

## ATTACHMENT D

### NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING OF THE PHOENIX HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION Meeting Final Minutes

Date: February 13, 2023  
 Time: 4:30 p.m.  
 Location: Virtual meeting via Webex

<b>Commission Members Present</b>	<b>Staff Present</b>
Dan Klocke, Chair	Kevin Weight
Dan Garcia, Vice Chair	Jodey Elsner
Tricia Amato	Bridget Collins
Richard DeUriarte	Helana Ruter
Christina Noble	Crystal Carrancho
Keely Varvel Hartsell	Cletus Montoya
	Emma Collins
	Paul Li (Assistant Chief Counsel)
<b>Commission Members Absent</b>	<b>Staff Absent</b>
Taz Khatri	
Greta Rayle	
Brenda Thomson	

<b>1.</b>	<p><b>Call meeting to order</b></p> <p>Chair Klocke verified that a quorum was established and called the meeting to order at 4:33 p.m.</p>	<b>Dan Klocke, HP Commission Chair</b>
<b>2.</b>	<p><b>Introduction of Commission Members and Staff</b></p> <p>The Commission members and HP staff made their introductions.</p>	<b>HP Commission &amp; Staff</b>
<b>3.</b>	<p><b>Review of minutes from the January 9, 2023, monthly meeting</b></p> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Approval of Minutes</p> <p>Chair Klocke asked the Commission for a motion on the January 9<sup>th</sup> minutes.</p> <p>Vice Chair Garcia made a motion to approve the minutes as submitted for the January 9, 2023, meeting.</p> <p>Commissioner Amato seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission votes, as follows:</p>	<b>HP Commission</b>

	<p>Chair Klocke – Yes  Vice Chair Garcia – Yes  Commissioner Amato – Yes  Commissioner DeUriarte – Yes  Commissioner Noble – Yes  Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 6-0.</p>	
<p>4.</p>	<p><b>Public Hearing for Application No. Z-2-22-4, HP Zoning Boundary Adjustment for Proposed PUD at the northwest corner of 11th Street and McDowell Road.</b></p> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning boundary modification</p> <p>Chair Klocke invited Kevin Weight to present this item.</p> <p>Mr. Weight presented the request for three changes at this site, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Z-2-22-4: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Base zoning change <i>From</i> R1-6, C-2, R-3A and P-1; <i>To</i> PUD</li> <li>○ Adjustment to HP zoning overlay boundary</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Z-15-22-4 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Modification to Coronado Neighborhood Conservation Plan (a.k.a. Coronado Neighborhood Special District Plan)</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Mr. Weight told the Commission members that they were being asked for a formal recommendation on the second item—the adjustment to the HP overlay—but could comment on other items if desired. He said that staff finds the modified boundary will still include the full width of each of the seven lots within the HP overlay and the primary historic building on each lot, thereby generally meeting the guidelines in Section 807.E of the Zoning Ordinance. Also, all seven properties will remain contributors to the Coronado Historic District. However, the reduction in lot size and increased proximity to much larger scale new construction will result in an adverse effect on the historic properties. To mitigate this adverse effect, HP staff recommends that perpetual easements be granted to the City on all seven historic properties. He said that staff was recommending that the approval of the boundary adjustment be subject to the following stipulation noted in the associated staff report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Perpetual conservation easements, in accordance with the requirements of the City’s Historic Preservation Office, shall be recorded on the following properties (which constitute a portion of this site): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 1622 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-014A);</li> <li>○ 1626 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-015);</li> <li>○ 1630 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-016);</li> <li>○ 1634 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-017);</li> <li>○ 1638 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-018);</li> <li>○ 1642 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-019); and</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p>Kevin Weight, HP Staff, Paul Gilbert, Beus Gilbert  McGroder PLLC</p>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 1646 North 11<sup>th</sup> Street (APN 117-25-020); with modified boundaries consistent with the HP zoning overlay boundary adjustment</li> </ul> <p>Next, Chair Klocke invited Paul Gilbert to give a brief update on the request for the boundary adjustment.</p> <p>Mr. Gilbert reviewed the project evolution, highlights, and proposed modifications to HP overlay zoning, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>● (Pre-Fairfield) Developer proposed 144-room hotel and 7-story, 307-unit apartment community for subject site, which would require demolition of all 7 historic houses;</li> <li>● (Public Outreach) Dozens of meetings/discussions with both neighbors and stakeholders, Phoenix HP Office, and cross-section of supporters; <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Developer initiated Working Group to include neighbors and stakeholders with wide range of perspectives &amp; interests to seek compromises to resolve outstanding issues;</li> <li>○ Significant design changes – based on feedback from neighbors, stakeholders, and staff – regarding height, density, orientation, architectural character, and historic preservation</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Modification justification <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Non-historic additions may be demolished if constructed after the historic building’s period of significance or lack historic significance;</li> <li>○ Demolition approval may be granted for properties in historic districts that are classified as non-contributors either due to age or a loss of historic integrity</li> <li>○ Detached garages and other accessory structures that were not built to the same standards as the primary historic building (i.e. – wood frame construction rather than masonry built directly on dirt or concrete slab with no footings);</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Revitalization – 4 key upgrades <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Front yard landscape updates</li> <li>○ Window repairs/replacements to current HP and energy efficiency standards</li> <li>○ Roof repairs and replacements per HP standards</li> <li>○ Front porch enhancements</li> </ul> </li> <li>● Highlights &amp; Benefits <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Preserve all 7 historic houses</li> <li>○ Guaranteed preservation via conservation easement</li> <li>○ Historic houses will remain within Coronado Historic District</li> <li>○ Historic houses will be revitalized per HP standards</li> <li>○ Redevelop &amp; revitalize vacant, obsolete medical facility &amp; surface parking lot</li> <li>○ Expand housing options &amp; opportunities in Coronado neighborhood</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	
--	---	--

- Create appropriate transition from Banner University Medical Center to Coronado Road
- Redesigned to respond to neighborhood concerns
  - Architecture designed to be compatible with character of Coronado neighborhood
  - Providing 3 rows of trees as a buffer between redevelopment site and the 7 historic houses
- Supported and approved by Staff and Encanto VPC

Chair Klocke asked the Commission for questions or comments for Mr. Weight or Mr. Gilbert.

Commissioner Varvel Hartsell asked for clarification on the proposed use for the seven historic houses.

Mr. Gilbert said that all seven of the historic houses would remain residential.

Commissioner Amato asked for clarification on the (potential) loss of the alley behind the seven historic houses.

Mr. Gilbert confirmed that the alley had been officially abandoned years ago.

Chair Klocke verified that there were no further questions or comments from the Commission.

Chair Klocke invited Reid Butler to share his comments on this item.

Mr. Butler said that he did not have any comments.

Chair Klocke asked the property owner, Vikki Reed, for her comments.

Ms. Reed said that she did not have any additional comments.

Chair Klocke asked Ms. Ruter whether any public comments had been submitted for this item.

Ms. Ruter said a few requests for public comment were submitted to the HP Office.

Laura Hahn said she lives in the Coronado neighborhood. She is enthusiastic about the area being reinvigorated with the new development.

Eddie Green said he is excited about the project to redevelop the site. He urged the HP Commission for their approval of the project.

Donna Reiner said she is a longtime resident of Coronado. She is not happy with the redevelopment plan, as the developer is well aware. However, she is happy about placing perpetual easements on the seven historic houses.

John Stenson said that he strongly supports the project. He commends the developers for their outreach to the community regarding the proposed plans for redevelopment of the site.

Ruben Valencia said he lives near the site. He was concerned about how the traffic flow patterns would be changed due to the new construction and the relocation of the entrance to Banner Health.

Mr. Gilbert said that a traffic study, which was completed and submitted to the city, was approved by the city. He stated that this project would produce less traffic than what could be built on the property under the existing zoning. In addition, the city requested the developer pay for a traffic-control device that would regulate the traffic flow crossing over McDowell Road to Banner Health. This should address the concerns about traffic flow.

Chair Klocke asked the Commission for questions or comments.

Vice Chair Garcia said that he thinks that this proposed project is a win for historic preservation. He said that it is important to balance historic preservation with new development. He would much rather see the preservation of these seven historic houses than losing all of them to demolition. He also appreciates the good-faith offer to place conservation easements on all of the historic properties. He would be willing to offer a motion on this item.

Commissioner DeUriarte agrees with Vice Chair Garcia's comments, and he would be willing to second a motion for this item with stipulations.

Chair Klocke said that there would need to be a formal call for a motion. He then invited Commissioner Amato to share her comments.

Commissioner Amato agreed. These seven houses were now being saved when previously they were going to be demolished for redevelopment of the site. Even with the release of the rear portion of each lot and the loss of a few auxiliary structures, this is still a win for the neighborhood and for historic preservation.

Chair Klocke echoed the previous comments. He said that the arterial streets are a disaster, and he thinks this issue will come up many times over the next 30 to 40 years regarding redevelopment within the city. He said that the edges of historic districts will continue to be nibbled at for redevelopment. He thinks this project would be a good example on how to address this issue with future developments. He expressed his appreciation for all the work that went into this project, and he said that he is very supportive of this project.

Chair Klocke asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Commissioner Amato made a motion to approve the recommendation on HP overlay zoning boundary modification to include the stipulation for

	<p>perpetual easements to be recorded on each of the seven properties noted in Case # Z-2-22-4 for the Proposed PUD at the northwest corner of 11<sup>th</sup> Street and McDowell Road.</p> <p>Commissioner DeUriarte seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission votes, as follows:  Chair Klocke – Yes  Vice Chair Garcia – Yes  Commissioner Amato – Yes  Commissioner DeUriarte – Yes  Commissioner Noble – Yes  Commissioner Varvel Hartsell – Yes</p> <p>Approved 6-0.</p>	
<p>5.</p>	<p><b>2022-2023 Warehouse and Threatened Building Grant Approval: City Center Motel (600 W Van Buren St).</b></p> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Recommend approval of grant funding</p> <p>Chair Klocke invited Kevin Weight to present this item.</p> <p>Mr. Weight gave some background on the subject property, as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2011 – City Center Motel was featured in Midcentury Marvels: Commercial Architecture of Phoenix 1945-1975, published by the City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Office. The book noted that the City Center Motel was a rare surviving local example of Googie-style roadside design. At that time, HP staff also determined the motel was eligible for listing on the Phoenix Historic Property Register and the National Register of Historic Places;</li> <li>• DEC 11, 2021 – Property owner (Fabius Enterprise, LLC) filed application to demolish both the main building fronting Van Buren Street and a secondary building located further to the north and replace them both with a new multi-story hotel on the same site <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The demolition application was subject to a 30-day hold due to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Property was over 50 years old</li> <li>▪ Commercial use</li> <li>▪ Located in Downtown Code Area</li> <li>▪ Flagged as historically eligible</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>• DEC 20, 2021 – HP Commission initiated HP zoning for the motel due to concern about losing the historic property. Subsequently, HP staff filed rezoning application Z-5-22-7, and the property owner withdrew the application for demolition</li> <li>• FEB 14, 2022 – Following several weeks of discussions between staff and property owner, the owner presented a revised design to build new hotel while preserving most of the existing historic main building. HP Commission accepted the revised design and</li> </ul>	<p><b>Kevin Weight, HP Staff; Nimesh Dinubhai, Fabius Enterprises</b></p>