60) and SR-143, and improved arterial preemption devices and signals. He stated ADOT shared their preferred proposer would be Pulice/FNF/Flatiron and City communications staff would assist with outreach.

Mr. Remes presented a new study of the area at the intersection of U.S. 60, 35th Avenue, and Indian School Road. He explained the study would propose improvements to the corridor, consider multimodal connectivity, and review the interaction with BSNF Railway. He stated the Better Utilizing Investments to Leverage Development (BUILD) Grant awarded to the Street Transportation Department would be applied to enhance safety and pedestrian elements in this area.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if MAG would participate in the study.

Mr. Remes confirmed that MAG would assist with funding and coordination.

Councilwoman Pastor requested MAG do a study on how to monitor activities at the homeless encampment in the area and propose proactive measure that can be taken to help those in need.

Mr. Remes stated he would submit the request to MAG and ask that it be included in their Continuum of Care considerations.

Mr. Remes concluded his presentation by discussing a new ADOT study underway at State Route 303 (Loop 303) from I-17 to Lake Pleasant Parkway. He explained the study was initiated in anticipation of the Taiwan Semiconductor facility development and would be completed in Fall 2021.

Councilwoman Stark stated she was excited to see the drainage problems would be mitigated along I-17.

### **13. (CONTINUED FROM DEC. 2, 2020) Pedestrian and Bicycle Safety Programs**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Street Transportation Director Kini Knudson and Assistant Street Transportation Director Briiana Velez to present on Pedestrian and Bicycle Safety Programs.

Mr. Knudson began by providing background information on the initial request from the subcommittee and explained the presentation would cover the Office of Pedestrian Safety, Capital Improvement Program, Implementation Pedestrian Safety Tools, the Active Transportation Program, and the Shared Streets for Social Distancing Pilot.

Mr. Knudson presented data on national pedestrian fatalities in the last 10 years, which demonstrated an increasing trend nationwide and in Phoenix, which had its highest



number of pedestrian fatalities in 2018. He explained staff had focused heavily on education and preliminary numbers comparing 2019 and 2020 reflected a decline in fatalities. He noted that the decrease in 2020 could be due to the pandemic and shared that staff would have a better understanding once the data is finalized.

Mr. Knudson also presented unofficial data for pedestrian fatalities from January to August of 2019 compared to the same months in 2020, which showed a 36 percent decrease. He explained that when he added the months of September and October to the 2019 and 2020 data, the reduction diminished to an 18 percent decrease in pedestrian fatalities.

Mr. Knudson shared the characteristics of the pedestrian fatalities and explained that most of them had happened on arterial roadways, many during dark or dusk hours and within 500 feet of a signalized crossing. He also mentioned more than half of the pedestrians had crossed midblock, and one-fourth of them were victims of hit and run drivers.

Ms. Velez presented a map identifying hot spots for pedestrian fatalities throughout the City and explained the department had developed it to help inform decisions on pedestrian safety improvements. She added that the map, broken down by council district, helped to prioritize funding, apply for grants, work with stakeholders, work with right-of-way inspectors, target education and outreach, and determine appropriate pedestrian safety tools.

Ms. Velez discussed improvement projects along the 35th Avenue corridor from Interstate 10 to Camelback Road, which would be supported by a \$17.5 million BUILD grant received from the US Department of Transportation. She explained the grant would help to advance safety, mobility, and economic development in the area, and projects included the installation of three new High-Intensity Activated Crosswalk (HAWK) signals, new and upgraded street lighting, new medians, and updated traffic signals.

Ms. Velez discussed additional spot improvements, such as high visibility crosswalk upgrades at 85 locations across the City, which include line style crosswalks, yield markings, new signs, and ADA ramp upgrades. She stated that work orders could be submitted if any new locations were identified.

Ms. Velez highlighted the installation of 66 new HAWK signals Citywide, including 17 installed in fiscal year 2020. She explained the signals were installed in hotspot areas, as well as in the vicinity of schools outside of those areas. She explained new signals would be designed in one fiscal year and installed the following fiscal year, starting in 2020.

Ms. Velez stressed the importance of enhancing pedestrian safety through the installation of double sided streetlighting and shared examples of this at 27th Avenue,

from Bethany Home Road to Maryland Avenue, as well as Thomas Road from 26th to 32nd Streets. She also discussed median islands as important pedestrian safety measures and highlighted new medians installed at 43rd Avenue, south of Baseline Road, and on Buckeye Road, east of Sky Harbor Circle.

Ms. Velez stated there had been 50 fatal pedestrian collision locations identified in the City from January to October 2020. She shared that in that time, 17 HAWK signals and two traffic signals had been installed.

Ms. Velez stressed the importance of including all roadway users in street safety practices. She stated the accelerated pavement maintenance program would be the best opportunity to make striping improvements for bike lanes, and a public engagement process would be required. She shared that 40 miles of new bike lanes and 29 miles of buffered and narrowed bike lanes were installed in fiscal year 2020. She noted that striping improvements were based on the pavement maintenance plan, separate from the hot spot map.

Ms. Velez concluded her presentation by providing an overview of the Shared Streets for Social Distancing program, aimed at supporting outdoor exercise and promoting social distancing on neighborhood streets. She mentioned that more than 50 applications had been received and were currently under review. She explained staff would prioritize high population density, streets that were more than one mile from a park or open space, and locations with a larger number of households without parks. She stated installation would occur from February to May 2021.

Vice Mayor Guardado asked if more HAWK signals would be installed. Ms. Velez stated staff would identify more locations and construction would begin in 2022.

Vice Mayor Guardado asked how the decision would be made. Ms. Velez explained the hot spot map would be used to decide on new HAWK signal locations.

Vice Mayor Guardado requested that the councilmembers be included before decisions would be made on new HAWK locations. She discussed the need for additional signage near schools, improved lighting in cul-de-sacs and throughout Maryvale, further maintenance on street landscaping, filled potholes, more HAWKs and lighting. She also mentioned there had been issues with vehicles running into homes and wanted to find a comprehensive approach to address street safety issues.

Councilwoman Stark agreed with Vice Mayor Guardado and stated she would like to see a more comprehensive report on street safety. She expressed concerns about cars speeding in her district and referenced an accident that occurred on 7th Street and Bell Road on Dec. 21, 2020. She stated she had discussed lane widths with staff and wanted to know about street calming measures as well as any collaborative efforts with the Police Department.

Mr. Knudson expressed his appreciation of the recommendation of a comprehensive approach. He stated the Street Transportation Department often coordinates with the Traffic Bureau of the Police Department, but the group often has a high volume of investigations for all accident types and traffic fatalities.

Chairwoman Williams agreed that speeding was a major problem and appreciated the comments for a more comprehensive approach and identifying more solutions.

Councilwoman Pastor agreed and stressed the importance of communicating street improvement efforts to residents. She also requested clarification on how the Shared Streets for Social Distance program would work.

Mr. Knudson explained the application process for the Shared Streets for Social Distance program was live throughout December and the ideal street was one that might not have continuous sidewalks or access to a park. He explained the streets would be restricted to local traffic and City services with barricades to provide residents an opportunity to use the street for recreational purposes. He mentioned staff would meet with the councilmembers about applications received in their districts.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if there was an update on the reorganization of the Pedestrian Bicycle section.

Mr. Knudson stated there had been some discussion about reorganization and there was a shift in some responsibilities to ensure there was emphasis on multimodal and active transportation.

Councilwoman Stark asked if Street Transportation and Police staff could collaborate to find ways to make streets safer. She asked if staff could report back to the subcommittee in February with any progress.

Mr. Knudson stated they can return next month if it would be the desire of the subcommittee.

Councilwoman Stark expressed her support for staff exploring a comprehensive approach to street safety and returning to the subcommittee with their results.

#### **14. (CONTINUED FROM DEC. 2, 2020) Ceremonial Sign Procedure**

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Street Transportation Director Kini Knudson and Assistant Street Transportation Director Briiana Velez to present on the item.

Mr. Knudson began by providing background on the ceremonial street sign program and highlighted the Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard street sign designated on Broadway Road. He explained that this designation for Broadway Road prompted

additional requests for ceremonial street signs in the last year and caused staff to establish a procedure.

Ms. Velez provided an overview of the honoree criteria, sign types, and application process. She explained the requestor would pay for all costs and the City would fabricate, install, and maintain the signs. She added that the procedure did not pertain to the official renaming of streets, which was handled by the Planning and Development Department.

Councilwoman Stark expressed her appreciation for the opportunity to review the procedure and asked if councilmember action would be needed.

Mr. Knudson explained he was presenting the procedure for councilmembers' awareness, but councilmember approval was not part of the process.

#### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

None.

#### **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

None.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairwoman Williams adjourned the meeting at 10:56 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Adeoffer-Marie Rabusa  
Management Intern