



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary

Z-91-22-5

Date of VPC Meeting	March 28, 2023
Request From	R1-6 and R-5
Request To	R-5
Proposed Use	Multifamily Residential
Location	Approximately 1,000 feet west of the southwest corner of 39th Avenue and Camelback Road
VPC Recommendation	Approval, per staff recommendation, with an additional stipulation
VPC Vote	12-2

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

No members of the public registered to speak on this item.

STAFF PRESENTATION

Mr. Samuel Rogers, staff, reviewed the surrounding land uses, zoning designations, and site context. Mr. Rogers displayed the proposed site plan, elevations, renderings, and concluded with staff findings, and recommended stipulations.

QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE

Chair Drew Bryck asked if the General Plan Land Use map designation of 15+ dwelling units per acre is highest residential density designation on the General Plan Land Use map. **Mr. Rogers** confirmed that the General Plan Land Use designation of 15+ dwelling units per acre is highest residential density designation in the General Plan.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Virginia Senior, representing the applicant with Vida Architects, presented the surrounding neighborhood and how the proposal will address challenges to the area. Ms. Senior described the public outreach and the responses from members and educational institutions within the community. Ms. Senior displayed the proposed site plan, elevations, and renderings, and explained how the proposal is addressing safety

and security. Ms. Senior concluded by explaining how the proposal will benefit the surrounding community and residents.

QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE

Chair Bryck asked if the sidewalk along Camelback Road is proposed to be detached. **Ms. Senior** confirmed that the sidewalk along Camelback Road is proposed to be detached.

Committee Member Charles Jones pointed out community concerns about the loss of privacy and asked about a step backed height design and if the proposed setback is required by code. **Ms. Senior** explained that the building is setback more than 73 feet, exceeding the required setback, and the western portion of the development adjacent to the single-family development is proposed to have enhanced landscaping.

Committee Member Crystal Carrillo expressed concerns about affordability in the area and asked about the proposed rental rates. **Ms. Senior** explained that the rental rates had not been determined yet, but the units are not proposed to be luxury. Ms. Senior also explained that the term affordable has a specific definition and made a distinction that the project is proposed to have attainable rents rather than affordable, low-income rents. **Jerome Maldonado**, owner, explained that expensive amenities included in traditional class A apartment complexes were not a part of this proposal so that rents can compete with rents at class B apartment complexes. Mr. Maldonado referenced a similar project he had developed in Youngtown, AZ called Youngtown Flats.

Committee Member Elizabeth Sanchez asked what the square footage of the units is proposed to be and expressed concerns about green space in the parking area. **Ms. Senior** explained the 2 bed and 2 bath apartments are 785 square feet and the 1 bed and 1 bath apartments are 656 square feet. Ms. Senior also explained that the green space in the parking area is a breezeway that is separated from traffic to safely connect the two pocket parks. Committee Member Sanchez asked about comments from the community and the pricing of the apartments. **Chair Bryck** explained that the committee had received one letter and the next portion of the agenda would invite community members to speak. Ms. Senior explained that comments from the community are available online and she would send comments from the developer's canvassing efforts in the future. **Mr. Maldonado** explained that the rent would be competitive with those in the surrounding area, but slightly higher due to the project being a new build.

Committee Member Jones asked for clarity on the attainable rents and if the apartments would be market rate. **Ms. Senior** explained that the units are smaller and have less amenities to keep the cost competitive in the area and confirmed the units are market rate for the type of units proposed.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

APPLICANT RESPONSE

None

FLOOR/PUBLIC DISCUSSION CLOSED: MOTION, DISCUSSION, AND VOTE

Committee Member Jak Keyser stated that he would like to add a stipulation requiring the provision of recycling on the site. **Ms. Senior** explained that two recycling containers are proposed on site.

MOTION

Committee Member Keyser motioned to recommend approval of Z-91-22-5 an additional stipulation requiring the provision of two recycling containers on the site as approved by the Planning and Development Department. **Committee Member Jones** seconded the motion.

11. A MINIMUM OF TWO RECYCLING CONTAINERS SHALL BE PROVIDED ON SITE, AS APPROVED BY THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT.

VOTE

12-2, motion to recommend approval of Z-91-22-5 with an additional stipulation passes, with committee members Adams, Camp, DeGraffenreid, Ender, Fitzgerald, Harris, Jones, Keyser, Krietor, LeBlanc, Smith, Bryck in favor, and committee members Carrillo and Sanchez opposed.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:

1. The development shall be in general conformance with the site plan date stamped December 30, 2022 with specific regard to the location of the buildings, the location of the open space, a minimum 5-foot-wide pedestrian pathway extending through the open space and connecting to Camelback Road, and with building entrances oriented onto the open space, as modified by the following stipulations and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
2. The development shall be in general conformance with the building elevations date stamped December 30, 2022, as modified by the following stipulations and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
3. The public sidewalk along Camelback Road shall be constructed to a width of 6 feet and detached from the back of curb by a minimum 10-foot-wide landscape area planted to the following standards, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work

with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with the creation of a comfortable pedestrian environment.

- a. Minimum 3-inch caliper, large canopy, single-trunk, shade trees shall be placed 25 feet on center or in equivalent groupings.
 - b. At tree maturity, the trees shall shade the sidewalks to a minimum 75 percent.
 - c. Drought tolerant shrubs and vegetative groundcovers shall be maintained at maximum height of 24 inches to provide a minimum of 75 percent live coverage at maturity.
4. The developer shall dedicate a 10-foot-wide sidewalk easement for the south side of Camelback Road, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
5. The required landscape setback along the west property line shall be enhanced with 5-foot by 5-foot triangular islands every 80 to 100 feet that protrude into the parking area. This landscape setback shall be planted with minimum 2-inch caliper single trunk, shade trees placed 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
6. The developer shall incorporate bicycle infrastructure as described below and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
 - a. Bicycle parking shall be provided at a minimum of 0.25 spaces per unit for up to a maximum of 50 spaces, located near the entrances to the building, and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance.
 - b. One bicycle repair station shall be provided and maintained in an area of high visibility to residents and within 75 feet of the Camelback Road right-of-way.
7. The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping, and other incidentals, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
8. A bus stop pad shall be constructed on westbound Camelback Road designed according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1260 with a depth of 10 feet and spaced from the western driveway according to City of Phoenix Standard Detail P1258, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.

9. In the event archaeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33-foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archaeologist, and allow time for the Archaeology Office to properly assess the materials.
10. Prior to preliminary site plan approval, the landowner shall execute a Proposition 207 waiver of claims form. The waiver shall be recorded with the Maricopa County Recorder's Office and delivered to the City to be included in the rezoning application file for record.
11. **A MINIMUM OF TWO RECYCLING CONTAINERS SHALL BE PROVIDED ON SITE, AS APPROVED BY THE PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT.**

Staff has no comment.