

Attachment G

David O Simmons

From: Alan and Lou <aleibowitz1@cox.net>
Sent: Sunday, January 31, 2021 10:08 PM
To: David O Simmons
Subject: Presentation February 1, 2021 at the Paradise Village Planning Meeting

I will virtually attend the presentation via Webex on February 1, 2012 at 6pm.

I have the following comments and questions.

Thank you.

Alan Leibowitz, MD

Town of Paradise Valley

Cell Phone: 602-826-0735

RE: Z-41-20-3: concerning the *presentation, discussion and possible recommendation regarding a request to rezone 3.19 acres located approximately 400 feet west of the northwest corner of 54th Street and Shea Boulevard from C-O (Approved PAD-2 SP) (Commercial Office, Approved Planned Area Development, Special Permit) and PAD-2 SP (Approved PAD-2 SP) (Planned Area Development, Approved Planned Area Development, Special Permit) to PUD (Planned Unit Development) to allow a hospital and other commercial uses*

I would like to submit 2 comments with questions to the applicant:

1. Shea Blvd. in this area is busy during the day with vehicular traffic. It is extremely busy during rush hour especially afternoon west bound traffic from Scottsdale. Traffic slows to a halt in this area.

The proposed health center will face difficulties both for entering vehicles traveling westbound that will require a left turn into the facility and exiting traffic in both directions on to Shea Blvd. This is a setup for accidents especially by sick or stressed people attending the center for medical care.

If traffic is affected in either direction, vehicles could circumvent bottlenecks, South, through the Town of Paradise Valley. This will have a major affect on currently low traffic, residential streets.

QUESTION: Has a traffic study been performed?

2. The narrative speaks to extremely rare instances of emergency ambulance presence, mainly transport from the facility. Yet the graphic on the cover of the narrative shows a red neon EMERGENCY sign. That is either a mistake or the narrative misstates or understates the use of emergency services. The sign is confusing to the public and a misrepresentation of services or the narrative is wrong.

QUESTION:

- **Will there be an Emergency area staffed by appropriate professionals?**
- **Is this appropriate for a freestanding, non-hospital with the traffic difficulties described in 1. (above)?**

Angela M. Banks & Marcus M. Young
5353 E. Sahuaro Drive
Scottsdale, AZ 85254

February 1, 2021

Paradise Valley Village Planning Committee

RE: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD is Z-41-20-3

Dear Committee members,

We are residents of La Camarilla. Angela is a professor at Arizona State University and Marcus is a dentist in private practice. We are writing to express our strong disapproval of the proposal by HonorHealth to rezone the 3.19 acre property located approximately 400 feet west of the northwest corner of 54th Street and Shea Boulevard. Rezoning this property to allow the construction of a 24/7 medical center will destroy the residential character of the area.

The medical center proposed by HonorHealth will operate 24/7 and have ambulance services. As property owners directly north of the property at issue we are deeply concerned about the increased noise and light pollution. Having a medical facility operating 24/7 with ambulance service will dramatically increase the traffic, noise pollution, and light pollution that the residents adjacent to the property will experience. While HonorHealth contends that the ambulance will only operate during specified hours, this statement is based on HonorHealth's proposed business model. Once the property is rezoned HonorHealth will be free to have ambulances utilize the facility 24/7. The PUD proposed by HonorHealth does not prohibit the use of ambulance lights and sirens, it merely states that lights and sirens will not be used for non-emergency patients.

Having a 24/7 medical facility at this location will have the additional impact of increasing traffic and lowering home values. HonorHealth has argued that placing a medical center at this location will benefit the broader community by providing additional medical resources. Yet HonorHealth currently has an urgent care facility near the intersection of E. Shea Boulevard and N. Tatum Boulevard. This urgent care facility is less than one mile from the property at issue in this rezoning application. An overwhelming number of community residents oppose this rezoning effort as we have adequate medical resources in the neighborhood.

It is our great hope that the Planning Committee will take seriously the concerns of the residents who live in the areas surrounding the property at issue in this rezoning application. There is plenty of commercial property in the area that can accommodate a 24/7 medical center without drastically changing the residential character of our neighborhood.

Sincerely,

/s/

Angela M. Banks

/s/

Marcus M. Young

David O Simmons

From: Kevin Engelhardt <kengelhardt352@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 28, 2021 7:03 PM
To: Candace Engelhardt; David O Simmons; docroc@cox.net
Subject: Honor Health Urgent care ER PV villages

David,

The Mountainside Fitness at PV villages replacing La Camarena was wrong. This proposed development is worse. Stop this rezoning. This area of Phoenix does not need to be “developed” and you know that.

Beyond the noise in a residentially zoned area I have the following concerns.

As a board certified pediatric intensive care physician I find freestanding ERs to be ethically deplorable. In my 5 years time in Dallas where such free standing ERs are a common scourge on the surrounding north Texas cities, I have seen first hand the horror they create when parents and EMS bring serious and often critically ill pediatric patients to unprepared physicians or worse independent practice APPs without physician backup. The providers staffing these ERs often have little or no meaningful hospital backup, minimal true emergency training, minimal emergency trained staff nor staff experience, and minimal tangible emergency resources. This model delays care on critical timelines often with the addition of missed and incorrect diagnosis’ and out of date interventions. Emergencies can and should be taken to emergency rooms in hospitals staffed with surgical and specialty medical services. This project has nothing to do with access to care and everything to do with greed. Do the right thing and stop it.

My wife Candace Engelhardt MD, a Pediatrician of the same opinion, happily give our time at the upcoming meeting on this topic to Dr Neal R Rockowitz MD.

Thank you for your time,

Kevin Engelhardt MD

David O Simmons

From: Darcy Royal <darcyroyal@gmail.com>
Sent: Sunday, January 31, 2021 3:54 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark; Rob A. Royal; Darcy Royal
Subject: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD is Z-41-20-3"

Dear PV Planning Committee,

(Please replace this email for my earlier one I sent. I accidentally hit the sent button too early. Thank you!)

We moved into our Orange Tree Estates neighborhood north of Shea in May 1987 because it was a "Quiet" & beautiful neighborhood. We enjoyed years playing tennis at La Camarilla as a "quiet" family neighborhood low profile business that enhanced the value of our neighborhood.

Rob is a litigator attorney & I am a former Risk Manager for a Bank. We had many opportunities to move elsewhere but love the acre lots, space & quiet neighborhood for 34 years, but when you allowed Mountainside fitness to build their tall, ugly egregious building I CRINGE in disgust everytime we turn on 54th Street!

Most of our friends & family have commented, how did the city allow such a building in your neighborhood? So if our friends say this to us, what do you think a potential buyer is thinking?

When anyone decides to purchase a home we don't look for a busy place to buy, we look for a quiet family neighborhood. And when banks or real estate appraisers look at a neighborhood with too much commercial businesses then that neighborhood is less desirable and their values go down & interest rates go up.

When you allowed Mountainside Fitness to build their eyesore in our neighborhood you helped destroy the visual appeal of our quiet beautiful neighborhood. The signage is disgusting and the building is like a Walmart.

Why would you want to destroy our neighborhood AGAIN with excessive traffic & noise by allowing a commercial entity like Honor Health to back up to our neighbors back yards?

When you allow this type of commercial activity (more traffic, exhaust, noise, lights, toxic medical waste & sirens...Pollution) like the Honor Health & Mountainside Fitness types of buildings it's an horrible intrusion to our quiet family neighborhood and you destroy our Property values & potential future sales.

There is plenty of open Commercial VACANT space just West a couple blocks near Tatum.

PLEASE protect our quiet Neighborhood and make them move to a Commercial pad as there is plenty available, and there is no reason to Rezone our neighborhood!

Also, please give Dr. Neal Rockowitz time to speak on our behalf.

Thank you very much for your valuable time and serious consideration.

Darcy Royal

darcyroyal@gmail.com

[602-501-0675](tel:602-501-0675)

"The Heart of A Volunteer, there is nothing stronger than the heart of a volunteer, with it beats the spirit of service, generosity and compassion...the health and well-being of our community, our country and our world." -Yamada

Sent from my iPhone

David O Simmons

From: Dianne Hampton <dhampt@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, January 26, 2021 9:37 AM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Neil Rockowitz, MD
Subject: Feb. 1, 2021 Registration Request - Dianne Hampton

Happy New Year David,

I'm hope you are safe and well. I am having problems with accessing the app to register for February 1st at 6pm

I would like time to address continued opposition to Agenda item#10, Mountainside Fitness PUD Rezoning. I yield my allotted time to Dr. Neil Rockowitz.

Please continue to take good care. Thank you for your assistance.

Respectfully,
Dianne Hampton, condo owner
Milano Terrace
5122 E. Shea Blvd.
Scottsdale, AZ 85254
Dhampt@aol.com

Sent from my iPhone
Dianne Hampton

David O Simmons

From: Harold Ganz <hganz@haroldganz.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 28, 2021 2:30 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark; docroc@cox.net
Subject: rezoning case: HonorHealthShea PUD is Z-41-20-3

Mr. Simmons,

I am contacting you in reference to the proposed rezoning of the land adjacent to Mountainside Fitness. As a homeowner for the past 28 years, it NEVER entered my mind that the tranquil neighborhood I love, would be substantially diminished and denigrated by having the peace and quiet destroyed by the construction of a 24/7 emergency medical facility.

The thought of sirens throughout the day and night, and the added congestion and traffic that already makes Shea Blvd a nightmare, is hard to comprehend. Since there is already high quality care delivered at Mayo and the Honor Health Facility at 90th and Shea, both only 10 minutes away, our residential community is NOT looking for any other conveniences closer to home.

It is wildly unreasonable for anyone to frame this rezoning project as a much needed addition to OUR neighborhood. Therefore, please inform the individuals trying to rezone not insult the collective intelligence of our community by stating in the Honorhealth flyer that this facility will be offering us CONVENIENCE. Mayo and HonorHealth, 10 minutes away, is all the convenience we are seeking.

Thanking you in advance of the meeting,

hganz@haroldganz.com

David O Simmons

From: Terry Hamlin <terry@all-ininc.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 28, 2021 4:56 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: whchristian@msn.com
Subject: Honor Heath zoning meeting Z-41-20-3 on Feb 1st

David Simmons, MA
Planner II* Village Planner
200 West Washington Street
3rd Floor
Phoenix, AZ 85003
602-262-4072
david.simmons@phoenix.gov

David-

Becky and I wish to relinquish our time to speak regarding Z-41-20-3 on Feb 1st to Bill Christian.

We as long time residents are opposed to the Honor Health Rezoning proposal. It should be denied on the basis it is involution of existing zoning and is inconsistent with nearby residential zoning.

Mountainside Fitness was allowed to violate existing Phoenix City Zoning Codes. Because a mistake was made. The City of Phoenix does not need to continue to violate or even change existing zoning law.

Becky and Terry Hamlin although unable to attend the public hearing on the 1st of February. We continue to remain opposed to any rezoning of the subject property for purposes as proposed by Honor Health.

Regards.

Terry & Becky Hamlin
5432 E. Alan Lane
Phoenix, AZ 85253
Sent from [Mail \[go.microsoft.com\]](mailto:terry@all-ininc.com) for Windows 10

David O Simmons

From: Gracie Rayburn <ghrayburn@aol.com>
Sent: Monday, February 1, 2021 1:12 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark
Subject: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD Z-41-20-3

Mr. Simmons,

As residents of La Camarilla Estates, we vehemently oppose the above rezoning. Our subdivision is adjacent to the property being considered to be rezoned for the Honor Health development of a 24/7 urgent care/emergency room. This has been a strictly residential area since we moved here in 1985 and the proposed commercial business would significantly diminish the quality of life in this residential area.

The existence of such a development is just not compatible with a residential neighborhood and would be detrimental to the area. It would create increased traffic, noise, a twenty four hour business, twenty four hour signs and lighting glaring directly into our subdivision, and, worst of all the sound of ambulance sirens at all hours. Such an incongruous change would also cause a significant drop in real estate values.

We strongly support the opposition expressed in previous letters, for the many reasons articulated in them. Please deny the request for rezoning.

We are registered to attend the meeting under James Rayburn and will not be speaking. We would like to donate our speaking minutes to Dr. Neal Rockowitz.

James & Gracie Rayburn

La Camarilla Estates
5370 E. Mercer Lane
Scottsdale, AZ 85254

David O Simmons

From: Nancy Ganz <nganz@haroldganz.com>
Sent: Thursday, January 28, 2021 4:51 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark; docroc@cox.net
Subject: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD is Z-41-20-3

Dear Mr. Simmons,

I am writing to you hoping to have a say in defeating Honor Health in their proposal of rezoning the area next to Mountainside Fitness.

Please add this letter to what you present to the committee members. Also, please donate both my husband's, Harold Ganz, and my speaking minutes to Dr. Neal Rockowitz.

Thank you for all you are doing to respect our community's opinions.

Nancy Ganz

January 28, 2021

To Whom it May Concern,

When you purchase a home, and picture living there with your family, many things are considered. We chose a residential neighborhood with retail areas being developed. This was a purposeful decision, and we have invested 28 years supporting our neighborhood small and large businesses, schools, and community. **Honor Health should not be the deciding factor that changes the atmosphere of OUR residential neighborhood that we all chose to live in!**

The land where Honor Health wants to build their facility was NEVER intended for their purpose—thus the present zoning! Their proposal that a change in zoning to clear the path for their build will be a “bonus” to our area, is laughable! I don’t ever remember a time I hoped **for a devaluation of our property, even more excessive traffic, greater noise, extreme lighting, and 24/7 activity!** No residential neighborhood would want this. In addition we all currently live ten minutes away from two existing facilities that provide the same medical needs.

I assume Honor Health is capable of finding another piece of land which **does not require rezoning** that will be perfect for their needs and welcomed by the surrounding area.

Life has changed enough this last year for all of us. We are all looking to get back to the “usual.” **Honor Health is not promoting anything we want. Honor Health is creating chaos,**

anxiety, and anger. And attempting to impose something on people who made choices long before they decided to interfere in our lives!

They need to: **STOP**

Think about their actions and assumptions

Observe the reactions of the people being affected

Proceed with NEW understanding and insight

THIS IS THE WRONG PLACE FOR THEIR FACILITY

Please, all committee members, **vote NO for the rezoning** of this land.

Nancy Ganz

David O Simmons

From: Sandy Kravetz <sekravetz@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, February 1, 2021 4:09 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark
Subject: Fwd: Letter to Phoenix Planning Committee

Importance: High

Dear Mr. Simmons and Councilwoman Stark,

It is my understanding that the Phoenix Planning Commission is meeting this evening. I am writing today about a zoning change that will adversely impact my neighborhood.

The Honor Health Outpatient Medical Center (an emergency medical facility) is requesting a rezoning permit for the empty lot to the west of the Mountainside Fitness (a new eyesore) on Shea Boulevard and 54th Street. While a landlocked neighborhood surrounded by other neighborhoods is truly safe from development, the homeowners directly behind the former La Camarilla, and those nearby, had a realistic expectation due to stringent zoning, that their neighborhood would be protected from development that would negatively impact their quality of life and their homes' values.

La Camarilla Tennis and Racquet Club only existed because of special PAD-2 residential zoning specific to that business. The developer who built La Camarilla Estates' homes also owned and built the tennis club. The owner of the parcel of land in question is Tom Hatten, the CEO and owner of Mountainside Fitness. I am sure he paid several million dollars to purchase La Camarilla and expended several more millions to create the Mountainside Fitness in its place. This facility is basically a warehouse in situated on property that was originally zoned for a racket club that complimented and was an asset to the neighborhood. I have no doubt that Mr. Hatten is eager to sell his remaining parcel to the highest bidder with as little regard that he showed the homes that abut Mountainside Fitness, just so he can recoup some of the invest he has made in the former La Camarilla club.

By Honor Health's own admission, this medical center will serve as an emergency room. This means neighbors can expect additional traffic and noise pollution from sirens. The Mountainside Fitness building is basically the "camel's nose under the tent." With the addition of the Honor Health Medical Center, the whole camel will be inside the tent. While there may not be a discussion now, I can envision adding a traffic signal to the intersection of 54th St. and Shea due to the increase in traffic.

Interestingly, Honor Health operates an office in a building to the west of this parcel. Has Honor Health considered locating its emergency medical center in that building? Currently there are at least three vacant spaces in the Paradise Village shopping Center on the northeast corner of Shea and Tatum. Can none of these spaces (the former Bed Bath and Beyond, the former Nationwide Eyeglasses that abutted the former Albertson's supermarket) be repurposed for Honor Health's Medical Center? There is also a large vacant parcel just west of Tatum on Shea that used to be the site of a suite of medical buildings. Did Honor Health consider that location?

Our community has already been ignored by the Planning Committee and the City Council once when it approved a big box gym in our neighborhood. I urge you not to make a rezoning mistake with the Honor Health Emergency Medical Center.

Additionally, I request that my minutes for addressing the Planning Committee be donated to Dr. Neal Rockowitz.

Thank you,

Sandy Kravetz
5430 E Mercer Lane

David O Simmons

From: Darcy Royal <darcyroyal@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, January 30, 2021 10:21 AM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark; Rob A. Royal; Darcy Royal
Subject: "Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD is Z-41-20-3"

Dear PV Planning Committee,

We moved into our Orange Tree Estates neighborhood north of Shea in May 1987 because it was a "Quite" & beautiful neighborhood. We enjoyed years playing tennis at La Camarilla as a "quite" family neighborhood low profile business that enhanced the value of our neighborhood.

Rob is a litigator attorney & I am a former Risk Manager for a Bank. We had many opportunities to move elsewhere but love the acre lots, space & quite neighborhood for 34 years but when you allowed Mountainside fitness to build their tall, ugly gregarious building I CRINGE in disgust everytime we turn on 54th Street!

Most of our friends & family have commented how did the city allow such a building in your neighborhood? So if our friends say this to us, what do you think a potential buyer is thinking?

When anyone decides to purchase a home we don't look for a busy place to buy, we look for a quite family neighborhood. And when banks or real estate appraisers look at a neighborhood with too much commercial businesses then that neighborhood is less desirable and their values go down & interest rates go up.

When you allowed Mountainside Fitness to build their eyesore to our neighborhood you helped destroy the visual appeal of our quite beautiful neighborhood.

Why would you want to destroy our neighborhood AGAIN with excessive traffic & noise with allowing a commercial entity like Honor Health to backup to our neighbors back yards?

When you allow this type of commercial activity (more traffic, exhaust, noise, lights, toxic medical waste & sirens...pollution) like the Honor Health & Mountainside Fitness types of buildings it's an intrusion to our quite family neighborhood and you destroy our Property values & potential future sales.

There is plenty of open Commercial VACANT space just West a couple blocks near Tatum.

PLEASE, protect our quite Neighborhood and make them move to a Commercial pad as there is plenty available & no reason to Rezone our neighborhood!

Also, please give Neal Rockowitz time to speak on our behalf.

Best,
Darcy

Darcy Royal
darcyroyal@gmail.com
[602-501-0675](tel:602-501-0675)

"The Heart of A Volunteer, there is nothing stronger than the heart of a volunteer, with it beats the spirit of service, generosity and compassion...the health and well-being of our community, our country and our world." -Yamada

Sent from my iPhone

David O Simmons

From: Kevin Ladin <kladin@gmail.com>
Sent: Saturday, January 30, 2021 7:58 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: La Camarilla HOA; neal rockowitz
Subject: Rezoning 54th/Shea parcel

Dear Mr. Simmons:

I wholeheartedly concur with Dr. Engelhardt. Rezoning the parcel to allow for the development of a [24/7](#) urgent care/emergency room is entirely unacceptable on so many levels in a residential community and MUST be staunchly opposed. It will destroy the character and livability of our neighborhood and community. There are undoubtedly many other options HonorHealth can pursue on land already appropriately zoned.

I also agree that HonorHealth is looking to capitalize on the ability to up-charge for urgent care services by masquerading as a full-fledged Emergency Room thereby putting patients at risk in the name of maximizing profits. That is the business model HonorHealth is pursuing. It is truly deplorable and has no place in our community. When confronted by this obvious fact, HonorHealth had no satisfactory response. Having a critically ill patient show up at this facility only to be "stabilized" while awaiting transfer to an actual hospital will unnecessarily delay needed care that could have been instituted right away had they traveled a few miles down the road to HonorHealth Scottsdale Shea or Mayo Clinic Hospital in the first place. This potential for patient harm far outweighs any "convenience" provided by a freestanding ER in our backyards.

Sincerely,

Kevin S. Ladin, MD
[5330 E Mercer Lane](#)
[Scottsdale, AZ 85254](#)

David O Simmons

From: Paul Michaud <pmichaud@paradisevalleyaz.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, January 27, 2021 3:36 PM
To: David O Simmons
Subject: HonorHealth Outpatient Medical Center- Shea (Z-41-20-3) Feb 1 Agenda

David:

I received a call from a resident in Paradise Valley concerned about possible traffic cut-through down 52nd Street to either Mountain View Road to Tatum Boulevard or further south to DoubleTree Ranch Road. I reviewed the case material online. On behalf of this resident, I would appreciate any information or further discussion by the Village Planning Commission Members about cut-through traffic off Shea Boulevard or Tatum Boulevard (particularly as it relates to emergency vehicles).

Regards,

Paul E. Michaud, AICP
Planning Manager
Community Development – Planning Division
6401 E Lincoln Drive
480-348-3574 (phone)
pmichaud@paradisevalleyaz.gov
Office Hours: Mon-Fri 7:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m., closed noon-1:00 p.m. and holidays

Stay informed with the Town's response to COVID-19 by visiting: www.paradisevalleyaz.gov/COVID-19
[\[paradisevalleyaz.gov\]](http://paradisevalleyaz.gov)

Sign up to receive emergency alerts & notifications from Alert PV: www.paradisevalleyaz.gov/AlertPV
[\[paradisevalleyaz.gov\]](http://paradisevalleyaz.gov)

Sign up for the Town's weekly COVID-19 Update by visiting: <https://l.townofpv.com/COVID19> [\[l.townofpv.com\]](http://l.townofpv.com)

Disclaimer:

All messages contained in this system are the property of the Town of Paradise Valley and are considered a public record subject to disclosure under the Arizona Public Records Law (A.R.S. 39-121). Town employees, public officials, and those who generate e-mail to and from this e-mail domain should have no expectation of privacy related to the use of this technology.

David O Simmons

From: Judith Pedersen <judithcpedersen@gmail.com>
Sent: Wednesday, January 27, 2021 10:58 AM
To: Debra W Stark
Cc: Geno Koman; David O Simmons
Subject: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD Z-41-20-3

Dear Ms Stark,

We oppose the rezoning of our residential neighborhood to one that would allow for the building of an emergency urgent care facility on Shea Blvd across the street from North Promontory.

A commercial facility in our residential neighborhood would have a negative impact and shows lack of wisdom when considering the following:

* **Safety.** There is enough traffic to contend with as it is on Shea Blvd, and noise, and we don't want to see this situation worsened by the presence of ambulances/emergency vehicles, sirens, and 24/7 activity. Access onto Shea is already encumbered by drivers in and out of Mountainside Fitness, a rather cold and austere architectural monster, ie, ugly, that many of us had hoped would have been at least as lovely as the tennis and exercise club it replaced (it didn't turn out that way) and pulling out on Shea will only get worse and more dangerous with the additional traffic an ambulance/urgent care facility will cause, no matter how attractive the owners promise to make the building.

* **Quality Environment.** This additional traffic activity will erode the quality of the neighborhood for the many people who enjoy living here. Many people walk and stroll the adjacent sidewalks and walkways to go to the store, to walk their pets, to jog or exercise, and to ride their bikes. We bought a house in North Promontory for its excellent location to schools and stores and the quality neighborhood it gave us. It has proven to be all we had hoped for and we would like to retain that value for us and for those who live here after us. This rezoning effort to commercial will negatively affect the value of our house.

* **Need.** We have never felt the need for an urgent care facility to enhance our neighborhood. That said, there is already an urgent care facility nearer the Tatum and Shea intersection. This proposal for a second facility seems redundant.

* **Stewardship of land.** It makes no sense to develop this area into a commercial setting when there are many other properties with better advantages for this kind of business. The Paradise Valley Mall is easily accessed, centrally located and probably has space available for upgrading to the needs of an urgent care facility for less than building a new structure. Why destroy something good in a neighborhood, its safety and ambience, when other, better suited options for an emergency care setting are available?

It takes time to build good, safe neighborhoods. They take care to maintain.

This letter is our vote to retain our neighborhood and oppose the addition of a commercial facility within it.

Thank you.

Judy and Peder Pedersen
5423 E Beryl Avenue
Scottsdale, AZ 85253

SAVE OUR NEIGHBORHOOD PETITION

We, the undersigned residents of La Camarilla Estates and North Phoenix Promontory, along with all of the surrounding neighborhoods are strongly opposed to Rezoning Case No. Z-41-20-3, the HonorHealth Medical Center with 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room Operations.

The current PAD zoning at this location, in accordance with City Municipal Code Sec 635, was designed to “provide a desirable and stable environment in harmony with that of the surrounding area.” Contrary to this, the planned development is utterly out of harmony with the character of the original zoning. Rezoning of a residential parcel for a 24/7 Emergency Room could not be a more jarring replacement of the idyllic tennis club that was previously zoned for this land.

Additionally, this rezoning proposal does not meet the City’s usage requirements for this area. PUD Sec 671 states: “Appropriate limitations will be placed on the character and intensity of permitted uses to promote neighborhood compatibility.” 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room operations, increased ambulance service, increased traffic, associated late-night noises and lighting, are simply incompatible with the character of a residential neighborhood.

This rezoning is particularly unnecessary given the existence of an obvious compromise: Honor Health should simply be encouraged to find a nearby property that is already correctly zoned. As more and more big-box chain stores inevitably close, there will be multiple commercial properties available in the vicinity, either now or in the near future. This would allow HonorHealth to provide its services while also preserving the character of our neighborhood. We respectfully request that this rezoning case be categorically denied.

Respectfully signed,

First Name	Last Name	Email	Phone	Address	Zip
Tom	Rusling	trusling@gmail.com	585-820-0213	5352 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
Neal	Rockowitz	docroc@cox.net	602-319-1961	5337 E. Sahuaro Dr	85254
Laura	Rockowitz	lrockowitz@cox.net	480-510-1931	5337 E. Sahuaro Dr	85254
Narita	Rusling	naritameme@yahoo.com			85254
Mike	Shano	mshano@ascosigns.com	602-920-4124	5419 E. Mercer Lane	85254
jonathan	Miller	hockeycpa@gmal.com	6028202220	5415 E Cannon Dr	85253
Victoria	Ross	vbr737@gmail.com	6023215690	5342 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
Burr	Ross	jbross@cox.net	6026201740	5342 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
Nancy	Ribble	nribble@q.com	6023003655	5227 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
Kevin	Ladin	kladin@gmail.com	6026977320	5330 E Mercer Ln	85254
James	Rayburn	jamestrayburn@aol.com	602-703-5593	5370 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Gracie	Rayburn	ghrayburn@aol.com	602-550-5073	5370 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Jody	Stachel	jodystachel@cox.net	480-213-9883	5321 E. Mercer Lane	85254
penny	miller	hockeywife77@msn.com	6024992679	5415 east canon drive	85253
Michael	Lee	ylipake@cox.net	480-951-3848	5322 east sahuaro drive	85254
Cynthia	Papa	ylipake@gmail.com	480-951-3848	5322 east sahuaro drive	85254
Richard	Hock	richie85253@gmail.com		10221 N 52nd st.	85253
Alvin	Bieniek	asbien@cox.net	480-998-2488	10839 N 52nd St	85254
Sharon	Bieniek	asbien@cox.net	480-998-2488	10839 N 52ND St	85254
Erik	Lige	eklige25@gmail.com	(201) 220-9439	5203 E. Sahuaro Dr.	85254
Rona	Lige	ronalige@hotmail.com	(703) 989-0984	5203 E. Sahuaro Dr.	85254
Eileen	Shorr	eileenshorr@gmail.com	856-275-4796	10401 N. 52d St. #101	85253
Steven	Shapiro	sscfsls@aol.com	602-418-3001	5363 e sahuaro dr.	85254
Paula	Shapiro	pss1217@aol.com	602-418-1383	5363 e sahuaro dr	85254
Nelda	Levine	nelda1011@gmail.com	310.924.2446	5249 E. Shea Blvd Unit 118	85254
Louis	Lopez	lopezphx@gmail.com	6025130787	5358 E Mercer	85254
Ashley	lopez	nolandlopez@gmail.com		5358 E Mercer	85254
Leigh	Ribble	lribble@q.com	6025739440	5227 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
laurie	shelton	laurieshelton@hotmail.com			
sue	McGrath	suemailsmcgrath@gmail.com			
Stephen	Stachel	sstach26@gmail.com	4803919039	5321 E Mercer Ln	85254
David	Efros	leodeo918@gmail.com	2484599430	5249 E shea unit 114	85254

Susan	Efros	leodeo918@gmail.com		5249 E Shea Blvd unit 114	85254
Will	Ephister	Will_Ephister@post.com		5230 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Alex	Neville	alex.neville@gmail.com	480.389.4006	5249 E Shea Blvd, Unit 101	85254
Mark	Aronauer	maronauer@palazzohc.com	615-429-3051	10819 N 52nd St	85254
Jack	Aronauer	jaronauer@palazzohc.com	615-364-7473	10819 N 52nd St	85254
Angela	Zampino	Angela@ZampinoHomes.com	602-616-8075	5249 E Shea Blvd 219	85254
Nicole	Hatton	nicolehatton4@gmail.com	602-617-0022	5249 E Shea Blvd, Unit 204	85254
Judy	Shano	jshano@ascosigns.com	480-390-7747	5419 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Dixie	Normous	Dixie_Normous_1963@pacificwest.com	602 652-0163	5230 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Sandy	Kravetz	sekravetz@gmail.com	480-231-5383	5430 E Mercer Lane	85254
Jeffrey	Kravetz	jeffkravetz@cox.net	480-642-7025	5430 E Mercer Lane	85254
Ben	Kravetz	bkravetz007@cox.net	480-642-7025	5430 E Mercer Lane	85254
Julie	Harvey	Jmagharvey@hotmail.com		5249 E Shea Blvd, Unit 113	85254
Susan	Brandt	suekbrandt@gmail.com	928-300-6648	5122 E. Shea Blvd., Unit 1030	85254
Matt	Vaccaro	mvaccaro@q.com	928-899-0147	5122 E. Shea Blvd., Unit 1086	85254
Sabra	Barnett			Sahuaro Dr	85254
Alvin	Bieniek			Lot 16, La Camarilla Estates	85254
Margaret	Stewart	ms.margaret.stewart@gmail.com	661-332-9102	5249 E. Shea Blvd Until 200	85254
Virginija	Paulauskas	virginijapaulauskas@yahoo.com	623-332-4522	5249 E Shea Blvd Unit 105	85254
na	Paulauskas	tinapaulauskas@yahoo.com	623-570-5773	12827 N 38th Way	85032
Robert	George			10227 N 56th St	85253
Victoria	George			10227 N 56th St	85253
Lou	Stools	loustools100@mail.com		5122 E Shea 1122	85254
Enrica	Carotenuto	rica.carotenuto@gmail.com	480-889-4627	5420 E Shea Blvd	85254
Pasquale	Carotenuto	rica57@cox.net	480-889-4626	5420 E Shea Blvd	85254
Jeff	Strom	strom@pobox.com	480-543-8160	5122 E Shea Blvd 1107	85254
suzan	pearlstein	suzan@suzanpearlstein.com	6022064343	5314 E Mercer	85254
Lynn	Pearlstein	lynn@lynnpearlstein.com	480-363-5121	5314 E Mercer	85254
Corinne	Canivez	canivez@hotmail.com	602-320-5783	5468 E. Oakhurst	85254
Jeff	Canivez	canivez@hotmail.com	480-905-3900	5468 E. Oakhurst	85254
Mike	Auxlong	Mike.Auxlong_4cm@workmail.com		5231 E Shea	85254
Jennifer	Rawicz	jenrawicz@cox.net	480-664-3569	5333 E. Mercer Lane	85254
John	Rawicz	jrawicz@cox.net	480-664-3569	5333 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Ken	Kahle	cladd121212@yahoo.com		5249 E Shea Blvd 211	85254
William	Christian	whchristian@msn.com	480-229-0858	5428 E Cannon Dr	85253
Laura	Gianas	lmgianas@gmail.com	480-694-2629	5428 E Cannon Dr	85253
Stuart	Taylor	stuart@stuarttaylor.name	415-515-4168	5507 E Shea Blvd	85254
Caroline	Richards Taylor	carolinerichardstaylor@gmail.com	415-846-2202	5507 E Shea Blvd	85254
Helene	Spero	speroaz@cox.net	602-999-3740	5403 E. Cannon Drive	85253
Larry	Spero	speroaz@codx.net	602-803-4559	5403 E. Cannon Drive	85253
Lauren	Leonard	laureneleonard@gmail.com	404-625-5948	5401 E Alana Lane	85253

Syed (Ish)	Jafri	ijafri@gmail.com	832-768-5374	5401 E Alan Lane	85253
Carol	Hunter	cahshopper@cox.net	480-922-4436	5401 E. Shea Blv.	85254
Debbie	Moudy	dmoudy1@cox.net	480-9484207	5427 E. Alan Lane	85253
Elizabeth	Fuentes	azemfuentes@gmail.com		5409 east Cannon Drive	85253
Larry	Moudy	lmoudy1@cox.net	480-948-4207	5427 E. Alan Lane	85253
Karen Ranee	Duckworth	Raneeduckie@gmail.com	480-213-2544	5427 E Cannon Drive	85253
Charles	Duckworth	cbduckwo@cox.net	602-809-2222	5427 E Cannon Drive	85253
Randall	Bain	crbain@cox.net	602-989-3273	5503 E. Cannon Drive	85253
Robert	Wiesenberger	rjwdmd@aol.com	480-607-3959	10211 N55th Pl.	85253
Fran	Wiesenberger	rjwdmd@aol.com	480-607-3959	10211 N55th Pl	85253
Robert	King	rbking2405@yahoo.com	480-241-7521	10213 N55th Street	85253
Patricia	King	pattik419@yahoo.com	480-628-1693	10213 N55th Street	85253
Leslie	Lewis	LeslieFLewis@gmail.com	480-773-4193	10214 N. 55th St.	85253
David	Lewis	David.Lewis@dlapiper.com	480-707-2913	10214 N. 55th St.	85253
John	Raines	johnmraines@aol.com	602-622-0401	10207 N. 54th. Pl.	85253
Barbara	Raines	rainesfam@aol.com	480-205-4279	10207 N. 54th. Pl.	85253
Linda	Miles	lhiles56@gmail.com	480-596-8297	10216 N. 55th Pl.	85253
Terry Allin	Hamlin	allin1947@gmail.com	602-625-0054	5432 E. Alan Lane	85253
Becky	Hamlin	bhamlinaz@aol.com	602-625-6252	5432 E. Alan Lane	85253
Shawn	Ruth	shawnlruth@gmail.com	480-686-4071	5249 E Shea Blvd #110	85254
Anne	Dutoit	acdutoit@me.com	718-974-4067	5501 E Shea Blvd	85254
Lucas	Dutoit			5501 E Shea Blvd	85254
Antonio	Dias	tonio04@gmail.com	480-209-4323	5373 E Sahuaro Dr	85254
Marcus	Young	mmy213@nyu.edu	7168600245	5353 E Sahuaro Dr.	85254
Larry	Langford	ldmsl@cox.net	480-443-1968	10811 North 52nd Street	85254
Mary Sue	Langford	ldmsl@cox.net	480-443-1968	10811 North 52ns Street	85254
Gary	Miller	gary@themgroupinc.com	4809514034	10802 N 52nd Street	85254
Amy	Miller	amymiller@cox.net	4809514034	10802 N 52nd Street	85254
Tim	Frohock	azrockitman@me.com	6025685200	5344 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Angelina	Cooper	angelina.n.cooper@gmail.com	6195080955	5414 E Alan Ln	85253
Daniel	Cooper	daniel.e.cooper@me.com	6195599289	5414 E Alan Ln	85253
Bruce	Beverly	bbeverly@azgat.com	602-327-8425	10202 N. 54th Place	85253
Toni	Beverly	ttbeverly@aol.com	602-828-9531	10202 N. 54th Place	85253
Jen	McCall	jenmccall@cox.net	480 628 6427	10810 N. 52nd St.	85254
Maulik	Parikh	parikh.physics@gmail.com	7189744077	5501 E Shea Blvd	85254
Jeff	McCall	jmjk254@gmail.com	602 565 3496	10810 N. 52nd St.	85254
Scott	Campbell	Scott@SierraCharlieAviation.com	480-390-2346	5321 E. Sahuaro Dr	85254
Melise	Campbell	MelseCampbell@Gmail.com	928-499-9624	5321 E. Sahuaro Dr	85254
Ken	Diamond	kbd0214@cox.net	602-538-1946	11201 N. 54th St.	85254
Barb	Diamond	kbd0214@cox.net	602-524-9854	11201 North 54th St	85254
Michelle	Ladin	michandbar@aol.com	602-565-0883	5330 E. Mercer Ln	85254
Angela	Banks	Young72013@gmail.com		5353 E Sahuaro Dr.	85254

Amy	Nielsen	toys72@hotmail.com	480-252-0873	5402 E Mercer Lane	85254
John	Nielsen	john.nielsen02@gmail.com	480-747-3483	5402 E Mercer Lane	85254
Peter	Reaven	preaven@cox.net	480-368-0926	10852 N. 53rd St	85254
Sylvia	Vela	bsvela@aol.com	480-368-0926	10852 N. 53rd St	85254
Kathryn	Mendivil	kaizen21@cox.net	480-348-9969	5430 E Shea Blvd	85254
Steven	Kopp	steven.m.kopp@gmail.com	480-695-3803	5416 E. Cannon Drive	85253
Alexis	Barton-Marsh	alexismmarsh@gmail.com	6173145940	5413 E Shea Blvd	85254
Drew	Marsh	drewmarsh.phx@gmail.com	4804450155	5413 E Shea Blvd	85254
Prabhakar	Chinta	reddy.code@gmail.com	4802482448	5509 E Cannon Dr	85253
Deepa	Biyyam	docrad4@gmail.com	4802482448	5509 E Cannon Dr	85253
Smith	Robert	aerobob1@gmail.com	4804433733	5433 E Alan Ln	85253
Smith	Joan	aerojoan1@gmail.com	4804433733	5433 E Alan Ln	85253
weiner	gerald	ghweiner@aol.com	480-483-1655	5407 e. Alan ln	85253
Minkner	Jay	jmrealtor@cox.net	4805968388	10207 N 55th St	85253
Minkner	Diane	dmrealtor@cox.net	6026229567	10207 N 55th St	85253
Gerston	Sandra	sandyger@cox.net	480 948 4746	9841 n. 57 st	85253
Sarah	Paikowsky	sarahpaikowsky@gmail.com	480-368-9078	5514 E Alan Lane	85253
OTenney	Dawn	dttenney@deserthighlandsscottsdale.com	480-200-9268	5624 E Larkspur Dr	85254
Tenney	Lynn	lynn@dkltofscottsdale.com	480-45-2727	5624 E Larkspur Dr	85254
Roth	Todd	todd.roth@sbcglobal.net	847-530-7113	5433 E Cannon Dr	85253
Roth	Sheila	rothsheila@yahoo.com	847-338-4240	5433 E Cannon Dr	85253
Roth	Colleen	cgroth1@asu.edu	847-477-5242	5433 E Cannon Dr	85253
Hiland	Chris	chris@mercurytradingco.com	602.538.4195	10226 N 54th Place	85253
Hiland	Katy	katka@cox.net	602.321.7364	10226 N 54th Place	85253
Hiland	Hannah	hannah.hiland@cox.net		10226 N 54th Place	85253
pHiland	Emma	emma.hiland@cox.net		10226 N 54th Place	85253
Audrey	Lamp	alamp@asu.edu	401.215.6232	5054 E Yucca St	85254
Leslie	Speedie	lesliespeedie@yahoo.com	480.206.0581	5054 E Yucca St	85254
Craig	Lamp	craiglamp@yahoo.com	401.215.6143	5054 E Yucca St	85254
Ian	Lamp	ianlamp7@gmail.com	401.215.6230	5054 E Yucca St	85254
Bill	Grove	bgrove1946@gmail.com	602.910.3607	10821 N 53rd Way	85254
Carol	Grove	cmcf8az@gmail.com	602.573.7452	10821 N 53rd Way	85254
Andrew	Armstrong	andrewmichaelarmstrong@gmail.com	480-251-9513	10235 N. 55th PL.	85253
Robert	Dubnow	bobbydubnow@gmail.com	480-483-2007	11825 N 55th St	85254
Pat	Chiccarella	rpchiccarella@yahoo.com	602-380-1502	5504 East Cannon Drive	85253
Sherry	Brown	sherrybrown@cox.net	602-524-3138	5201 East Turquoise Ave	85253
Richard	Folz	rtfolz@msn.com	6024004655	5448 E. Oakhurst Way	85254
Julie	Chrisman	julchrisman@gmail.com	513-505-8050	5448 E Oakhurst Way	85254
Rob	Royal	robroyalaz@gmail.com	602-708-3341	5420 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Darcy	Royal	darcyroyal@gmail.com	602-501-0675	5420 E. Mercer Lane	85254
Judith	Pedersen	judithcpedersen@gmail.com	602-234-0597	5423 E Beryl Avenue	85253
Peder	Pedersen	judithcpedersen@gmail.com	602-234-0597	5423 E Beryl Avenue	85253
Eva	Pedersen	eva.pedersen@gmail.com	602-507-0168	5423 E Beryl Avenue	85253
Marla	Crown	crownlaw@cox.net	4809485303	10222 N 55th Pl	85253

Dixie	Normous	DixieNormous_100@mail.com	602 652-0163	5230 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Erdman	Tammi	inthehoodmooky@outlook.co		10450 N 52nd St	85253
Erdman	Bob	inthehoodmooky@outlook.com		10450 N 52nd St	85253
Jim	Carroll	jamescarroll1@cox.net		5426 East Alan Lane	85253
kelly	bird	kelley@me.com	(502) 489-1599	16213 N 63rd Pl	85254
leah	odoherty	leaho@cox.net	6023639461	5226 east sahuaro drive	85254
Matt	Crown	macrown@cox.net		10222 N 55th Pl	85253
Frank	Medina	monamae3@cox.net		10401 N52nd St	85253
Mona	Firestone	monamae54@gmail.com	602-881-0185	10401 N 52nd St	85253
Peggy	Jackson	peggyjacksonfeller@gmail.com		10847 N. 53rd Way	85254
Shirley	Carroll	shirleycarroll9@yahoo.com		5426 East Ian Lane	85253
cari	milller		6024218279	6930 Mcdonald Drive	85253

Emma	Paikowsky	emma.paikowsky@gmail.com		5514 East Alan Lane	85253
Dianne	Hampton	Dhampt@aol.com	202-746-3311	5122 E Shea Blvd	85254
Arthur	Paikowsky	abpaiskys@aol.com		5514 East Alan Lane	85253
Kim	Benson	kbenson54@me.com		5122 E. Shea Blvd	85254
kelly	archer	kjarcher5@gmail.com	602-908-5550	5122 E Shea Blvd	85254
steve	hartley	stevehartley@shaw.ca		5122 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Joe	De la Vara	joe@delavaraco.com	602-309-8595	5301 E. Sahuaro Drive	85254
Michelle	De la Vara	delavara@cox.net	602-316-5333	5301 E. Sahuaro Drive	85254
Nico	De la Vara	ndelavara@gmai.com	480-473-3722	5301 E. Sahuaro Drive	85254
Joseph	De la Vara	josephdlv@icloud.com	480-473-3722	5301 E. Sahuaro Drive	85254
Terry	Hartley	terryhartley@shaw.ca		5122 E. Shea Blvd	85254
Aaron	Smidt	aaronsmidt@yahoo.com		5359 E Mercer Ln	85254
Jeff	Beiser	jbeiser@ymail.com		5301 East Mercer Lane	85254
Amy	Beiser	Abeiser@ymail.com		5301 East Mercer Lane	85254
Tatum	Savocchia		602-618-4385	5249 E Shea Blvd	85254
Nick	Savocchia		602-618-3416	5249 E Shea Blvd	85254
Luis	Gonzalez		623-293-7431	5249 E Shea Blvd	85254
Randy	Oppenheimer	randyoppenheimer50@gmail.com	4803264740	5421 E Cannon Dr	85253
Julie	Oppenheimer	zonymom1@gmail.com	4806998868	5421 E Cannon Dr.	85253
Sean	Lille	thanositytree@yahoo.com	4809486073	10500 N 52nd St	85253
Diane	Lille	thanositytree@yahoo.com	4809486073	10500 N 52nd St	85253

Rasha	Kidess	duked87201@gmail.com	(480) 991-2290	4930 E Cochise Rd	85253
Reem	Kidess	duked87201@gmail.com	(480) 991-2290	4930 E Cochise Rd	85253
Nancy	Ganz	nganz@haroldganz.com	480-483-6969	5429 E Mercer Lane	84254
Harold	Ganz	hganz@haroldganz.com	480-483-6969	5429 E Mercer Lane	85254
Connie	Berger	cberger49@cox.net	602-996-9221	4526 0E. Mercer Lane	85028
Carol	Berger	cberger29@cox.net	602-996-9221	4526 E. Mercer Lane	85028
Jason	Ganz	jganz@cmgrisks.com	602-316-5412	4417 E Acoma Dr	85032
Hillary	Ganz Lee	hillaryganz@me.com	602-910-0538	4901 E Dahlia Dr	85254
Wayne	Lee	waynerlee@msn.com	602-348-7171	4901 E Dahlia Dr	85254
Ralph	Rabadi	red295wing@gmail.com	480-878-4269	10452 N 48th PI	85253
Mary	Rabadi	red295wing@gmail.com	480-878-4269	10452 N 48th PI	85253

Debby	Reynolds	gustocregino@gmail.com	605-338-4112	10416 N 52nd St	85253
Julio	Rodriguez	72ambrosekid@gmail.com		5040 E Cannon Dr	85253
Rebeca	Garcia	72ambrosekid@gmail.com		5040 E Cannon Dr	85253
Giselle	Linse	linse.giselle@gmail.com	703-371-2700	5420 E. Sahuaro Dr.	85254
CHristopher	Linse	linse.giselle@gmail.com	703-371-2700	5420 E. Sahuaro Dr.	85254
Augustine	Chavez	allvalleycarpentry@gmail.com		5054 E Cannon	85253
Alyssa	Forcehimes	allvalleycarpentry@gmail.com		5054 E Cannon	85253
David	Dorward	forchrisnato@gmail.com		10400 N 49th PI	85253
Jen	Dorward	forchrisnato@gmail.com		10400 N 49th PI	85253
John	Jurju	dtrounder@aol.com	480-699-4780	4801 E Beryl Ave	85253
Charlton	Haerter	cph3456@yahoo.com	602-549-1760	5202 E Sahuaro Drive	85254
Sonal	Haerter	haerter.sonal@gmail.com	602-758-4336	5202 E Sahuaro Drive	85254
Paul	Couture	azbrandy@outlook.com		10423 N 48th PI	85253
Robin	Couture	azbrandy@outlook.com		10423 N 48th PI	85253
Stephen	Kaplan	sk@driverprovider.com	480-998-5088	10221 N. 54th PI	85253
Barbara	Kaplan	barbara@barbarakaplan.com	480-998-5088	10221 N. 54th PI	85253
Janine	Lobello	jlo4376@gmail.com	602-341-7500	5363 e sahuaro dr.	85254
Kevin	Engelhardt	kengelhardt352@gmail.com			
Candace	Engelhardt	candaceengelhardt@gmail.co			

David O Simmons

From: Leslie <lesliespeedie@yahoo.com>
Sent: Saturday, January 30, 2021 11:25 AM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: neal rockowitz; Debra W Stark
Subject: Rezoning Case: HonorHealth Shea PUD is Z-41-20-3

Hello Mr. Simmons,

I am requesting to speak at the meeting on February 1, 2021 and would like to donate my minutes to Neal Rockowitz.

I and my husband, Craig Lamp, are opposed to the rezoning of the property on Shea for the proposed HonorHealth facility. We feel that it would diminish the value of the surrounding neighborhoods. The zoning of the property was not meant for that - it would represent poor planning and aesthetically would not add anything to the area except noise and increased traffic right where the road narrows from three to two lanes.

There are other medical facilities nearby, including a full Honor hospital approximately 4.5 miles east and an honor urgent care approximately 0.5 miles west on Shea near Tatum. Is a standalone ER a good idea? What happens when a patient needs emergency surgery or another intervention? There is now wasted transport time to a larger facility and the chance that care workers at the standalone facility will not be ready and/or qualified to treat a serious emergency. They will be treating patients of all ages.

Thank you,
Leslie Speedie and Craig Lamp

David O Simmons

From: Jody Stachel <jodystachel@cox.net>
Sent: Thursday, January 28, 2021 11:45 AM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Debra W Stark
Subject: Meeting for zoning of Honor Health on shea

I am writing to you to give my minutes to speak to Neal Rockowitz.

I am attending the meeting virtually but want to give Neal my minutes. I also want to indicate that my husband and i do not want Honor Health to build on that land that is west of Mountainside Fitness for many reasons. We live in La CAMARILLA estates and feel that Mountainside Fitness has already violated many regulations that were put in place and we have so many ongoing issues with them that we do not trust anyone else to adhere to certain laws in that location.

Thank you.

Jody and Stephen Stachel

Best Regards,

Jody Stachel
Events 13

David O Simmons

From: William Christian <whchristian@msn.com>
Sent: Wednesday, January 27, 2021 4:31 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Geno Koman
Subject: Letter Opposed to Rezoning Case Z-41-20

Dear Paradise Valley Village Planning Committee Members:

I am writing to request your support in denying Honor Health's Medical Center rezoning request, Case Z-41-20, located near 54th St and Shea Blvd.

I am a Phoenix resident and live in the North Phoenix Promontory subdivision which borders Shea Blvd starting at 54th St.

As you are aware, the proposed rezoning area is currently zoned PAD-2 SP, especially designed by the City of Phoenix to be a residential compatible area. Section 635 of the Phoenix Municipal Code for PAD zoning says: "...developments which will provide a desirable and stable environment in harmony with that of the surrounding area".

Honor Health's request will not provide neighborhood harmony or compatibility in the service and hours of operation it plans on providing and in my opinion, it does not meet the requirements for PUD rezoning. Phoenix Municipal Code Section 671 for PUD states: "Use: Appropriate limitations will be placed on the character and intensity of permitted uses to promote neighborhood compatibility." An Urgent Care and Emergency Room Medical Center with 24/7 operations should not qualify under the PUD city zoning code due to its lack of "neighborhood compatibility". 24/7 operations with increased traffic, round the clock business operations with associated noises, ambulance and otherwise, certainly do not qualify under character or intensity concerning neighborhood compatibility.

I am not only concerned about Honor Health's operations in the near future, but what about 5-10 years down the road? To borrow from the movie Field of Dreams – "if you build it, they will come." Honor Health promotes their business model to provide patients with more expeditious service and cost savings by having the opportunity to first use their 24/7 Urgent Care before needing to use Emergency Room services. As the word gets out and hospitals get overwhelmed with even longer ER wait times, more and more people will make the drive, even a longer drive, to get faster and less expensive care at the newly proposed Honor Health site. In the long term this proposed rezoning request will equate to more 24/7 traffic and more people visiting the HH Med Center at all hours – all leading to more round the clock traffic and surrounding area noise. Honor Health claims there will be very little ambulance traffic, but in the small print they acknowledge they cannot guarantee the amount. Even Honor Health's Community Organizer, Tom Bilsten, said at a meeting in Dec 2020 that if his child was to get sick in the middle of the night, he would prefer the opportunity to use a 24/7 medical center like this one versus having to take his child to a hospital emergency room. That is exactly my point! Over time its popularity will only increase drawing more and more customers and all the associated round the clock activities and noises.

With the current economy and wave of the future there are many commercially zoned areas that are or will become available. Honor Health needs to find an already commercially zoned area to build their medical center, not one surrounded by residential neighborhoods - this proposed area is not the appropriate location for a 24/7 medical business.

I am not against this portion of land being developed. I am; however, opposed to any 24/7 operation for the reasons explained above. This is not the appropriate location for this medical center business with round the clock operations. At various meetings some of us asked the Honor Health representatives if they would be willing to compromise by eliminating the ER, thus the 24/7 operation – Honor Health refused – a stark indicator of their true concerns for the surrounding residents.

Honor Health promotes a viable business model that will likely turn out to be very successful. However, it should be located in an already commercially zoned area that will still aptly serve its customers. This area of land they would like to rezone needs to be developed without 24/7 operations and with a business or set-up that is compatible, harmonious and provides a stable environment with the surrounding residential neighborhoods - the City's intent of the current PAD- 2 zoning. Honor Health's 24/7 Medical Center proposal certainly does not meet these requirements. Finally, Honor Health's stated operations do not meet PUD zoning qualifications in the "character and intensity" needed to promote neighborhood compatibility.

I ask that you vote to deny this rezoning request.

Respectfully,

William H Christian Jr
5428 E Cannon Dr

Paradise Valley, AZ 85253

David O Simmons

From: Council District 3 PCC
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 3:46 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Raquel Estupinan; Rose Ferguson
Subject: FW: Opposition to Phoenix Rezoning Case Z-41-20

Hello David,

Please see the opposition to Case Z-41-20 below.

Adam

From: Bob King <rbking2405@yahoo.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 16, 2021 3:43 PM
To: Debra W Stark <debra.stark@phoenix.gov>; Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>
Subject: Opposition to Phoenix Rezoning Case Z-41-20

Dear Councilwoman Stark -

I am writing as a resident, and in my capacity as President of the North Phoenix Promontory Homeowners Association, to oppose Phoenix Rezoning Case Z-41-20, and respectfully request that you join in this opposition.

This request pertains to the proposed Honor Health Medical Center on Shea, east of 56th Street, requiring a rezoning from residential to commercial. We feel strongly that this rezoning for a 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room operation is not compatible with our neighborhood. This neighborhood was severely impacted by the construction of the huge Mountainside Fitness facility which replaced La Camarilla; the construction of this Medical Center will cause even greater permanent irreparable harm.

Instead of granting this unnecessary re-zoning request to construct a 24/7 Emergency Room in a residential area, I believe it would be far more prudent for Honor Health to utilize the now largely vacant shopping center at the NE corner of Tatum and Shea which already has the requisite zoning. Adding more commercial zoning to a residential area when so much commercial space is currently vacant is not in the best interests of our community.

Thank you in advance for your support.

Robert and Patricia King
10213 N. 55th Street
cell: 480-241-7521

David O Simmons

From: Raquel Estupinan
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 12:04 PM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Rose Ferguson; Adam Grant
Subject: Honor Health PUD opposition

Hi David,

I received a call from Joan Smith in opposition to the Honor Health PUD. She let me know she is opposed because of the proximity to the residential neighborhood, and there are other nearby vacant properties that she feels would be more appropriate and already have the required zoning. She would like her opposition put into the record. Ms. Smith can be reached at 480-443-3733 and aerojoan1@gmail.com.

Thank you,

Raquel Estupinan
Chief of Staff
District 3 Councilwoman Debra Stark
602-261-8623 | direct
602-262-7441 | main
raquel.estupinan@phoenix.gov

David O Simmons

From: Raquel Estupinan
Sent: Wednesday, March 17, 2021 12:36 PM
To: David O Simmons
Subject: Honor Health PUD opposition

Hi David,

We received another call from a resident opposed to the Honor Health PUD. Larry Langford, who lives at 10811 N. 52nd St. is opposed for two reasons: there are other vacant lots/properties nearby that already have the required zoning; and he's concerned about rezoning practices in general and the impact that has on neighborhoods.

Mr. Langford wanted his opposition included for the record. He can be contacted at ldlmsl@cox.net or 480-443-1968.

Thank you,

Raquel Estupinan
Chief of Staff
District 3 Councilwoman Debra Stark
602-261-8623 | direct
602-262-7441 | main
raquel.estupinan@phoenix.gov

David O Simmons

From: Council District 3 PCC
Sent: Friday, March 19, 2021 8:34 AM
To: Helene Spero
Cc: David O Simmons; Adam Grant; Rose Ferguson
Subject: RE: Rezoning Case No. Z-41-20, the HonorHealth Medical Center with 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room Operations

Good morning Helene and Larry Spero,

Thank you for contacting the District 3 Office and taking the time to express your concerns about the Honor Health rezoning case. I will pass along your comments to Councilwoman Stark. I'm also copying David Simmons, the village planner, on this email.

Respectfully,

Raquel Estupinan
Chief of Staff
Councilwoman Debra Stark's Office
Main: 602-262-7441

From: Helene Spero <hbdmimi@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, March 18, 2021 7:16 PM
To: Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>
Subject: Rezoning Case No. Z-41-20, the HonorHealth Medical Center with 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room Operations

Dear Council District 3 PCC,

In 1972, my family and I moved to 5401 E. Cortez, Scottsdale, 85254. We now live at: 5403 E. Cannon Drive, Paradise Valley, 85253. I have watched this area grow literally. When we first moved here, we had to grocery shop at Bayless and during the summers, we would take a styrofoam cooler with us in order to bring our groceries home. Many things have changed but one thing that has **not changed** is that this area has grown and remained **a residential community**. We have watched people continue to invest in their residential properties. Our area is beautiful and very family conscience.

As a community, I don't really remember fighting the city on a lot of the growth that has taken place. I even remember when Smitty's originally came in and wanted to build on the corner of Tatum and Shea.

The company met with us and together we planned to satisfy both sides. When [La Camarilla Racquet Club Tennis Courts \[tennismaps.com\]](#) wanted to come into our neighborhood. They set up meetings at the community's homes and took the time to answer every question of everyone in the area. They took notes of our concerns. They went back to the drawing board and represented everything until the community was satisfied. Many signed up for membership even before they broke ground. They sought, they worked for and they earned our support.

Now Honor Health wants to come into our neighborhood, wants to change the zoning, desires to create more traffic on Shea and to force our acceptance of a facility that we truly do **NOT** want in our neighborhood! In addition, we feel strongly about this because there are so many properties open to them that are already zoned for their facility. Building on the NE corner of Tatum and Shea would be a welcome use of the land available but they are not willing to compromise or go where our neighborhood would gladly accept them.

I don't know how in good conscience your council can support this decision. We were brought up to believe that our elected officials are elected to represent our citizenship and to support those who have elected you to office. May I suggest that you work a little bit harder and think a little more deeply into finding a solution to this problem. Have any of you verified any of the people that were brought before your council by Honor Health as examples in favor of this zoning change? Some of our coordinators checked where these people reside. They are not people who reside adjacent to this property. Some live as far as eight miles away. Those of us who do live close to this property are begging you to re-examine your decision. Take the time to evaluate the alternative properties available to Honor Health. You have a solution right in front of you that would be welcomed by our community. Please show so empathy - think about how you might feel with this in your backyard. We want to know and to see the democratic process working. We are praying that you will do the job that we elected you to do.....**represent us !**

Thank you for taking the time to read how I feel; how our community feels and please seek a decision against this rezoning and a solution that would be very advantageous to us all.

Thank you,

Helene and Larry Spero

David O Simmons

From: Raquel Estupinan
Sent: Monday, March 22, 2021 7:53 AM
To: Joan Smith
Cc: David O Simmons; Rose Ferguson; Adam Grant
Subject: RE: ER zoning

Good morning Ms. Smith,

Thank you for your email. I will pass on your concerns about the Honor Health PUD to Councilwoman Stark and the village planner, David Simmons.

Respectfully,

Raquel Estupinan
Chief of Staff
Councilwoman Debra Stark's Office
Main: 602-262-7441

-----Original Message-----

From: Joan Smith <aerojoan1@gmail.com>
Sent: Friday, March 19, 2021 9:32 PM
To: Raquel Estupinan <raquel.estupinan@phoenix.gov>
Subject: ER zoning

1. Too much noise day and night.
2. Too much congestion.
3. Empty big box stores already zoned for ER purposes.
4. Tatum and Shea a much better location.
5. Would harm our community and may even lower property values.

Joan Smith
480-443-3733

David O Simmons

From: Council District 3 PCC
Sent: Tuesday, March 23, 2021 8:48 AM
To: David O Simmons
Cc: Raquel Estupinan; Rose Ferguson
Subject: FW: Save Our Neighborhood

Good morning David,

Below is an opposition to rezoning case Z-41-20-3.

Adam

From: Timothy Spooner <t.spooner@spoonerpt.com>
Sent: Tuesday, March 23, 2021 8:40 AM
To: Debra W Stark <debra.stark@phoenix.gov>
Cc: Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>
Subject: Save Our Neighborhood

Dear Councilwoman Stark,

I write this message as a resident of La Camarilla Estates and North Phoenix Promontory, and along with all of the surrounding neighborhood residents, are strongly opposed to Rezoning Case No. Z-41-20-3, the HonorHealth Medical Center with 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room Operations.

The current PAD zoning at this location, in accordance with City Municipal Code Sec 635, was designed to "provide a desirable and stable environment in harmony with that of the surrounding area." Contrary to this, the planned development is utterly out of harmony with the character of the original zoning. Rezoning of a residential parcel for a 24/7 Emergency Room could not be a more jarring replacement of the idyllic tennis club that was previously zoned for this land.

Additionally, this rezoning proposal does not meet the City's usage requirements for this area. PUD Sec 671 states: "Appropriate limitations will be placed on the character and intensity of permitted uses to promote neighborhood compatibility." 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room operations, increased ambulance service, increased traffic, associated late-night noises and lighting, are simply incompatible with the character of a residential neighborhood.

This rezoning is particularly unnecessary given the existence of an obvious compromise: Honor Health should simply be encouraged to find a nearby property that is already correctly zoned. As more and more big-box chain stores inevitably close, there will be multiple commercial properties available in the vicinity, either now or in the near future. This would allow HonorHealth to provide its services while also preserving the character of our neighborhood. We respectfully request that this rezoning case be categorically denied.

Respectfully signed,

Timothy A Spooner, PT, FAFS
President/CEO

Spooner Inc

14287 N. 87th St., Suite C-220
Scottsdale, AZ 85260

602-527-0586 Cell
480-247-8499 Fax
www.spoonerpt.com [[spoonerpt.com](mailto:info@spoonerpt.com)]



IMPORTANT: The documents accompanying this transmission contain CONFIDENTIAL INFORMATION belonging to the sender that is legally privileged. This information is intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. The authorized recipient of this information to any other party and is required to destroy the information after its stated need has been fulfilled. If you are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any reading, disclosure, copying, distribution, or action taken in reliance on the contents of these documents is strictly prohibited. Violators may be prosecuted. If you have received this email in error, please notify the sender immediately and destroy the transmitted information. *****

From: AnnDee Johnson <anndeej@cox.net>
Sent: Tuesday, March 23, 2021 3:36 PM
To: Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>
Cc: anndeej@cox.net
Subject: HonorHealth Rezoning effort on Shea Blvd.

Dear Councilwoman Stark,

I live in the Promontory subdivision across Shea Blvd from the proposed HonorHealth 24/7 Emergency Room Site. I am completely opposed to this rezoning effort and ask you to stop this. The City of Phoenix already dropped the ball by allowing the monstrosity that is Mountainside Fitness to slide under the radar and violate several zoning ordinances, such as height and signage. Please do not compound this mistake by allowing this proposed rezoning to happen.

I have lived in my house for 26 years and this rezoning, if allowed to happen, will completely disrupt our whole area, comprising several residential neighborhoods. I ask you to consider how you would like it if someone were allowed to put a 24/7 emergency room right across the street from your house? I suspect you would not appreciate it. I ask you to put yourself in our shoes. We have all invested in our community and do not want it blasted apart like this. The noise and traffic increase will be impossible.

The northeast corner of Tatum and Shea offers several sites that are already zoned commercial and could easily accommodate a facility like this. In fact, HonorHealth is now part owner of the UrgentCare facility on that corner.

Please respect our neighborhoods and STOP THIS REZONING EFFORT!

AnnDee Johnson
5503 E Alan Ln
Scottsdale, AZ 85253

From: AnnDee Johnson <anndeej@cox.net>
Sent: Tuesday, March 23, 2021 3:36 PM
To: Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>
Cc: anndeej@cox.net
Subject: HonorHealth Rezoning effort on Shea Blvd.

Dear Councilwoman Stark,

I live in the Promontory subdivision across Shea Blvd from the proposed HonorHealth 24/7 Emergency Room Site. I am completely opposed to this rezoning effort and ask you to stop this. The City of Phoenix already dropped the ball by allowing the monstrosity that is Mountainside Fitness to slide under the radar and violate several zoning ordinances, such as height and signage. Please do not compound this mistake by allowing this proposed rezoning to happen.

I have lived in my house for 26 years and this rezoning, if allowed to happen, will completely disrupt our whole area, comprising several residential neighborhoods. I ask you to consider how you would like it if someone were allowed to put a 24/7 emergency room right across the street from your house? I suspect you would not appreciate it. I ask you to put yourself in our shoes. We have all invested in our community and do not want it blasted apart like this. The noise and traffic increase will be impossible.

The northeast corner of Tatum and Shea offers several sites that are already zoned commercial and could easily accommodate a facility like this. In fact, HonorHealth is now part owner of the UrgentCare facility on that corner.

Please respect our neighborhoods and STOP THIS REZONING EFFORT!

AnnDee Johnson
5503 E Alan Ln
Scottsdale, AZ 85253

-----Original Message-----

From: Al And Sharon Bieniek <asbien@cox.net>

Sent: Thursday, March 25, 2021 8:18 PM

To: Mayor Gallego <mayor.gallego@phoenix.gov>; Thelda Williams <thelda.williams@phoenix.gov>; Jim Waring <Jim.Waring@phoenix.gov>; Debra W Stark <debra.stark@phoenix.gov>; Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>; Laura Pastor <laura.pastor@phoenix.gov>; Betty S Guardado <betty.guardado@phoenix.gov>; Sal DiCiccio <sal.diciccio@phoenix.gov>; Michael.nowakowski@phoenix.gov; Carlos D Garcia <carlos.garcia@phoenix.gov>

Subject: Rezoning, La Camarilla

As all of you may be aware, Honor Health is requesting that the City of Phoenix rezone a parcel of land on Shea Blvd. and 52nd Street from PAD 2 to C-O in order to build a 24 hour 7 day a week emergency room. I sat in the recent meeting with the zoning commission which approved the zoning change. Honor Health's attorney expressed the need in the area for this new type of medical facility, but did NOT MENTION why it had to be on that parcel!!! There are properly zoned empty shopping centers at Tatum and Shea, as well as around PV mall. So what's the fascination with this property that backs up to a residential neighborhood? I was always told to "follow the money". There appears to be two organizations that will profit greatly from locating this facility here.

Mountainside Fitness which owns the land in question and the Johnson Companies who owns the multistory office property already zoned C-O immediately to the west of this parcel. Are they the ones supporting and promoting this?? Honor Health can afford to go anywhere. My question to all of you and to Honor Health is when have you seen a medical facility that does not grow over time? I foresee the future facility stretching from 54th Street to the wash on the west with both of the above organizations selling to Honor Health. What then, a multistory surgical center, cancer treatment center, enhanced ER with not only ambulances but maybe helicopters?? I am a property owner on 52nd Street (and part of La Camarilla) which will be impacted by the reduced property values caused by adding this facility not to mention the increased traffic and stop lights on a already gridlocked Shea Blvd..

Al Bieniek, Phoenix

--

This email has been checked for viruses by Avast antivirus software.

[https://urldefense.com/v3/__https://www.avast.com/antivirus__;!!LkjWUF49MRd51_ry!MDIArt2HZvG9C826ti2rKH_Ug_w8sXUy9yVF4msnz2Wul_fKgULo0Bj1YtIupYLYQW3mfwYIO6GC\\$](https://urldefense.com/v3/__https://www.avast.com/antivirus__;!!LkjWUF49MRd51_ry!MDIArt2HZvG9C826ti2rKH_Ug_w8sXUy9yVF4msnz2Wul_fKgULo0Bj1YtIupYLYQW3mfwYIO6GC$)

From: JDK <johnndavidkay@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, March 25, 2021 6:04 PM

To: Council District 3 PCC <council.district.3@phoenix.gov>

Subject: PROPOSED HonorHealth 24-hour Emergency Room and Urgent Care center at 54th St. and Shea

I write urging you to protect and defend the residential nature of the beautiful part of the Shea Boulevard corridor my family moved onto in 2008, by VOTING NO on the OUTRAGEOUS proposal by HonorHealth, which has gotten way too far already! This proposal would bring a 24-hour commercial business right to my front door. This would be horrible for me and my neighbors in North Promontory - RIGHT ACROSS SHEA BOULEVARD from HonorHealth's NEW HOSPITAL!

How much real estate tax relief will you also vote in favor of, to compensate me for the loss of value your irresponsible and reckless behavior is about to inflict on me?

How about I find some nifty commercial operation to develop next to your house?

DO THE RIGHT THING HERE!!! VOTE TO REJECT THIS OUTRAGEOUS INCONSISTENT LAND USE IN MY FRONT YARD!

Thanks.

Best regards,

John David Kay

5407 E Shea Blvd

Scottsdale, AZ 85254

(610) 733-6974

From: Larry Spero <lrspero@gmail.com>

Sent: Thursday, March 25, 2021 6:08 PM

Subject: The rezoning of the property on E. Shea and 54th St. for Honor Health. Rezoning Case No. Z-41-20, the HonorHealth Medical Center with 24/7 Urgent Care and Emergency Room Operations

To Whom It May Concern,

I have previously written to you begging you **not to approve** this rezoning. My letter was extensive and it included numerous reasons why your vote should be **no**. Today, I was driving on Shea. I came across a piece of land on Shea, across the street from Fry's on the north side of the street. It is adjacent to where the new traffic light was installed on Shea just west of Tatum. The land is just west of the shopping center where Trader Joe's is located. There is a separate building directly to the west of this piece of property. This would be a perfect place for HonorHealth to build their Emergency Room.

While I am not in commercial real estate, I would think that this land is worth Honor Health to take a look and see if it meets their demands: It already has the zoning. It already has the traffic light. In addition, they can still capitalize on the fact that they could build a standalone building in a "high income and highly insured" areas. If affiliated with a hospital (HonorHealth), the facility can upcharge all services. If they are 24/7, they can upcharge even more. While this particular site is not directly across the street from PV nor does it have the zip code of 85253. (The PV zip code of 85253 is ranked #1 in AZ for MEDIAN INCOME and #2 for INCOME GROWTH.) This property that I am talking about is not across the street, BUT it is *diagonally across from PV*. (HonorHealth can not buy in the zip code in PV because PV does not permit development like this) So, the next best thing is to open the facility across the street in PHX *or one that is diagonally across still in PHX*. HonorHealth is literally unconcerned about the downside for our neighborhood. It really shows because of all the millions of empty commercial square footage nearby at Tatum/Shea and Tatum/Cactus already zoned properly."

Please consider how your voters feel. With all this property available to them, they must get rezoning of a piece of property right in the middle of an upscale neighborhood where the citizens really care about their homes. Please, please do your jobs. Represent your voters and protect our properties.

Thank you.

Larry and Helene Spero
5403 E. Cannon Drive
PV, AZ 85253
