

# ATTACHMENT C

## PHOENIX HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MONTHLY MEETING Final Meeting Minutes

Date: September 16, 2024  
 Time: 4:30 p.m.  
 Location: Virtual-only via Webex

<b>Commission Members Present</b>	<b>Staff Present</b>
Dan Garcia, Chair	Helana Ruter
Tricia Amato, Vice Chair <i>(virtual)</i>	Kevin Weight
Dan Klocke	Desiree Aranda
Taz Khatri <i>(virtual)</i>	Cletus Montoya
Christina Noble <i>(virtual)</i>	Emma Collins
Brenda Thomson	Bridget Collins
Chad Gestson <i>(virtual - late arrival)</i>	Jodey Elsner <i>(virtual)</i>
	Crystal Carrancho <i>(virtual)</i>
	Maura Jackson <i>(virtual)</i>
	Danny Inglese (Law Department)
<b>Commission Members Absent</b>	<b>Staff Absent</b>
Francesca Miller	
Keely Varvel Hartsell	

<b>1.</b>	<p><b>Call meeting to order</b></p> <p>Chair Garcia verified that a quorum was established and called the meeting to order at 4:39 p.m.</p>	<b>Dan Garcia, HP Commission Chair</b>
<b>2.</b>	<p><b>Introduction of Commission Members and Staff</b></p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission members to introduce themselves followed by staff introductions.</p>	<b>HP Commission and Staff</b>
<b>3.</b>	<p><b>Review of meeting minutes from the annual work session and the monthly meeting held on August 19, 2024.</b></p> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Approval of minutes (separate actions for the two meetings).</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments about the draft minutes from the August 19<sup>th</sup> annual work session. None were posed.</p> <p>Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on the draft minutes from the August 19<sup>th</sup> annual work session.</p>	<b>HP Commission</b>

	<p><i>(NOTE: After agenda item four completed, Chair Garcia returned to agenda item three and asked Mr. Inglese for an update on the paused outcome of the vote on the minutes for the August 19<sup>th</sup> HP Commission monthly meeting.</i></p> <p><i>Mr. Inglese stated that per the Commission’s rules of procedure, a quorum is required to conduct business. However, conducting business then only requires a majority of those present. Since there were six members present and four members voted, yes, the minutes did pass in this case. Also, he referenced the Robert’s Rules of Procedure, which state that abstentions are not required if a member was not present at a prior meeting – members are welcome to vote on minutes for any prior meeting that they did not attend.</i></p> <p><i>Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Inglese for confirming the vote of 4-0 with 2 abstentions for the August 19<sup>th</sup> HP Commission monthly meeting minutes. He also appreciated the clarification on abstentions not being required when voting on minutes from prior meetings that members may have missed.</i></p> <p><i>Following this confirmation of the vote on the second action item for agenda item three, Chair Garcia then moved the agenda forward to item five.)</i></p>	
5.	<p><b>Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. Z-94-24-3, Thompson Rock Garden, at 10023 North 13<sup>th</sup> Place.</b></p> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Maura Jackson to present this item.</p> <p>Ms. Jackson said that Rezoning Application No. Z-94-24-3 is a request to establish Historic Preservation (HP) overlay zoning for the property located at 10023 North 13<sup>th</sup> Place, which is known historically as the Thompson Rock Garden or the Sunnyslope Rock Garden. She presented the following information in support of the request:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Background:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ 1979 Phoenix Historic Building Survey           <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Although subject property was not yet 50 years old, it was identified as eligible for listing as a unique local example of folk art used in landscaping;</li> <li>▪ Subject property, now substantially over 50 years in age, is recommended as eligible for listing on the Phoenix Historic Property Register (PHPR) under Criterion C as an exceptional example of a folk art environment</li> <li>▪ Request for designation was initiated by the current property owner; and</li> <li>▪ Designation was initiated by the HP Commission on June 17, 2024</li> <li>▪ HP overlay zoning application was filed by HP Office on June 26, 2024</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Property Overview:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Grover Cleveland Thompson purchased this property in 1954</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Maura Jackson, HP Staff

- Mr. Thompson created a folk art environment over two decades throughout the exterior of his home;
  - He combined original mosaic pieces, freeform concrete and mortar, statuary, native rock, and cast concrete pieces to create an immersive folk art environment;
  - His home is present on this parcel and is included within the boundaries of the proposed historic designation – the house blends seamlessly into the exterior sculptures and contributes to the overall site;
- **Significance:**
  - The Thompson Rock Garden property is eligible under Criterion C as a rare local example of a folk art environment. The sculptures possess high artistic value using a distinctive method of construction and materials
- **Integrity:**
  - After Mr. Thompson's death in 1977, Marion Blake purchased the property in 1978
    - Ms. Blake, a teacher with background in Art History, has maintained the folk art environment, thus enabling the Thompson Rock Garden to retain its historic integrity, including location, design, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association
- **Boundary:**
  - The proposed HP zoning boundary encompasses 0.22 gross acres. It has been drawn to include the subject parcel in its entirety as well as the adjacent portion of the right of way, as is customary in rezoning cases;
  - The proposed boundary contains the documented historic resources and follows parcel lines and street monument lines as much as possible

In conclusion, Ms. Jackson said that staff was recommending the rezoning request (Z-94-24-3) to establish HP overlay zoning for the subject property should be approved for the following reasons:

- The property meets the significance, age, and integrity requirements for HP overlay zoning set forth in Section 807.D of the Zoning Ordinance; and
- The proposed boundaries meet the eligibility criteria outlined in Section 807.E.

Chair Garcia thanked Ms. Jackson for the presentation. Prior to asking the Commission for questions or comments, he asked for clarification when the information packet was sent to the Commission, since he did not receive it.

Ms. Ruter responded to Chair Garcia and apologized that she had sent the information packet to his personal email rather than his work email address.

Chair Garcia requested that his email information be updated to reflect his work email address for HP communications.

Ms. Ruter stated that she would update the email contact information.

Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for any questions or comments.

Commissioner Khatri asked for clarification whether this designation would limit any additions or changes to the Thompson Rock Garden.

Ms. Jackson said that any future proposed changes to the subject property would need to come through the Historic Preservation design review process. She also believes that the property owner's intention is to maintain what is currently on site and to conserve it as it is existing. However, if changes were proposed in the future, those probably would not be recommended during that review process.

Commissioner Khatri commented that the rock garden was really a reflection of its creator, Mr. Thompson.

Chair Garcia verified that there were no further comments from the Commission. He then reviewed the comment cards that were submitted for this item, as follows:

- Marion Blake (Owner of subject property) – In favor of this item, but did not wish to speak
- Julia Taggart – In favor of this item, and wished to speak
- Terry Glaze – In favor of this item, but did not wish to speak
- Kim Kasper – In favor of this item, but did not wish to speak
- John Jacquemart – In favor of this item, and wished to speak

Chair Garcia invited Julia Taggart to the podium to share her comments.

Ms. Taggart appreciated Ms. Jackson's presentation on the history of the Thompson Rock Garden. She thinks the garden is an amazing piece of artwork. She expressed her concern that other rock gardens in Phoenix have been destroyed such as *Somewhere Over the Rainbow* rock salvage yard. Although the Louis Lee Rock Garden still exists, the family does not wish to pursue historic designation for its property. However, the Lee Family does support Marion Blake's request for historic designation of her property. Therefore, with an approval of HP overlay zoning, Ms. Blake's property would be the only rock garden to have historic preservation protection. She said that the Thompson Rock Garden is much loved by many in the community and beyond. She mentioned that Ms. Blake wants to preserve her property, as does the Sunnyslope community, and she would be happy to have her property receive historic designation and be listed on the Phoenix Register. Next, Ms. Blake would like to pursue listing her property on the National Register as well. In addition, she reminded the Commission that the Sunnyslope Studio Art Tour is scheduled for October 26-27, 2024.

Chair Garcia thanked Ms. Taggart. Then, he verified that Marion Blake, property owner, was in support of this item, but did not wish to speak.

	<p>Next, Chair Garcia invited John Jacquemart to the podium to share his comments.</p> <p>Mr. Jacquemart said that he was in support of this item, and he requested the HP Commission for its support too. He then mentioned the Watts Towers in Los Angeles, for context, and referenced its similarities of the doorways and the site.</p> <p>Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Jacquemart. Then he verified that the Commission had no additional comments on this item.</p> <p>Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for a motion on this item.</p> <p>Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve the Rezoning Application No. Z-94-24-3 for the Thompson Rock Garden located at 10023 North 13<sup>th</sup> Place.</p> <p>Commissioner Klocke seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows:  Chair Garcia – Yes  Vice Chair Amato – Yes  Commissioner Khatri – Yes  Commissioner Klocke – Yes  Commissioner Noble – Yes  Commissioner Thomson – Yes  Commissioner Gestson – Yes</p> <p>Approved 7 – 0.</p> <p>Chair Garcia thanked the Commission, and he moved on to the next agenda item.</p>	
<p><b>6.</b></p>	<p><b>Update on requests for demolition</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 30-day demolition holds</li> <li>• Properties on the Phoenix Register</li> </ul> <p><b>Action Requested:</b> Information and possible discussion</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Emma Collins to present the update.</p> <p>Ms. Collins referenced the 30-day hold report that was provided to the HP Commission and briefly reviewed the DAPPs that were submitted since last meeting, as follows:</p> <p><u>DAPPs:</u> (12 Total)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (3) Closed</li> <li>• (1) Open – Currently in 30-day hold period</li> <li>• (1) Extended – 9801 North Metro Parkway East; previous review extended</li> <li>• (7) Pending <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ (5) Pending submissions</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<p><b>Emma Collins,  HP Staff</b></p>