



## Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary Z-72-21-7

<b>Date of VPC Meeting</b>	January 17, 2023
<b>Request From:</b>	RE-35, R1-8, and C-2
<b>Request To:</b>	R-2 and C-2
<b>Proposed Use:</b>	Single-family residential, multifamily residential, and commercial
<b>Location</b>	Northwest corner of 67th Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road
<b>VPC Recommendation</b>	Approval, per the staff recommendation with an additional stipulation
<b>VPC Vote</b>	8-1

### VPC DISCUSSION:

#### Staff presentation:

**Nayeli Sanchez Luna**, staff, presented an overview of the rezoning requests. Mrs. Sanchez Luna discussed the location of the site, the requested zoning designation, the surrounding land uses, and the General Plan Land Use Map designation. Mrs. Sanchez Luna displayed the site plan and elevations and described the configuration including the proposed open space, the amenities, and the multi-use trail along Lower Buckeye Road. Mrs. Sanchez Luna concluded the presentation by providing the community input and summarizing the staff findings, the recommendation, and proposed stipulations.

#### Applicant presentation:

**Sean Lake**, representing the applicant with Pew & Lake, PLC, provided an overview of the proposed rezoning case. Mr. Lake summarized the surrounding land uses and displayed the site plan, noting the configuration of the proposed development. Mr. Lake displayed the conceptual plan and noted the large open space, pedestrian pathways, and single-family residential design. Mr. Lake summarized the citizen participation and the school districts and concluded the presentation by displaying elevation renderings.

#### Questions from the committee:

**Vice Chair Parris Wallace** asked if the proposed development would have electric vehicle charging stations. **Mr. Lake** stated that wiring would be provided within each

individual unit. **Vice Chair Wallace** asked if the development would be mixed income. **Mr. Lake** stated that the west portion of the site would be for sale and the multifamily portion of the site would be for rent. Mr. Lake stated that rental rates would depend on the unit. **Vice Chair Wallace** stated that the market rate is unaffordable. **Mr. Lake** stated that a one-bedroom unit would be approximately between \$1,300 to \$1,500. **Vice Chair Wallace** stated that the proposed rental rate is not affordable. **Dafra Joel Sanou** stated that that was the market rate within the City of Phoenix. **Mr. Lake** stated that they could work with the City to reduce construction cost. **Vice Chair Wallace** responded that she did not want to reduce quality over quantity and reiterated that the market rate is not affordable. **Vice Chair Wallace** asked if the proposed landscaping would be drought tolerant and if it would include fruit trees. **Mr. Lake** stated that there would be areas of artificial turf and that they could include edible vegetation. **Vice Chair Wallace** asked for two dog parks to be included in the amenities. **Mr. Lake** stated that all amenities are connected via pedestrian connections and that they could integrate an additional dog park.

**Andre Serrette** stated that there has been a decrease in the housing market and asked if this would affect the rental rates. **Mr. Lake** stated that if there is a decrease in the housing market, then there would be a decrease in the rental rates. **Mr. Serrette** asked for clarification on the dimensions of the single-family residential development. **Mr. Lake** stated that the single-family development would include 6,000 square feet housing. **Mr. Serrette** asked if this portion of the project would be developed later. **Mr. Lake** confirmed that development would occur at a later date.

**Vice Chair Wallace** stated that she was opposed to liquor stores, smoke shops, or other similar uses within the C-2 portion of the subject site. **Lisa Perez** voiced her agreement. **Mr. Lake** stated that a church owned the C-2 portion and that they had religious standards that would prevent the leasing of liquor stores or other similar uses.

**Angelica Terrazas** requested more information on the lazy river. **Mr. Lake** stated that the lazy river was an extension of the pool. **Ms. Terrazas** stated that she was opposed to the lazy river due to the water usage and asked what other amenities were provided. **Mr. Lake** listed the provided amenities including fire pits, pickleball and tennis courts, hammock garden.

**Ms. Perez** stated that the Estrella Village did not have a lot of amenities and that the lazy river would benefit the future community. Ms. Perez added that she lived to the development to the south. Ms. Perez stated that she would like the traffic study to determine if a deceleration lane would be required. Ms. Perez asked staff if a stipulation could be added regarding the traffic study and the deceleration lanes. **Mrs. Sanchez Luna**, staff, stated that the Street Transportation Department had provided stipulation language. Mrs. Sanchez Luna added that the proposed language would require a deceleration lane to be added, if the traffic study concludes that one is required. **Ms. Perez** stated that she would like to add that stipulation and provided an overview of the lane configuration of 67th Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road. Ms. Perez noted that the proposed traffic light on 71st Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road has not been confirmed. Ms. Perez asked if the site plans and elevations for the future single-family development and commercial development would be reviewed by the Estrella VPC. **Mrs. Sanchez**

**Luna** stated that the single-family development would have to present site plan and elevations to the Estrella Village prior to final site plan approval. Mrs. Sanchez Luna added that the commercial portion would go be reviewed by the Planning Hearing Officer through the public hearing process. **Ms. Perez** added that additional housing is required in the Estrella Village and appreciated the proposed layout when compared to other projects that have been proposed on the subject site.

**Dan Rush** stated that he appreciated the artificial turf and that he was in favor of the lazy river and the other amenities.

**Kristine Morris** asked if the north property, that was owned by the school district, would be developed as a school. **Mr. Lake** stated that the school had not provided any information on future development. **Ms. Morris** stated that she would like to add pedestrian connections to the north property if a school is proposed. **Mr. Lake** stated that they could add pedestrian connections if a school is proposed. **Ms. Perez** added that the land is being leased for farming and that a school is not proposed at this location. **Ms. Morris** asked how the development would affect the number of students in the area. **Mr. Lake** stated that the current zoning allowed large lots, but the proposed zoning would have more housing which would result in more children. **Ms. Morris** stated that some cities have impact fees and stated that these impact fees would go towards adjacent schools. **Ms. Perez** voiced her agreement.

**Ms. Terrazas** asked if the amenities would be accessible to the future development to the west. **Mr. Lake** stated that the amenities would be accessible to those that lived in the development.

**Ms. Perez** noted that the Estrella Village Planning Committee could still voice their concerns or comments during Planning Commission.

**Public Comment:**

None.

**Applicant Response:**

None.

**Committee Discussion:**

None.

**Motion:**

**Lisa Perez** motioned to recommend approval of Z-72-21, per the staff recommendation with the following additional stipulation:

*The Traffic Impact Study shall include a right-turn deceleration analysis, as required and approved by the Street Transportation Department.*

**Vice Chair Parris Wallace** second the motion.

**Vote:**

**8-1**, motion to recommend approval passed with Committee members Burd, Cenicerros, Morris, Perez, Rush, Sanou, Serrette, and Wallace in favor, and Committee member Terrazas in opposition.

**Recommended Stipulations:**

**OVERALL SITE**

1. Building elevations shall be developed to the following standards, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
  - a. All building elevations shall contain a primary material and a minimum of one secondary material to provide tasteful and balanced enhancements to the architecture. The secondary materials and colors shall be composed of brick, masonry, stone, Hardie Plank, lap siding, shudders, or another exterior accent material that exhibits quality, durability, and consistency with the architectural theme.
  - b. All building elevations shall contain architectural embellishments and detailing such as textural changes, pilasters, offsets, pop-outs, recesses, variation in window size and location, pitched roofs and/or overhang canopies.
2. A minimum of 10% of the required shrubs, shall be a milkweed or other native nectar species, and shall be planted in groups of three or more, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
3. The development shall conform with the Estrella Village Arterial Street Landscaping Program landscape palette and landscaping standards along arterial streets in the Estrella Village, except as otherwise noted herein, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
4. All perimeter walls visible from street right-of-way shall include material and/or textural differences, such as stucco and/or split face block with a decorative element, such as tile or stamped designs, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
5. A system of pedestrian connections shall be provided as follows, and connecting the following via the most direct route, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
  - a. A minimum of two pedestrian connections shall be provided from the residential zoned portion of the site to the public sidewalk along Lower Buckeye Road.
  - b. A minimum of one pedestrian connection shall be provided from the multifamily-zoned portion of the site to the public sidewalks along 67th

Avenue and 71st Avenue.

- c. Illuminated pedestrian scale lighting per Section 1304(H)5 for pedestrian pathways connecting the multifamily and commercial development, and along pedestrian entrances to the multifamily development.
  - d. Where pedestrian walkways cross a vehicular path, the pathway shall be constructed of decorative pavers, stamped or colored concrete, or other pavement treatments that visually contrasts parking and drive aisle surfaces.
6. The bus stop pads along Lower Buckeye Road shall be shaded a minimum of 50% by vegetative shade at maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with a pedestrian environment.
  7. All uncovered surface parking lot areas shall be landscaped with minimum 2-inch caliper size large canopy drought tolerant shade trees. Landscaping shall be dispersed throughout the parking area and achieve 25% shade at maturity, as approved by Planning and Development Department.
  8. The sidewalk along 67th Avenue shall be a minimum of 5 feet in width and detached with a minimum 13-foot-wide landscape strip located between the sidewalk and back of curb. The landscape strip shall be planted with minimum 2-inch caliper, single trunk, drought-tolerant shade trees to provide a minimum of 75% shade at maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with a pedestrian environment.
  9. The sidewalk along 71st Avenue shall be a minimum of 5 feet in width and detached with a minimum 8-foot-wide landscape strip located between the sidewalk and back of curb. The landscape strip shall be planted with minimum 2-inch caliper, single trunk, drought-tolerant shade trees to provide a minimum of 75% shade at maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with a pedestrian environment.
  10. The sidewalk along Lower Buckeye Road shall be a minimum of 5 feet in width and detached with a minimum 13-foot wide landscape strip located between the sidewalk and back of curb. The landscape strip shall be planted with minimum 2-inch caliper, single trunk, drought-tolerant shade trees to provide a minimum of 75% shade at maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with a pedestrian environment.

11. A 30-foot-wide multi-use trail easement (MUTE) shall be dedicated along Lower Buckeye Road and a minimum 10-foot-wide multi-use trail (MUT) shall be constructed within the easement, in accordance with the MAG supplemental detail and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
12. The developer shall construct two bus stop pads along westbound Lower Buckeye Road. One west of 67th Avenue and another west of the 69th Avenue alignment. The bus stop pads shall be constructed according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1260 with a minimum depth of 10 feet and shall be spaced from the intersection of 67th Avenue and the 69th Avenue alignment according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1258.
13. The developer shall dedicate minimum 55-feet of right-of-way and construct the north side of Lower Buckeye Road, as required by the C-M Cross Section identified on the Street Classification Map and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
14. The developer shall dedicate minimum 60-feet of right-of-way and construct the west side of 67th Avenue to include a 14-foot-wide landscaped median, as required by the C-M Cross Section identified on the Street Classification Map and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
15. The developer shall dedicate minimum 40-feet of right-of-way and construct the east side of 71st Avenue, as required by the E Cross Section identified on the Street Classification Map and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
16. Access control for the development site shall comply with the City of Phoenix Street Planning and Design Guideline Standards and as approved by the Street Transportation Department.
17. The developer shall submit a Traffic Impact Analysis (TIS) to the City for this development. No preliminary approval of plans shall be granted until the study is reviewed and approved by the City. The study shall include signal warrant analysis at the intersection of 71st Avenue and Lower Buckeye Road. The developer shall be responsible for constructing and/or providing funds in escrow all off-site improvements including modifications to existing traffic signals, as recommended by the approved TIS.
18. **THE TRAFFIC IMPACT STUDY SHALL INCLUDE A RIGHT-TURN DECELERATION ANALYSIS, AS REQUIRED AND APPROVED BY THE STREET TRANSPORTATION DEPARTMENT.**
- ~~18.~~ Existing irrigation facilities along all public streets are to be undergrounded and relocated outside of City right-of-way. Contact SRP to identify existing land rights and establish the appropriate process to relocate the facility. Relocations that require additional dedications or land transfer require completion prior to obtaining
- 19.

plat and/or civil plan review approval.

- ~~19.~~ **20.** The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping and other incidentals, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
- ~~20.~~ **21.** If determined necessary by the Phoenix Archeology Office, the applicant shall conduct Phase I data testing and submit an archaeological survey report of the development area for review and approval by the City Archeologist prior to clearing and grubbing, landscape salvage, and/or grading approval.
- ~~21.~~ **22.** If Phase I data testing is required, and if, upon review of the results from Phase I data testing, the City Archeologist, in consultation with a qualified archeologist, determines such data recovery excavations are necessary, the applicant shall conduct Phase II archeological data recovery excavations.
- ~~22.~~ **23.** In the event archeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33-foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archeologist, and allow time for the Archeology Office to properly assess the materials.

## **R-2 Zoned Areas (Both Single-Family and Multifamily)**

- ~~23.~~ **24.** A site plan and building elevations shall be presented to the Estrella Village Planning Committee for review and comment prior to preliminary site plan approval for the area depicted as a single-family residential subdivision on the Concept Plan date stamped November 30, 2022.
- ~~24.~~ **25.** The approximate 48-acre multifamily development depicted on the Concept Plan date stamped November 30, 2022, shall be in general conformance with the Concept Plan and elevations date stamped November 30, 2022, as modified by the following stipulations and approved by the Planning and Development Department.
- ~~25.~~ **26.** The primary vehicular entrance to the development shall include the following elements, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
  - a. Pedestrian pathways connecting the interior of the development to the public sidewalks along both sides of the vehicular driveway.
  - b. The pedestrian pathways shall be detached from the vehicular driveway and lined with landscape areas on both sides of not less than 5 feet in width. The landscape area shall be planted with drought-tolerant plant materials providing seasonal interest and minimum 75% live coverage at maturity.
  - c. A mix of ornamental trees (no less than 2-inch caliper), shrubs (no less than

five 5-gallon shrubs per tree) and flower beds that will provide a variety of texture and color throughout the year and minimum 75% live coverage, shall be provided along both sides of the entryway.

- d. The entry driveway surface shall be constructed of decorative pavers, stamped or colored concrete, or another material, other than those used to pave the parking surfaces.
- ~~26.~~ A minimum of 10% of the site area shall be provided as open space for each residential development, exclusive of landscape setbacks, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
- ~~27.~~ The development shall incorporate bicycle infrastructure as described below and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
- ~~28.~~
- a. A minimum of 30 bicycle parking spaces shall be provided through Inverted U and/or artistic racks, or in a secure area and located throughout the site including near the centralized open space and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H. of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance.
  - b. One bicycle repair station (“fix it station”) shall be provided and maintained in the multifamily development portion of the site within a central amenity area or primary site entrance. The bicycle repair station (“fix it station”) shall be provided in an area of high visibility and separated from vehicular maneuvering areas, where applicable. The repair station shall include: standard repair tools affixed to the station; a tire gauge and pump affixed to the base of the station or the ground; and a bicycle repair stand which allows pedals and wheels to spin freely while making adjustments to the bike.

### **C-2 Zoned Area**

- ~~28.~~ The conceptual site plan and elevations for future development of the commercially zoned area shall be reviewed and approved by the Planning Hearing Officer through the public hearing process for stipulation modifications prior to preliminary site plan approval. This is a legislative review for conceptual purposes only. Specific development standards and requirements will be determined by the Planning Hearing Officer and the Planning and Development Department. The site plan shall incorporate the following elements:
- ~~29.~~
- a. Refuse bins shall be screened from view by a 6-foot-tall wall.
  - b. Accessible pedestrian pathways that connect building entrances, public sidewalks, and the bus stop pad along Lower Buckeye Road using the most direct route for pedestrians.
  - c. Pedestrian connections between adjacent commercial developments (if developed across multiple phases).

- ~~29.~~ Evergreen trees shall be planted within the north and west landscape setbacks, as  
**30.** approved by the Planning and Development Department.
- ~~30.~~ A minimum of 6 bicycle parking spaces shall be provided through Inverted U  
**31.** and/or artistic racks installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H. of the  
Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, as approved by the Planning and Development  
Department.

**Staff comments regarding VPC Recommendation:**

None.