ATTACHMENT C



VILLAGE PLANNING COMMITTEE

Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary Z-79-22-4

Date of VPC Meeting	January 9, 2023
Request From	R-3
Request To	R-4
Proposed Use Location	Multifamily Residential Approximately 200 feet northwest of the northwest corner of 12th Street and Turney Avenue
VPC Recommendation VPC Vote	Approve, per staff recommendation 14-0-1

VPC DISCUSSION:

One member of the public registered to speak on this item in support.

Committee Member Rick Mahrle recused himself on the basis that his firm is representing the applicant. *This reduced the quorum to 15 members (9 being required for a quorum).*

STAFF BACKGROUND PRESENTATION

Mr. Joshua Bednarek, staff, provided an overview of the site's location, existing zoning, General Plan Land Use Map designation, and the proposal. Staff recommends approval subject to the stipulations as detailed in the staff report.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Ms. Ashley Marsh from Gammage and Burnham introduced herself as representing the applicant. The site is 1.6 gross acres which includes a portion of the canal and Turney Avenue. The street is developed with mostly multifamily complexes with an APS Substation north of the canal. The subject site is adjacent to R-3 on the north and west and R-4 on the south. The site is developed with 19 units from the 1960s with head-in parking directly from the street and no streetscape. The proposal is to redevelop the site with 45 units in a three story configuration including 2 pedestrian access points onto the canal, bicycle parking, a bicycle fix-it station, a pool and lounge, and two additional open space amenities. She then shared renderings of the project which is oriented along the canal with landscaping along the street. She added that the applicant agrees with the recommendation and the stipulations including a financial contribution to a HAWK at the canal trail to promote multimodal activity.

Encanto Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary January 9, 2023 Page 2 of 3

QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE

Committee Member Matthew Jewett asked for a breakdown of the number of units proposed in terms of size and price-points. Ms. Marsh responded that they are proposing 30 1-bedroom units and 15 2-bedroom units that will be leased at market-rate. The forecasted rent for a one bedroom will be \$1,450 - \$1,800 per month.

Vice Chair Nicole Rodriguez asked if the rendering is accurate in that it is depicting palm tree. **Ms. Ashley Marsh** responded that the rendering is misleading in that if the actual vegetation were depicted at maturity, it would obscure the building. The vegetation will be low water use and drought tolerant trees.

Committee Member Drew Bryck stated that he would like to see a conceptual rendering from the canal. He added that shade trees are preferable to palms especially considering the proximity to the canal trail and the pedestrian crossing at 12th Street which will both generate pedestrian traffic.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Mr. Ryan Boyd introduced himself as a representative of the Urban Phoenix Project and emphasized the importance of having two direct and convenient pedestrian access points between the project and the canal. He added that there is a prevalence of households with 0-1 vehicles and stated that it is unfortunate that city code requires vehicular parking, especially where viable transportation alternatives exist.

APPLICANT RESPONSE

Ms. Ashley Marsh stated that this site has challenging geometry that makes circulation difficult while also meeting the city code requirements. She noted that proposal includes 2 parking spaces above the required and that they take pedestrian circulation seriously.

FLOOR/PUBLIC DISCUSSION CLOSED: MOTION, DISCUSSION, AND VOTE

Committee Member Steve Procaccini echoed the concerns expressed by Committee Member Bryck and Vice Chair Rodriguez. He added that the site has some mature trees out front and asked that the developer try to preserve the trees in place. Regarding the lobby portion of the building, he noted that it looks very unpleasant and un-residential and asked that design enhancements be made to help the building fit in with the 50s / 60s vibe of the neighborhood.

Vice Chair Nicole Rodriguez asked if the developer would be open to reducing parking if stipulated. Ms. Ashley Marsh responded that the proposal is just 2 spaces overparked but that the developer may be willing to entertain a change if it is the will of the committee. Vice Chair Nicole Rodriguez added that the one point of connection to the canal seems hostile to individuals who may have limited mobility and recommended enhanced access. She also suggested that shade trees be added along the canal frontage.

Encanto Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary January 9, 2023 Page 3 of 3

MOTION

Committee Member G.G. George made a motion to approve Z-79-22-4 per the staff recommendation. **Committee Member Matthew Jewett** seconded to the motion.

DISCUSSION

Vice Chair Nicole Rodriguez stated that she will support the project but believes it merely meets the bare minimum and that there should be another point of access to the canal.

<u>VOTE</u>

14-0-1: motion to approve Z-79-22-4 per the staff recommendation passes with Committee Members Benjamin, Bryck, Cothron, George, Jewett, Kleinman, Matthews, Picos, Procaccini, Searles, Tedhams, Thacker, Vice Chair Rodriguez, Chair Wagner in support; with none opposed, and Schiller abstaining.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION:

No comments.