



## Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary

### Z-69-19-5

<b>Date of VPC Meeting</b>	May 13, 2020
<b>Request From</b>	S-1 SP, S-1
<b>Request To</b>	R-2
<b>Proposed Use</b>	Multifamily residential
<b>Location</b>	Approximately 315 feet west of the northwest corner of Ball Park Boulevard and Camelback Road
<b>VPC Recommendation</b>	Denial
<b>VPC Vote</b>	12-0

#### **VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:**

*This item was heard concurrently with GPA-MV-1-19-5.  
Ken DuBose joined during this item bringing the quorum up to 12.*

**Sarah Stockham**, staff, provided an overview of the requests, noting the location and the history of the site. Ms. Stockham displayed an aerial map, a proposed site plan, and reviewed staff's recommendation and stipulations.

**Sarah Gonzalez** asked about congestion mitigation on the site given the traffic that is generated from baseball games. **Sarah Stockham** replied that most of the traffic will enter and exit along Camelback Road and the gate along Ball Park Blvd is exit only. Ms. Stockham deferred to the applicant to further address their circulation and traffic plans for the site.

**Jordan Rose**, with Rose Law Group representing the applicant, presented an overview of the request and displayed an aerial image of the surrounding area. Ms. Rose explained that the land designated as Open Space in the General Plan was for an expansion of the ballpark and the request is to designate part of that for mixed use to support the community and the ballpark. Ms. Rose continued that the site proposed for multifamily residential will be a highly amenitized gated community with an elaborate clubhouse, resort-style pool, community garden, sidewalks connecting all amenities, dog park, car wash station, guest parking, garages, valet trash service, private rear yards and ample open space. Ms. Rose ended her presentation by stating that this is a

collaborative effort between the City of Glendale, City of Phoenix, The Empire Group and the White Sox and L.A. Dodgers to redevelop the land surrounding the ballpark.

**Vice Chair Gene Derie** asked how many people were notified about the request, where the neighborhood meeting was held and how many people were in attendance. **Ms. Rose** asked that her planner, **Jennifer Hall** answer the question. Ms. Hall responded that they notified property owners per the City's notification standards and HOA's within one mile of the site. Ms. Hall added that she spoke to the HOA president to the south who was excited to see mixed use in the area. Ms. Hall continued that they held a community meeting at the elementary school near the site and no one attended, and to date have not received any correspondence regarding this request. Mr. Derie asked which elementary school the meeting was held at. Ms. Hall responded that it was Villa de Paz Elementary school, near the site.

**Jeff O'Toole**, stated that the request is to designate fifty-four acres of land owned by the public for open space and convert it to private use. Mr. O'Toole continued that they have heard from an overwhelming number of residents in this area that they do not want more housing in this area. Mr. O'Toole asked what do the public, who currently own this land, and the tax payers get in exchange for the fifty-four acres of open space that they are giving up. **Ms. Rose** responded that the Parks Department in the City of Phoenix determined that the land, as it was originally planned for, would be incorporated into the ballpark development. Ms. Rose added that John Kaite, representing the Camelback Ranch Spring Training Facility could speak to the plans they have for the area. Ms. Rose continued that land was never utilized as open space for the community and it was waiting to develop with the ballpark. Ms. Rose stated that from a community benefit perspective the mixed use designation will support the ballpark and the commercial activity will energize the area which corresponds to the positive public comment they have received regarding this request. Mr. O'Toole stated that if you look back at original zoning, there was a time when Dust Devil Park at the southeast corner of Camelback Road and 107th Avenue extended to the entire area of ballpark and there was a point in time when the community was promised a much larger area of open space which got whittled away to allow the ballpark. Mr. O'Toole continued that the multifamily development itself looks good, but his issue is that the applicant has worked well with the City and the ballpark to accommodate their plans but only one member of the community gave their support, and the applicant, having worked on cases in the area in the past knows that this community is not supportive of additional housing. Mr. O'Toole added that this land is publicly owned and it up to the public and the taxpayers through this public hearing process to determine the future use of the property, and he does not see anything given back to them. Mr. O'Toole ended that in order for him to be supportive, he would like to see some sort of land swap for property along Ball Park Blvd where open space can be incorporated.

**John Kaite**, representing the White Sox and Dodgers baseball teams and the Camelback Ranch Training Facility, shared that the baseball facility is operated without tax payer dollars. Mr. Kaite added that they paid the City of Glendale over 3 million dollars, full market value, to buy one of the parcels. Mr. Kaite added that they were purchasing the land owned by the City of Phoenix after a market appraisal was done, in addition to completing the road to the north with Mattamy Homes and the City of Glendale. Mr. Kaite thanked the community for their support of the ballpark and they believe a park is a park: some have swing sets and others have baseball fields, and the ballpark is a great public amenity that has invested in this area for the past eleven

years. **Ms. Rose** added that both cities want the spring training facility to be successful and the mixed use designation would allow for a mixed use highly amenitized area for the public to enjoy. Mr. Kaite continued that the community will have another crack at this case since the request is just to change the General Plan designation, and when the plans for the surrounding area are solidified it will require a zone change, and they will work with the community to make sure the plans they have for the area surrounding the ballpark are appropriate. Mr. Kaite stated that COVID-19 has put a hold on any interest to get the development team together but hopes that once things settle down they can continue with their plans to redevelop the area.

Mr. O'Toole shared that the community supports the ballpark and their development plans along the corridor but his challenge with the proposal is that giving up fifty-four acres of publicly-owned open space for private enterprise is great from an economic development perspective but not for the community. Mr. O'Toole hopes that they bring the stakeholders together when they are developing the plans for the area surrounding the ballpark and would like to see some publicly accessible open space incorporated into the plan. Ms. Rose added that they are taking notes for when the fifty-four acres come back before the committee for a zone change.

**Mike Webber** asked for clarification that the proposal is on the west side of the ballpark, and if it originally was slated to be retail and hotels for visitors to the ballpark. **Ms. Rose** responded affirmatively, and that this proposal for a mixed use General Plan designation would allow the ballpark to come back to the committee with some great options for developing the land for those uses. Mr. Webber added that he understood why community members are concerned with more housing in the area and he wanted to see more retail go into the area. **Mr. Kaite** added that they would like to see a hotel go into the area as well, and the biggest challenge right now is the pandemic given that public spaces are not open now. Ms. Rose added that the request is to designate most of the land as mixed use on the General Plan and a smaller portion would be designated for housing, which they feel is an appropriate location and appropriate for the community. Ms. Rose continued that the additional residents will help support the retail development around the ballpark. Mr. Kaite stated that there is a joint agreement between the City of Phoenix and Glendale to split the tax revenue on those developments to repay the bonds to build the buildings so both cities are anxious to see development take place.

**Vice Chair Gene Derie** shared that he has concerns with an extreme amount of new housing that is being built, has been built or planned to be built in the area. Mr. Derie shared that in April 2017, at the Southwest Planning Summit at South Mountain Community College, the area around 107th Ave and Camelback Road was discussed to be an economic engine for Maryvale Village, not a housing development. Mr. Derie shared several examples of new housing such as:

- 95th Avenue and Indian School Road:
  - 501 homes under construction
- 99th Avenue Indian School Road and:
  - 127 bungalows planned
- 107th Avenue and Camelback Road, south of the CVS:
  - 127 bungalows completed
- 99th Avenue and Camelback Road, southeast corner:
  - around 200 bungalows planned

- 99th Avenue in the Aldea PUD:
  - 266 apartments

Mr. Derie calculated that there are about 1,200 new residential units within a two to three-mile radius. Mr. Derie explained that if the General Plan Amendment request was to designate the entire area as mixed use and mixed use only, he would vote in favor.

**Ms. Rose** shared that the current General Plan designation is for 26 acres of residential, and the request is for 18 acres of residential at a higher density; the request would decrease the amount of land designated for residential. Mr. Derie shared that there is a tremendous amount of housing being built in the area within the past two years.

**Chair Jeff Armor** asked for clarification that the number of residential units overall being proposed is less now than what it is zoned for. **Ms. Rose** answered that the amount of land designated on the General Plan for residential would decrease, but as proposed it would be at a higher density designation.

**Mike Weber** asked if there was anyone from the Parks Department on the line who could speak to the plans for the parcel to the north of the rezoning site. **Mr. Kaite**s responded that the Parks Department is selling the parcel to the north rezoning site to the ballpark and that land will be part of a future rezoning case when the master plan for the retail uses is ready to move forward.

**Jeff O'Toole** asked about the proposed designation for the southeastern parcel next to 107th Avenue. **Mr. Kaite**s responded that it is proposed to be mixed use; in the original plan from 2006 it was supposed to be a hotel, but the vision is to put something really nice there for people to use year-round.

**Public Comment:**

None.

**Motion for Z-69-19-5:**

**Vice Chair Gene Derie** motioned to deny Z-69-19-5. **Mike Weber** seconded the motion.

**Vote:**

12-0, Motion to recommend denial passed, with Committee members Barba, Battle, Demarest, DuBose, Garcia, Gonzalez, O'Toole, Sirochman, Valenzuela, Weber, Derie and Armor in favor.

**STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:**

None.