



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary

GPA-MV-1-21-5

Date of VPC Meeting	January 12, 2022
Request From	Amend the General Plan Land Use Map Designation from Mixed Use (Commercial/Industrial) to Residential 3.5 to 5, Residential 5 to 10, and Residential 10 to 15 dwelling units per acre
Proposed Use	To allow residential densities less than 20 dwelling units per acre
Location	An area generally bounded by 91st Avenue to 99th Avenue, Thomas Road to Campbell Avenue
VPC Recommendation	Denial
VPC Vote	5-4

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

Items 6 (GPA-MV-1-21-5) and 7 (Z-19-G-00-5) are companion cases and were heard together.

Sarah Stockham, staff, provided an overview of the requests, noting the location and the history of the site. Ms. Stockham displayed a map of the current and proposed General Plan Land Use Map designations, and staff's findings. Ms. Stockham displayed an aerial map, a conceptual site plan and elevations, and reviewed the surrounding land uses, the proposal, staff's recommendation, and stipulations.

Stephen Anderson, representing the applicant with Gammage & Burnham, reviewed the proposed developments within the Algodón Center PUD area sharing that by 2023 the proposal will add around 4,000 jobs and 2,400 housing units, they had an extensive mailing list and hosted two neighborhood meetings, and the proposed PUD major amendment has gone through a thorough review with city staff. Mr. Anderson reviewed the proposed mix of housing types with estimated pricing, detailed the five-acre central amenity area in the development and shared that they have been asked to construct bicycle lanes along Indian School Road, they will be constructing a sewer lift station, and that converting agricultural land to housing uses less water. Mr. Anderson added that the Pendergast School District is excited for the proposal they will construct 93rd Avenue (which runs along the south side of the school), the proposal is below the density limits for their comparative zoning districts, they are providing three times the amount of open space than what would be required in the Zoning Ordinance, and their PUD standards require detached sidewalks, enhanced shading standard and design

review, in addition to providing 50% shade for the bus stops and bus infrastructure they are required to provide in stipulation Nos. 3 through 5. Mr. Anderson concluded that this proposal would add around 2,500 housing units in a wide variety of housing types, and the proposal preserves approximately 200 acres for commercial development which will add to the job opportunities in the area.

Questions from the Committee:

Saundra Cole asked if the jobs will be high-paying or low-paying. Mr. Anderson replied that he thinks they will be high paying jobs, there is a critical labor shortage and there are a lot of budding businesses in the area and there is data showing wage pressure which is causing higher wages and the entry-level minimum wage is also increasing.

Sandra Oviedo asked what type of corporate buildings would be constructed in the PUD area. Mr. Anderson replied that he does not know, LGE is under contract for 90 days to purchase land in the PUD area to construct commercial buildings and showed LGE's website and examples of their past projects. Ms. Oviedo shared that is nice to see the corporate building examples and shared a desire to see more white-collar jobs in the area rather than big-box retail.

Mike Weber shared that it is nice to see some areas devoted to businesses going into the PUD area and that it is not all housing, and that along the freeway the PUD allows for higher height limits. Mr. Anderson replied that yes, the PUD has always allowed high height limits and they are not proposing to change that, and that the applicant did provide a noise study which calls for over-height walls along the freeway when adjacent to residential homes.

Jeff O'Toole thanked John F. Long for all the investment in Maryvale, shared that he liked the mix of housing types which brings in a diversity of residents, recognized that there is a housing crisis but there is also an employment crisis, which leads to longer commutes and increased traffic, and that while the proposal shows very nice housing with great open space, this is the last area to make an employment center in the West Valley, and it is hard to argue that housing is the highest and best use for this area along the freeway. Mr. O'Toole added that it is a failure of the Community and Economic Development Department to make the employment center a reality, the renderings of the commercial buildings are nice but not guaranteed, in 2018 John F. Long promised that they would not come back to amend the PUD again to allow any more housing and that this proposal is too much housing, they already have around 2,800 units approved in the area.

Joe Barba asked the applicant to provide some statistics on jobs created and the economic impact of this proposal. Mr. Anderson replied that he can send that to staff.

Sandra Oviedo agreed with committee member O'Toole's comments, shared that the area should be a self-sufficient community where people can live, work and play in the same area, asked the applicant to elaborate on the bike lanes and if they would consider a park-and-ride at this site. Mr. Anderson replied that the light rail is not proposed to extend near this area, they will be installing painted bike lanes along the arterial streets, they area stipulated to install bus bays and bus stops which will be shaded to 50%, there is a lot of multimodal access on the site, the Public Transit Department did not ask for a park-and-ride at this location, and they will be adding an additional vehicular lane along Indian School Road in addition to the painted bike lanes,

which are not curb or parking separated. Ms. Oviedo asked how crossing will happen along the major streets and what pedestrian amenities will be provided. Mr. Anderson replied that they are required to install five traffic signals, which is where the crossings will occur.

Jeff O'Toole asked if the proposed housing development will be gated and how far north does the third lane along 99th Avenue extend to. Mr. Anderson replied that yes, the community will be gated, the private streets and amenity areas will be maintained by the HOA, the school buses will have access through the gates, and that the travel lane will extend to Campbell Avenue which is the northern border of the subject site, and that there is a SRP well at 99th Avenue and Campbell Avenue and a SRP ditch, the City of Avondale is in charge of the west side of the street and the improvements will be shifted east. Mr. O'Toole added that going down to two lanes along 99th Avenue in conjunction with not having a dedicated right-turn lane onto Camelback Road creates significant traffic congestion concerns. Mr. Anderson replied that they are only required to improve the street along the subject site which ends at Campbell Avenue, but the other concerns can be shared with the Street Transportation Department.

Zeke Valenzuela asked how long it would be until the subject site reached 60%-70% completion. Mr. Anderson replied that full build out would be around a decade, the commercial buildings would develop faster and that 60%-70% completion might be within five years.

Sandra Oviedo shared that it would be nice to see a self-sufficient community where people play, shop and live in the area, and that the crossings can be dangerous at the surrounding intersections.

Chair Gene Derie shared that the Algodón Center PUD PCD has been around for 20 years, was meant to be a major employment and economic center, there are roughly 2,600 housing units entitled or being built in the surrounding area, half of which are on the west side of 99th Avenue between Indian School Road and Thomas Road and asked what the plan was for the parcel at the northwest corner of 99th Avenue and Indian School Road. **Tim Wright**, with John F. Long Properties replied that the site in Avondale was sold to Fulton homes. Chair Gene Derie continued that there are several housing developments proposed in the area, citing 99th Avenue and Camelback Road by the charter school (267 units), 99th Avenue and Indian School Road (228 units), 111th Avenue and Camelback Road (194 units), east of Loop 101 near 95th Avenue and Indian School Road (501 units) and around 1,300 units in Avondale near 104th Avenue and Indian School Road. Chair Gene Derie added that he liked what is proposed on the east side of the freeway, but not what is proposed west of the freeway, concluding that the PUD was supposed to be the economic engine of Maryvale.

Sandra Oviedo asked the applicant to clarify what the vocational campus is as depicted in the PUD area. Mr. Anderson replied that the West MEC campus is around 30-acres, it stands for the Western Maricopa Education Center, it provides vocation education in many fields such as healthcare, welding, aviation maintenance. Ms. Oviedo responded that the campus is a great addition, there is a need for more places like that in addition to access to healthy food.

Joe Barba asked if the Chair's concerns with the proposal was that it was too much housing. Chair Gene Derie replied affirmatively, sharing that there are many housing

units planned for the area. Joe Barba replied that there are many people moving to Phoenix, and this is an opportunity to bring them to Maryvale, the population is going to increase significantly by 2030, they shouldn't paint too much housing as a bad thing, and that there is a huge need for housing.

Sandra Oviedo shared that there should be both housing and commercial uses in the community where people can work, live and play in the same area.

Joe Barba shared that he is not disagreeing with committee member Oviedo, and that the people who are moving to the area are going into areas like Buckeye and then must commute to their jobs, which will contribute to congestion.

Ken DuBose shared that he has lived in the area for 35 years, they are surrounded by a residential area, traffic is inevitable with growth, it is disappointing to see the City of Phoenix which has an affordable housing plan to not do some affordable housing at this site, this is the last largest land mass in Maryvale and the committee should be careful with this request, and that he wants to see more affordable housing and senior housing in the Village. Mr. DuBose added that the income needed for a one-bedroom in this proposal is \$56,000, a schoolteacher does not make that amount, which confirms the need for affordable housing. Mr. DuBose asked the applicant to explain how they came up with the income needed for the housing units in the proposal. Mr. Anderson replied that the income calculations came from mortgage financing for the homes, and they have talked to the Housing Department about the project site potentially being within an employee-assisted program where employers help get their employees housing, and that the Housing Department does not have funds for that sort of program, but they know that the developer is interested in being involved if that program was ever created.

Jeff O'Toole shared that he agreed with committee member Barba's comments and there is a desire to draw talent to the area, but if nothing but housing is built on land available for commercial uses, they will miss the opportunity to have more places for people to work in the Village and to have more retail spaces. Mr. O'Toole concluded that he might be more amenable to the proposal if the housing to commercial land use ratio was closer to 50/50. Mr. Anderson replied that the proposal is 58% residential and 42% commercial, and asked Mr. David Sellers with LGE Design Group to share about their plans for the commercial areas of the PUD. **David Sellers**, with LGE Design Group, shared that the two parcels within the PUD are incredible pieces of land, having housing nearby their planned commercial properties is a benefit to the employers, the buildings will be very nice and will draw in high-paying jobs, and that while they haven't closed on the property yet they have the capital for the projects, they are a vertically-integrated, they like the freeway visibility and that commercial tenants will see housing nearby as an asset.

Sandra Oviedo asked if there are any long-term projects for when the community ages. Mr. Anderson replied they do not have any age-restricted projects proposed on the site, and that the area could accommodate the Next Gen style of development that Lennar offers.

Chair Gene Derie commented that John F. Long's dream for the Algodón Center PUD PCD was to have an employment center in Maryvale because they had already built enough housing, churches and schools in the Village.

Public Comment:

None.

Item No. 6 GPA-MV-1-21-5

Motion:

Joe Barba motioned to recommended approval of GPA-MV-1-21-5 per the staff recommendation. **Zeke Valenzuela** seconded the motion.

Discussion:

Sandra Oviedo commented that she would like to see safe protected bike lanes within the subject site.

Vote:

4-5, Motion to approve fails, with Committee Members Barba, Cole, Oviedo, and Valenzuela in favor and committee members Battle, DuBose, O'Toole, Weber, and Derie opposed.

Motion:

Jeff O'Toole motioned to recommended denial of GPA-MV-1-21-5. **Mike Weber** seconded the motion.

Vote:

5-4, Motion to deny passes, with Committee Members Battle, DuBose, O'Toole, Weber, and Derie in favor and committee members Barba, Cole, Oviedo, and Valenzuela opposed.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION:

None.