

### City Council Formal Meeting

---

Wednesday, November 7, 2018

2:30 PM

phoenix.gov

---

#### **CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL**

The Phoenix City Council convened in formal session on Wednesday, November 7, 2018 at 2:37 p.m. in the Council Chambers.

**Present:** 8 - Councilman Sal DiCiccio, Councilwoman Vania Guevara, Councilwoman Felicita M. Mendoza, Councilman Michael Nowakowski, Councilwoman Laura Pastor, Councilwoman Debra Stark, Vice Mayor Jim Waring, and Mayor Thelda Williams

Councilman Nowakowski entered the Chambers and joined the voting body during Citizen Comments held at the beginning of the meeting. Councilman DiCiccio left the Chambers, but remained part of the voting body via telephone during discussion on Item 79.

#### **CITIZEN COMMENTS**

Elizabeth Mann discussed the history of the zoning application for the Chinese Cultural Center. She noted the application was approved by the City in 1996 and at that time it was required to include public art in the development. She mentioned the Chinese cultural garden and iconic roof lines met the City zoning requirements. She expressed concern for the public art at the center which is endangered and suggested the City did nothing to help stop its destruction. She added it was a poor argument to say the public art was not paid for by the City. She said the issue was not about the Chinese Cultural Center, but the ability for the City to administrate regulations, requirements, and the public art program.

Note: Councilman Nowakowski entered the Chambers and joined the voting body.

Charles Qian talked about the destruction of the Chinese Cultural Center, and

stated as an arts-lover, it reminded him of other tragedies. He conveyed the destruction of the Chinese Cultural Center was destroying his faith in government, and asked for the City to do something to enforce laws and rules to protect artwork at the Chinese Cultural Center.

Zach Morgan noted he was a pastor at Apologia Church, and added he came to express concerns with issues of great importance. He discussed the history of President John Quincy Adams and slavery in the United States, and related that to a Bible verse. He mentioned a group of people were oppressed in terms of abortion, and added innocent lives were lost every day. He asked Council to uphold their duty to abide by Arizona Revised Statute 13-3603.

Diane Barker expressed her pleasure with the growth of downtown Phoenix, and noted her displeasure with traffic-caused congestion and pollution. She said the pollution affects the most vulnerable, including children. She asked for staff to direct traffic on Roosevelt Street when needed, to avoid congestion.

Leonard Clark talked about his concern with the repairs at the Chinese Cultural Center, and possible destruction of artwork. He also discussed a global climate change plan for Phoenix. He described the effects of climate change, and noted climate change could lead to a global crisis. He stated he was pro-justice, and asked for a citizen oversight commission with subpoena powers because Phoenix is one of the last major cities to not have one.

Mayor Williams acknowledged the presence of Mario Barajas, a Spanish interpreter. In Spanish, Mr. Barajas announced his availability to the audience.

The City Clerk confirmed that copies of the titles of Ordinances G-6518 through G-6528, S-45071 through S-45131, and Resolutions 21686 through 21692 were available to the public in the office of the City Clerk at least 24 hours prior to this Council meeting and, therefore, may be read by title or agenda item only pursuant to the City Code.

References to attachments in these minutes relate to documents that were attached to the agenda.

## **MINUTES OF MEETINGS**

### **1 For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Formal Meeting on**

**Aug. 29, 2018****Summary**

This item transmits the minutes of the Formal Meeting of Aug. 29, 2018, for review, correction and/or approval by the City Council.

The minutes are available for review in the City Clerk Department, 200 W. Washington St., 15th Floor.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be approved. The motion carried by the following voice vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**2 For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Formal Meeting on Sept. 5, 2018**

**Summary**

This item transmits the minutes of the Formal Meeting of Sept. 5, 2018, for review, correction and/or approval by the City Council.

The minutes are available for review in the City Clerk Department, 200 W. Washington St., 15th Floor.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Guevara, seconded by Councilwoman Pastor, that this item be approved. The motion carried by the following voice vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS**

**3 Mayor and Council Appointments to Boards and Commissions**

**Summary**

This item transmits recommendations from the Mayor and Council for appointment or reappointment to City Boards and Commissions.

The following individuals were recommended for appointment/reappointment by Mayor Williams and Councilmembers:

Citizens Transportation Commission

Appoint Alex Navidad, representing District 8, replacing Patrick Brennan, for a term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilwoman Mendoza.

Reappoint David Adame, representing District 7, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilman Nowakowski.

Reappoint Bret Aldieri, representing District 3, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilwoman Stark.

Reappoint Sue Glawe, representing District 5, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilwoman Guevara.

Reappoint Gabe Loyola, representing District 4, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilwoman Pastor.

Reappoint Roy Miller, representing District 6, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Councilman DiCiccio.

Reappoint Dave Siebert, representing District 1, for his first full term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Mayor Williams.

Reappoint William "Sparky" Smith, representing District 2, for a second term to expire June 30, 2021 as recommended by Vice Mayor Waring.

The following individuals were recommended for appointment/reappointment by Mayor Williams:

Design Review Committee

Appoint Tiffany Halperin, replacing Bryan Bazley as a representative of the Central City Village Planning Committee, for a term to expire Aug. 31, 2020.

Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission

Appoint Josh Bendor, replacing Spencer Scharff, for a term to expire Aug. 31, 2018.

Industrial Development Authority Board

Appoint Breeann Adleman, replacing Sal Rivera, for a partial term to

expire May 1, 2021.

Appoint Tess Burleson, replacing Christa Severns, for a partial term to expire Nov. 1, 2019.

Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board

Appoint Brian Foster, for a partial term previously held by Byron Jones to expire Dec. 15, 2018.

Planning Commission

Appoint Pete Gorriaz, replacing William Whitaker, for a term to expire April 15, 2019.

Appoint Nico Howard, replacing Andrea Katsenes, for a term to expire April 15, 2022.

Reappoint Justin Johnson, for a second term to expire April 15, 2021.

Reappoint John Montalvo, for his first full term to expire April 15, 2020.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilman DiCiccio, that this item be approved as revised. The motion carried by the following voice vote:**

**Yes:**                    8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara,  
                                 Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski,  
                                 Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor  
                                 Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:**                    0

Mayor Williams administered the oath of office to the following Boards and Commissions appointees:

Bret Aldieri, and Roy Miller - Citizens Transportation Commission;  
Josh Bendor - Environmental Quality and Sustainability Commission;  
Breeann Adleman - Industrial Development Authority Board;  
Brian Foster - Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board; and  
Pete Gorriaz - Planning Commission

The above individuals were invited to approach the dais so Council could extend their appreciation.

**LIQUOR LICENSES, BINGO, AND OFF-TRACK BETTING LICENSE APPLICATIONS**

Mayor Williams requested a motion on liquor license items. A motion was made as appears below.

Note: Comment cards were submitted for the record in favor of the following items, with no one wishing to speak:

Jody Farley - Applicant, Item 5  
Sarhadoon Odisho - Applicant, Item 7  
Harry Todd Goldman - Agent, Item 8  
Elizabeth Alva - Applicant, Item 10  
Margaret Neno - Applicant, Item 13  
Diandra Montano, Item 14  
Gilberto Hernandez - Applicant, Item 16  
Brian Szymura - Agent, Item 17  
Kim Graham - Agent, Item 19

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that Items 4-21 be recommended for approval, except Item 21 which is recommended for disapproval, and noting Item 20 is withdrawn. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara,  
Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski,  
Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor  
Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

#### **4 Liquor License - Wet N Wild**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application  
07070848.

#### **Summary**

##### Applicant

Jeffrey Miller, Agent

##### License Type

Series 7 - Beer and Wine Bar

Location

4243 W. Pinnacle Peak Road

Zoning Classification: RE-43

Council District: 1

This request is for an ownership transfer of a liquor license for a water park. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and may currently operate with an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 13, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This applicant does not hold an interest in any other active liquor license in the State of Arizona.

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

“We will ensure any employees handling alcohol will attend the Title 4 basic liquor law course.”

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because: “We purchased the park and would like to continue to offer the guests of Wet N Wild an alcoholic beverage if they choose.”

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - Wet N Wild

Liquor License Map - Wet N Wild

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**5 Liquor License - Special Event - The Singletons**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**

Applicant

Jody Farley

Location

21001 N. Tatum Blvd.

Council District: 2

Function

Community Event

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Nov. 11, 2018 - 9:30 a.m. to 12:30 p.m. / 500 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**



**6 Liquor License - Copper Blues Live**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 06070407.

**Summary**Applicant

Andrea Lewkowitz, Agent

License Type

Series 6 - Bar

Location

21001 N. Tatum Blvd., Ste. 38-1350

Zoning Classification: C-2 DRSP

Council District: 2

This request is for an ownership and location transfer of a liquor license for a bar. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and does not have an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 30, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

The ownership of this business has an interest in other active liquor license(s) in the State of Arizona. This information is listed below and

includes liquor license violations on file with the AZ Department of Liquor Licenses and Control and, for locations within the boundaries of Phoenix, the number of aggregate calls for police service within the last 12 months for the address listed.

Stand Up Live/Copper Blues (Series 6)

50 W. Jefferson St., #200, Phoenix

Calls for police service: 188

Liquor license violations: In April 2012, a warning letter was issued for failure to request ID from underage buyer and for selling, giving, furnishing underage person with alcohol. In November 2015, a warning letter was issued for allowing disorderly to remain on premises.

Tempe Improv/Copper Blues (Series 6)

930 E. University Drive, D1-201, Tempe

Calls for police service: N/A - not in Phoenix

Liquor license violations: None

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"Applicant is committed to upholding the highest standards for business and maintaining compliance with applicable laws. Managers and staff will be trained in the techniques of legal and responsible alcohol sales and service."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because:

"Copper Blues will open its second Phoenix location at Desert Ridge Marketplace. The club will feature live comedy and concerts. Applicant

would like to offer guests 21 and over the opportunity to enjoy alcoholic beverages as an incident to the entertainment.”

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - Copper Blues Live

Liquor License Map - Copper Blues Live

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**7 Liquor License - Special Event - St. George Church, The Ancient Apostolic Church Of**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**

Applicant

Sarhadoon Odisho

Location

1915 W. Thunderbird Road

Council District: 3

Function

New Year's Eve Party

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Dec. 31, 2018 - 8 p.m. to 2 a.m. / 400 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**8 Liquor License - Zipps Sports Grill**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31317.

## Summary

### Applicant

Harry Goldman, Agent

### License Type

Series 12 - Restaurant

### Location

10662 N. 32nd St.

Zoning Classification: C-2

Council District: 3

This request is for a new liquor license for a restaurant. This location was not previously licensed for liquor sales and does not have an interim permit. This business is currently being remodeled with plans to open in February 2019.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 9, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

### Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This information is not provided due to the multiple ownership interests held by the applicant in the State of Arizona.

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I am currently an Agent for 13 Series 12 liquor licenses, all of which have a solid history. I am fully aware of the responsibility that it takes to maintain a license in good standing with the City, State and local residents. I also understand that holding a liquor license is a privileges which comes with great responsibility and have always taken this very seriously."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because:

" We will keep our building and surrounding areas clean with respect to the center and the surrounding residential community. All noise restrictions will be respected. We are a positive addition to our communities, bringing jobs and a great local place for friends and family to come together. We also believe in donating and giving back to our communities which can be substantiated over the past 25 years."

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application noting the applicant must resolve any pending City of Phoenix building and zoning requirements, and be in compliance with the City of Phoenix Code and Ordinances.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - Zipps Sports Grill

Liquor License Map - Zipps Sports Grill

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**9 Liquor License - Special Event - Rosie's House: A Music Academy**

**for Children, Inc.**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**Applicant

Alyson Hartsock

Location

300 E. Indian School Road

Council District: 4

Function

Concert

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Dec. 2, 2018 - 3 p.m. to 5:30 p.m. / 300 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**10 Liquor License - 27th Ave Market**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31466.

**Summary**Applicant

Elizabeth Alva, Agent

License Type

Series 10 - Beer and Wine Store

Location

2720 W. Indian School Road

Zoning Classification: C-2

Council District: 4

This request is for a new liquor license for a convenience store that does not sell gas. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and may currently operate with an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 10, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

#### Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This applicant does not hold an interest in any other active liquor license in the State of Arizona.

#### Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

#### Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I hold a certificate for 'The Basic Liquor Law Training'. This training

provided me the opportunity of learning the importance and significance of obtaining a beer and wine license. I am assured to uphold the laws and regulations about beer and wine license. I have never been involved in any criminal activity, no record of getting in trouble with law and authorities.”

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because: “This store will provide a safe and secure place for the neighborhood to buy beer and wine. The location will be convenient for the people in neighborhood who may not have access to transportation. Adding the long time experience of the owner with running a store while upholding all the laws and regulations, the store will be a safe, secure and convenience place for the customer to purchase quality liquor.”

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - 27th Ave Market

Liquor License Map - 27th Ave Market

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**11 Liquor License - Special Event - Veterans Transportation**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**

Applicant

Eric Morales

Location

4344 W. Indian School Road, Ste. 100

Council District: 5

Function

Concert



Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Nov. 14, 2018 - 7 p.m. to 2 a.m. / 500 attendees

Nov. 15, 2018 - 7 p.m. to 2 a.m. / 500 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**12 Liquor License - Special Event - Veterans Transportation**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**Applicant

Eric Morales

Location

4344 W. Indian School Road, Ste. 100

Council District: 5

Function

Concert

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Nov. 17, 2018 - 7 p.m. to 2 a.m. / 500 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**13 Liquor License - Special Event - North Valley Chorale**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**Applicant

Margaret Neno

Location

4633 N. 54th St.  
Council District: 6

Function

Dinner

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Nov. 17, 2018 - 6:30 p.m. to 10 p.m. / 150 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**14     Liquor License - Angry Crab Shack & BBQ**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31770.

**Summary**Applicant

Jeffrey Miller, Agent

License Type

Series 12 - Restaurant

Location

3820 E. Ray Road, Ste. 30  
Zoning Classification: C-2 PCD  
Council District: 6

This request is for a new liquor license for a restaurant. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and may currently operate with an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 13, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of

the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

#### Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This information is not provided due to the multiple ownership interests held by the applicant in the State of Arizona.

#### Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

#### Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"We will ensure employees will attend the Ttiel 4 liquor law courses through ALIC."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because:

"We would like to continue to offer our patrons an alcoholic beverage if they choose."

#### Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

#### Attachments

Liquor License Data - Angry Crab Shack & BBQ

Liquor License Map - Angry Crab Shack & BBQ

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**15 Liquor License - Special Event - Downtown Phoenix Partnership, Inc.**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**

Applicant

Sara Lynch

Location

424 N. Central Ave.

Council District: 7

Function

Community Event

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Dec. 1, 2018 - 5 p.m. to 10 p.m. / 1,000 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**16 Liquor License - Brewskis Distribution LLC**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31746.

**Summary**

Applicant

Gilberto Hernandez, Agent

License Type

Series 4 - Wholesaler

Location

431 N. 47th Ave.

Zoning Classification: A-1

Council District: 7

This request is for a new liquor license for a wholesaler. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and does not have an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 13, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, consideration may be given only to the applicant's personal qualifications and not to the location.

Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This applicant does not hold an interest in any other active liquor license in the State of Arizona.

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I've been a bussines owner for more then 10 year I am very responsable I own Economy Drywall."

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**17 Liquor License - Twisted Distribution LLC**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31968.

**Summary**

Applicant

Brian Szymura, Agent

License Type

Series 4 - Wholesaler

Location

825 N. 73rd Ave., Ste.126

Zoning Classification: Industrial Park

Council District: 7

This request is for a new liquor license for a wholesaler. This location was not previously licensed for liquor sales and does not have an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 17, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, consideration should be given only to the applicant's personal qualifications.

Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This applicant does not hold an interest in any other active liquor license in the State of Arizona.

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I was in restaurant management before I was a stay-at-home dad for 12 years. I have the abilities to multi-task and manage situations in a calm and deliberate manner. In addition, I have been alcohol free for over 3

years, and I strive to live a healthy lifestyle.”

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**18 Liquor License - Special Event - Alwun House Foundation**

Request for a Series 15 - Special Event liquor license for the temporary sale of all liquors.

**Summary**

Applicant

Dana Johnson

Location

1204 E. Roosevelt St.

Council District: 8

Function

Community Event

Date(s) - Time(s) / Expected Attendance

Dec. 7, 2018 - 7 p.m. to 1 a.m. / 250 attendees

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**19 Liquor License - Club at Phoenix**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 31384.

**Summary**

Applicant

Kim Graham, Agent

License Type

Series 14 - Club

Location

3800 E. Sky Harbor Blvd., T4 N4 IC-Club Level

Zoning Classification: A-1

Council District: 8

This request is for a new liquor license for a club. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and may currently operate with an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application is Nov. 9, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This information is not provided due to the multiple ownership interests held by the applicant in the State of Arizona.

Public Opinion

No protest or support letters were received within the 20-day public comment period.

Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:



"I am the agent for the owner, Sodexo America, LLC. The Sodexo organization has operated in North America since the 1970's. Sodexo is a current liquor license holder in the State of Arizona and is a leading provider of integrated food, facilities management and other services that enhance organizational performance and improves the quality of life daily in North America."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because: "The licensed premises is an existing business at the Phoenix Airport. Sodexo is the new management company of the "Club at Phoenix" and will continue to provide a relaxing space for all travelers to compress, enjoy a comfortable place to rest and relax before their flights."

Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends approval of this application.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - Club at Phoenix

Liquor License Map - Club at Phoenix

**This item was recommended for approval.**

**20 (CONTINUED FROM OCT. 3 AND 17, 2018) - Liquor License - Speedo Business**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 28037.

**Summary**

Applicant

Odette Odeh, Agent

License Type

Series 10 - Beer and Wine Store

Location

4150 N. 35th Ave.

Zoning Classification: C-2

Council District: 5

This request is for a new liquor license for a convenience store that sells gas. This location was previously licensed for liquor sales and may currently operate with an interim permit.

The 60-day limit for processing this application was Oct. 5, 2018.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

#### Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

The ownership of this business has an interest in other active liquor license(s) in the State of Arizona. This information is listed below and includes liquor license violations on file with the AZ Department of Liquor Licenses and Control and, for locations within the boundaries of Phoenix, the number of aggregate calls for police service within the last 12 months for the address listed.

Gas & Food Mart (Series 10)  
1902 W. Cactus Road, Phoenix  
Calls for police service: 30

Liquor license violations: In January 2014, a fine of \$375 was paid for delinquent taxes. In March 2017, a fine of \$750 was paid for failure to request ID from an underage buyer and selling, giving, furnishing an underage person with alcohol.

#### Public Opinion

One letter protesting the issuance of this license has been received and

is on file in the Office of the City Clerk. The letter is from the Sevilla Neighborhood Association. They feel the applicant has a pattern of problematic business practices including several tax liens, allowing intoxicated transients to loiter on their property, and failure to maintain their property free from weeds, trash and litter. They also feel the location, which is already challenged with high crime, requires a highly responsible operator with a proven track record. They believe the applicant does not meet this criteria. They do not support the issuance of this liquor license.

#### Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I had a liquor license for the past 20 year and I had more than one business with liquor lincense and I have been very sucessfull in running them."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because:

"I service the community and I have a very good service with the community."

#### Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends disapproval of this application based on a Police Department recommendation for disapproval and neighborhood protest. The Police Department disapproval is based on concerns with the applicants' capability, reliability and qualifications to hold and control a liquor license. The applicants provided inaccurate information on the application and have had numerous liquor license violations, blight violations and civil judgments levied against them. The applicants have not demonstrated the capability, qualifications and reliability to hold and control a liquor license.

#### Attachments

Liquor License Data - Speedo Business

Liquor License Map - Speedo Business

Liquor License Police Department Recommendation - Speedo Business

**This item was withdrawn.**

**21 Liquor License - T & C Convenience Store**

Request for a liquor license. Arizona State License Application 29630.

**Summary**

Applicant

Cimo Berrada, Agent

License Type

Series 10 - Beer and Wine Store

Location

4812 N. 35th Ave.

Zoning Classification: C-2

Council District: 5

This request is for a new liquor license for a convenience store that does not sell gas. This location was not previously licensed for liquor sales and does not have an interim permit. This location requires a Use Permit to allow package liquor sales.

The 60-day limit for processing this application was Oct. 27, 2018.

However, the applicant submitted a written request for more time.

Pursuant to A.R.S. 4-203, a spirituous liquor license shall be issued only after satisfactory showing of the capability, qualifications and reliability of the applicant and that the public convenience and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance. If an application is filed for the issuance of a license for a location, that on the date the application is filed has a valid license of the same series issued at that location, there shall be a rebuttable presumption that the public convenience and best interest of the community at that location was established at the time the location was previously licensed. The

presumption shall not apply once the licensed location has not been in use for more than 180 days.

#### Other Active Liquor License Interest in Arizona

This applicant does not hold an interest in any other active liquor license in the State of Arizona.

#### Public Opinion

One letter protesting the issuance of this license have been received and is on file in the Office of the City Clerk. The letter is from Sevilla Neighborhood Association. They feel that the additional liquor license housed in a smoke shop retailer is not consistent with the best interest of this community.

#### Applicant's Statement

The applicant submitted the following statement in support of this application. Spelling, grammar and punctuation in the statement are shown exactly as written by the applicant on the City Questionnaire.

I have the capability, reliability and qualifications to hold a liquor license because:

"I am responsible honest individual who will do the right thing for the city, community and our customers. This will be a family owned convenience store to help local residents around the area with any necessities they need for their residence as well as sale of beer and wine."

The public convenience requires and the best interest of the community will be substantially served by the issuance of the liquor license because:

"We will make sure no rules or laws will be broken, the business will be ran having the City and community's best interest in mind. This convenience store will help the 1000s of residents that live around the area with any necessities they may need for their households from cleaning supplies, to snacks chips and candy, to non-alcoholic beverages to beer and wine."

#### Staff Recommendation

Staff recommends disapproval of this application based on a Police

Department recommendation for disapproval. The Police Department disapproval is based on hidden ownership and admitted to lying on the application. The applicant has not demonstrated the capability, qualifications and reliability to hold and control a liquor license.

Attachments

Liquor License Data - T & C Convenience Store

Liquor License Map - T & C Convenience Store

Liquor License Police Department Recommendation - T & C Convenience Store

Councilwoman Guevara asked to hear a staff report and police report.

Police Detective Robin Gokool, Jr. spoke on behalf of the Police Department Cactus Park Precinct, stating they recommended disapproval for the Series 10 liquor license for the T & C Convenience Store. He noted Cimo Berrada was not reliable, capable, or qualified for a liquor license because of the following reasons: hidden ownership related to the business, criminal activity related to sale and possession of dangerous drugs and paraphernalia, and illegal sale of tobacco. He stated Mr. Berrada worked six to seven days a week at a banking institute in downtown Phoenix, and added Mr. Berrada said the store was an investment for when he retired and in the meantime his parents were running the store. Det. Gokool, Jr. described his meeting with Mr. Berrada's parents, Khalid Berrada and Khadou Ghannam and described the convenience store as covered in dust and missing price tag labels. Khalid acknowledged the cigarettes on display did not have a stamp which was required for sales, and he stated half of the cigarettes were for sale while the other half were for personal use, which is not allowed.

Det. Gokool, Jr. said he did a criminal background check on Mr. Berrada's parents and found that Khalid had been arrested previously at a tobacco shop related to the sale of dangerous drugs. He said Khalid had an outstanding warrant and therefore, arrested him. When he arrested him, Khalid had \$1,900 in cash and there was spice in the cigarette loader. He noted Khalid had admitted he had spice there for personal use. Det. Gokool, Jr. conducted another search warrant for the business where he recovered ledgers, drug paraphernalia and several ounces of spice. He acknowledged the area had a major drug problem, and noted

because of those reasons he said Mr. Berrada should not be issued a liquor license.

Lawrrie Fitzhugh spoke in opposition, and stated she was representing the Sevilla Neighborhood Association. She said they were protesting the liquor license application as to person and location and because of the over-saturation of liquor licenses in the area. She mentioned during their review of public records, they determined the applicant was unreliable and harmful to the neighborhood. She talked about how her neighborhood association and other neighborhood associations advocated to protect children by limiting their access to tobacco, vaping products, and alcohol. She noted the application was counter-intuitive to the Canyon Corridor redevelopment area, and asked for support to recommend disapproval of the application.

Councilwoman Guevara asked if the applicant was present in the Chambers, and after hearing no response she motioned to disapprove Item 21 based on the Police Department recommendation and neighborhood protests, to which Vice Mayor Waring seconded.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Guevara, seconded by Vice Mayor Waring, that this item be recommended for disapproval based on Police Department recommendation and neighborhood protest. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:**                    8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:**                    0

### **ORDINANCES, RESOLUTIONS, AND NEW BUSINESS**

Mayor Williams requested a motion on the remaining agenda items. A motion was made, as appears below.

Note: Comment cards were submitted for the record by the following individuals:

Conor Gleasa - In Favor, Item 80

Brian Neely - In Favor, Item 116  
Carolyn Christy - In Favor, Item 116  
Terri Gillies - In Favor, Item 116  
Peggy Neely - In Favor, Item 116  
Sebastien Reyes - In Favor, Item 118  
Viri Hernandez - Opposed, Item 118

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that Items 22-127 be approved or adopted, except Items 33, 40-41, 65, 74-75, 79, 100, 119-123, and 126-127; noting that Item 43 has been withdrawn; Item 118 has been continued to the Nov. 14, 2018 City Council Formal Meeting, and Items 124-125 have been continued to the Dec. 5, 2018 City Council Formal Meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara,  
Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski,  
Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor  
Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

Items 22-32, 34-39, Ordinance S-45071 were requests to authorize the City Controller to disburse funds, up to amounts indicated for the purpose of paying vendors, contractors, claimants and others, and providing additional payment authority under certain existing city contracts. This section also requested continuing payment authority, up to amounts indicated below, for the following contracts, contract extensions and/or bids awarded. As indicated below, some items below require payment pursuant to Phoenix City Code section 42-13.

## **22 Telos Identity Management Solutions, LLC**

For \$95,000.00 in additional payment authority for Contract 139716 for Designated Aviation Channeling Services for the Aviation Department. Telos Identity Management Solutions processes electronic fingerprint-based background checks and federally-mandated security threat assessments for all employees who work or provide services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport. These services are required by Federal security regulations; additional payment authority will allow submission of fingerprint-based criminal history record checks and security threat assessments through the life of the contract.



**This item was adopted.**

**23 Courier Graphics Corp.**

For \$80,000.00 in payment authority for the printing, addressing and mailing of a publicity pamphlet for the November 2018 Special Election for the City Clerk Department. The current contracted vendor, Century Graphics, went out of business without giving the City advance notice. The cost for Courier Graphics to create and disseminate the pamphlet is comparable to the contracted pricing for Century Graphics. State law and City Code require the mailing of a publicity pamphlet to households with at least one registered voter before early ballots are mailed. To meet this requirement, pamphlets must be mailed out 35 days prior to the election.

**This item was adopted.**

**24 Matheson Tri-Gas Inc.**

For \$360,000.00 in additional payment authority to add the Water Services Department as an authorized user of Contract 148124 for five years for welding supplies. The contract was initially established for use by the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments to supply a variety of welding related materials, tools and equipment needed to complete repairs to City facilities and equipment.

**This item was adopted.**

**25 Tri-Tech Forensics, Inc.**

For \$15,000.00 in payment authority for a new contract, entered on or about Nov. 1, 2018 for a term of five years, to purchase urine kits for the Police Department. The kits are vital for the Laboratory Services Bureau and for the Police Officers to test suspect urine samples, driving under the influence of drugs, sexual assault and homicide cases. In addition, the kits offer evidence collection tools, containers that provide verifiable chain of custody, security against tampering, and provable security of different types of evidence related to cases. This equipment is a critical part of the Police Department's effort to provide life safety services to the public and for use in critical incidence and complicated scenes.

**This item was adopted.**

**26 Mobile Training Solutions, LLC**

For \$40,000.00 in payment authority for a new contract, entered into on

or about Nov. 8, 2018, for a five-year period. This contract will provide training services for approximately 200 Parks and Recreation Department pesticide applicators. The training will occur semi-annually at multiple City locations and will cover a variety of pest-related topics such as wood-destroying organism management, ornamental turf, weed control, aquatics, and fumigation. This training is necessary to maintain current pesticide applicator licensing for department staff and also satisfies the continuing education requirement of the Pest Management Division of the Arizona Department of Agriculture.

**This item was adopted.**

**27 Raftelis Financial Consultants, Inc.**

For \$70,000.00 in additional payment authority to add the Finance Department as an authorized user of Contract 147961 for financial services. The consultant will perform an independent water review of proposed rate increases as required by section 37-62 of the City Code. Services will also include financial analysis related to water rate studies, future bond sales, and review of cost of service studies.

**This item was adopted.**

**28 Leeds Precision Instruments, Inc. doing business as Leeds Forensic Systems, Inc.**

For \$83,600.00 in payment authority to purchase a Leeds Firearms and Tool Marks Comparison Microscope (LCF3) for the Police Department. This equipment is necessary to perform a microscopic examination on all cartridge casings, bullets, and other evidence submitted to the Firearms Section for comparative analysis. This analysis ensures the observation and documentation of similar and or differing features that identify, describe the level of consistency, or exclude evidence from each other.

**This item was adopted.**

**29 All Flag and Flagpoles, Inc.**

For \$50,000.00 in payment authority for a new contract, entered on or about Jan. 1, 2019 for a term of five years, to provide United States, State of Arizona, City of Phoenix, and international flags to departments citywide. The U.S. flags are to be displayed at all City facilities.

**This item was adopted.**

**30 Settlement of Claim Schatz v. City of Phoenix**

To make payment of \$40,000.00 in the settlement of claim in *Schatz v. City of Phoenix*, Maricopa County Superior Court, Case No. CV2015-054131, 14-0462-01 GL PD, for the Finance Department pursuant to Phoenix City Code Chapter 42.

**This item was adopted.**

**31 Mountain States Specialties, Inc.**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to add additional expenditures to cooperative Contract MCC13135C with Mountain States Specialties, Inc., in the amount of \$75,000.00. The additional funding will allow the Neighborhood Services Department to purchase and install a large digital LED message board at the Broadway Heritage Neighborhood Resource Center for the display of community announcements, meetings, and events. This purchase is paid for by 2006 GO Bonds.

**This item was adopted.**

**32 Settlement of Claim Korff v. City of Phoenix**

To make payment of \$100,000.00 in settlement of claim in *Korff v. City of Phoenix*, United States District Court for the District of Arizona, Cause No.: 2:13-ev-02317-ESW, 12-0540-001 GL BI, for the Finance Department pursuant to Phoenix City Code Chapter 42.

**This item was adopted.**

**34 Arizona Blue Stake Inc. doing business as Arizona 811**

For \$15,000.00 in payment authority for Contract 134365, through Dec. 31, 2020, for annual membership payments to continue to locate and mark City underground facilities prior to disturbance of earth surface. The Public Transit Department's membership is required by State law.

**This item was adopted.**

**35 Various Vendors for Solid Waste Equipment Washing**

For \$50,000.00 in additional payment authority for solid waste equipment washing services for the Public Works Department. Additional funds are needed to add the Solid Waste Diversion and Disposal Division to the contract for washing services of equipment located at the City's two transfer stations.

Fleetwash, Inc., Contract 147297

Reyes and Sons Landscaping LLC., Contract 147296

**This item was adopted.**

**36 Graffiti Protective Coatings, Inc.**

For \$50,000.00 in additional payment authority to amend Contract 143885 to include the Street Transportation Department. The City utilizes this contractor to perform custodial and maintenance services for bus stops and passenger facilities. Street Transportation will utilize this contractor to empty trash receptacles that have recently been placed in the City's Right of Way (ROW). This includes 1st Street from Pierce Street to north of Portland Street, and 2nd Avenue from the Polk Street alignment to Roosevelt Street. The City anticipates additional trash receptacles will be placed in the ROW over the life of this contract including those that are planned for the 12-mile Grand Canalscape Project currently under construction, and other receptacles that are part of the streetscape projects currently in the design phase.

**This item was adopted.**

**37 G & G Specialty Contractors, Inc.**

For \$71,785.53 in additional payment authority for Agreement 146649, for Change Orders 6 and 7 (Project AH10150006-E) Pine Tower Apartments Phase II Remodeling Project for the Housing Department. Pine Towers Apartments is a four-story senior/disabled public housing complex with 156 apartments and a Community Center. Constructed in 1960 the City acquired the property in 1972 for its assisted senior housing program. Federal Capital Funds are being utilized for Phase II of the building modernization project that includes complete renovation of 45 studio apartments, additional laundry room for the site and remodeling the Community Center. The federal funds do not permit an allowance within the bid documents so Change Orders are needed to accommodate unforeseen conditions, owner requested modifications, building code compliance, and life safety issues. This request for additional payment authority includes 18 activities such as replacing deteriorated plumbing systems and framing discovered behind drywall after demolition, provide lighting fixture changes to smaller more energy efficient products now available, adding additional conduit and wiring in the community center to meet new City IT Department requirements to

support City staff that will be located in the building, installing door sweeps, adding more user friendly pocket door hardware, needing additional 600 MCM cable to circumvent a buried pool, providing a special inspection prior to energizing the 2,000 amp SES panel for the building, installing semi-recessed fire extinguisher per inspector instead of wall mount, rewiring community center kitchen to meet current code and ADA accessibility, and installing video cameras and equipment for the community center for the security of residents and city property. These items were enhancements to the original design, necessary to meet code compliance, provide better energy efficiency and improve life safety issues for the residents of the facility. This project uses federal Housing and Urban Development funds and no General Funds are required.

**This item was adopted.**

**38 LambTech, Inc.**

For \$15,000.00 in payment authority for Contract 141655 for fence line odor testing services for the Water Services Department. This contract provides labor, materials, equipment, licensing fees, administration, and testing services of the hydrogen sulfide fence line, wet well, and City wastewater treatment scrubbers and pump stations, to maintain City compliance with Maricopa County air quality reporting requirements. The funding is for the third and final option to exercise a one-year contract extension. The original ordinance was for a one-year contract with three, one-year extension options, and \$45,000 of funding.

**This item was adopted.**

**39 SPX Flow, Inc. doing business as SPX Flow US, LLC**

For \$17,340.00 in payment authority for a one-time purchase of a new Lightnin Mixer Model 16Q10 for the Water Services Department. This equipment mixes chemicals used during the water treatment process. The equipment at the Deer Valley Water Treatment Plant is unable to be repaired and requires immediate replacement.

**This item was adopted.**

**42 Online Investigative Services for Police Department - RFA 18-037 (Ordinance S-45074)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a

contract with TransUnion Risk and Alternative Data Solutions, Inc. (TRADS) to provide Online Investigative Services to the Homeland Defense Bureau of the Phoenix Police Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$125,400.

**Summary**

The contract is necessary to provide Police Department staff subscription services to the TLOxp Online Investigative Services software. Services include access to an online investigative research database of public and proprietary information. The subscription offers specialized, unique modules, search capabilities, investigators and analysts with exclusive platforms unavailable within any other known database. The TLOxp database is built on an architecture of cutting edge proprietary information and a massive repository of data which continues to grow. Services provide officers relevant, actionable and timely information. The information available in this database is vital to the role and mission of the department. The use of this software has streamlined processes resulting in expedited location and apprehension of criminal violators and other involved parties.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Procurement Information**

In accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10, normal competition was waived as a result of an approved determination memo citing the specialized and proprietary information available through TRADS. TRADS provides these same services to other local and state law enforcement agencies.

**Contract Term**

The contract term shall begin on or about Nov. 7, 2018 and end on Nov. 6, 2021.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$125,400. Funds are

available in the Police Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**43     Emergency Preparedness Equipment and Public Safety - U.S. Communities RFP 2000002547 (Ordinance S-45076)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to access U.S. Communities Cooperative Contract and to enter into contract with Mallory Safety and Supply, LLC to acquire public safety and emergency preparedness equipment and related services for the Information Technology Services Department, Aviation Department, and the Office of Homeland Security and Emergency Management. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$544,923.

**Summary**

This contract allows City departments, such as Information Technology Services, Aviation, and the Office of Homeland Security and Emergency Management, to purchase emergency preparedness equipment, such as the Everbridge Emergency Notification System and Information Technology (IT) Alerting platform. This equipment is critical to the support of emergency preparedness and public safety. The Everbridge Emergency Notification System provides priority information notifications to the Transportation Safety Administration (TSA), Airline Managers, Department of Homeland Security (DHS), and airport personnel. The IT Alerting platform integrates and automates communication, collaboration, and orchestration processes for Service Operations (Ops), IT Security Ops, and Disaster Recovery Ops for faster recovery and delivery.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Procurement Information**

In accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10, a participating agreement is required when the City uses a cooperative agreement from another public agency. The contract was awarded through a competitive process consistent with the City's procurement processes, as set forth in Phoenix City Code, Chapter 43. Cooperative agreements allow the City to benefit from national government pricing and volume discounts.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract term will expire on or about Oct. 31, 2023.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$544,923. Funds are available in the department budgets of the Information Technology Services and Aviation departments and the Office of Homeland Security and Emergency Management.

**This item was withdrawn.**

**44 Acceptance and Dedication of a Deed and Easement for Public Utility and Roadway Purposes (Ordinance S-45079)**

Request for the City Council to accept and dedicate a deed and easement for public utility and roadway purposes; further ordering the ordinance recorded.

**Summary**

Accepting and dedicating the property interests below will meet the Planning and Development Department's Single Instrument Dedication Process requirement prior to releasing any permits to applicants.

Deed (a)

Applicant: Done Deal Investments, LLC, its successor and assigns

Purpose: Roadway

Location: 5605 E. Lafayette Blvd.

File: FN 180096

Council District: 6

Easement (b)

Applicant: Leobardo Jaurequi, its successor and assigns

Purpose: Public Utility

Location: 1715 W. Buckeye Road

File: FN 180097

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**45 Rental Equipment and Accessories for Parks Events - Requirements Contract - IFB 19-024 (Ordinance S-45081)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a



contract with Arizona Bounce Around, Inc. to provide party and event rental equipment for the Parks and Recreation Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$212,000 over a five-year period.

**Summary**

This contract will provide the Parks and Recreation Department with all materials, equipment, labor, and transportation associated with the rental of unique party/event activities such as inflatables, carnival games and outdoor movie equipment, for use at various community events. The vendor will set up, tear down and monitor equipment to ensure safe operation at the events. These events are intended to contribute to the quality of life for residents by strengthening communities, providing unique activities, building awareness of diverse cultures and identities, and acting as a source of community pride.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 19-024 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. There was one offer received by the Finance Department Procurement Division on Aug. 31, 2018. Another offer was deemed non-responsive for failing to include all costs in the overall rental price, as required in the solicitation. The notice of bid was sent to 45 registered vendors and publicly posted and available for download on the City website. The offer from Arizona Bounce Around, Inc. was evaluated on price, responsiveness to specifications and responsibility to provide the required goods and/or services. The price was determined to be fair and reasonable based on a comparison with previous department rentals of similar items.

The Deputy Finance Director recommends the offer from Arizona Bounce Around, Inc. be accepted as a responsive and responsible offer.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract term will begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$212,000, with an estimated annual expenditure of \$42,400. Funds are available in the

Parks and Recreation Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**46 Authorization to Amend License to Extend Term with Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District at Aguila Golf Course (Ordinance S-45082)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to amend Contract 130389 with Salt River Project Agricultural Improvement and Power District (SRP), to extend the term for a 10-year period for landscaping improvements, irrigation, asphalt parking, and concrete patio and sidewalk purposes located on portions of the Aguila Golf Course. The annual fee will be \$1,894.02, plus applicable taxes. The fee will increase annually based on the Consumer Price Index, All Cities Average. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds related to this item.

Further request, pursuant to Phoenix City Code (PCC) 42-20(B), an exemption from the indemnification prohibition set forth in PCC 42-18(A) and (B) to permit the City to indemnify, release and hold harmless SRP, the Salt River Valley Water Users' Association and the United States of America (USA) for: (a) acts or omissions of the City, its agents, officers, directors, or employees; (b) the City's use or occupancy of the licensed property for the purposes contemplated by the license, including, but not limited to, claims by third parties who are invited or permitted onto the licensed property, either expressed or implied, by the City or by the nature of the City's improvement or other use of the licensed property pursuant to this license; and (c) the City's failure to comply with or fulfill its obligations established by the license or by law.

**Summary**

The Parks and Recreation Department licenses a portion of the USA irrigation ditch for access and maintenance of landscaping improvements, irrigation, asphalt parking, and concrete patio and sidewalk located on portions of the Aguila Golf Course. The City is responsible for operation and maintenance costs related to the improvements. The current contract term expires Nov. 30, 2018.

**Contract Term**

The contract will be extended for a 10-year term beginning Dec. 1, 2018,

and expiring on Nov. 30, 2028, and may be terminated upon a 30-day written notice.

**Financial Impact**

The annual fee will be \$1,894.02, plus applicable taxes. The fee will increase annually based on the Consumer Price Index, All Cities Average.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The current contract was authorized by Ordinance S-37606, adopted Jan. 5, 2011.

**Location**

8440 S. 35th Ave.

Council District: 7

**This item was adopted.**

**47 Acceptance and Dedication of Easements for Slope and Public Utility Purposes (Ordinance S-45083)**

Request for the City Council to accept and dedicate easements for slope and public utility purposes; further ordering the ordinance recorded.

**Summary**

Accepting and dedicating the property interests below will meet the Planning and Development Department's Single Instrument Dedication Process requirement prior to releasing any permits to applicants.

Easement (a)

Applicant: PS35, LLC, its successor and assigns

Purpose: Public Utility

Location: 13615 N. 35th Ave.

File: FN 180079

Council District: 1

Easement (b)

Applicant: BME I, LLC, its successor and assigns

Purpose: Slope

Location: 5246 E. Red Rock Drive

File: FN 180083

Council District: 6

**This item was adopted.**

**48 Disposable Gurney Sheets - Requirements Contract, IFB 19-010  
(Ordinance S-45084)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Henry Schein, Inc., to purchase disposable gurney sheets for the Fire Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$1,221,225.

**Summary**

The contract is necessary to allow Fire Department staff to purchase disposable gurney sheets to cover ambulance gurneys. These products are necessary to safely transfer patients from the gurney to a hospital bed. The disposable gurney sheets are durable and highly resistant, which allows for absorbency of fluids, guards against stains and spills and aids in infection control.

**Procurement Information**

An Invitation for Bid, IFB 19-010 for disposable gurney sheets, was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. The notification was sent to 45 vendors and was posted on the City's website on Aug. 10, 2018. Three offers were received by the Procurement Division on Aug. 31, 2018. All offers received were responsive to the specifications as stated in the solicitation.

Henry Schein, Inc.:	\$244,244.50
Life-Assist, Inc.:	\$265,645.00
Bound Tree Medical LLC:	\$289,389.90

The Deputy Finance Director recommends the bid from Henry Schein, Inc. be accepted as the lowest priced, responsive and responsible bid.

**Contract Term**

The contract term shall begin on or about Nov. 8, 2018 and end Nov. 7, 2023.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$1,221,225. Funds are available in the Fire Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**49 Protective Footwear Contract (Ordinance S-45085)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Industrial Safety Shoe Company dba Industrial Shoe of Arizona and add to Ordinance S-44865. Approval of this Ordinance allows Finance Department Procurement Office to add this company to the existing qualified vendor list for protective footwear.

**Summary**

Administrative Regulation 2.313 set administrative controls to eliminate employee exposure to unsafe conditions. The vendor will provide protective footwear to meet the Occupational Safety and Health Act section 5(a)(1) General Duty Clause, which states each employer "shall furnish to each of his employees employment and a place of employment which are free from recognized hazards that are causing or are likely to cause death or serious physical harm to his employees." Primary users include the Parks and Recreation and Public Works departments. The requested products are critical to safe citywide operations.

**Procurement Information**

RFQu 18-184 Protective Footwear was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10.

The Deputy Finance Director recommends the offer from Industrial Shoe of Arizona to be accepted for the Qualified Vendor List.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract will end on June 30, 2023.

**Financial Impact**

Ordinance S-44865 was approved on the July 5 Council agenda.

**This item was adopted.**

**50      Acquisition of Real Property for Palm Lane Storm Drain Improvement Project Between 28th and 32nd Streets (Ordinance S-45086)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to acquire fee title or lessor interest in a portion of unimproved land by donation, purchase within the City's appraised value, or by the power of eminent domain for the Palm Lane Storm Drain Improvement Project. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Palm Lane Storm Drain Improvement Project will provide necessary flood mitigation for the area by installing storm drain improvements along Palm Lane between 28th and 32nd streets. Project construction includes the installation of new manholes, catch basins and storm drain pipes in various sizes along Palm Lane. The property impacted by this project is located at 3119 E. Palm Lane, identified by Maricopa County Assessor's Parcel Number (APN) 120-20-083.

**Financial Impact**

Funding is available in the Street Transportation Department's Capital Improvement Program budget.

**Location**

3119 E. Palm Lane, identified by APN 120-20-083  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**51      Grant of Public Utility Easement on City-owned Property for the 24th Street Water Treatment Plant Rehabilitation 2017 Project (Ordinance S-45087)**

Request City Council to grant a public utility easement, for consideration of \$1.00, for installation of pad-mounted transformers, switching cabinets and equipment pads on City-owned property in the Salt River Project (SRP) service area, and further ordering the Ordinance recorded. The public utility easement is required to support new process equipment being installed at the City's 24th Street Water Treatment Plant.

**Summary**

This public utility easement will be granted to all public service corporations, agricultural improvement districts, and telecommunication corporations providing utility service (collectively "Grantee"), in perpetuity so long as Grantee uses the Easement Premises for the purposes herein specified, for an indefinite period, subject to the following terms and conditions:

A. Grantee is hereby granted the right to construct, reconstruct, replace, repair, operate and maintain utility facilities together with appurtenant fixtures for use in connection therewith (collectively "Grantee Facilities") to, through, across and beyond Grantor's property within the Easement Premises. Subject to the notice requirements provided in paragraph "I," Grantee shall at all times have the right of full and free ingress and egress to and along the Easement Premises for the purposes herein specified. Grantee acknowledges and accepts that Grantee shall share the Easement Premises with other Grantees and shall use such Easement Premises with other Grantees in accordance with and consistent with industry standards and customs for shared use. Grantor agrees to coordinate the location of Grantee's Facilities within the Easement Premises and to pay costs for relocation of Grantee's Facilities as provided in paragraph "F."

B. Grantor shall not locate, erect or construct, or permit to be located or erected or constructed, any building or structure within the limits of the Easement Premises. However, Grantor reserves all other rights, interests, and uses of the Easement Premises that are not inconsistent with Grantee's easement rights herein conveyed and which do not interfere with or endanger any of the Grantee Facilities. Notwithstanding the foregoing, Grantor shall not have the right to lower by more than one foot or raise by more than two feet the surface grade of Easement Premises without the prior written consent by the Grantee whose facilities will be affected by the change of elevation.

C. Grantee shall not have the right to use the Easement Premises to store gasoline or petroleum products, hazardous or toxic substances, or flammable materials; provided however, that this prohibition shall not apply to any material, equipment or substance contained in, or a part of,

the Grantee Facilities, provided that Grantee must comply with all applicable federal, state and local laws and regulations in connection therewith. Additionally, the Easement Premises may not be used for storage of construction-related materials or to park or store construction-related vehicles or equipment except on a temporary basis to construct, reconstruct, replace, repair, operate, or maintain the Grantee Facilities.

D. Grantor shall maintain an appropriate three-foot clear area around all edges of all equipment pads for Grantee Facilities in addition to a clear operational area that extends 10 feet immediately in front of all transformer or switching cabinet openings, within the Easement Premises. No obstruction, trees, shrubs, fixtures, or permanent structures shall be placed or permitted by Grantor within said areas. Grantee is hereby granted the right to trim, prune, cut, and clear away trees, brush, shrubs, or other obstruction within said areas.

E. Grantee shall exercise reasonable care to avoid damage to the Easement Premises and all improvements thereon and agrees that following any work or use by Grantee within the Easement Premises, the affected area, including without limitation, all pavement, landscaping, concrete and other improvements permitted within the Easement Premises pursuant to this easement will be restored by Grantee to as close to original condition as is reasonably possible, at the expense of Grantee.

F. Grantor reserves the right to require relocation of Grantee Facilities to a new location within Grantor's property; provided however, that: (1) Grantor pays the entire cost of redesigning and relocating existing Grantee Facilities to the new location; and (2) Grantor provides Grantee with a new and substantially similar public utility easement at no cost to Grantee. After relocation of Grantee Facilities to the new easement area, Grantee shall abandon its rights to use the Easement Premises granted in this easement without cost or consequence to Grantor.

G. Each public service corporation and telecommunication services corporation as a Grantee shall coordinate and work with other grantees in the use of the Easement Premises. In the event that a third party or other



Grantee requests relocation of existing Grantee Facilities to a new location (whether or not) within the Easement Premises, the requesting party shall pay the entire cost of redesigning and relocating the existing Grantee Facilities.

H. Grantee shall not have the right to transfer, convey or assign its interests in this easement to any individual, corporation, or other entity without the prior written consent of Grantor, which consent shall not be unreasonably withheld. Grantee shall notify Grantor of any proposed transfer, conveyance or assignment of any rights granted herein at address listed below.

I. Except in emergencies or exigent circumstances such as service restoration, Grantee agrees to contact Grantor at least one business day prior to Grantee's entrance onto the Easement Premises where the Easement Premises are located: (1) on a site that includes Aviation Department facilities; (2) Water Services Department water and wastewater treatment facilities; (3) Police Department headquarters located at 620 W. Washington St.; (4) Fire Department headquarters located at 150 S. 12th St.; (5) City Hall located at 200 W. Washington St.; (6) City Court Building located at 300 W. Washington St.; (7) Calvin C. Goode Building located at 251 W. Washington St.; (8) Transit Operations Center located at 320 N. 1st Ave. or West Transit Facility located at 405 N. 79th Ave.; or (9) in a secured or fenced area.

#### **Location**

Near 24th Street and Lincoln Drive, identified by Maricopa County

Assessor Parcel Number 164-32-003B

Council District: 6

**This item was adopted.**

#### **52 Purchase of Paratech Lifting Equipment - Contract 146484 (Ordinance S-45088)**

Request for additional payment authority for Contract 146484 with L.N. Curtis and Sons, in an amount not to exceed \$350,000, to purchase Paratech Lifting Equipment for the Fire Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Fire Department, Special Operations Training, will replace current equipment that has outlived its expected service life with Paratech Lifting Equipment. The Fire Department uses Paratech Lifting Equipment for fast stabilization and safe lifting of heavy weights in lifesaving rescue situations, protecting firefighters and Phoenix residents in emergency situations. The additional payment authority is needed to support a recent amendment to the contract for additional items.

**Financial Impact**

Upon approval of the additional payment authority of \$350,000, the revised aggregate value will be \$611,250, during the term of the contract ending Nov. 30, 2022. Funds are available in the Fire Department's budget.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

Use of the Paratech Lifting Equipment contract with L.N. Curtis and Sons was approved by council action on Nov. 29, 2017.

**Responsible Department**

This item is submitted by Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney, Jr. and the Fire Department.

**This item was adopted.**

**53     Illuminated Street Signs - Requirements Contact - IFB 19-025  
(Ordinance S-45090)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Fluoresco Services, LLC for the fabrication and installation of illuminated street signs for the Street Transportation Department in an amount not to exceed \$6.25 million over five years. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

This contract will be used by the signal shop section of the Street Transportation Department for the supply of various sizes of single- and double-sided illuminated street signs, related components and installation services when required. Illuminated street name signs are the standard at

all of the City's signalized intersections.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB 19-025) was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. One offer was received by the Procurement Division on Sept. 14, 2018. The notice of bid was sent to more than 100 registered vendors and was publicly posted and available for download on the City website. The offer was evaluated on price, responsiveness to specifications and responsibility to provide the required goods and/or services. The price offered was determined to be fair and reasonable based on a comparison with previous contract pricing.

The Deputy Finance Director recommends the offer from Fluoresco Services, LLC be accepted as a responsive and responsible offer.

**Contract Term**

The term of the contract will be five years to begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$6.25 million over five years, with an estimated annual expenditure of \$1.25 million. Funds are available in the Street Transportation Department's operating budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**54     Portable Toilet Rental & Service - Requirements Contract  
(Ordinance S-45092)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with United Site Services of Arizona, Inc. and Right Away Disposal to provide rental and servicing of portable toilets on an as-needed basis in the amount not to exceed \$553,000. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

Contractors will provide long term portable toilet rentals to various City

parks, water treatment plants, transfer stations and Aviation sites. Contractors will also provide short term portable toilet rentals for festivals and events offered to the citizens of Phoenix and unforeseen events, such as water shutdowns or other emergencies. The primary departments using these contracts are Aviation and Parks and Recreation. Approximately 37 percent of the contract spend is used by enterprise funds. The requested products and services are critical to citywide facility operations.

### **Procurement Information**

IFB 18-245 Portable Toilet Rental & Service was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. The solicitation was emailed to 23 contractors and was posted on the City's website. Two offers were received by the Procurement Division on May 18, 2018.

The Deputy Finance Director recommends the offer from United Site Services of Arizona, Inc. and Right Away Disposal be accepted as the responsive and responsible offers.

### **Contract Term**

The five-year contracts will begin Nov. 15, 2018.

### **Financial Impact**

The aggregate five-year contract value shall not exceed \$553,000. Funds are available in all City of Phoenix departments' budgets.

**This item was adopted.**

## **55 Maintenance, Repair and Operational Supplies with W.W. Grainger, Inc. (Ordinance S-45093)**

Request authorization for the City Manager, or his designee, to increase funding for Cooperative Purchasing Agreement 146460-0 (National Intergovernmental Purchasing Alliance Cooperative Contract 141003) by \$4.8 million to continue to provide essential maintenance, repair and operational supplies required by all City of Phoenix departments through Dec. 31, 2020. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

### **Summary**

This contract is used to purchase maintenance, repair and operational (MRO) supplies which support the needs of City employees, facilities, and warehouses, as well as the general public. MRO supplies include, but are not limited to: motors, electrical supplies, lighting, hand and power tools, safety equipment and clothing, pumps, material handling equipment, pneumatic equipment, machining/cutting tools, HVAC equipment and supplies, test instruments and a wide variety of goods required for the City to remain operational on a daily basis. This contract is open and used by all City departments.

The City of Phoenix Police Department has recently utilized this agreement (partially funded through the Police Department's Records Management System grant) to replace its entire stock of gas masks and accessories for police officers. This special project reduced the available 2018 funding by approximately \$650,000, with the potential for another \$650,000 expenditure in early 2019 to complete the \$1.3 million project. Additionally, the Aviation, Parks and Recreation and Water departments utilize approximately 50 percent of the total contract spend, and their use of the contract has increased because of tools, supplies and safety equipment that is at end of life. The remaining balance will be utilized by the other large users of this contract, which include Fire, Convention Center, Street Transportation and Public Works to provide operational supplies and equipment to support their departments.

**Contract Term**

The original term of this contract is Sept. 2, 2015 through Dec. 31, 2017, with three options to extend. As originally approved by City Council, the contract options have been exercised annually and the contract will expire Dec. 31, 2020.

**Financial Impact**

Initial funding for this contract was originally approved through City Council on Payment Ordinance S-41999 and S-42565-ac, with a total expenditure of \$9,165,000. Increasing the contracts value by \$4,800,000 will bring the total amount, not to exceed, to \$13,965,000.

**This item was adopted.**

**56      Utility Service Meter Cabinets Type A - Requirements Contract -  
IFB 19-031 (Ordinance S-45094)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with City Electric Supply, Inc. to purchase Type A utility service meter cabinets for the Street Transportation Department, in an amount not to exceed \$300,000. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Street Transportation Department will use these Type A utility service meter cabinets to provide power to traffic signals at intersections throughout the City of Phoenix.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 19-031 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. Three offers were received by the Procurement Division on Sep. 14, 2018. The offers were evaluated on price, responsiveness to specifications and responsibility to provide the required goods and/or services. Following are the bid prices:

City Electric Supply, Inc.: \$55,931.05

Wesco Distribution, Inc.: \$58,435.00

JTB Supply Company, Inc.: \$108,355.00

**Contract Term**

The term of the contract will be five years and will begin on or about Nov. 15, 2018.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$300,000 with an estimated annual expenditure of \$60,000. Funds are available in the Street Transportation Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**57 Acquisition of Temporary Construction Easement for Tierra Buena Lane Sidewalk Improvement Project, Between 16th Drive and 15th Avenue (Ordinance S-45096)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to acquire a temporary construction easement by donation, purchased within the City's appraised value, or by the power of eminent domain for the Tierra Buena Lane Sidewalk Improvement Project. Further request authorization

for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Tierra Buena Lane Sidewalk Improvement Project will provide necessary sidewalk improvements along the north side of Tierra Buena Lane between 16th Drive and 15th Avenue. The work includes the construction of a sidewalk and driveway reconnection along the north side of Tierra Buena Lane to provide a contiguous pathway to pedestrians. The property impacted by this project is located at 1656 W. Tierra Buena Lane, identified by Maricopa County Assessor's parcel number (APN) 208-13-012E.

**Financial Impact**

Funding is available in the Street Transportation Department's Capital Improvement Program budget.

**Location**

1656 W. Tierra Buena Lane, identified by APN 208-13-012E  
Council District: 3

**This item was adopted.**

**58 Vehicle Detection Sensor Loops for Efficient Timing of Lights at Intersections - Requirements Contract - IFB 19-027 (Ordinance S-45098)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Kimbrell Electric, Inc. to purchase loop detector installation services for more efficient timing of lights at intersections for the Street Transportation Department. The contract amount will not exceed \$3.54 million over five years. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Traffic Signal Shop will use this contract for the installation of new and the replacement of existing vehicle detection sensor loops, which are installed at traffic signal intersections, for both left-turn and through-traffic lanes, throughout the City of Phoenix. These detection loops provide accurate detection of vehicles on City roadways and allow for more efficient timing of lights at intersections.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 19-027 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. Three offers were received by the Procurement Division on Sep. 21, 2018. The offers were evaluated on price, responsiveness to specifications and responsibility to provide the required goods and/or services. Following are the bid prices per year:

Kimbrell Electric, Inc.: \$706,804

Roadway Electric, LLC: \$1,350,975

CPC Construction, LLC: \$752,580

### **Contract Term**

The term of the contract will be five years and will begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018.

### **Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$3.54 million over five years, with an annual estimated expenditure of \$708,000. Funds are available in the Street Transportation Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

## **59 Contract for Automated External Defibrillators (Ordinance S-45102)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to allow the use of the US Communities solicitation (12-JLH-011) with Cintas Corporation to lease automated external defibrillators (AED) to replace AEDs throughout the City, and enter into a cooperative contract. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$1,639,380.

### **Summary**

The contract is necessary to replace AED inventory approaching its end of life, and as a result, replacement parts and service of the devices will no longer be available from the manufacturer. The AEDs are used to treat sudden cardiac arrest by sending an electric shock to the heart to restore normal rhythm. An assessment of the Citywide inventory of AEDs was completed by Cintas and in consultation with the Fire Department, the City determined the placement and location of the AEDs citywide to ensure the availability of devices to assist in life safety efforts.



The contract covers the leasing of equipment, installation, online compliance tool, monthly inspections, medical direction, replacement of pads and batteries, and a training component. The contract will be managed and implemented by the Public Works Department.

**Procurement Information**

In accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10, a participating agreement is required when the City uses a cooperative agreement from another public agency. The contract was awarded through a competitive Request for Proposal (RFP) process consistent with the City's procurement processes, as set forth in the Phoenix City Code, chapter 43. The use of this cooperative contract will provide the City the deepest national discounts on the devices.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract term will end Nov. 8, 2023.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value will not exceed \$1,639,380. Funds are available in the Aviation, Phoenix Convention Center, Public Works and Water Services Departments' budgets. By implementing the program, the cost of the assessment is waived, saving the City \$50,000. In addition, the contractor is offering up to \$500 rebate on eligible devices, with a potential savings to the City of up to \$100,000.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

Approval to move forward with the assessment portion of the contract was approved via formal Council action on June 6, 2018.

**This item was adopted.**

**60 Miner Southwest, L.L.C. (Ordinance S-45105)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to add additional expenditure funding to Miner Southwest L.L.C. Contract 138804 in the amount of \$192,000 to continue to provide labor, materials, tools, and equipment necessary to perform all operations needed for preventative maintenance and increase in repairs of automatic doors at Citywide

facilities. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The City of Phoenix has automatic doors at most of its public buildings. Door maintenance and repair is critical for compliance with Americans with Disabilities Act requirements, continued American Association of Automatic Door Manufacturers certification, and to maintain a secure environment for staff and citizens. Additional funds are needed due to an increase in repairs and scheduled replacements of doors nearing the end of their useful life. Public Works identified \$32,000 in preventive maintenance and scheduled projects; and the Fire Department requests \$100,000 for scheduled maintenance and emergency repairs at various fire stations. Based on historical spend analysis, \$60,000 is projected for other emergency repairs within other City facilities.

**Financial Impact**

With \$192,000 in additional funds, the contracts' revised aggregate value, through June 30, 2019, is \$1,062,736.40, with a revised annual expenditure of \$212,547.28. Public Works and Fire departments are the primary users and funds are available in each department's budget. The contract is available to all City departments.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This contract is a result of IFB 14-139, Ordinance S-40985, adopted at the June 18, 2014 Formal Council meeting.

**This item was adopted.**

**61 Locking Systems and Parts - Requirements Contract - IFB 17-069 (Ordinance S-45107)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to add additional expenditures to Contract 144095 with Intermountain Lock and Security Supply; Contract 144096 with Anixter, Inc., Contract 144097 with Craftmaster Hardware LLC; and Contract 144094 with Sun Door and Trim, Inc., in an aggregate amount of \$800,000. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

Contractors provide locking systems and parts critical in keeping the City's assets safe and secure. Departments are responsible for securing and monitoring City-owned property, as established in A.R. 5.13. The Public Works Department provides such services at 676 City owned and leased facilities. Such services include door re-keying and core replacements, door handle replacements, high security key duplication, ADA compliant door assemblies, and automatic door hardware. The Aviation Department has several new building projects, including a new Terminal 3 with new Airline tenants, a new Command Center, Bus Maintenance Building, and several new Car Rental tenants. Aviation is also in the process of re-keying all of Sky Harbor, including the Corporate Office Building, and Executive Terminal. The locking systems are used by all departments citywide. The City of Phoenix Enterprise departments have used approximately 78 percent of the contract funds. An additional \$800,000 is being requested to get through the remaining 39 months of the contract. This is based on an average monthly spend of \$22,000 for the past 21 months.

**Financial Impact**

With the \$800,000 in additional funds, the contract's revised aggregate value through Dec. 31, 2021, is now \$1,350,000 (including all applicable taxes) with new estimated annual expenditures of \$270,000. Funds are available in all City department budgets.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

These contracts are the result of IFB 17-069 awarded by Formal Council Action at the Dec. 7, 2016 Council meeting.

**This item was adopted.**

**62 Acceptance and Dedication of Deed for Roadway Purposes  
(Ordinance S-45108)**

Request for the City Council to accept and dedicate a deed for roadway purposes; further ordering the ordinance recorded.

**Summary**

Accepting and dedicating the property interests below will meet the

Planning and Development Department's Single Instrument Dedication Process requirement prior to releasing any permits to applicants.

Deed (a)

Applicant: SWC 67th Avenue, LLC, its successors and assigns

Purpose: Roadway

Location: 6711 W. McDowell Road

File: FN 180090

Council District: 7

**This item was adopted.**

**63 Periodical Subscription Services - Requirements Contract - RFP  
19-033 (Ordinance S-45127)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with EBSCO Information Services for Periodical Subscription Services for the Library Department for five years in an amount not to exceed \$672,000. Further request authorization for City Controller to disburse funds related to this item.

**Summary**

This contract will provide periodical subscriptions and related services to enable the Library Department to make available a variety of informative magazines, newspapers, and journals of all topics and genres and from a vast number of publishers, to community residents at the Library Department's 17 branches. This contract will also assist the Library Department in managing both new and renewal subscriptions by providing technical support, online ordering and lost issue claims capabilities, as well as a variety of reports and analytics to ensure the informational needs of community residents are met.

**Procurement Information**

Request for Proposal (RFP) 19-033 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. There were two offers received by the Finance Department's Procurement Division on Aug. 31, 2018. The proposals were scored by a three-member evaluation panel based on the following criteria:

Approach to Scope of Work  
Qualifications and Expertise

## Price

The proposers and their scores are as follows:

EBSCO: 960 points

WT Cox: 512 points

The Deputy Finance Director recommends that the offer from EBSCO Information Services be accepted as the highest-scoring, responsive and responsible offer that is most advantageous to the City.

## Contract Term

The five-year contract term shall begin on or about Jan. 1, 2019.

## Financial Impact

The aggregate value of the contract shall not exceed \$672,000, with an estimated annual expenditure of \$134,400. Funds are available in the Library Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

## **64 Wireless Communications Services, Accessories, and Equipment (Ordinance S-45126)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to extend and add additional expenditures for Contracts ADSPO13-032444 with AT&T Mobility, ADSPO13-034209 with Sprint Solutions, Inc., ADSPO13-034339 with T-Mobile USA, Inc., and ADSPO13-034099 with Verizon Wireless for the purchase of wireless communications services, accessories, and equipment for departments Citywide in an amount not to exceed \$2,600,000. The State of Arizona has extended their cooperative agreements until June 30, 2019 while they complete a new solicitation. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

## Summary

City departments utilize mobile devices, wireless services, equipment and accessories to conduct City business every day. Equipment and services are procured utilizing State of Arizona cooperative agreements, which have been extended until June 30, 2019 and offer significant cost savings. This request is for authorization to continue to utilize these contracts, and for additional payment authority to cover the period of the

extension.

**Contract Term**

This request is to extend the contract term until June 30, 2019 to allow time for the State to complete a new solicitation.

**Financial Impact**

These contracts were approved by City Council on Feb. 19, 2014 with an original aggregate value of \$17,419,290. With the \$2,600,000 in additional funds, the revised aggregate value is now \$20,019,290 (including applicable taxes). The additional funds are needed to continue to utilize wireless communications services, accessories, and equipment for the remaining eight months of the contracts.

**This item was adopted.**

**66 Request for City Council to Call to Meet in Executive Sessions**

Request for the City Council to call to meet in Executive Sessions pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.), section 38-431.03.A, on Tuesday, Dec. 11, 2018, at 1 p.m. in the East Conference Room, 12th Floor of Phoenix City Hall, 200 W. Washington St., Phoenix, Arizona; on Friday, Dec. 14, 2018, at 9 a.m. in the Meeting Room, 300 W. Jefferson St., Phoenix, Arizona; and on Tuesday, Jan. 15, 2019, at 1 p.m. in the East Conference Room, 12th Floor of Phoenix City Hall, 200 W. Washington St., Phoenix, Arizona.

**Public Outreach**

The Notice and Agenda for the Executive Sessions to be held on these dates will be posted no later than 24 hours prior to the meeting pursuant to A.R.S. section 38-431.02.

**This item was approved.**

**67 Arizona Public Service Weatherization Grant Contract Amendment (Ordinance S-45103)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Arizona Public Service (APS) and accept up to \$500,000 to fund City-approved individual grant agreements between property owners and qualified contractors to provide Weatherization Assistance Program (WAP) services in accordance with the APS contract terms. Further

request authorization for the City Controller to accept and disburse all funds related to this item over the life of the contract.

**Summary**

The Neighborhood Services Department (NSD) utilizes funding received from APS, and other local organizations and federal agencies, to perform weatherization activities in households which meet federal poverty income guidelines throughout the City. WAP services include energy efficiency retrofit activities, such as attic insulation, sun screens, duct sealing, room pressure relief/air balancing, and the repair or replacement of heating and cooling systems to eligible dwellings.

APS may provide additional weatherization funds to NSD during or after calendar year 2019. Should additional funding be provided to NSD exceeding the above detailed amount, an amendment will be submitted for Council approval.

**Contract Term**

The term of the agreement will be from Jan. 1, 2019 to Dec. 31, 2019.

**Financial Impact**

There is no financial impact to the General Fund; Weatherization Assistance Programs are funded with grants from federal agencies and local organizations.

**This item was adopted.**

**68 Arizona Department of Housing Low-Income Weatherization Assistance Program (Ordinance S-45104)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with the Arizona Department of Housing (ADOH) and accept up to \$200,000 to fund City-approved individual grant agreements between property owners and qualified contractors to provide Weatherization Assistance Program (WAP) services in accordance with the ADOH contract terms funded by Southwest Gas Corporation (SWG). Further request authorization for the City Controller to accept and disburse all funds related to this item over the life of the contract.

**Summary**

NSD provides WAP services such as attic insulation, sun screens, duct sealing, room pressure relief/air balancing, and the repair or replacement

of heating and cooling systems to households which meet federal poverty income guidelines. NSD will receive WAP funding from ADOH through programs financed by Southwest Gas Corporation, the U.S. Department of Energy, and the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Low-Income Home Energy Assistance Program.

**Contract Term**

The contract term is for a one-year period from Jan. 1, 2019 to Dec. 31, 2019.

**Financial Impact**

There is no financial impact to the General Fund; these programs are funded with grants from federal agencies and local organizations.

**This item was adopted.**

**69     2018 Community Development Block Grant Reprogramming Request (Ordinance S-45109)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to reprogram \$1 million of available Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program income to continue to fund additional targeted code enforcement. Further request to authorize the City Controller to disburse the funds for the purposes of this ordinance.

**Summary**

Throughout the fiscal year, programs and projects funded through the CDBG allocation are reviewed, closed projects are reconciled, and available program income is referred to City Council for reprogramming into critical department programs and projects. The Neighborhood Services Department (NSD) requests a total of \$1 million of available CDBG program income to be reprogrammed to fund the following critical core departmental program previously approved by City Council, and to assist with meeting CDBG timeliness requirements:

*Targeted Code Enforcement (\$1 million)*

This provides an additional year of continued funding for nine Neighborhood Preservation Inspector I positions and one Neighborhood Preservation Inspector II position originally eliminated as part of the Feb. 3, 2009 General Fund budget reduction. Staff will continue to provide enforcement of the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance in targeted



eligible low-moderate-income census tracts, specifically in the City's targeted Neighborhood Initiative and Redevelopment areas, including the West Phoenix Revitalization Area (WPRA), through June 30, 2019.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval at the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee meeting on Oct. 2, 2018 by a vote of 4-0.

**Location**

Targeted Neighborhood Initiative Areas and Redevelopment Areas, including the West Phoenix Revitalization Area (WPRA).

**This item was adopted.**

**70      Loan Agreement with Neighborhood Economic Development  
Program Recipient Roland's Market, LLC (Ordinance S-45110)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a loan agreement with Roland's Market, LLC for up to \$100,000 in Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) program funds for facade and site improvements through the Neighborhood Commercial Rehabilitation (NCR) and Operation Patch and Paint (OPP) programs. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds associated with this agreement. The CDBG program is funded by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development; no General Funds are required for this project.

**Summary**

The NCR and OPP programs offer CDBG funding to complete exterior improvements through a deferred loan, secured by a Deed of Trust, which is forgiven over a period of up to 10 years. The programs were approved by City Council through Ordinance S-41711 as part of the 2015-2020 CDBG Consolidated Plan. NCR and OPP projects are selected through an open application process.

The goal of the NCR and OPP programs is to support the revitalization or improvement of commercial buildings along targeted business corridors to ensure the long-term sustainability of the community, its businesses and structures. Eligible economic revitalization projects must provide a

public benefit or deliver neighborhood enhancements including job creation for local residents, blight elimination, or the provision of qualified goods or services to residents of targeted, low-to-moderate income areas in Phoenix.

Roland's Market, LLC is a new business that began serving the community in 2018. This project includes, but is not limited to, improving the exterior facade with shading, an outdoor patio, landscaping, front-entry railing, and a rear security cage for equipment.

**Financial Impact**

The CDBG program is funded by the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development; no General Funds are required for this project.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval by the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee on Oct. 2, 2018 by a vote of 4-0.

**Location**

1505 E. Van Buren St. (Garfield Redevelopment Area)

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**71 Amend Lead-Based Paint Hazard Control Grant Ordinance  
(Ordinance S-45125)**

Request to amend Ordinance S-43133 to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to fund City-approved individual grant agreements between property owners and Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) certified lead abatement contractors in accordance with the terms of the Lead Hazard Control Program Grant from the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) Office of Lead Hazard Control and Healthy Homes. This grant does not impact the General Fund.

**Summary**

Per the Notice of Funding Availability issued by HUD on Nov. 21, 2016, the Neighborhood Services Department applied for and accepted Lead-Based Paint Hazard Control Grant funds for \$2.9 million from HUD. These funds provide lead testing and lead hazard control services in privately-owned housing occupied by low-income families with children

under six years of age. The certified contractors will provide lead hazard control services and address health and safety hazards in single-family and multi-family rehabilitation projects.

**Contract Term**

The program period of performance is 36 months from the grant effective date of Jan. 3, 2018.

**Financial Impact**

There is no impact to the General Fund; the Lead Hazard Control Program Grant is funded through HUD's Office of Lead Hazard Control and Healthy Homes.

**This item was adopted.**

**72 License Agreement for Additional Mobile Solar Generators  
(Ordinance S-45112)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to update the current revocable, non-exclusive license agreement with DC Solar Freedom from a maximum of 100 mobile solar generators to allow for up to 200 mobile solar generators, at no cost to the City.

**Summary**

Established in 2015, DC Solar Freedom, a benefit corporation, began manufacturing mobile solar generators -- a transportable solar energy capture and storage device about the size of a typical utility trailer -- capable of providing a number of energy services including event lighting, electric vehicle charging, equipment charging, and back-up power. Given the solar generators charge by solar energy, they provide clean and renewable power while operating noise-free.

The solar generators come in three configurations:

As a light tower equipped with eight LED lights capable of lighting 1-2 acres for 20 hours.

As an electric vehicle charging station capable of level 2 (220V) fast charging.

As a solar generator capable of providing continuous power for a number of applications from its eight 120V and 240V outlets.

City Council approved a license agreement with DC Solar Freedom for a

maximum of 100 solar trailers in early 2018. Since that time, over 60 trailers have been installed in parks, streets, police, aviation, and at transit park-and-rides with more units being installed this fall at various locations. City departments have tested the initial tranche of trailers, and received positive feedback from staff and the community. There is interest in updating the five-year license agreement to allow for up to 200 solar trailers for use on City property.

The financial model for DC Solar Freedom, as a benefit corporation, is different than that of a typical for-profit company. A benefit corporation is a type of for-profit corporate entity, authorized by 30 U.S. states and the District of Columbia, that includes positive impact on society, workers, the community and the environment in addition to profit as its legally defined goals. Within that context, DC Solar Freedom will cover the full cost of the mobile solar generator of \$150,000 each through strategic partner lease arrangements with DC Solar Distribution, Inc., a major clean energy company, and specific businesses that make the socially responsible decision to underwrite the power. DC Solar Freedom will cover the cost of all units they produce at no charge to cities and university campuses. The mobile solar generators will bear the logo of DC Solar and its partners in accordance with City advertising standards.

### **Financial Impact**

There is no financial impact for this change in the maximum number of trailers.

### **Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for City Council approval by the Water, Wastewater, Infrastructure and Sustainability Subcommittee on Oct. 3, 2018 by a vote of 3-0.

**This item was adopted.**

## **73 Golf Course Maintenance and Operation Contract (Ordinance S-45113)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a new contract with OB Sports Golf Management, LLC for maintenance of municipal golf courses at Aguila, Cave Creek, Encanto 18, Encanto 9, and Palo Verde; and to operate the Phoenix Golf Grills at Aguila, Cave

Creek and Encanto 18 golf courses for the Parks and Recreation Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The aggregate contract value for the initial five-year period will not exceed \$16.7 million, with an estimated annual expenditure of \$3.34 million.

**Summary**

Outsourcing the maintenance of municipal golf courses and concessions has been a key component to mitigating operational expenses at the courses. The Parks and Recreation Board approved outsourcing these services at its Dec. 13, 2012 meeting. The current contract for these services is scheduled to expire on Dec. 31, 2018.

The Parks and Recreation Department requested proposals from qualified firms to provide golf course maintenance services and concessions. The resulting professional services contract will contain a revenue-generating concessions component and a capital investment requirement.

**Procurement Information**

A Request for Proposals (RFP) was issued on Aug. 30, 2018, in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10, with responses due by Sept. 21, 2018. The RFP was sent to 25 golf management companies and advertised in the Arizona Republic, Arizona Informant and the Prensa Hispana newspapers for two consecutive weeks. The solicitation was also advertised on the City's solicitation web page. Additionally, a pre-proposal conference was held on Sept. 6, 2018, and eight firms were in attendance.

One response was received by the RFP due date and evaluated per the terms of the RFP. OB Sports Golf Management, LLC was found to be responsive and responsible. An evaluation panel reviewed the response based on the following evaluation criteria listed in the RFP:

Proposer's Qualifications and Experience (400 points).  
Method of Approach (300 points).  
Price Proposal/Fee to the City (200 points).  
References (100 points).

Offerors were required to provide a detailed strategy and list the total capital improvements for the Phoenix Golf Grills. Best and final contract negotiations were performed with the responsive offeror.

**Contract Term**

The contract term will be for five years covering Jan. 1, 2019 through Dec. 31, 2023, with an option to extend for three years, plus two additional one-year periods, for a total of 10 years.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value for the initial five-year period will not exceed \$16.7 million, with an estimated annual expenditure of \$3.34 million. Funds are available in the Parks and Recreation Department's budget.

**Location**

Golf Courses: Cave Creek, 15202 N. 19th Ave.; Encanto 18, 2775 N. 15th Ave.; Encanto 9, 2300 N. 17th Ave.; Palo Verde, 6215 N. 15th Ave.; and Aguila, 8440 S. 35th Ave.

Council Districts: 3, 4, 5 and 7

**This item was adopted.**

**76 Authorization to Enter into Contract with Equus Group, Inc. for Sale and Redevelopment of City-Owned Property at 135 N. 2nd Ave. (Ordinance S-45119)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a disposition and redevelopment agreement, and other agreements as necessary (Agreements), with Equus Group, Inc., or its City-approved designee (Developer), for the sale and redevelopment of the Ellis Building at 135 N. 2nd Ave. (Site); and for the City Treasurer to accept funds. The Project will generate one-time sales proceeds revenue of \$2.25 million for the General Fund.

**Summary**

In December 2015, City Council authorized the relocation of employees from the Site and for the sale of the building through a competitive solicitation process. The Site, the former Human Resources Building, became vacant in June 2016 and the City entered into a contract with the successful proposer in February 2017. Due to certain circumstances, in

January 2018, the parties mutually terminated the contract in May 2018. At the end of July, eight offers were received and reviewed by the Community and Economic Development Department (CEDD). Upon review and analysis of the offers, CEDD began negotiations with Developer. The Developer and City agreed to proposed business terms on Sept. 19, 2018. Staff and the Developer have negotiated the following business terms:

Enter into Agreements by Dec. 28, 2018. This period shall also be the due diligence period for the Developer.  
Close escrow by Dec. 28, 2018, which will include the Developer purchasing the Site and the City transferring title.  
Purchase price will be \$2.25 million.  
Accept a 10-year deed restriction on the Site to remain a primarily office use.  
City will disconnect the Site from the City's chilled water system.  
City will work with Developer to provide 140 parking spaces for the Project, at market rates, in mutually agreeable parking facilities for a term not less than seven years.  
Developer will complete the project within 24 months from close of escrow.  
Additional terms and conditions as required by the City.

Should the Developer identify a serious defect during the due diligence period, or finalize the parking agreement, which will make the project unfeasible, the parties may terminate the Agreement.

### **Contract Term**

The Developer will have until Dec. 28, 2018 to perform due diligence efforts, enter into the Agreement and close escrow. The Agreement will conclude upon the completion of construction of the improvements to redevelop the Site, which is expected to be no more than 24 months. The deed restriction will be for 10 years from the close of escrow.

### **Financial Impact**

The Project will generate one-time sale proceeds of \$2.25 million to the City. This purchase price will be used to pay off any remaining debt on the Site and the remainder will go to the General Fund.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The City Council approved the issuance of the RFP at the Dec. 16, 2015 meeting.

**Location**

135 N. 2nd Ave.

Council District: 7

**This item was adopted.**

**77 Edwards Fire Life Safety Systems - Requirements Contract - IFB 19-002 (Ordinance S-45095)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Southwest Integrated Solutions to provide test, inspection, and repair services for the Networked Edwards Fire Life Safety System for the Phoenix Convention Center Department (PCCD). Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The five-year aggregate value of the contract will not exceed \$300,000, with an annual estimated expenditure of \$60,000.

**Summary**

PCCD will use services under this contract to provide annual testing, maintenance, and repair of the Edwards fire alarm system in Symphony Hall, the Herberger Theater, Orpheum Theatre, Phoenix Convention Center South Building, Regency Garage, Heritage Garage, and East Garage. This contract will provide all testing, maintenance and repair services for the system.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 19-002 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. There were two offers received by the PCCD Financial and Procurement Services section on Sept. 6, 2018. The offer was evaluated on price, responsiveness to specifications and responsibility to provide the required services. The price was determined to be fair and reasonable based on the previous contract pricing. The solicitation notification was publicly posted and available for download from the City's website.

The vendor's offer is as follows: Southwest Integrated Solutions -



\$60,000 annually

The Deputy Phoenix Convention Center Director recommends that the offer from Southwest Integrated Solutions be accepted.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract term will begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018.

**Financial Impact**

The five-year aggregate value will not exceed \$300,000, with annual estimated expenditure of \$60,000. Funds are available in the Phoenix Convention Center Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**78 Authorization to Enter into Affiliated Personnel Agreements (Ordinance S-45128)**

Request authorization for the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into agreements with Scott Kurbat, Derek Hanson, John Gallagher, Steve Reinhart, Paul Debrowski, Franco Castro-Marin, Robert French, Dan Cook, Todd Davis, Dan Hogan, David Troxell, Fred Nelson, and Dennis Wipf to serve as Affiliated Personnel of the Arizona Task Force One (AZ-TF1). Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The Phoenix Fire Department is the sponsoring agency of AZ-TF1, one of 28 national Urban Search and Rescue response system task forces that can rapidly deploy skilled personnel and state of the art equipment to sites of natural disasters, terrorist attacks, and building collapses.

AZ-TF1 consists of individuals occupying certain specified positions plus additional support personnel, all of whom have been properly trained with the requisite skills and capabilities required for urban search and rescue operations and/or deployment of the AZ-TF1. As a requirement of the Urban Search and Rescue (US&R) Readiness Cooperative Agreement, PFD is charged with the recruitment and training of new task force members to an operation-ready state of deployment.

**Contract Term**

The agreements shall be effective upon approval and execution and shall remain in effect for a term of five years.

**Financial Impact**

Affiliated Personnel will be reimbursed through Federal Emergency Management Agency (FEMA) funds.

**This item was adopted.**

**80 Airport Towing and Auto Assistance - Requirements Contract - IFB 18-056 (Ordinance S-45075)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Priority Towing, LLC to provide towing and auto assistance services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport in an amount not to exceed \$1,389,360 for a five-year aggregate contract term. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

This contract will provide towing and auto assistance services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport which includes, but is not limited to: security tows, enforcement tows, safety tows, construction tows, abandoned vehicle tows, and parking garage relocations. Additionally, as part of the customer service amenities this contract will provide battery boost, flat tire assistance, fuel delivery, and lockout service. This contract will provide safety to customers and employees throughout the airport.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 18-056 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. Four offers were received and all offers were deemed responsive and responsible. Priority Towing, LLC was deemed as the lowest responsive and responsible bidder. All bids received are listed below:

Priority Towing, LLC: \$277,872.

First Class Automotive Transport, LLC: \$284,744.

Alliance Towing, LLC: \$290,305.

Western Towing of Phoenix, Inc.: \$688,208.

**Contract Term**

The contract shall begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018 for a five-year aggregate term with no options to extend.

**Financial Impact**

The contract value will not exceed \$1,389,360 for the five-year aggregate term. Funds are available in the Aviation Department budget.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval at the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board Subcommittee meeting on Oct. 18, 2018, by a vote of 6-0 with one abstention.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**81     Airport Consulting Services Contract Award - AVN RFP 18-038  
(Ordinance S-45077)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with LeighFisher, Inc. (LeighFisher) to provide financial and business consulting services to the Aviation Department in an amount not to exceed \$8.5 million for the five-year aggregate contract term. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

On June 6, 2018, the Phoenix City Council authorized the issuance of a Request for Proposal (RFP) for Airport Consulting Services. The awarded vendor will provide financial and business consulting services for the Aviation Department, including bond feasibility analyses, passenger forecasts, financial modeling, assistance with passenger facility charge applications and amendments, and support of the airline rates and charges program. The financial and business consulting services are crucial to the Aviation Department's ability to issue bonds, provide for the capital improvement program, and pursue its business objectives.

**Procurement Information**

Request for Proposal (RFP) AVN RFP 18-038 Airport Consulting Services was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. One proposal was received from LeighFisher, Inc. on July 13, 2018.

The proposal was evaluated and scored by a three-member evaluation committee based on the following criteria (total point range 0 - 1,000):  
Qualifications and Experience of Proposer (0-350 points).  
Qualifications and Experience of Key Team Members (0-300 points).  
Approach to Scope of Services (0-250 points).  
Fee Schedule (0-100 points).

The proposal and its score is as follows:  
LeighFisher: 920 points

**Contract Term**

The contract will begin on or about Nov. 1, 2018, for a five-year aggregate term with no options to extend.

**Financial Impact**

The contract will not exceed \$8.5 million for the five-year aggregate term. Funds are available in the Aviation Department budget.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

On Sept. 6, 2018, the Business and Development Subcommittee (BDSC) of the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board (PAAB) recommended approval of contract award to LeighFisher to the PAAB.

On Sept. 20, 2018, the PAAB recommended approval of contract award to LeighFisher to the Aviation and Transportation Subcommittee.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**82 Phoenix Deer Valley Airport Taxiway D - Construction Manager at Risk Preconstruction Services - AV31000089 FAA (Ordinance S-45091)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an agreement with Kiewit Infrastructure West Co. to provide Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Preconstruction Services for the Phoenix Deer Valley Airport Taxiway D project. Further request to authorize execution of amendments to the agreement as necessary within the Council-approved expenditure authority as provided below, and for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The fee for services will not exceed \$95,000.

**Summary**

The purpose of this project is to construct a new Taxiway D to be located south of Taxiway C at the Phoenix Deer Valley Airport (DVT). The hold bars south of Runway 7R/25L are currently located 150 feet south of the runway centerline. The design standard is 250 feet. This standard cannot be met with the current taxiway configuration without blocking traffic on Taxiway C. The addition of Taxiway D, as recommended in the June 2015 DVT Master Plan Update, solves this problem. The scope of this project will also include: new signage and LED lighting; relocating Taxiway C hold bars and existing helicopter landing pads; and improvements to the existing drainage system. The project will be constructed in phases consistent with FAA funding availability.

Kiewit Infrastructure West Co. will begin in an agency support role for CMAR Preconstruction Services. Kiewit Infrastructure West Co. will assume the risk of delivering the project through a Guaranteed Maximum Price (GMP) agreement.

Kiewit Infrastructure West Co.'s services include, but are not limited to: cost estimating; project planning and scheduling; assisting with permitting processes, providing alternate systems evaluation and constructability studies; and protecting the City's sensitivity to quality, safety, and environmental factors. A Disadvantaged Business Enterprise goal will be established for this project upon substantial completion of Preconstruction Services and prior to the start of construction.

**Procurement Information**

The selection was made using a qualifications-based selection process set forth in section 34-603 of the Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.). In accordance with A.R.S. section 34-603(H), the City may not release information on proposals received or the scoring results until an agreement is awarded. Four firms submitted proposals and are listed below.

**Selected Firm**

Rank 1: Kiewit Infrastructure West Co.

**Additional Proposers**

Rank 2: J. Banicki Construction, Inc.

Rank 3: Combs Construction Company, Inc.

Rank 4: Granite Construction Company, Inc.

**Contract Term**

The term of the agreement is 180 calendar days from the issuance of the Notice to Proceed. Work scope identified and incorporated into the agreement prior to the end of the term may be agreed to by the parties, and work may extend past the termination of the agreement. No additional changes may be executed after the end of the term.

**Financial Impact**

The agreement value for Kiewit Infrastructure West Co. will not exceed \$95,000, including all subcontractor and reimbursable costs.

Staff anticipates reimbursement from the FAA. Funding is available in the Aviation Department's Capital Improvement Program budget. The Budget and Research Department will separately review and approve funding availability prior to execution of any amendments. Payments may be made up to agreement limits for all rendered agreement services, which may extend past the agreement termination.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The City Council approved Engineering Services Agreement 146519 (Ordinance S-44131) on Dec. 13, 2017.

**Location**

Phoenix Deer Valley Airport, 702 W. Deer Valley Road.

Council District: 1

**This item was adopted.**

**83 Swissport Fueling Lease Amendment (Ordinance S-45115)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to amend Swissport Fueling, Inc.'s (Swissport) Facility Lease Agreement 132684 (Lease) at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport (Airport) to extend the term for one year. Rent for the fuel facility will be approximately \$64,876 for the one-year extension.

**Summary**

Swissport offers ground services, such as fueling and maintenance, for several air carriers at the Airport. In order to provide timely fueling for their customers, Swissport operates a fueling facility consisting of 3,983 square feet of land located on the airfield south of the north runway. The Lease will expire on Dec. 31, 2018. Swissport has requested a one-year extension to the term of the Lease. The purpose of the extension is to align the expiration date of the Lease with another lease Swissport has with the City.

**Contract Term**

The term of the Lease will be extended one year to expire Dec. 31, 2019. The amendment will not contain any option to extend. Other provisions of the Lease will be updated as needed. All other terms and conditions of the Lease will remain the same.

**Financial Impact**

Rent for the fuel facility will be approximately \$64,876 for the one-year extension.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval by the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board on Sept. 20, 2018 by a vote of 7-0.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**84 Amend Sky Harbor Center Ground Lease with GPT GIG BOA Portfolio Owner, LLC (Ordinance S-45116)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an amendment to ground lease 48819 with GPT GIG BOA Portfolio Owner, LLC (GPT) to extend the term of the ground lease 14 years and five months for lots one and two. The amendment may contain other terms and conditions deemed necessary or appropriate by the City Manager or his designee. Beginning Jan. 1, 2019, annual rent for both lots will be approximately \$1,466,303. Rent will be adjusted annually according to the Consumer Price Index.

**Summary**

GPT requested that the term of its ground lease for two lots located at 1825 E. Buckeye Road in Sky Harbor Center be extended 14 years and five months. In exchange for the extended term, GPT will invest \$11 million in capital improvements on the site by the end of calendar year 2025, and complete construction of the improvements prior to the end of calendar year 2037. If GPT fails to construct the improvements, then the extended term will be removed from the ground lease and the original expiration date of June 30, 2053 will remain. GPT owns the current building and Bank of America is the current tenant.

The rent during the extended term will be established by conducting an appraisal by an independent appraiser to set the fair market value of the land. Rent for the first year of the extended term will be set at the higher of the appraised value or the rent due for the final year of the current term. Rent will be adjusted annually thereafter according to the Consumer Price Index. Standard lease provisions will be updated. All other terms and conditions of the ground lease will remain the same.

**Contract Term**

The term will be extended 14 years and five months and will expire on Nov. 29, 2067.



**Financial Impact**

Beginning Jan. 1, 2019, annual rent for both lots will be approximately \$1,466,303. The rent will be adjusted annually according to the Consumer Price Index.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval by the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board on Sept. 20, 2018 by a vote of 6-1.

**Location**

1825 E. Buckeye Road  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**85      Airspace Analysis Services - Requirements Contract - RFP 18-037  
(Ordinance S-45117)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Planning Technology, Inc. to provide Airspace Analysis Services for the Aviation Department in an amount not to exceed \$60,000 for a five-year aggregate contract term. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

This contract provides specialized software which helps Aviation Planning staff to review proposed development both on and off airport property to determine if the construction will pose hazards/obstructions to aircraft flight paths that Aviation is required to protect. Objects protruding into airport aeronautical surfaces can significantly affect airport capacity by requiring changes to the airport minima. This service will include airspace surfaces that are unique for aircraft operation in Instrument Flight Rules (IFR) conditions to each runway at each airport. The current software agreement expires in November 2018.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Procurement Information**

Request for Proposal (RFP 18-037) Airspace Analysis Services, was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. The solicitation was advertised on Airport Consultants Council (ACC) and Southwest Chapter of American Association of Airport Executives (SWAAAE), plus courtesy notification was sent to 183 potential proposers registered in ProcurePHX. There was one offer received by the Contract and Services Division on May 29, 2018, and deemed responsive and responsible.

The proposals were evaluated by an evaluation panel and scored by consensus based on the following criteria, with a maximum of 1,000 points:

Software Capabilities (400 points).

Plan and Approach (250 points).

Company Qualifications and Experience of Proposer (200 points).

Fee Schedule (150 points).

The proposer and their score is as follows:

Planning Technology, Inc.: 805 points.

**Contract Term**

The five-year contract shall begin on Dec. 1, 2018, with no options to renew.

**Financial Impact**

The total five-year contract value is \$60,000; making the approximate annual cost \$12,000. The funds are available in the Aviation Department's budget.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

This item was recommended for approval at the Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board meeting on Sept. 20, 2018, by a vote of 7-0.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd., Deer Valley Airport, 702 W. Deer Valley Road, and Goodyear Airport, 1658 S.

Litchfield Road, Goodyear, Ariz.  
Council Districts: 1, 8 Out of City.

**This item was adopted.**

**86 Airport Dynamic Signage Maintenance and Repair - IFB 19-003  
(Ordinance S-45118)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into contracts with F&N Enterprises DBA SmithCraft, and Fluoresco Services, LLC to maintain and repair dynamic signs on an as-needed basis at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport for a combined amount not to exceed \$1.2 million for a five-year aggregate contract term. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

There are 96 dynamic signs on the airport campus that require ongoing maintenance. Dynamic signs are programmable displays that cast multimedia content for informational, marketing, or advertising purposes. These signs are visible along the roadways, on the terminal curbs, and inside the terminals to provide wayfinding, flight and airport information to visitors of the airport. The contracts will be for parts and labor to service, maintain and repair dynamic signs to ensure that outages have minimal impact to patrons of the airport. The contracts will also allow the City to replace dynamic signs that have reached end of life or to purchase and install new dynamic signs.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Procurement Information**

Invitation for Bid (IFB) 19-003 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. The solicitation was divided into six groups based on the manufacturer, age and location of the dynamic sign type and offerors were given the opportunity to bid on all, some, or one of the groups. Two offers were received on Aug. 17, 2018 and both offers were deemed responsive and responsible.

F&N Enterprises DBA SmithCraft is the lowest responsive and responsible bidder and is the recommended vendor for the following

groups:

Group 1 - Airport Roadway Dynamic Signs

Group 2 - Terminal 4 Curb Signs

Fluoresco Services, LLC is the lowest responsive and responsible bidder and is the recommended vendor for the following groups:

Group 3 - Parking Signs

Group 4 - Terminal 4 Baggage Handling Signs

Group 5 - Terminal 3 Curb Signs

Group 6 - Terminal 3 Concourse Signs

### **Contract Term**

The contract shall begin on or about Nov. 8, 2018 for a five-year aggregate term with no options to extend.

### **Financial Impact**

The combined contract value will not exceed \$1.2 million for the five-year aggregate term. Funds are available in the Aviation Department budget.

### **Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The Phoenix Aviation Advisory Board unanimously recommended approval on Sept. 20, 2018.

### **Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

## **87 Agreement with Air Canada Under the Air Service Incentive Program (Ordinance S-45120)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an Air Service Development Agreement with Air Canada, in accordance with the approved International Air Service Incentive Program (Program), and to waive landing fees for a flight to Montreal, Canada and reimburse eligible marketing costs. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds to Air Canada, not to exceed USD \$273,000,

for reimbursement of the eligible marketing costs.

**Summary**

On April 19, 2017, the City Council approved a new International Air Service Incentive Program to encourage the growth of international air service at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport (PHX).

Air Canada resumed scheduled air service between Phoenix and Montreal on Sept. 6, 2018. Montreal was Phoenix's largest Canadian market without nonstop air service. Montreal is a qualifying city in the Aviation Department's International Air Service Incentive Program approved by the City Council. Air Canada qualifies for benefits included in the incentive program by establishing these new flights.

**Financial Impact**

Per the City Council-approved Program, the City is to reimburse Air Canada up to USD \$273,000 for eligible marketing costs supporting the Phoenix-Montreal route. In addition, per the Council-approved Program, the City will waive landing fees from the implementation date and up to 12 months of operation of the new flight, through May 2019. Funds are available in the Aviation Department's operating budget.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**88 Agreement with Condor Flugdienst GmbH Under the Air Service Incentive Program (Ordinance S-45121)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an Air Service Development Agreement with Condor Flugdienst GmbH (Condor) and to waive general fees and to reimburse eligible marketing cost for a flight to Frankfurt, Germany, in accordance with the approved International Air Service Incentive Program. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds to Condor, in an amount not to exceed USD \$477,000.

**Summary**

On April 19, 2017, the City Council approved a new International Air Service Incentive Program (Incentive Program) to encourage the growth

of international air service at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport (PHX).

Condor will resume scheduled air service between Phoenix and Frankfurt on May 4, 2019. Frankfurt is Phoenix's second-largest European market without nonstop air service. Frankfurt is a qualifying city in the Incentive Program. Condor qualifies for benefits included in the Incentive Program by establishing these new flights.

### **Financial Impact**

Per the City Council-approved Incentive Program, the City is to reimburse Condor in an amount not to exceed USD \$477,000 for marketing costs. Marketing activities are expected to stimulate travel between Phoenix and Frankfurt. In addition, per the Incentive Program, the City will waive general fees not to exceed \$200,000. Funds are available in the Aviation Department's operating budget.

### **Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

## **89 Facility License Agreement with LGSTX Services, Inc. (Ordinance S-45122)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a Facility License Agreement (Agreement) with LGSTX Services, Inc. (LGSTX) for 49,614 square feet in Buildings A, B, and C of the West Air Cargo Facility. The rent for the agreement will be approximately \$829,855 for the first year. The rent will be adjusted annually based on Airline Rates and Charges.

### **Summary**

LGSTX specializes in providing facility maintenance services, aviation ground support equipment services, and distribution services. The company is requesting to enter into a Facility License Agreement for 49,614 square feet in Buildings A, B, and C of the West Air Cargo Facility. The space being requested consists of 21,120 square feet of vacant space in Building A, and an additional 28,494 square feet in Buildings B and C, currently occupied by ABX Air, Inc. (ABX) under

Letter of Authorization (LOA) 146613. ABX is a sister company to LGSTX and has requested to consolidate all space used by ABX and LGSTX into one agreement.

**Contract Term**

The term will be for two years, with two, one-year options to extend at the sole discretion of the Aviation Director.

**Financial Impact**

Rent for the agreement will be approximately \$829,855 for the first year. The rent will be adjusted annually based on Airline Rates and Charges.

**Location**

Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**90 Agreement with American Airlines Under the Air Service Incentive Program (Ordinance S-45123)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an Air Service Development Agreement, in accordance with the approved International Air Service Incentive Program (Program), with American Airlines for rent credits based on net new passengers on the new daily flights to and from London, England. The City is to provide a \$12 rent credit to American Airlines for each net new Phoenix enplaned passenger on the new flights, as established in the Program. Rent credits may not exceed rent charged.

**Summary**

On April 19, 2017, the Phoenix City Council approved a new International Air Service Incentive Program to encourage the growth of international air service at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport (PHX).

American Airlines has agreed to add new daily nonstop scheduled air service between Phoenix and London beginning March 31, 2019. London is Phoenix's largest overseas market and is a qualifying city in the International Air Service Incentive Program. American Airlines qualifies for benefits included in the Program by establishing these new flights.

**Financial Impact**

Per the City Council-approved Program, the City is to provide a \$12 rent credit to American Airlines for each net new Phoenix enplaned passenger on the new flights. Net new is defined as the total Phoenix enplaned passengers on the route that month, including on the new flight, exceeding the total number of Phoenix enplaned passengers on the route during the same month the previous year. Rent credits may not exceed rent charged.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.  
Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**91 Ground Lease with LGSTX Services, Inc. (Ordinance S-45124)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a Ground Lease with LGSTX Services, Inc. (LGSTX) for approximately 80,000 square feet of vacant space to park its fleet of tractor trailers on Aviation land. Rent will be approximately \$80,000 for the first lease year. The rent will be adjusted annually based on the Consumer Price Index.

**Summary**

LGSTX specializes in providing facility maintenance services, aviation ground support equipment services, and distribution services. The company is requesting to enter a ground lease for approximately 80,000 square feet of vacant space to park its fleet of tractor trailers on Aviation land. LGSTX will install fencing, a seal coat and striping, and will have 24-hour security. LGSTX has also requested, and the lease may contain, the option to expand its leasehold in year two of the agreement up to approximately 179,000 square feet. This lease request is in conjunction with an additional request by LGSTX to lease cargo space in West Air Cargo Buildings A, B, and C to conduct air cargo operations.

**Contract Term**

The term of the ground lease will be for two years, with two, one-year options to extend at the sole discretion of the Aviation Director.



**Financial Impact**

Rent will be approximately \$80,000 for the first lease year. The rent will be adjusted annually based on the Consumer Price Index.

**Location**

610 S. 24th St.

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**92 Request to Issue RFP for Baggage Handling System Operation, Maintenance and Repair Services**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to issue a Request for Proposals (RFP) for baggage handling system (BHS) operation, maintenance and repair services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport (Airport).

**Summary**

The RFP contract will provide for the daily operation, maintenance, and repair of the BHS at the Airport. The services required under the contract include all labor, supervision, equipment, parts, and supplies to ensure that the Airport's BHS meets strict airline and Transportation Security Administration operating and performance criteria. The RFP requires services for the following BHS:

Terminal 2 - Outbound (Terminal 2 will sunset in 2020).

Terminal 3 - Outbound.

Terminal 4 - International - Outbound.

Terminal 4 - International - Recheck.

**Procurement Information**

The proposal evaluation criteria (up to 1,000 points will be available) are as follows:

Fee Schedule.

Method of Approach.

Qualifications & Experience of Proposed On-Site Manager.

Qualifications & Experience of Proposer.

**Contract Term**

The term of the contract will be five years. The contract will not contain any option to extend the term.

**Financial Impact**

The total estimated annual contract value is \$2 million per year, not to exceed \$10 million over the five-year term of the contract.

**Location**

Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport, 3400 E. Sky Harbor Blvd.

Council District: 8

**This item was approved.**

**93      Approval of Federal Transit Administration Required 2018 Title VI Program Update**

Request City Council approval of the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) required 2018 Title VI Program update for the City of Phoenix Public Transit Department (PTD). The program plan will be effective Dec. 1, 2018 through Nov. 30, 2021.

**Summary**

As required by Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, “No person in the United States shall, on the grounds of race, color, and national origin, be excluded from participation in, be denied the benefits of, or be subjected to discrimination under any program or activity receiving federal financial assistance.”

Every three years, each recipient of federal funding must submit an updated Title VI Program that documents compliance with federal Title VI guidance. As the primary (designated) recipient of FTA funding in the Phoenix-Metro region, Public Transit is required to submit its updated program. The Title VI Program is also required by FTA guidance to be approved by the the City Council.

Public Transit has collaborated with Valley Metro and regional partners to update the Title VI Program. Public Transit will submit the Title VI Plan to the FTA on behalf of the entire region.

The Title VI Program elements include the following:

A signed Title VI assurance and governing body approval of the overall

Title VI Program.

A copy of the agency's public notice with a list of where the notice is posted.

Instructions for how to file a complaint with a copy of the complaint form.

A list of any Title VI investigations, lawsuits or complaints and how such complaints were addressed and resolved by the City of Phoenix Public Transit Department.

A Public Participation Plan and list of outreach activities conducted since the last submission.

A Language Assistance Plan for providing language assistance.

A table depicting the racial composition of transportation-related committees, board, and advisory councils.

Title VI analyses conducted for applicable facilities.

System-wide standards and policies.

Demographic and service profile maps and charts.

Fare and Service Equity Policy.

Origin and Destination data to include customer travel patterns and demographic markup.

Service Monitoring Program.

Description of how primary recipient of FTA funding monitors subrecipients.

The draft Public Transit Department 2018 Title VI Program Plan is available to the public at the Phoenix Public Transit Department located at 302 N. 1st Ave., 9th floor, Phoenix, 85003 and [http://www.phoenix.gov/publictransitsite/Documents/2018-08-13\\_City-of-Phoenix\\_Title-VI-Program.pdf](http://www.phoenix.gov/publictransitsite/Documents/2018-08-13_City-of-Phoenix_Title-VI-Program.pdf).

**This item was approved.**

**94      Contract for Maintenance of Software and Licensing Services with Trapeze Software Group, Inc. (Ordinance S-45099)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with Trapeze Software Group, Inc. (Trapeze) for the purchase of maintenance and licensing services for vehicle scheduling, dispatching and monitoring software for the Public Transit Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds in an amount not to exceed \$568,328 over five years.

**Summary**

The Public Transit Department currently uses Trapeze PASS and PASS-MON software for the coordination of real-time vehicle scheduling, dispatching and monitoring of all paratransit trips within the City of Phoenix. Trapeze is the developer of the software and only Trapeze is able to provide the necessary ongoing maintenance and support of the software.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Contract Term**

The contract term shall begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018 and end on Nov. 30, 2020. Provisions of the agreement also include options to exercise up to three one-year options, for a total of up to five years, which may be exercised by the Public Transit Director if it is in the City's best interest to do so.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value, if the City exercises all options, shall not exceed \$568,328 over five years. Funds are available in the Public Transit Department budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**95 Vehicle Management Support and Administration Contract Extension (Ordinance S-45100)**

Request an ordinance authorizing the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a one-year extension of Contract 134880 with Conduent Transport Solutions, Inc. (Conduent) to continue software and system administration support services for the existing Vehicle Management System (VMS) in the Public Transit Department until replacement of the system is complete. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds in an amount not to exceed \$530,424.

**Summary**

The City of Phoenix Public Transit Department, its contractors, and regional transit partners currently utilize the regional Vehicle Management System (VMS) developed by Conduent (previously Xerox Transport Solutions, Inc. and Affiliated Computer Services) and put into operation in 2003. VMS is the existing Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system that

provides Automatic Vehicle Location (AVL) capabilities for buses throughout the region operating under the Valley Metro brand and for Phoenix Dial-A-Ride (DAR) vehicles.

The existing Vehicle Management System (VMS), for which a replacement system is currently being installed, is used to help plan, operate, and monitor integrated systems for coordinated vehicle scheduling and dispatching, and monitoring technologies for the region.

The Public Transit Department currently has a regional CAD/AVL system upgrade project in progress which will replace the aging VMS. The replacement project is expected to be completed during the first half of 2019. To ensure bus operations are not negatively impacted during the transition, the continuous use of the existing VMS is necessary until the complete regional fleet is transitioned to the new system. This request is to extend the current Contract 134880 with Conduent Transportation Solutions, Inc during that time.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

### **Contract Term**

The extension will be for up to a one-year period beginning on Jan. 1, 2019, through Dec. 31, 2019, with an option to terminate the contract early with 30 days' notice, allowing the ability to terminate the contract coincident with the completion of the installation of the new CAD/AVL system.

### **Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$530,424. Funds are available in the Public Transit Department operating budget Transportation 2050 fund. The City will be reimbursed by regional transit partners for their respective share of the cost of this support agreement.

**This item was adopted.**

## **96 In-Vehicle Parts and Motorola Equipment Support - Contract Extension (Ordinance S-45101)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a one-year extension for Contract 134881 with Conduent Transport Solutions, Inc. (Conduent) for support services on the in-vehicle parts and Motorola equipment components of the Vehicle Management System (VMS) for the Public Transit Department. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds in an amount not to exceed \$391,356.

**Summary**

The City of Phoenix Public Transit Department, its contractors, and regional transit partners currently utilize the regional VMS developed by Conduent (previously Xerox Transport Solutions, Inc. and Affiliated Computer Services) and put into operation in 2003. VMS is a Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system that provides Automatic Vehicle Location (AVL) capabilities for buses throughout the region operating under the Valley Metro brand and for Phoenix Dial-A-Ride (DAR) vehicles.

The in-vehicle parts and Motorola equipment supported by this contract are part of the existing VMS, which is used to help plan, operate, and monitor integrated systems for coordinated vehicle scheduling and dispatching, and monitoring technologies for the region.

The Public Transit Department currently has a regional CAD/AVL system upgrade project in progress which will replace the aging VMS. The project is expected to be completed during the first half of 2019. To help ensure bus operations are not negatively impacted during the transition, the continuous use of the existing VMS is necessary until the complete regional fleet is transitioned to the new system. This request is to extend the current Contract 134881 with Conduent Transportation Solutions, Inc., to ensure continued support of the in-vehicle parts and Motorola equipment components of VMS.

This item has been reviewed and approved by the Information Technology Services Department.

**Contract Term**

The extension will be for up to a one-year period beginning on Jan. 1, 2019, through Dec. 31, 2019, with an option to terminate the contract

early with 30 days' notice, allowing the ability to terminate the contract coincident with the completion of the installation of the new CAD/AVL system.

**Financial Impact**

The aggregate contract value shall not exceed \$391,356. Funds are available in the Public Transit Department operating budget. The City will be reimbursed by regional transit partners for their respective share of the cost of this support agreement.

**This item was adopted.**

**97 Contract Change Order with Regional Public Transportation Authority for Fixed Route Bus Transit Service (Ordinance S-45114)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract change order to Contract 143071 with the Regional Public Transportation Authority (RPTA) for a year-end reconciliation payment for bus transit services provided to the City of Phoenix. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse funds for the change order in an amount not to exceed \$225,633.

**Summary**

This Intergovernmental Agreement was originally approved by City Council on April 20, 2016, and commenced on July 1, 2016. A contract change order is executed each fiscal year to authorize the funding for that year's bus service based on estimates of annual fixed route miles, cost per mile, farebox revenue and federal preventive maintenance funding credit. Transit services are customarily purchased and sold between regional entities where adding service or continuing an existing bus route is most economical. Phoenix also sells service to the RPTA on various routes.

On May 10, 2017, City Council authorized payment to the RPTA for the City of Phoenix portions of fixed bus routes 30, 45, 56, 61, 77, 108, 140 and 156 for fiscal year 2017-18 in the amount of \$6,854,701, funded by Transportation 2050. Subsequently, the fiscal year 2017-18 reconciliation recently provided by the RPTA revealed the actual expense after revenues were applied was \$7,080,334, resulting in an additional amount due to the RPTA of \$225,633. Public Transit Department staff reviewed the reconciliation and determined it to be accurate.

The changes in final expenses were the result of:

Updated revenue miles due to adopted service changes. In October 2017, Route 140 began service on Ray Road. In April 2018, Route 30 and Route 77 service to South Mountain Community College were modified.

Updated cost per mile.

Actual fares collected to offset transit expenses.

Updated federal preventative maintenance credits received.

### **Financial Impact**

The total amount of this change order will not exceed \$225,633. Funds are available in the Public Transit Department operating budget Transportation 2050 fund.

**This item was adopted.**

## **98 Fuel Tanker Tank Inspection, Maintenance and Repair Contract Recommendation (Ordinance S-45089)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with HCP GWL Holdings, LLC dba Great Western Leasing and Sales, LLC to provide fuel tank inspections, maintenance and repair of City of Phoenix fuel tanker trucks as required. The estimated aggregate amount for this contract is \$65,000. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

### **Summary**

The Public Works Department manages and maintains a fleet of four fuel tanker trucks. These trucks deliver thousands of gallons of fuel products to various City sites and generators on a daily basis. This contract will enable Public Works to have repairs completed on fuel tanks, fuel pumps, fuel plumbing and grounding systems, as well as have annual vapor testing conducted to maintain compliance with Maricopa County Air Pollution Control Regulations.

### **Procurement Information**

Request for Quotes (RFQ) 19-FSD-017 was conducted in accordance with Administrative Regulation 3.10. The Public Works Department, Procurement Section, received two quotes, with one vendor being



recommended.

Great Western Leasing and Sales, LLC: \$82 per hour labor rate  
Massey's Truck and Tank Repair, Inc.: \$86 per hour labor rate

### **Contract Term**

The initial one year contract term shall begin on or about Dec. 1, 2018 with four option years in increments up to one year, with a total contract option term of five years.

### **Financial Impact**

This contract will have a \$13,000 estimated annual expenditure, with a total aggregate amount not to exceed \$65,000 over the life of the contract. Funds are available in the Public Works Department's budget.

**This item was adopted.**

**99 Salt River Project Land Use License with City of Phoenix for Private Commercial Development Project, "Amazon PHX3 Parking Lot," at Southeast Corner of Buckeye Road and 71st Avenue**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a land use license with Salt River Project (SRP) for a private commercial development project "Amazon PHX3 Parking Lot" (KIVA Number 17-1253) located at the southeast corner of Buckeye Road and 71st Avenue. There is no financial impact to the City for this license.

### **Summary**

The land use license is necessary to facilitate the development of the property located at the southeast corner of Buckeye Road and 71st Avenue. The license will allow for the construction of right-of-way improvements including: pavement, curb, gutter, sidewalk and landscaping along 71st Avenue and will be consistent with and shall not interfere with U.S. Bureau of Reclamation fee property.

### **Indemnification**

The SRP license agreement includes authorization pursuant to Phoenix City Code section 42-20 to indemnify, release and hold harmless SRP for: (A) acts of omissions of the City, its agents, officers, directors or employees; (B) the City's use of occupancy of the licensed property for

the purposes contemplated by the license, including but not limited to claims by third parties who are invited or permitted onto the licensed property, either expressed or implied by the City or by nature of the City's improvement or other use of the licensed property pursuant to this license; and (C) the City's failure to comply with or fulfill its obligations established by the license or by laws. Per City of Phoenix Code, indemnification of another public entity requires approval from the City Council.

**Contract Term**

The term of the License shall be for 25 years beginning Jan. 1, 2019 and ending Dec. 31, 2045. The license may be renewed upon written agreement by the parties.

**Financial Impact**

There is no financial impact for this license.

**Location**

Southeast corner of Buckeye Road and 71st Avenue.

Council District: 7

**This item was approved.**

**101 Intergovernmental Agreement with Maricopa Association of Governments and Maricopa Department of Transportation for Transportation and Infrastructure Study in South Mountain and Laveen Villages (Ordinance S-45073)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA) with the Maricopa Association of Governments (MAG) and the Maricopa County Department of Transportation (MCDOT) for a transportation and infrastructure study to evaluate traffic circulation and land use impacts in the South Mountain and Laveen villages. This project will help staff plan for transportation, roadway and infrastructure needs that will accommodate the expanding development in the southwest part of the City. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this agreement. The City's cost share is \$100,000.

**Summary**

The Laveen-South Mountain area has seen extensive growth over the

past 20 years. This area has experienced a major transition from agricultural and rural type land uses to more dense residential development, which has resulted in high population growth and increased traffic. In addition, the large storm event in August 2014 brought to light the need for improved roadway and drainage infrastructure for this growing area.

### Study Objectives

Provide framework to add traffic capacity to areas south of Gila River to improve connectivity.

Partner with MCDOT to resolve 'patchwork' land uses and roadway designations to plan for an efficient transportation network that includes appropriate drainage infrastructure.

Upgrade area roads that are unimproved in specific segments causing traffic congestion.

Require the development community to pay their share of roadway improvements to provide adequate infrastructure to serve the needs of development in outlying areas.

Address existing Salt River Project (SRP) canals and their connectivity to unincorporated and incorporated areas in relationship to the transportation network.

Coordinate existing and future flood control mitigation needs and opportunities as they relate to the transportation network.

The study will include two areas of focus: 1) For overall system improvements, the plan will evaluate items that improve accessibility, circulation and safety, and 2) Plan recommendations will be developed for system-wide roadway classifications, signalization needs, circulation patterns based on existing conditions and future land use changes, multi-modal connections, and bridge infrastructure needs.

### Study Duration

The study has an estimated duration of 18 months with a projected start time of Spring 2019.

### **Financial Impact**

The study is a cooperative effort with MAG providing \$300,000, and MCDOT and the City of Phoenix each providing \$100,000. Funding is

available in the Street Transportation Department's Capital Improvement Program.

**Location**

The study area is bounded by 83rd Avenue to the west, the Salt River to the north, Elliot Road to the south and 27th Avenue to the east.

Council Districts: 7 and 8

**This item was adopted.**

**102 Water Services Department Pressure Reducing Valve Program - Engineering Services - WS85110007 (Ordinance S-45078)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into an agreement with Wilson Engineers, LLC to provide Engineering Services that include assessment, design, and possible construction administration and inspection (CA&I) services for the Pressure Reducing Valve (PRV) program. Further request to authorize the execution of amendments to the agreement as necessary within the council-approved expenditure authority as provided below, and for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The fee for services will not exceed \$2,475,000.

Additionally, request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to take all action deemed necessary to execute all utilities-related design and construction agreements, licenses, permits, and requests for utility services related to the development, design and construction of the project and to include disbursement of funds. Utility services included, but are not limited to: electrical, water, sewer, natural gas, telecommunication, cable television, railroads, and other modes of transportation. This authorization excludes any transaction involving an interest in real property.

**Summary**

The purpose of this project is to evaluate safety features, instrumentation control, operational efficiencies, capacity expansion, and other issues related to the existing PRVs. There are 94 active PRVs within the City's water production and distribution system. Many of them are located inside vaults under major streets. During vault access, traffic control and confined space entry is necessary, which creates challenges for regular preventative maintenance activity access. One of the main goals of the

program is to inventory, identify and assess the PRVs currently located inside vaults under major streets and potentially relocate them above ground and outside of any street right-of-way.

Wilson Engineers, LLC's services include, but are not limited to: working as a team with the selected Job Order Contractor to ensure there is an efficient, consistent and seamless approach for different activities within this program. They will also be responsible for providing inspection; assessment; design and construction administration and inspection services for two to three PRV stations for potential relocation/improvement each year; provide services, as needed, for land survey and acquisition; construction easements; drainage; and site geotechnical investigation associated with PRV relocation.

### **Procurement Information**

The selection was made using a qualifications-based selection process set forth in section 34-603 of the Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.). In accordance with A.R.S. section 34-603(H), the City may not publicly release information on proposals received or the scoring results until an agreement is awarded. Three firms submitted proposals and are listed below:

#### Selected Firm

Rank 1: Wilson Engineers, LLC

#### Additional Proposers

Rank 2: Carollo Engineers, Inc.

Rank 3: Primatech, LLC

### **Contract Term**

The term of the agreement is four years from the issuance of the Notice to Proceed. Work scope identified and incorporated into the agreement prior to the end of the term may be agreed to by the parties, and work may extend past the termination of the agreement. No additional changes may be executed after the end of the term.

### **Financial Impact**

The agreement value for Wilson Engineers, LLC will not exceed

\$2,475,000, including all subconsultant and reimbursable costs.

Funding is available in the Water Services Department's Capital Improvement Program budget. The Budget and Research Department will separately review and approve funding availability prior to execution of any amendments. Payments may be made up to agreement limits for all rendered agreement services, which may extend past the agreement termination.

**This item was adopted.**

**103 Street Transportation Department Soils and Materials Testing On-Call Services for Calendar Years 2019-2020 (Ordinance S-45080)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into separate agreements with the 18 consultants listed in **Attachment A**, to provide Soils and Materials Testing On-Call services for the Street Transportation Department. Further request to authorize the execution of amendments to the agreements as necessary within the Council-approved expenditure authority as provided below, and for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The fee for services will not exceed \$1.2 million for each agreement.

Additionally, request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to take all action deemed necessary to execute all utilities-related design and construction agreements, licenses, permits, and requests for utility services relating to the development, design, and construction of the project, and to include disbursement of funds. Utility services include, but are not limited to: electrical; water; sewer; natural gas; telecommunications; cable television; railroads; and other modes of transportation. This authorization excludes any transaction involving an interest in real property.

**Summary**

The On-Call consultants will be responsible for providing On-Call geotechnical, soils and materials testing, and laboratory services that include, but are not limited to: sampling; laboratory and field testing of soil, concrete and asphalt; asphalt, concrete and aggregate plant inspections; and analyses and preparation of reports. The consultants will have appropriate certifications such as: Occupational Safety and Health

Administration Trench Safety, Mine Safety Health Administration, American Concrete Institute, Arizona Technical Testing Institute, Concrete & Cement Reference Laboratory, and American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials.

### **Procurement Information**

The selections were made using a qualifications-based selection process set forth in section 34-604 of the Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.). In accordance with A.R.S. section 34-604(H), the City may not publicly release information on proposals received or the scoring results until an agreement is awarded. Twenty firms submitted proposals and are listed in **Attachment A**.

### **Contract Term**

The term of each agreement is for two years, or up to \$1.2 million, whichever occurs first. Work scope identified and incorporated into the agreement prior to the end of the term may be agreed to by the parties, and work may extend past the termination of the agreement. No additional changes may be executed after the end of the term.

### **Financial Impact**

The agreement values for each of the On-Call consultants will not exceed \$1.2 million, including all subconsultant and reimbursable costs. The total fee for all services will not exceed \$21.6 million.

Funding is available in the Street Transportation Department's capital improvement program and operating budgets. The Budget and Research Department will review and approve funding availability prior to the issuance of any on-call task order. Payments may be made up to agreement limits for all rendered agreement services, which may extend past the agreement termination.

**This item was adopted.**

**104     Salt River Project Construction Services Agreement for Aguila Golf Course Irrigation Water Structure - PA75300232 (Ordinance S-45106)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a construction services agreement with Salt River Project (SRP) to install a

new irrigation water structure to Aguila Golf Course, located at the northwest corner of 35th Avenue and Dobbins Road. Further request authorization for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item, in an amount not to exceed \$96,948.

**Summary**

The City of Phoenix Aguila Golf Course has an open, private irrigation ditch to feed a lake on the golf course. Due to maintenance and safety issues, the Parks and Recreation Department would like to remove the open, private irrigation ditch and feed the lake with a new irrigation structure.

**Indemnification**

The SRP license agreement includes authorization pursuant to Phoenix City Code section 42-20 to indemnify, release and hold harmless SRP for: (A) acts of omissions of the City, its agents, officers, directors or employees; (B) the City's use of occupancy of the licensed property for the purposes contemplated by the license, including but not limited to claims by third parties who are invited or permitted onto the licensed property, either expressed or implied by the City or by nature of the City's improvement or other use of the licensed property pursuant to this license; and (C) the City's failure to comply with or fulfill its obligations established by the license or by laws. Per City of Phoenix Code, indemnification of another public entity requires approval from the City Council.

**Financial Impact**

Funding in the amount of \$96,948 is available in the Parks and Recreation Department's Capital Improvement Program budget through the Phoenix Parks and Preserve Initiative fund.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The design services agreement (S-44579) for this project was approved at the May 16, 2016 Formal Council Meeting.

**Location**

8440 S. 35th Ave.  
Council District: 7



**This item was adopted.**

**105 Salt River Project Facilities Relocation Agreement for Electrical Facility for City of Phoenix - 27th Avenue, Buckeye Road to Lower Buckeye Road - ST85100341 (Ordinance S-45111)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to execute a Facility Relocation Agreement with Salt River Project (SRP) for electrical facilities within 27th Avenue from Buckeye Road to Lower Buckeye Road. There is no financial impact to the City.

**Summary**

SRP currently has electrical facilities on 27th Avenue which will be undergrounded as a result of the 27th Avenue Street Improvement Project. The 27th Avenue project involves undergrounding some electrical facilities, installing new street lights and roadway construction.

A Facilities Relocation Agreement (FRA) will be executed to include addressing potential future relocation costs if future relocation of undergrounded electrical facilities is caused by a City project. Because the project uses SRP Aesthetics Funds to underground the electrical facilities, the FRA states that the City will pay 100 percent of any potential future relocation costs. The FRA will contain additional terms and conditions deemed necessary and appropriate to facilitate future electrical relocations.

Further request the City Council to grant an exception pursuant to Phoenix City Code section 42-20 to authorize indemnification and assumption of liability provisions that otherwise would be prohibited by Phoenix City Code section 42-18.

**Financial Impact**

There is no financial impact to the City.

**Public Outreach**

Citizen notification was completed as part of the design and construction process.

**Location**

27th Avenue, Buckeye Road to Lower Buckeye Road.

Council District: 7

**This item was adopted.**

**106 Support for Formation of Rancho Ventura No. 3 Irrigation Water Delivery District (Resolution 21689)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to adopt a resolution to support formation of the Rancho Ventura No. 3 Irrigation Water Delivery District (IWDD) through Maricopa County. The proposed IWDD includes the single-family residential properties bounded by Cambridge Avenue to the south, Thomas Road to the north, 40th Street to the west, and 43rd Street to the east. This action has no financial impact to the City of Phoenix.

**Summary**

Under the provisions of Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.) title 48, chapter 20, Irrigation Water Delivery Districts, when the majority of the lot or parcel owners entitled to or capable of receiving irrigation water from the same system want irrigation water delivered to their lands, they may propose the organization of an IWDD. Maricopa County requires that applicants for an IWDD within City of Phoenix boundaries obtain City Council support before the County will start the process of forming or re-establishing a district.

If approved by the City Council, landowning neighbors seeking an IWDD complete a special taxation impact statement, and submit this document to the Maricopa County Board of Supervisors. The Board of Supervisors, along with Salt River Project (SRP), will decide if a petition to organize an IWDD may be circulated. See **Attachment A** for the Consent from SRP to the Board of Supervisors.

This request has been reviewed by the Water Services Department.

**Financial Impact**

This action has no financial impact to the City of Phoenix.

**Public Outreach**

On Sept. 27, 2018, the City received a formal written request from City of Phoenix resident Tanis LJ Fitzgerald, representative for the Rancho Ventura No. 3 neighborhood, to pursue Council approval to form an

IWDD with Maricopa County (**Attachment B**).

**Location**

The proposed IWDD includes the single-family residential properties bounded by Cambridge Avenue to the south, Thomas Road to the north, 40th Street to the west, and 43rd Street to the east.

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**107 Final Plat - Storage Conversion - 180013 - Southeast Corner of 35th Avenue and Greenway Road**

Plat: 180013

Project: 00-1089

Name of Plat: Storage Conversion

Owner(s): WPC Greenway Storage, LLC

Engineer(s): Hunter Engineering

Request: A 6 Lot Commercial Plat

Reviewed by Staff: Oct. 4, 2018

Final Plat requires Formal Action Only

**Summary**

Staff requests that the above plat be approved by the City Council and certified by the City Clerk. Recording of the plat dedicates the streets and easements as shown to the public.

**Location**

Generally located at the southeast corner of 35th Avenue and Greenway Road.

Council District: 1

**This item was approved.**

**108 Final Plat - Peak View Park - 180097 - Southeast Corner of 44th Street and Peak View Road**

Plat: 180097

Project: 05-2315

Name of Plat: Peak View Park

Owner(s): Keystone at Peak View, LLC

Engineer(s): Bowman Consulting Group, Ltd.

Request: A 19 Lot Single Family Residential Plat

Reviewed by Staff: Oct. 12, 2018

Final Plat requires Formal Action Only

**Summary**

Staff requests that the above plat be approved by the City Council and certified by the City Clerk. Recording of the plat dedicates the streets and easements as shown to the public.

**Location**

Generally located at the southeast corner of 44th Street and Peak View Road.

Council District: 2

**This item was approved.**

**109 Final Plat - Verano Vista - 180009 - 1905 E. Virginia Ave.**

Plat: 180009

Project: 17-2041

Name of Plat: Verano Vista

Owner(s): Ron R. Eghrari, Silvernine Properties, LLC

Engineer(s): Engineering & Environmental Consultants, Inc.

Request: An 8 Lot Residential Subdivision Plat

Reviewed by Staff: Sept. 20, 2018

Final Plat requires Formal Action Only

**Summary**

Staff requests that the above plat be approved by the City Council and certified by the City Clerk. Recording of the plat dedicates the streets and easements as shown to the public.

**Location**

Generally located 1905 E. Virginia Ave.

Council District: 4

**This item was approved.**

**110 Abandonment of Right-of-Way - V180045A - 3301 W. Morten Ave.  
(Resolution 21688)**

Abandonment: V180045A

Project: 18-2793

Applicant: Gabrielle and Kathleen Chagolla

Request: To abandon 25 foot right-of-way immediately east of property located at 3301 W. Morten Ave., between lots 12 and 13 of the North View Acres subdivision.

Date of Hearing: Aug. 28, 2018

**Location**

3301 W. Morten Ave.

Council District: 5

**Financial Impact**

A fee was also collected as part of this abandonment in the amount of \$1,228.

**This item was adopted.**

**111 Abandonment of Right-of-Way - V180037A - 501 East State Avenue (Resolution 21691)**

Abandonment: V180037A

Project: 18-1678

Applicant: Joseph Ian Swiergol

Request: To abandon a portion of the east - west alley between north 3rd Street and 6th Place, along the south property line of 301, 311, 319, 327, and 501 E. State Ave. and the north property line of 302, 320, 330 and 350 E. Northview Ave. and ending at the east place of 350 E. Northview Ave.

Date of Hearing: July 31, 2018

**Location**

501 E. State Ave.

Council District: 6

**Financial Impact**

A fee was also collected as part of this abandonment in the amount of \$981.

**This item was adopted.**

**112 Abandonment of Right-of-Way - V180026A - 1401 E. Van Buren St. (Resolution 21687)**

Abandonment: V180026A

Project: 16-3254

Applicant: Chicanos Por La Causa

Request: To abandon the 15 foot portion of alleyway bounded by Van Buren Street and Monroe Street, and APN 116-46-038A and APN 116-46-039A; book 001, page 11, Maricopa County Recorder.

Date of Hearing: June 12, 2018

**Location**

1401 E. Van Buren St.

Council District: 8

**Financial Impact**

A fee was also collected as part of this abandonment in the amount of \$2,250.

**This item was adopted.**

**113 Amend City Code - Official Supplementary Zoning Map 1176 (Ordinance G-6519)**

Request to authorize the City Manager or his designee to amend Section 601 of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance by adopting Official Supplementary Zoning Map 1176. This amendment reflects that the property owner has met all of the rezoning conditions previously approved by City Council with Z-94-06-8, Z-192-86-2 and the entitlements are fully vested.

**Summary**

To rezone a parcel located at the northeast corner of 35th Street and Palm Lane.

Z-94-06-8

Zoning: R-3

Owner: Palm Grove Homes LP

Acreage: Approximately 3.25

Location: Northeast corner of 35th Street and Palm Lane.

Council District: 8

To rezone a parcel located at the southwest corner of 7th Avenue and Pinnacle Peak Road.

Z-192-86-2

Zoning: CP/GCP

Owner: Deer Valley Airpark Assoc., et al.

Acreage: Approximately 45.65

Location: Southwest corner of 7th Avenue and Pinnacle Peak Road

Council District: 2

**This item was adopted.**

**114 Amend City Code - Official Supplementary Zoning Map 1177  
(Ordinance G-6526)**

Request to amend Section 601 of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance by adopting Official Supplementary Zoning Map 1177. This amendment reflects that the property owner has met all of the rezoning conditions previously approved by City Council with Z-62-06-8 and the entitlements are fully vested.

**Summary**

To rezone a parcel located on the southwest corner of 1st Avenue and Grant Street

Z-62-06-8

Zoning: R-3

Owner: Earl and Mary Rose Wilcox

Acreage: Approximately 0.37

Location: Southwest corner of 1st Avenue and Grant Street

Council District: 8

**This item was adopted.**

**115 Amend City Code - Remove/Replace Zoning District for 107th  
Avenue and Broadway Road - Annexation No. 489 (Ordinance  
G-6527)**

Request to amend the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, Section 601, the Zoning Map of the City of Phoenix, by removing the Maricopa County Rural 43 zoning district and replacing it with the City of Phoenix S-1 (Ranch or Farm Residence) zoning district on property at the location described below, which was annexed into the City of Phoenix on October 3, 2018 by Ordinance S-45035 (102-acre property located east of 107th Avenue and Broadway Road).

**Location**

Property located east of 107th Avenue and south of Broadway Road

Council District: 7

**This item was adopted.**

**116 Amend City Code - Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application  
Z-36-18-2 - Southeast Corner of Tatum Boulevard and Grovers  
Avenue (Ordinance G-6524)**

Request to amend the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, Section 601, the Zoning Map of the City of Phoenix, by adopting Rezoning Application Z-36-18-2 and rezone the site from R1-18 to R1-10 and R-2 to allow single-family residential (detached and duplexes).

**Summary**

Current Zoning: R1-18

Proposed Zoning: R1-10 and R-2

Acreage: 121.70

Proposed Use: Single-family residential (detached and duplexes).

Owner: Jean M. Marley Trust and JLEY Investors Limited Partnership

Applicant: Jason Morris, Withey Morris, PLC

Representative: Jason Morris, Withey Morris, PLC

Staff Recommendation: Approval, subject to stipulations.

VPC Action: The Paradise Valley Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 17, 2018, and recommended approval per staff recommendation by a 13-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the Addendum A Staff Report by a 6-0 vote.

**Location**

Southeast corner of Tatum Boulevard and Grovers Avenue.

Council District: 2

Parcel Addresses: 17150 N. 52nd St.

**This item was adopted.**

**117 Amend City Code - Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application  
Z-40-18-7- Approximately 255 Feet North of the Northeast Corner of  
75th Avenue and Van Buren Street (Ordinance G-6521)**

Request to amend the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, Section 601, the Zoning Map of the City of Phoenix, by adopting Rezoning Application Z-40-18-7 and rezone the site from CP/GCP to A-1 to allow light



industrial uses.

**Summary**

Current Zoning: CP/GCP

Proposed Zoning: A-1

Acreage: 25.34

Proposed Use: Light industrial

Owner: CI PHX I-GW, LLC

Applicant: Colony NorthStar, Inc.

Representative: Shaine Alleman, Tiffany & Bosco, P.A.

Staff Recommendation: Approval, subject to stipulations.

VPC Action: The Estrella Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 11, 2018, and recommended approval per the staff recommendation by a 7-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the Estrella Village Planning Committee recommendation with an additional stipulation by a 7-0 vote.

**Location**

Approximately 255 feet north of the northeast corner of 75th Avenue and Van Buren Street.

Council District: 7

Parcel Address: 405 N. 75th Ave.

**This item was adopted.**

**118 Amend City Code - Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application  
Z-SP-3-18-7 - Approximately 300 Feet East of the Northeast Corner  
of Jesse Owens Parkway and Baseline Road (Ordinance G-6523)**

Request to amend the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, Section 601, the Zoning Map of the City of Phoenix, by adopting Rezoning Application Z-SP-3-18-7 and rezone the site from C-2 to C-2 SP for a special permit to allow self-service storage, household moving center (truck rental) and all underlying C-2 uses.

**Summary**

Current Zoning: C-2 BAOD

Proposed Zoning: C-2 SP BAOD

Acreage: 10.27

Proposed Use: Special permit to allow self-service storage, household moving center (truck rental) and all underlying C-2 uses.

Owner: Amerco Real Estate Company

Applicant: Amerco Real Estate Company

Representative: Moses Eason, Amerco Real Estate Company

Staff Recommendation: Approval, subject to stipulations.

VPC Action: The South Mountain Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 11, 2018, and recommended approval with a modification and an additional stipulation by a 12-3 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the South Mountain Village Planning Committee recommendation with an additional stipulation by a 6-0 vote.

#### **Location**

Approximately 300 feet east of the northeast corner of Jesse Owens Parkway and Baseline Road.

Council District: 7

Parcel Address: 336 and 340 E. Baseline Road

**This item was continued to the Nov. 14, 2018 City Council Formal Meeting.**

**124 Public Hearing - Amend City Code and Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application Z-46-18-8 - Southwest Corner of 55th Avenue and Elliot Road (Ordinance G-6522)**

Request to hold a public hearing for the following item and consider adoption of the Planning Commission's recommendation and the related Ordinance if approved. Request is to rezone the site from S-1 to R1-8 to allow single-family residential.

#### **Summary**

Current Zoning: S-1

Proposed Zoning: R1-8

Acreage: 39.78

Proposed Use: Single-family residential

Owner: Northside Hay Company, Inc.

Applicant: Chris Colyer, Snell and Wilmer, LLP

Representative: Chris Colyer, Snell and Wilmer, LLP

Staff Recommendation: Approval, subject to stipulations.

VPC Action: The Laveen Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 10, 2018, and recommended approval with modifications and additional stipulations by an 8-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the Laveen Village Planning Committee recommendation with modifications and additional stipulations by a 5-2 vote.

**Location**

Southwest corner of 55th Avenue and Elliot Road.

Council District: 8

Parcel Address: 5555, 5601, and 5655 W. Elliot Road

**This item was continued to the Dec. 5, 2018 City Council Formal Meeting.**

**125 Public Hearing - Amend City Code and Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application Z-41-18-4 - Northeast Corner of 7th Street and Thomas Road (Ordinance G-6525)**

Request to hold a public hearing on the rezoning application for the following item and consider adoption of the Planning Commission's recommendation and the related Ordinance if approved. Request is to rezone the site from P-1 to R-5 H-R to allow multifamily high-rise residential.

**Summary**

Current Zoning: P-1

Proposed Zoning: R-5 H-R

Acreage: 2.94 acres

Proposed Use: Multifamily high-rise residential

Owner: Phoenix Country Club

Applicant: AGS, LLC

Representative: Larry S. Lazarus

Staff Recommendation: Denial as filed, approval of R-5 with stipulations.

If approved R-5 H-R, an additional mitigating height stipulation is recommended.

VPC Action: The Encanto Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 10, 2018 and recommended denial by a 13-2 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018 and recommended approval of the R-5 H-R zoning with the staff recommended stipulations, a modified stipulation, and an additional stipulation by a 5-2 vote.

### **Location**

Northeast corner of 7th Street and Thomas Road

Council District: 4

Parcel Address: 2901 N. 7th St.

**This item was continued to the Dec. 5, 2018 City Council Formal Meeting.**

Item 33, Ordinance S-45071 was a request to authorize the City Controller to disburse funds, up to amounts indicated for the purpose of paying vendors, contractors, claimants and others, and providing additional payment authority under certain existing city contracts. This section also requested continuing payment authority, up to amounts indicated below, for the following contracts, contract extensions and/or bids awarded. As indicated below, some items below require payment pursuant to Phoenix City Code section 42-13.

### **33 Settlement of Claim Grachus v. City of Phoenix**

To make payment of \$35,000.00 in settlement of claim in *Grachus v. City of Phoenix*, Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) Charge No. 540-2018-00900, claim no. 17-1196-001 GL BI, for the Finance Department pursuant to Phoenix City Code Chapter 42.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark and Mayor Williams

**No:** 1 - Vice Mayor Waring

**40      Eight-Hour Rule Request for Examination of Public Safety  
Infrastructure Needs**

Request City Council approval for staff from the City Manager's Office, Budget and Research, Finance, Law, City Clerk, Police, and Fire departments to spend in excess of eight hours of staff time, per City Council Rule 12, to develop bond program options.

**Summary**

Mayor Thelda Williams requested the City Manager place an item on the next available Formal Agenda to direct staff to examine bond program options available to the City to fund public safety infrastructure needs (**Attachment A**).

If the City Council approves the item, staff will complete an evaluation and share findings at a Formal meeting by the end of the year.

**Discussion**

Councilwoman Pastor made a motion to approve Item 40, to which Councilwoman Stark seconded the motion.

During his vote, Councilman DiCiccio asked for clarification if staff could explore all options on the table, and said this item only talked about going to the bond direction.

Mayor Williams commented staff was going to gather all information and bring it back to a workshop in December to include everything to move forward.

Councilman DiCiccio mentioned the way the item was written it said to bond, to which Mayor Williams responded that was right and added it would be all inclusive.

City Manager Ed Zuercher asked for clarification if Councilman DiCiccio talked about all funding options for public safety facilities in addition to bonds, to which Councilman DiCiccio answered yes.

Councilman DiCiccio asked if staff could come back with a manpower need for public safety to combine the two. He stated it was a similar discussion that when putting out a capital outlay, it had to be known what

would be built to. He conveyed what he did not want was to have a capital discussion without a manpower discussion.

Mr. Zuercher said his understanding of the motion was any discussion of facilities also tied in staff needs to those facilities to get a complete picture of what a fire station or police station would mean in regards to capital and operating.

Councilman DiCiccio asked for a friendly amendment to the motion for staff to explain all funding options and staffing needs, to which Councilwoman Pastor agreed to add that to the motion.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be approved with direction for staff to explain all funding options and staffing needs. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**41 League of Arizona Cities and Towns Membership (Ordinance S-45131)**

This item requests payment authority for the FY 2018-19 City of Phoenix annual membership dues of \$145,300 to the League of Arizona Cities and Towns.

**Summary**

The League of Arizona Cities and Towns provides services and resources focusing on member representation and interests of cities and towns before the legislature. It also provides technical and legal assistance, coordinates shared services and educational conferences and events. The membership ensures Phoenix's interests are represented and advocated for at the Governor's Office, state legislature, and other state agencies.

This item was withdrawn by Management from the Payment Ordinance on the Wednesday, Oct. 17, 2018 Formal Council Meeting Agenda. On Oct.

18, 2018, Vice Mayor Jim Waring, Councilman Sal DiCiccio, and Councilwoman Felicita Mendoza delivered a letter to the City Manager, per City Council Rules requesting this item be placed on the Nov. 7, 2018 Formal Agenda (**Attachment A**).

### **Discussion**

Mayor of City of Maricopa and President of the Arizona League of Cities and Towns Christian Price expressed appreciation for the opportunity to speak, and talked about his work with the Arizona League of Cities and Towns during his first month as President. He stated he understood it was difficult to make decisions to justify and quantify relationships, and talked about the work with the City and the Arizona League of Cities and Towns at the State legislature in regards to a \$26 million savings from the residential rental tax and \$35 million from the construction sales tax to the City. He said from the work at the State legislature in relation to the dues it was a good return-on-investment, and explained he could not change everything overnight but he worked hard to make changes at the Arizona League of Cities and Towns. He commented he was not afraid to make the changes, and asked Council to keep an open mind on the membership.

Councilman DiCiccio inquired about the motion on the floor, to which Councilwoman Pastor replied the motion was to not approve the dues. He made a substitute motion to approve the dues, to which Mayor Williams seconded.

Councilman DiCiccio discussed what happened with the relationship between the City and the Arizona League of Cities and Towns when they came to the City for a similar situation, and noted he would not support the dues that day. He talked about the rental tax mentioned earlier, and said he got calls from the multi-family industry that they received threats from other cities to not develop in those areas. He told Mr. Price he had done a great job in the City of Maricopa, and mentioned recent developments built in that city.

Mayor Williams stated she appreciated the relationship the City had with other cities, and noted the Council was frustrated with the performance of the Arizona League of Cities and Towns. She said staff from the Arizona League of Cities and Towns had worked against City interests without

consulting or involving the Council, and added they had proved they were ineffective on key issues. She made the point the Council had to be responsible with public dollars, and commented they could not pay dues to an organization that had been ineffective for Phoenix taxpayers. She said she hoped Council could be open to paying dues in the future, but mentioned that could not happen until the Council saw changes.

Prior to his vote, Vice Mayor Waring explained he had previously been lobbied by the Arizona League of Cities and Towns in a different life, and stated the City did not get its money worth. He said he had been frustrated by this organization for a long time, and he hoped the City would get out of the relationship.

**A substitute motion was made by Councilman DiCiccio, seconded by Mayor Williams, to adopt Item 41. The motion failed by the following vote:**

**Yes -** 1 - Councilwoman Guevara

**No -** 7 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski,  
Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring,  
and Mayor Williams

Mayor Williams asked if there needed to be another motion, to which City Attorney Brad Holm explained that technically under Robert's Rules, since the motion failed the Council would go back to the original motion to disapprove.

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilman DiCiccio, that this item be denied. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Mendoza,  
Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor,  
Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 1 - Councilwoman Guevara



**65 Tohono O'odham Nation Gaming Grant (Ordinance S-45130)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to accept, and enter into an agreement for \$75,000 in new funding from the Tohono O'odham Nation. Authorization is also requested for the City Treasurer to accept, and the City Controller to disburse, funds as directed by the Tohono O'odham Nation in connection with this grant.

**Summary**

The funds would be applied as directed by the Tohono O'odham Nation for the application submitted by the Arizona Science Center, a nonprofit organization, to support its request for funding of two programs, Science on Wheels and Focused Field Trips programs for low-income youth in Title I schools, where at least 40 percent of attending students are eligible for the National School Lunch Program. Both programs are provided free of charge and would not be possible without the generous support of donors who believe that all young people should be given a chance to realize their full potential in life, develop skills to fill the talent pipeline, and contribute to the common good.

The gaming compact entered into by the State of Arizona and various tribes calls for 12 percent of gaming revenue to be contributed to cities, towns and counties for government services that benefit the general public including public safety, mitigation of impacts of gaming, and promotion of commerce and economic development.

**Financial Impact**

There is no budgetary impact to the City of Phoenix and no General Funds are required. Entities that receive gaming grants are responsible for management of those funds.

**Discussion**

Leonard Clark spoke in favor, and talked about how the Tohono O'odham nation had helped Phoenix and the surrounding municipalities. He said they had been beneficial to the community and asked the Council to vote in favor of the item.

Prior to his vote, Councilman DiCiccio mentioned the Tohono O'odham nation were great to work with and deserved thanks for the work they did. He discussed the history of the Water Settlement Act, and added before

the Water Settlement Act it was a hard time for the local indigenous nations. He noted Mayor Williams and himself worked on the Water Settlement Act in the 1990s, and said people did not want it to happen but it was the right thing to do.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**74 Public Hearing and Resolution to Approve the 2019 Downtown Enhanced Municipal Services District Assessments (Resolution 21686)**

Hold a public hearing for the consideration of the 2019 Downtown Enhanced Municipal Services District (EMSD) assessments and request to adopt a Resolution approving such assessments for the 2019 calendar year. The City of Phoenix estimated annual expenditure for this program is \$1,285,640.

**Summary**

Pursuant to State law, a public hearing must be held prior to the annual adoption of the assessments for the EMSD. City Council authorized the formation of the EMSD in 1990 to provide enhanced public services, over and above the level of services provided in the remainder of the City. The EMSD is generally bounded by Fillmore Street, 7th Street, 3rd Avenue, and the railroad tracks south of Jackson Street. The City contracts directly with Downtown Phoenix, Inc. (DPI) to implement the work plan of the EMSD. The work plan and budget for 2019 provides a variety of enhanced services in the Downtown core, including the Ambassadors, streetscape improvements and maintenance, a Clean Team, marketing, events, economic and community development, and transportation services.

The annual assessments for the EMSD will be levied for the 2019 calendar year after the required EMSD legal process has been

completed. Assessments are determined in proportion to the benefits received by each parcel. There are approximately 785 parcels in the EMSD that the budget will be assessed on. This is based on the approved EMSD assessment diagram that indicates the properties to be assessed for enhanced municipal services. This diagram is on file in the office of the Director of the Street Transportation Department in the City of Phoenix and was posted online at the Community and Economic Development Department website.

The figures below represent the assessments for private property owners and public property owners based on the approved 2019 EMSD budget of \$3,922,780. This includes \$156,315 for streetscape maintenance expenses, which are paid only by property owners and tenants adjacent to the Streetscape Improvement District, as shown below.

Downtown Enhanced Municipal Services District Calendar Year 2019 Assessments

Private Property Owners Assessments: \$1,795,817  
Public Property Assessments: \$2,126,963  
Total Assessments: \$3,922,780

Streetscape Maintenance Expenses (expenses are included in the figures above)

Private Property Owners Assessment: \$89,365  
Public Property Assessments: \$66,950  
Total Streetscape Expenses: \$156,315

**Financial Impact**

The City's estimated annual expenditure for this program is \$1,285,640; which includes \$368,117 from the General Fund, \$539,798 from the Convention Center, \$128,607 from the Sports Facilities Fund, \$8,983 from the Genomics Facilities Operations and Maintenance Fund, and \$240,135 from collections from tenants on City-owned properties. An additional \$841,323 is collected from other government-owned properties including Maricopa County, Maricopa County Stadium District,

and the State of Arizona. The remaining \$1,795,817 of funds are collected from private property owners through an assessment on their property tax bill. The total amount for the 2019 calendar year budget is \$3,922,780.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

On Oct. 17, 2018, the City Council approved the 2019 EMSD estimate of expenses, assessment of expenses, the EMSD assessment diagram, and set the date of Nov. 7, 2018, for the hearing on the estimated assessments. The work plan and budget were recommended for approval by the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee on Oct. 2, 2018 by a vote of 4-0.

**Public Outreach**

On Oct. 17, 2018, City Council set the date of Nov. 7, 2018, as the date for the public hearing on the EMSD assessments. On Oct. 17, 2018, 21 days prior to the hearing, which is greater than the legally required 20 days, all property owners were notified by mail of their annual assessment cost by the Community and Economic Development Department. In addition to the work plan and budget being recommended for approval by the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee on Oct. 2, 2018, DPI has sent letters to all the property owners and the EMSD Board approved the 2019 budget at the June 11, 2018 board meeting.

**Location**

The EMSD is generally bounded by Fillmore Street, 7th Street, 3rd Avenue, and the railroad tracks south of Jackson Street.

Council Districts: 7 and 8

**Discussion**

Mayor Williams declared the public hearing opens, and asked staff to give a briefing on the item.

Community and Economic Development Director Chris Mackay explained this item was a public hearing on the Enhanced Municipal Services District that was established at the request of the property owners in 1990. She said this provided enhanced services to downtown Phoenix,

and added the Downtown Phoenix Partnership (DPP) had operated the district since 1990. She talked about how DPP was governed by a district board that included downtown property owners and City representation. She noted Council did approve the DPP work plan and budget annually.

Councilman DiCiccio asked how much the City funded for the overall operations, as well as how much Maricopa County funded annually.

Ms. Mackay replied the General Fund portion was \$368,117 and added the total assessment year over year decreased because of the sale of the Barrister building.

Councilman DiCiccio commented Ms. Mackay did a great job.

Ms. Mackay thanked Councilman DiCiccio, and continued explaining the breakdown of the expenditures for the program by the City. She cited the annual expenditure was \$1,285,640 which was where the \$368,117 is from General Fund, and said \$539,798 was from the enterprise fund of the Convention Center and \$128,607 was from the sports facilities fund. She noted for the biocampus, \$8,983 was from the Genomics facility's operating and maintenance fund, and \$240,135 was collected from tenants on City-owned properties. She concluded an additional \$841,323 was not the City's portion but was collected from other governments.

Councilman DiCiccio said the bottom line was the City was the funding source for it, and added it was taxpayer money being used. He said he could not think of another group that received that much City funding, and commented it is at a point where organizations should fund themselves. He announced he would not support the item.

Dan Klocke spoke in favor, and stated he served as Executive Director for the DPP. He mentioned the City had been generous over the last few decades to support activities in the downtown area as well as the private sector. He commented what was important was DPP started to generate funds for the City, and talked about a study on the return-on-investment the City, Maricopa County, and the State were getting from the downtown area. He stated the downtown area produced over \$37 million a year in sales tax to the City, and said this was a way to protect that investment.

He talked about the different stakeholders DPP worked with including Police and property owners, and conveyed DPP provided a tremendous amount of value for property owners including the City.

Councilman DiCiccio asked how much DPP produced, and asked when DPP would do more for themselves.

Mr. Klocke responded DPP was doing a lot themselves, and added they were very efficient. He gave an example of how they manage trees in downtown Phoenix, and said they paid for trash cans and for the efficient use of those trash cans towards recycling. He talked about the ambassadors working in downtown Phoenix, and said they brought value to the City.

Councilman DiCiccio asked about the \$37 million a year in sales tax to the City DPP produced.

Mr. Klocke answered he meant that was what the downtown area produced.

Councilman DiCiccio commented it irritated him when groups took credit for what business owners were doing, and added at some point DPP had to start funding themselves more.

Councilwoman Pastor asked staff to explain the Enhanced Municipal Services District and why it was created.

Ms. Mackay explained the Enhanced Municipal Services District did services above and beyond what the City would do in an area. She noted it was created to help the downtown area grow, and added the activities they did were events geared towards safety and beautification. She stated they were funded for the most part by property owners in the area.

Councilwoman Pastor talked about how she felt safe walking downtown the previous night, and added it was because of the ambassadors out at that time. She stated the ambassadors were part of DPP.

Ms. Mackay clarified the ambassador program was the signature program

provided by the Enhanced Municipal Services District. She said they had people near events to help people get directions to different restaurants, how to get parking, and to give them recommendations on ways to get around the area.

Councilwoman Pastor stated that was what DPP provided when there were large events such as the Super Bowl and the Final Four. She noted the ambassadors kept people moving through downtown Phoenix and kept the vibrancy, safety, and cleanliness for the area. Ms. Mackay affirmed that was the structure of the Enhanced Municipal Services District for those big events.

City Manager Ed Zuercher added the cleanliness, security and environment made people feel comfortable downtown, and said that benefited the entire city. He thanked Mr. Klocke and the DPP for the feeling of safety and security in downtown Phoenix.

Councilman Nowakowski stated he was a representative of downtown Phoenix, and talked about how the downtown area was now vibrant compared to how it was in the past. He said this was because of business leaders coming together to work along with the City. He mentioned various ways people experience downtown Phoenix, and talked about how the ambassadors were the most friendly people. He commented other cities have come to Phoenix to see those best practices to take back to their cities, and added he would support this item. He thanked DPP for their work as being one of the City's biggest advocates for the downtown area.

Mayor Williams declared the public hearing closed.

Note: Comment cards were submitted for the record in favor of Item 74:

Nickie Casciaro  
Marissa Frazey  
Maria Baier  
David Krietor

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilman Nowakowski, that this item be adopted. The motion**

**carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark and Mayor Williams

**No:** 2 - Councilman DiCiccio and Vice Mayor Waring

**75 Authorization to Pay Invoices for 2019 Downtown Enhanced Municipal Services District (Ordinance S-45097)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to pay all invoices received from Downtown Phoenix, Inc. (DPI) through the Phoenix Downtown Enhanced Municipal Services District (EMSD) Agreement, City Contract 141594, in an amount not to exceed \$3,922,780, for work related to the 2019 EMSD budget and work plan through Dec. 31, 2019. Further request authorization for the City Treasurer to accept, and the City Controller to disburse funds related to this item.

**Summary**

The City Council authorized formation of the EMSD in 1990 to provide enhanced public services, over and above the level of services provided in the remainder of the City. The City contracts directly with DPI to implement the work program of the downtown EMSD, including enhanced streetscape, event management and the ambassador program. Pursuant to State law, each year a budget must be approved for the EMSD. This action is the final step in the annual budget process to authorize Community and Economic Development Department (CEDD) to pay DPI for services rendered in 2019 under the EMSD contract.

**Financial Impact**

The City's estimated annual expenditure for this program is \$1,285,640; which includes \$368,117 from the General Fund, \$539,798 from the Convention Center, \$128,607 from the Sports Facilities Fund, \$8,983 from the Genomics Facilities Operations and Maintenance Fund, and \$240,135 from collections from tenants on City-owned properties. An additional \$841,323 is collected from other government-owned properties including Maricopa County, Maricopa County Stadium District, and the State of Arizona. The remaining \$1,795,817 of funds are collected from private property owners through an assessment on their



property tax bill. The total amount for the 2019 calendar year budget is \$3,922,780.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

On Oct. 17, 2018, the City Council approved the 2019 EMSD estimate of expenses, assessment of expenses, the 2019 EMSD assessment diagram, and set the date of Nov. 7, 2018, for the hearing on the estimated assessments. The work plan and budget were recommended for approval by the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee on Oct. 2, 2018, by a vote of 4-0.

**Public Outreach**

On Oct. 17, 2018, City Council set the date of Nov. 7, 2018, as the date for the public hearing on the EMSD assessments. On Oct. 17, 2018, 21 days prior to the hearing, which is greater than the legally required 20 days, all property owners were notified by mail of their annual assessment cost by the Community and Economic Development Department. In addition to the work plan and budget being recommended for approval by the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee on Oct. 2, 2018, DPI has sent letters to all the property owners and the EMSD Board approved the 2019 budget at the June 11, 2018 board meeting.

**Location**

The EMSD is generally bounded by Fillmore Street, 7th Street, 3rd Avenue and the railroad tracks south of Jackson Street.

Council Districts: 7 and 8

Note: Comment cards were submitted for the record in favor of Item 75:

Dan Klocke

Nickie Casciaro

David Krietor

**A motion was made by Councilwoman Pastor, seconded by Councilman Nowakowski, that this item be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 6 - Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark and Mayor Williams

**No:** 2 - Councilman DiCiccio and Vice Mayor Waring

**79 Authorization to Purchase Two LRAD-500X Mass Communications Systems for Police Department (Ordinance S-45129)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into a contract with the LRAD Corporation for the one-time purchase of two, Long-Range Acoustic Device (LRAD) 500X mass communications systems and accessories in an amount not to exceed \$94,954.06 for the Police Department. Further request authorization from the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item.

**Summary**

Several large protests and demonstrations have confirmed the need to upgrade the Police Department's communications capabilities for safety and legal requirements. The current communications equipment, LRAD-100X, is a backpack system that was purchased in 2010. The system was not adequate for the recent Red for Ed march that had more than 50,000 participants. The upgraded system is a vehicle-mounted platform that is specifically designed to address large crowd communications, allowing highly intelligible voice messages with an operational range of up to 650 meters, or almost half a mile, over 88 decibels of background noise. The Police Department intends to mount the devices to trailers for greater portability and flexibility so they can be deployed with any police vehicle equipped with a tow hitch. The LRAD-500X system meets and exceeds all upgrading needs for the Police Department.

**Procurement Information**

This procurement will be a non-competitive process. The equipment is purchased directly from the manufacturer. No other vendor makes this product. LRAD demonstrations have been successfully performed with Phoenix City officials and members of the Police Department's Executive, Command Staff, and other department personnel.

**Contract Term**

To begin upon Council approval for the one-time purchase of two, LRAD 500X mass communications systems and accessories.

**Financial Impact**

The total cost of two systems is \$94,954.06. Funds are available in the Police Department's budget.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The Public Safety and Veterans Subcommittee recommended this item for approval at its Oct. 17, 2018 meeting by a vote of 4-0, with the provision that language specific to the LRAD be included in the Police Department's Operations Order 1.5, Use of Force policy (**Attachment A**).

**Discussion**

Police Chief Jerri Williams stated they requested the purchase of a long-range acoustic device for communication purposes. She introduced Assistant Chief Sandra Renteria, Commander Dennis Orender, and Assistant City Manager Milton Dohoney, Jr.

Shawn Severud mentioned after this item was approved to be sent to Council by the Public Safety and Veterans Subcommittee, he circulated an e-petition. He gave copies of the results to Council, and noted many of the people who signed the petition opposed the sonic weapons to the Police. He commented the City did not need a militarized police force, rather a community police force. He stated if someone was critical of the police, they were not necessarily anti-police, and talked about when the item was heard over the summer. He asked Council to vote no, and told the Council if they would vote yes to first go to Tempe to experience this device with the media present.

Chimene Hawes spoke in opposition, and said the Council was here to serve the people of Phoenix and not the police force. She said she did not want the City to spend money on a sonic device that was meant to deafen. She talked about a pending lawsuit, and asked for no more police weaponry.

Kate Tutaya spoke in opposition, and said the sonic weapons were horrendous. She asked Council to be critical of the argument Police Chief Williams used for her request of this item, and talked about her experience at the protest during President Trump's visit to Phoenix. She mentioned a public records request that looked into the Request for Proposals made by Police Chief Williams, and suggested she wanted to use the device as a weapon.

Leonard Clark spoke in opposition, and commented on a civilian oversight police board. He talked about his experience at the protest during President Trump's visit to Phoenix, and added based on his military experience there should be sociological and psychological training for officers. He stated there was a need for accountability.

Note: Councilman DiCiccio left the Chambers and remained part of the voting body via telephone.

Viri Hernandez spoke in opposition, and stated this device was a weapon used by the military. She said even if the device was free through a grant, the time spent should have been used to figure out how to de-escalate the Police Department. She discussed the events at the protest, and suggested the Police Department did not give warnings to protesters. She commented this device was a weapon to continue a culture of violence within the Police Department and urged the Council to vote no.

Maria Teresa Mabry spoke in opposition stating she was a resident of District 8 and a third-generation Phoenician. She stated she was dismayed this item was heard again when the community told the Council this was a militarized weapon. She conveyed if Council chose to invest in a militarized weapon, it would de-invest in community safety. She said there was no offer for a conversation with the community on the device, and asked Council to vote no on the item.

Joseph Larios spoke in opposition, and noted he agreed with the lack of oversight and accountability of the Police Department. He suggested there was no public process or Request for Proposals, and added that was problematic for the City to build trust. He said investing in militarizing the Police Department continued to demonstrate dominance and force,

rather than trust and relationship building. He asked Council to vote no on this item, and suggested this did not build trust.

Xenia Ovona spoke in opposition, and stated she was present at the protest last year. She suggested the crowd was energized and noisy, but peaceful, and said the Police Department did not communicate with the crowd. She commented the use of weapons against people was within the standard procedure of the Police Department, and added these devices were a threat to the community. She asked Council to vote no and to extend a continuance to further discuss with the affected communities.

Jennifer Tunning spoke in opposition, and cited the Long Range Acoustic Device (LRAD) 500 could emit sounds up to 154 decibels. She stated noise-induced hearing loss could start at 85 decibels, and added this device could cause permanent damage. She suggested if communication was the goal, that there were other options without having the ability to cause permanent damage to citizens. She asked Council to vote no on the item.

Fatima Muhammad Roque spoke in opposition, and commented one of the reasons she opposed the item was because of the cost. She mentioned she opposed this item because of the possibility of hearing loss and other effects, and added this device was used at other protests across the country. She said this would increase the distrust in the community, and mentioned there could be an opportunity to have community-based training for the Police Department.

Lola Levesque spoke in opposition, and stated she was a community-based organizer and a south Phoenix resident. She suggested south Phoenix was one of the most heavily-policed communities in Arizona, and asked what message the purchase of this device sent to the community. She said there was no oversight of the Police Department, and asked Council to listen to the people, not the police.

Councilwoman Guevara asked for clarification on what it meant when the policy said under no circumstances would the department take any steps

to weaponize the LRAD to inflict harm on the public.

Police Chief Williams mentioned under no circumstances would the Police Department try to weaponize the device, and noted as outlined in the policy, the device would not go above 113 decibels. She said they created a dynamic policy to have accountability and responsibility to the community.

Councilwoman Guevara asked if using the device at levels above 113 decibels was considered weaponizing it.

Police Chief Williams responded the policy would be 113 decibels, and added there would be 15 people trained for the device and would face discipline for going over 113 decibels.

Ms. Renteria suggested at the maximum level the device would not be weaponized, and clarified what LRAD (Long Range Acoustic Device) stood for. She mentioned the device was manufactured to limit the decibel level and frequency level that could disorient or cause loss of bodily function.

Councilwoman Guevara clarified she wanted to know what would be considered weaponizing the device.

Industrial Hygienist Peter LeCheminant stated in terms of weaponizing he did not have a specific answer, and noted the 113 decibel level is the intended level by the time it reached the audience. He explained as noise traveled across a distance, the intensity spreads out, and said it was his obligation to make sure the device was used at safe levels because Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) deemed that employees could not be exposed to hazardous levels of noise equalling 140 decibels. He stated any instantaneous exposure to that level was a risk of permanent hearing loss.

Councilwoman Guevara asked how would you know when something was considered a weapon, and asked why that term was in the policy if it could not be defined.

Police Chief Williams explained in conversations with community members and some elected officials, they wanted it to be clear in the policy that the device was not going to be weaponized.

Councilwoman Guevara questioned what would be considered misuse of the device, and what potential discipline would someone face.

Police Chief Williams answered if there was excessive force or using the device against how they were trained, the discipline would depend on different factors. She pointed out only 15 people would be trained to use the device. She mentioned they were willing to identify that if someone used the device inappropriately, that the Police Department would look into it and start the review process and if necessary discipline the employees.

Councilwoman Guevara asked if using the device above 113 decibels would be considered misuse instead of weaponizing it.

Police Chief Williams replied misuse would be failing to follow training, policy, or procedure.

Councilwoman Guevara further questioned when the LRAD device is used, how would the Police Department document the use and ensure the policy was complied with.

Ms. Renteria responded the documentation would be completed in internal departmental reports. She noted anytime there was an injury or alleged injury it would be documented. She clarified the 113 decibel level was for the intended listener, and if the intended listener was far away the device would be at a higher decibel level in order to reach them at 113 decibels because of the distance.

Councilwoman Guevara stated the Police Department should look into a separate way to report the use of the device for transparency and accountability purposes, and added that needed to be a report that states: which officers used the device, what the distances were, if tones were used, who approved the use and why.

Councilwoman Mendoza asked why this was not put out for a Request for Proposals.

Police Chief Williams answered this device was approved by OSHA and was used by other jurisdictions around the country, which was why they went with the sole source route.

Councilwoman Mendoza questioned how far the LRAD needed to be from the crowd when the alert tones went off.

Mr. LeCheminant replied it was based off a simple calculation of how loud the LRAD is turned up and the measure of the distance. He gave an example that if the crowd was 100 feet away, the LRAD could be at 142 decibels so by the time the sound reached the crowd it would be 113 decibels for the intended audience.

Councilwoman Pastor asked where the LRAD would be in the Chambers if Council was the intended audience.

Ms. Renteria answered it depends, and suggested it would be turned down so Council would receive the message at 113 decibels. She noted the difference between sirens on the police cars and the LRAD, was that the sirens on a police car were only one level whereas the LRAD could be controlled to higher or lower volumes. She commented the distance would be determined by using range-finders.

Councilwoman Mendoza questioned when it came to documentation, who would measure the distance, to which a staff member from the Police Department replied it would be the 15 trained operators that would go out with a distance matrix to determine the sound level. She asked how that documentation would be presented, to which a staff member from the Police Department stated it would go in an incident report, and whoever operated the LRAD would be responsible for putting in that information. She questioned what other methods would be used if the Police Department did not have the LRAD.

Police Chief Williams responded they would use what the Police Department already had, and she noted it was not effective during the



protest. She talked about using aircraft and other devices mentioned in the after action report, and commented those devices were not effective in communicating to the crowd.

Councilwoman Mendoza inquired about officers being in the crowd, to which Police Chief Williams responded there were community response squad officers in plain clothes on the ground along with the tactical response unit officers, and noted there would be a mix of law enforcement in the community. She asked what the difference would be in decibels for a fire siren, police siren and a fire alarm.

Mr. LeCheminant answered between different sources and manufacturers a police siren or fire siren would be around 130 decibels, and noted for a fire alarm the accepted standards needed to be 15 decibels above the area background noise. He said generally it would be between 95 to 130 decibels.

Councilman Nowakowski mentioned during the Public Safety and Veterans Subcommittee they heard negative experiences in other jurisdictions, and asked what the Police Department would do to make sure this did not have a negative impact on the City.

A staff member from the Police Department replied the two jurisdictions mentioned were Pittsburgh and New York City where there was a lawsuit filed in each city. He noted Pittsburgh settled their lawsuit, and pointed out both cities did not have adequate training from LRAD or there was no policy in place.

Councilman Nowakowski asked if there was a difference between verbal decibels and siren decibels.

Mr. LeCheminant responded the LRAD had two features, an alert tone feature and decibel feature. He stated the alert tone did operate at a higher level and the LRAD maxed out at 149 decibels, and added either feature at 113 decibels is the same level whether it is voice or alert tone.

Councilman Nowakowski acknowledged he was at the protest, and commented it was hard to hear with the voice from the helicopters flying

over. He asked if this was the best way to communicate to a crowd of individuals.

Police Chief Williams replied the LRAD was another tool in order to communicate information on the fly. She said the Police Department researched practices in other cities that had the same device, and the difference was there would be specifically-trained employees who would use this and would be documented. She noted anytime there was an event or incident there would be a post brief and an after action report where the Police Department would review what did and did not work.

Councilman Nowakowski asked if the officers that were specialists in crowd control be part of the 15 individuals who would be trained to operate the LRAD, to which Chief Williams responded yes, they would be part of the tactical response unit.

Councilwoman Pastor discussed the research she did on the topic of safe noise and decibel level, and said if someone was exposed to 112 decibels they could only be exposed for 50 seconds or there would be damage, while at 115 decibels it would be 28 seconds. She asked at what point would it be determined to have a safe decibel level, and asked for clarification on what that level would be.

Police Chief Williams answered they were not talking about using the device for 20 to 30 seconds, but rather one to five seconds changing from voice to tones.

Mr. LeCheminant clarified from the standards he followed under OSHA guidelines, OSHA had a published table that indicated at 110 decibels you can be exposed for 30 minutes safely, and at 115 decibels that went down to 15 minutes. He gave examples of what devices would be at that decibel level in relation to the LRAD device.

Police Chief Williams commented the policy talked about using the device for two to five seconds, and then using the tones for two to five seconds, which she explained would not be a constant noise but rather broken up into pieces.

Councilwoman Pastor asked to see a table mentioning the statistics of acceptable decibel levels when using the device from two to five seconds.

Councilwoman Guevara cited the policy that said under no circumstance would the Police Department take any steps to weaponize the LRAD to inflict harm upon the public, and asked if there was any use of the device that would be considered a weapon.

Ms. Renteria answered the device was not a weapon and could not be weaponized. She mentioned in order for it to be a weapon there would be intent to cause physical injury or death, and added that was not the way it was manufactured.

Councilwoman Guevara asked why the definition provided by Ms. Renteria was not in the policy, to which Ms. Renteria responded the Police Department wanted to make it clear the intention of the device was strictly for communication. Councilwoman Guevara commented the line in the policy meant nothing if it was not defined, to which Police Chief Williams disagreed and stated the Police Department wanted to make note of the fact it would be used as a communication device and that was all it was planned for.

Councilwoman Stark inquired if the LRAD was meant to disperse the crowd and prevent other things from happening.

Police Chief Williams replied that was true, and suggested instead of using chemical agents or having officers go hands-on, they wanted to create a distance dynamic to relay accurate information to community members on where to disperse to be safe.

Councilwoman Pastor asked for weaponization to be defined, and suggested the device could be perceived to be weaponized.

Councilwoman Guevara asked for Ms. Hernandez to come up and speak to the Council.

Ms. Hernandez asked what kind of message would be delivered in two to

five seconds, as well as what tones would be used. She clarified during the protest there were no warnings given, and suggested that was in a report put out to the community.

Police Chief Williams responded the Police Department could add information in the policy to clarify a weapon is designed or used for inflicting bodily harm or damage, and added the tones used would be determined by the incident. She gave examples on what type of language would be used in certain situations to allow the community to disperse safely.

Councilwoman Pastor inquired about the motion and asked if everything discussed would be part of the motion.

Mr. Zuercher answered the definition of weaponizing would be included. Councilwoman Pastor asked about the table detailing decibel levels and if that would be included, to which Mr. Zuercher responded that could be added into the training function. Councilwoman Pastor asked for it to be included in both the policy and training function.

Councilman DiCiccio commented he understood the debate on whether this was good or bad policy, but stated these things always digressed into an anti-police debate. He expressed appreciation for the Police Department and asked to hear others say they appreciated the police and the good job they were doing. He said what would end up happening was the police would constantly get attacked and that would be a form of acceptance. He acknowledged that sometimes there are problems but they did an incredible job. He conveyed he appreciated the debate on this item, and added he would call out anti-police rhetoric.

Councilwoman Pastor stated she was not anti-police, and expressed appreciation for police officers. She mentioned at the end of the day we are all one community and even though some solutions may not be liked, Phoenix and the rest of the country needed to be safe.

Councilwoman Guevara commented it was not anti-police to ensure accountability and clarity in regards to City policy, and noted when Councilman DiCiccio inquired about the Police Department's use of

cameras at football games at a previous formal meeting. She said these questions had to be asked to address community concerns.

Councilman DiCiccio clarified what he said was there were members in the public that came to the Council day-to-day and week-to-week that were anti-police, and stated they needed to be addressed and pushed back.

Prior to her vote, Councilwoman Guevara explained that she appreciated the willingness of the Police Department to participate in governing the device, and noted because the policy was available to the public they ended up with better policy. She hoped there would be a better way to involve the public in policy development, and noted she could not support the item after what she heard from constituents.

Prior to her vote, Councilwoman Mendoza asked if the motion included what Councilwoman Pastor added, to which Mayor Williams replied yes.

Prior to his vote, Councilman Nowakowski stated he supported the item so long as it would be used as a tool and not a weapon. He commented the policy needed to include the input from the other councilmembers, and make sure only 15 police officers would be trained who would be the only ones operating the tool. He requested when the device is used to have the alert tone first, then a voice message.

Prior to her vote, Councilwoman Pastor asked to add to the motion to have a yearly review of the LRAD, to which City Attorney Brad Holm stated the Council would have to go back and revote on the motion with the additional language.

Mayor Williams allowed the language to be added to the motion, and restarted the roll call vote.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be adopted as amended for additional direction for staff to include; updating the policy to include a chart or table showing the distance and decibel settings, to clarify the definition of weaponization, and to establish an annual review of use of the device. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 7 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 1 - Councilwoman Guevara

**100 Aquifer Storage and Recovery Wells and Water Production Wells - Engineering Services - WS85010054 (Ordinance S-45072)**

Request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to enter into three separate agreements with Wilson Engineers, LLC, Brown & Caldwell, Inc., and Stanley Consultants, Inc. to provide Engineering Services that include construction administration and inspection (CA&I) services for the Aquifer Storage and Recovery (ASR) Wells and Water Production Wells project. Further request to authorize execution of amendments to the agreements as necessary within the Council-approved expenditure authority as provided below, and for the City Controller to disburse all funds related to this item. The fee for services will not exceed \$3.965 million.

Additionally, request to authorize the City Manager, or his designee, to take all action deemed necessary to execute all utilities-related design and construction agreements, licenses, permits, and requests for utility services related to the development, design and construction of the project and to include disbursement of funds. Utility services include, but are not limited to: electrical, water, sewer, natural gas, telecommunication, cable television, railroads and other modes of transportation. This authorization excludes any transaction involving an interest in real property.

**Summary**

The purpose of this project is to construct seven ASR wells by 2021. Water pumped from the wells will be used to supplement potable water customers throughout Phoenix and augment Phoenix's potable water resources during times of long-term water shortage and emergency outage, as well as balance potable water system demand.

The Engineering consultants' services will include, but are not limited to: project administration and engineering services during construction,

review of structural and shop drawings, on-site special inspections, record drawings, contractor's and manufacturer's equipment training, reviewing and processing contractor progress payments, recording and tracking warranty requests during the warranty period, coordination between other consultants that may be necessary to ensure proper performance of the consultants, and other special services as needed.

### **Procurement Information**

The selections were made using a qualifications-based selection process set forth in section 34-604 of the Arizona Revised Statutes (A.R.S.). In accordance with A.R.S. section 34-604(H), the City may not publicly release information on proposals received or the scoring results until an agreement is awarded. Nine firms submitted proposals and are listed below.

#### Selected Firms

Rank 1: Wilson Engineers, LLC

Rank 2: Brown & Caldwell

Rank 3: Stanley & Associates

#### Additional Proposers

Rank 4: Carollo

Rank 5: ARCADIS

Rank 6: NCS Engineers

Rank 7: Terra Tech

Rank 8: Michael Baker International

Rank 9: Golder Associates

### **Contract Term**

The term of each agreement is three calendar years from the issuance of the Notice to Proceed. Work scope identified and incorporated into the agreement prior to the end of the term may be agreed to by the parties, and work may extend past the termination of the agreement. No additional changes may be executed after the end of the term.

### **Financial Impact**

The agreement values including all subconsultants and reimbursable costs are as follows:

Wilson Engineers, LLC will not exceed \$1.64 million.  
Brown & Caldwell, Inc. will not exceed \$1.23 million.  
Stanley Consultants will not exceed \$1.095 million.

Funding is available in the Water Services Department's Capital Improvement Program budget. The Budget and Research Department will separately review and approve funding availability prior to execution of any amendments. Payments may be made up to agreement limits for all rendered agreement services, which may extend past the agreement termination.

**Location**

ASR Well 304: 31st Avenue and Cochise Drive.  
ASR Well 305: 56th Street and Century Lane.  
ASR Well 306: 57th Street and Thunderbird Road.  
ASR Well 307: 56th Street and Deer Valley Drive.  
ASR Well 308: Deer Valley Drive and Tatum Boulevard.  
ASR Well 309: Deer Valley Road and 36th Avenue.  
ASR Well 312: Tatum Boulevard and Paradise Lane.  
Council Districts: 1, 2 and 3

**Discussion**

Leonard Clark mentioned it was very good the City did this, and asked Council to vote in favor of the item.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Mayor Williams, that this item be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**119 Public Hearing - Amend City Code - Amend Downtown Code Land Use Matrix - Z-TA-1-18-8 (Ordinance G-6518)**

This report requests City Council approval of a proposed text amendment to the Zoning Ordinance Text Amendment, Z-TA-1-18-8,



regarding Amending Chapter 12, Section 1204.D (Land Use Matrix) to allow tattoo/body piercing studios within the Evans Churchill East Character Area in the Downtown Code. Staff recommends approval of Z-TA-1-18-8 as reflected in proposed Ordinance.

**Summary**

The intent of this proposed text amendment is to amend Chapter 12, Section 1204.D (Land Use Matrix) to allow tattoo/body piercing studios within the Evans Churchill East Character Area in the Downtown Code. The Evans Churchill East Character area is generally bounded by Moreland Street to the north, 7th Street to the east, McKinley Street to the south from 6th Street to 7th Street, Garfield Street to the south from 4th Street to 6th Street, and 4th Street to the west.

**Concurrence/Previous Council Action**

The Central City Village Planning Committee heard the item on May 14, 2018 and recommended approval per staff the recommendation by a vote of 16-0.

The Planning Commission heard the item on June 7, 2018 and recommended approval per the Central City Village Planning Committee recommendation by a vote of 7-0.

The Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee heard this item on Oct. 2, 2018 and recommended approval by a 4-0 vote.

**Location**

The Evans Churchill East Character area is generally bounded by Moreland Street to the north, 7th Street to the east, McKinley Street to the south from 6th Street to 7th Street, Garfield Street to the south from 4th Street to 6th Street, and 4th Street to the west.

Council District: 8

**Discussion**

Mayor Williams declared the public hearing open. Noting there was no one present wishing to speak, she declared the public hearing closed. She asked Planning and Development Director Alan Stephenson to explain their recommendation for the item.

Mr. Stephenson answered this item was a request to amend the Downtown Code Land Use Matrix to allow for a tattoo body-piercing

studio in the Evans Churchill East Care character area. He noted this was approved by the Central Village Planning Committee by a 16-0 vote, the Planning Commission by a 7-0 vote, and the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee by a 4-0 vote. He stated staff recommended approval per the Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee recommendation.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilman Nowakowski, that this item be adopted per Planning and Economic Development Subcommittee approval at its Oct. 2, 2018 meeting. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**120 Public Hearing and Resolution Adoption - GPA-CC-1-18-7 - Approximately 400 Feet West of the Northwest Corner of 19th Avenue and Van Buren Street (Resolution 21690)**

Request that the City Council hold a public hearing on the land use for the following item to consider adopting the Planning Commission's recommendation and the related Resolution if approved. This case is a companion case to Z-28-18-7 and should be heard prior.

Application: GPA-CC-1-18-7 (Companion case Z-28-18-7)

Current Designation: Industrial

Proposed Designation: Residential 15+ dwelling units per acre

Acreage: 1.76 acres

Proposed Use: Multifamily Residential

Owner: Iskwatikan, LLC and RJJ Investments, LLC

Applicant: Keith Grayson, RJJ Investments, LLC

Representative: Keith Grayson, RJJ Investments, LLC

Staff Recommendation: Approval.

VPC Action: The Central City Village Planning Committee heard this on Sept. 17, 2018 and recommended approval by a vote of 11-0.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this item on Oct. 4, 2018

and recommended approval per the Central City Village Planning Committee recommendation by a vote of 7-0.

**Location**

Approximately 400 feet west of the northwest corner of 19th Avenue and Van Buren Street.

Council District: 7

Parcel Address: 1926 and 1930 W. Van Buren St.

**Discussion**

Planning and Development Director Alan Stephenson mentioned Item 120 was a request to change the General Plan land use designation for a 1.76 acre parcel to allow for residential development. He noted the Central City Village Planning Committee voted 11-0 to approve it, as well as the Planning Commission by a 7-0 vote. He talked about Item 121 and noted this was a related case to Item 120. He said the request was to go from A1 and C3 capital mall overlay district, to R4 and R4 capital mall overlay district to allow for multi-family residential development. He commented the Central City Village Planning Committee voted 11-0 to approve it, as well as the Planning Commission by a 7-0 vote.

Mayor Williams declared the public hearing open on Items 120 and 121. Noting there was no one present wishing to speak, she declared the public hearing closed.

Note: Keith Grayson submitted a comment card for the record in favor of Items 120 and 121.

Note: Blas Guillen submitted a comment card for the record as neutral on Item 121.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilman Nowakowski, that this item be adopted per Planning Commission's approval on Oct. 4, 2018. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**121 Public Hearing - Amend City Code and Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application Z-28-18-7- Approximately 400 Feet West of the Northwest Corner of 19th Avenue and Van Buren Street (Ordinance G-6528)**

Request to hold a public hearing on the rezoning application for the following item and consider adoption of the Planning Commission recommendation and the related Ordinance if approved. Request is to rezone the site from A-1 and C-3 CMOD to R-4 and R-4 CMOD to allow multifamily residential. This is a companion case to GPA-CC-1-18-7 and to be heard following the companion case.

**Summary**

Current Zoning: A-1 and C-3 CMOD

Proposed Zoning: R-4 and R-4 CMOD

Acreage: 1.76 acres

Proposed Use: Multifamily residential

Owner: Iskwatikan, LLC and RJJ Investments, LLC

Applicant: Randall Johnson

Representative: Keith Grayson, RJJ Investments, LLC

Staff Recommendation: Approval, subject to stipulations.

VPC Action: The Central City Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 17, 2018 and recommended approval per staff's recommendation by an 11-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018 and recommended approval per the Central City Village Planning Committee recommendation by a 7-0 vote.

**Location**

Approximately 400 feet west of the northwest corner of 19th Avenue and Van Buren Street.

Council District: 7

Parcel Address: 1926 and 1930 W. Van Buren St.

Note: For discussion on Item 121, refer to Item 120.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilman Nowakowski, that this item be adopted per Planning Commission's approval on Oct. 4, 2018. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**122 Public Hearing - Amend City Code and Resolution Adoption - General Plan Amendment GPA-DV-1-18-2 - Approximately 3,300 Feet North of the Northeast Corner of Black Canyon Highway and Jomax Road (Resolution 21692)**

Request to hold a public hearing on a General Plan Map Amendment for the following item and consider the Planning Commission's recommendation and the related Resolution if approved. This file has a companion case Z-45-18-2 which is to be heard following this case.

**Summary**

Application: GPA-DV-1-18-2 (Companion Case Z-45-18-2)

Current General Plan Land Use Map Designation: Mixed Use (Residential 15+ / Commerce/Business Park), Residential 5 to 10 dwelling units per acre, and Commerce/Business Park

Proposed General Plan Land Use Map Designation: Residential 5 to 15 dwelling units per acre

Acreage: 20.54

Proposal: Multifamily residential development up to 15 dwelling units per acre

Owner: Jared Geisler, NexMetro Communities; BADO-Park, LLC; and Clay Investments, LLC

Applicant: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA

Representative: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA

Staff Recommendation: Approval.

VPC Action: The Deer Valley Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 20, 2018, and recommended approval per the staff recommendation by a 7-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the Deer Valley Village Planning Committee recommendation by a 6-0 vote.

**Location**

Approximately 3,300 feet north of the northeast corner of Black Canyon Highway and Jomax Road

Council District: 2

Parcel Address: 27701 and 27777 N. Black Canyon Hwy.

**Discussion**

Planning and Development Director Alan Stephenson mentioned Item 122 was a General Plan amendment request located approximately 3,300 feet north of the northeast corner at Black Canyon Highway and Jomax Road. He stated this request was to changed the General Plan land use designation from commerce park to residential. He noted the Deer Valley Village Planning Committee recommended approval by a 7-0 vote, as well as the Planning Commission by a 6-0 vote. He noted Item 123 was a related case that was a request to go from commerce park general, commerce park, commerce park with a special permit, and S1 to R3 to allow for multi-family residential development. He commented this was approved by the Deer Valley Village Planning Committee by a 7-0 vote and by the Planning Commission by a 6-0 vote.

Mayor Williams declared the public hearing open. Noting there was no one present wishing to speak, she declared the public hearing closed.

Note: Brennan Ray submitted a comment card for the record in favor of Item 122.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be adopted per Planning Commission's approval on Oct. 4, 2018. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**123 Public Hearing - Amend City Code and Ordinance Adoption - Rezoning Application Z-45-18-2 (Companion Case GPA-DV-1-18-2) - Approximately 3,300 Feet North of the Northeast Corner of Black**

**Canyon Highway and Jomax Road (Ordinance G-6520)**

Request to hold a public hearing to amend the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, Section 601, the Zoning Map of the City of Phoenix, by adopting Rezoning Application Z-45-18-2 and rezone the site from CP/GCP, CP/GCP SP, and S-1 (Approved CP/GCP) to R-3 to allow multifamily residential. This is a companion case to GPA-DV-1-18-2.

**Summary**

Application: Z-45-18-2 (Companion Case GPA-DV-1-18-2)

Current Zoning: CP/GCP, CP/GCP SP, and S-1 (Approved CP/GCP)

Proposed Zoning: R-3

Acreage: 19.74

Proposed Use: Multifamily residential

Owner: Baseline BADO Park, LLC and Clay Investments, LLC

Applicant: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA

Representative: Brennan Ray, Burch & Cracchiolo, PA

Staff Recommendation: Approval per the Addendum A Staff Report.

VPC Action: The Deer Valley Village Planning Committee heard this case on Sept. 20, 2018, and recommended approval per the Addendum A Staff Report by a 7-0 vote.

PC Action: The Planning Commission heard this case on Oct. 4, 2018, and recommended approval per the Deer Valley Village Planning Committee recommendation by a 6-0 vote.

**Location**

Approximately 3,300 feet north of the northeast corner of Black Canyon Highway and Jomax Road

Council District: 2

Parcel Addresses: 27701 and 27777 N. Black Canyon Hwy.

Note: For discussion on Item 123, refer to Item 122.

**A motion was made by Vice Mayor Waring, seconded by Councilwoman Stark, that this item be adopted per Planning Commission's approval on Oct. 4, 2018. The motion carried by the following vote:**

**Yes:** 8 - Councilman DiCiccio, Councilwoman Guevara, Councilwoman Mendoza, Councilman Nowakowski, Councilwoman Pastor, Councilwoman Stark, Vice Mayor Waring and Mayor Williams

**No:** 0

**126 Consideration of Citizen Petition Submitted by M. Cheak Yee  
Related to the Chinese Cultural Center**

This report provides the City Council with information in response to a citizen petition submitted by M. Cheak Yee at the Oct. 17, 2018 Formal City Council meeting regarding the art elements of the Chinese Cultural Center (**Attachment A**).

**Summary**

The petitioner requests the City Council clarify development requirements related to "public art" elements for private development. The petition also asks for a declaration of and clarification of responsibility and liability for any changes made to the property by the current owner.

There currently is no Art in Private Development Program in the City of Phoenix. Developers of private parcels sometimes are required to include art in their projects if they are stipulated to do so as a condition of rezoning the properties. The art in these developments is created and is owned and maintained by the private property owner, not the City of Phoenix. Though art was required as a condition of approval of the original 1988 zoning case for C-2 Mid-Rise zoning, and carried through to later stipulation modifications that were approved to allow for eventual development of the Chinese Cultural Center, there is no record indicating a specific type of art element requirements in any final rezoning stipulations imposed by the City Council. Based on the stipulation in this case, a private property owner can modify the specific type of art.

In the late 1980s, the Planning Commission and City Council approved the use of interim guidelines to establish standards for integrating art into private developments when the Planning Commission and City Council required art during the rezoning process. The guidelines were intended to lay the groundwork for adding an Art in Private Development Program to



the City's Zoning Ordinance. However, the City Council never added an Art in Private Development requirement to the Zoning Ordinance. Staff appeared to use the informal guidelines on an ad hoc basis into the 1990s, including in the rezoning (Z-172-88-8) and stipulation modification cases for the Chinese Cultural Center.

Though the petition refers to "public art" to describe art elements at the Chinese Cultural Center, the City of Phoenix Public Art Program invests funds from the City's Capital Improvement Program solely to enhance the design of City property. These Public Art Program funds cannot be spent on private property. Thus the art referenced in the stipulations and petition falls outside of the jurisdiction of the City's Public Art Program; it is outside of the parameters within which that art is created, maintained and controlled for the public. It is privately-owned art that is visible to the public, and some type of art that is visible to the public must be visible on the site to comply with the stipulations.

**Location**

Northwest corner of 44th Street and Fillmore Street  
Council District: 8

**Discussion**

Leonard Clark spoke in favor of Item 126, and noted the Council was constricted by law but asked if one of the councilmembers could draft a letter to the State legislature. He questioned if Council could work with the United Nations, and noted the age of the Chinese Cultural Center in regards to it being a cultural site. He asked Council to support the petitions for the Chinese-American community to send a message of diversity.

Charles Qian spoke in favor of both petitions, and clarified he was in favor of preserving the art pieces. He made the point that the artwork at the Chinese Cultural Center was considered public art, and suggested the City said it was not public art because City dollars did not go towards the public art. He talked about how the Council had voted with zoning stipulations on new buildings for public art that satisfied that requirement. He suggested the City had jurisdiction over the public art at the Chinese Cultural Center, and commented the City was liable for damages

because of the permits given.

City Manager Ed Zuercher stated staff was available to answer questions about public art, and permits. He said there was no suggested motion, and added Council was not obligated to make a motion.

Elizabeth Mann spoke in favor of Item 126, and stated this was not a Chinese Cultural Center issue, but a City public art program issue. She discussed how the City had jurisdiction to control where public art is required, and noted she put \$3 million into the Chinese Cultural Center when it was built. She mentioned an issue retrieving documents from the Planning Department, and commented this was about public art and not City art. She asked Council to investigate the Public Art Program, and noted she disagreed with the recommendation in the City Council Report. She repeated the point that this was a City issue, not a Chinese Cultural Center issue, and said it was built not for the Chinese but for Phoenix.

Ms. Mann discussed the issue of jurisdiction and made the point the art she contributed was subject to City jurisdiction. She said the Chinese Cultural Center was built according to City requirements, and commented the City set a precedent for other developers like herself that apply for zoning to agree with City terms. She suggested once those terms were met, that agreements would be destroyed. She repeated her issue with accessing documents online.

Mayor Williams asked if there was something in the City Charter or Council Rules that a previous Council could not bind another.

City Attorney Brad Holm answered he did not think that issue came into play in regards to this public art issue, and noted the bottom line was if Council could have previously set requirements for public art in a private project, the City did not actually do that but applied it as a concept on an Ad-Hoc basis to some projects. He commented that could not be done today under Proposition 207.

Councilwoman Pastor asked what documentation was missing.

Planning and Development Director Alan Stephenson responded the

Planning Department had records from the zoning case that started in 1988, and noted there were amendments through that case. He mentioned there were other records that were related to site planning that were not legally binding, and added documents had to be kept for seven years. He talked about Council discussion in the late 1980s related to art in private development that was visible to the public, and said the zoning stipulation that was on there did not reference any type of specific Chinese art. He said you had to have art, and stated it was on the parcel prior to the Chinese Cultural Center.

Mr. Stephenson gave the example that high- and mid-rise developments having some type of public plaza that contained artwork, benches, and other things that was the vein of that requirement. He noted in regards to the Chinese Cultural Center, they proposed to include the Chinese element as part of creating the Chinese Cultural Center to satisfy the stipulation. He said there were other modified stipulations suggested for that site plan, but that requirement was not modified, and suggested staff told the current owner they had to have artwork on the site to comply with the stipulation or go back through the public hearing process.

Councilwoman Pastor questioned if the owner was going to go through a public hearing process or maintain the artwork.

Mr. Stephenson replied the applicant indicated in prior discussions they tried to donate art to Hance Park and make a monetary contribution towards a Chinese garden. He stated he did not have any more discussions with the owners recently about that issue because it involved multiple private lawsuits between the private property owners.

**This item was heard.**

**127      Consideration of Citizen Petition Submitted by Elizabeth Mann  
Related to the Chinese Cultural Center**

This report provides the City Council with information in response to a citizen petition submitted by Ms. Elizabeth Mann at the Oct. 17, 2018 Formal City Council meeting regarding the Chinese Cultural Center and public art (**Attachment A**).

**Summary**

The petition requests confirmation that the Chinese Cultural Center is a

"City Public Art program" and that the city preserve its "Public Art program."

Though the artwork and architectural enhancements at the Chinese Cultural Center are visible to the public, they are not part of the City of Phoenix Public Art Program, and are what is known as art in private development. The stipulation mentioned in the petition refers to art that was a condition of the original zoning approval in 1988. The art elements were paid for with private funds to enhance private property, and belong to and are maintained by the owner of the property. Though there are records of the City using a set of informal guidelines for adding art requirements to private property rezoning requests in the 1980s and 90s, and developers of private parcels sometimes are required to include art in their projects, the City Council never adopted any guidelines and the Zoning Ordinance does not contain provisions that require art. There are provisions for instances when art is provided and how it may be used for bonuses, but no outright requirement for art in private development is contained in the Zoning Ordinance.

Though the petition uses the term "public art" to describe art elements at the Chinese Cultural Center, the City of Phoenix Public Art Program invests funds from the City's Capital Improvement Program solely to enhance the design of City property. These Public Art Program funds cannot be spent on private property. Thus the art referenced in the petition falls outside of the jurisdiction of the City's Public Art Program and the legal parameters within which that art is created, maintained and controlled by the public.

**Location**

Northwest corner of 44th Street and Fillmore Street  
Council District: 8

**Discussion**

George Papa spoke in support of preserving the Chinese Cultural Center, and clarified it was more than just a center but an icon for the community. He talked about Elizabeth Mann who developed the property, and noted she made several trips back and forth to China to bring artisans and materials to create an authentic Chinese community center. He suggested the City put into motion an eminent domain condemnation

in reverse, and stated he knew numerous investors who could close an escrow in 30 days with cash to buy the Chinese Cultural Center. He commented it was tried in the past, but conveyed if the City put into motion an actual appraisal of the property and forced sale for preservation, it would be beneficial.

Councilwoman Stark asked City Attorney Brad Holm if it was correct that the City had police powers, with one of them being condemnation that was routinely used for public purpose, to which Mr. Holm responded that was correct. She stated she was not sure if this case would be a public purpose such as property for a police station or a fire station, to which Mr. Holm replied that was also correct. She suggested this would be a dangerous path of abuse of power in regards to condemnation if Council looked at this.

Mr. Papa commented this was an exception due to the historical and irreplaceable value, and suggested if it is destroyed it would not be replaced.

Mr. Holm stated if people were willing to buy the property, they could do so on a private negotiating basis. He commented if the City was to act as leverage in the negotiation that would be illegal and an abuse of police power.

Mr. Stephenson stated the Bailey's Brake Shop case was a decision in Arizona that a City could only use condemnation for a direct public purpose, and the City would have to use it as a public facility.

Councilwoman Stark said that was correct, and related a case in Connecticut that was similar to the example in Arizona.

Mayor Williams stated there had been a full discussion on the Chinese Cultural Center and the response from staff.

Note: Comment cards were submitted for the record in favor of Item 127:

Elizabeth Mann  
Leonard Clark

Charles Qian

**This item was heard.**

**REPORTS FROM CITY MANAGER, COMMITTEES OR CITY OFFICIALS**

None.

**CITIZEN COMMENTS**

None.

**ADJOURN**

There being no further business to come before the Council, Mayor Williams declared the meeting adjourned at 5:13 p.m.

---

MAYOR

ATTEST:

---

CITY CLERK

TS

**CERTIFICATION**

I hereby certify that the foregoing minutes are a true and correct copy of the minutes of the formal session of the City Council of the City of Phoenix held on the 7th day of November, 2018. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held and that a quorum was present.

Dated this 6th day of February, 2019.

---

CITY CLERK