



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary

Z-40-20-7

Date of VPC Meeting	February 10, 2021
Request From	C-2 (Intermediate Commercial) and RSC (Regional Shopping Center)
Request To	Planned Unit Development
Proposed Use	Multifamily residential and a senior living facility
Location	Northeast corner of 79th Avenue and Encanto Boulevard
VPC Recommendation	Approval, per the staff recommendation with modified stipulations
VPC Vote	9-1

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

Committee members Denise Garcia and Brandon Sirochman joined the meeting during this item and Joe Barba and Denise Garcia left during this item, bringing quorum to 10.

Sarah Stockham, staff, reviewed the surrounding land use and zoning around the subject site, showed aerial images and renderings, reviewed the Maryvale Village Core Plan and the proposal. Ms. Stockham concluded her presentation by noting staff's findings, recommendation, and stipulations. Ms. Stockham noted there were two changes to the stipulations since the staff report was written regarding right-of-way dedications and that staff's recommendation is approval, subject to the modified stipulations.

Owen Metz, with Dominion and **Susan Demmitt**, with Gammage and Burnham introduced themselves. Ms. Demmitt reviewed the surrounding zoning and construction timeline. Mr. Metz shared that the proposed project is affordable housing at the 60% AMI level, reviewed other affordable housing projects of theirs in the Valley, the maximum rent limits for the different floor plans, and that this would be affordable for 30 years. Ms. Demmitt reviewed the project and amenities, renderings, and project conformance with the Core Plan.

Jeff O'Toole asked if the project will receive any tax incentives or any public subsidies. **Mr. Metz** responded that this project will use low-income tax credits, but they do not receive any direct public subsidy.

Ken DuBose asked about site security. **Mr. Metz** replied that they determine the level of security based on need once residents moved in, but the site will have fobs and cameras.

Mike Weber shared that originally, he had concerns with traffic and parking, but he believes that the concert pavilion parking won't spill out into the neighborhood and asked what the applicant will do if they receive noise complaints from concerts nearby.

Brandon Sirochman asked if what construction mitigation measures the applicant will take to lessen the noise from the nearby concert pavilion and what traffic mitigation measures will be taken. **Ms. Demmitt** responded that the site has ample parking for residents, it is near a proposed light rail line and near the transit center, and they are required to submit a traffic study to the Street Transportation Department to review traffic impacts from the new development. **Mr. Metz** responded that given the amount of insulation and high efficiency windows used to construct the site, they don't have sound complaints from residents.

Alvin Battle asked about security on site. **Mr. Metz** replied that they determine the level of security based on need once residents moved in, but the site will have gated access and cameras.

Vice Chair Viri Hernandez asked staff for an update on the light rail extension and the applicant about why they chose the site in Maryvale, what are the company's core values, what were the community outreach plans and dates of meetings, and how they are designing the site with the users in mind and if they will do criminal background checks for residents. **Ms. Stockham**, staff, replied when the Capitol I-10 extension alignment near the Capitol Mall went to City Council for approval, they were directed to continue working with the State regarding the alignment near State buildings and staff does not have an update regarding the alignment past the Capitol Mall area. **Vice Chair Hernandez** asked staff to update the committee with more information on the extension near Maryvale when it becomes available. **Ms. Stockham** replied that she will do so. **Mr. Metz** responded that they are excited to come to Maryvale and that their company values are to be good stewards and to have dignity in their developments, so residents can be proud of where they come home to, and they have an internship and scholarship program for residents. **Ms. Demmitt** added that they sent out notification letters to property owners and registered neighborhood groups per the City of Phoenix rezoning guidelines, included information in Spanish, and asked District 7 for names of community members and were told to work with the Village Planning Committee. **Ms. Demmitt** added that they usually send staff out to knock on doors however were unable to do so during the pandemic. **Vice Chair Hernandez** shared that sometimes outreach doesn't engage those with a technology gap, and that she was involved in the community meetings for the creation of the Core Plan and the vision that the community had for the area was having a space for the community to congregate and a crosswalk along Encanto Blvd, and she can see that the community has not been involved in the design of this project. She continued that Maryvale has "million-dollar blocks" with individuals who were formally incarcerated, and she has a concern with criminalization of those in the public areas and who belongs in those spaces. **Ms. Demmitt** responded that they worked on the public spaces to make them clear and delineated from the private spaces and that they are sensitive to community outreach and that there are more opportunities for community engagement through the rezoning process and they want to make sure they engage all stakeholders. **Mr. Metz** added that they follow Fair

Housing laws and rent to those who show up, and that having a good community manager is very helpful with community engagement. **Katessa Archer**, with Dominion, added that through their other projects in Phoenix they have been in contact with the Black Lives Matter organization and Mass Liberation Arizona. **Ms. Demmitt** added that the scope of the Traffic Study is still being evaluated with the Street Transportation Department and asked the Vice Chair for help identifying other people to reach out to.

Jeff O'Toole asked if there are any local incentives that the project will receive for providing affordable housing. **Mr. Metz** responded that they don't receive local funding, just the federal low-income housing tax credits.

Saundra Cole asked how long the applicant will own the property and what is the plan for maintaining the site. **Mr. Metz** replied that typical ownerships range from 15-30 years, since with tax credits they have a 15-year minimum commitment and then they can re-invest for another 15 years, and that since they manage their own properties they are committed to making sure the buildings are maintained well. **Saundra Cole** responded that there is a need to make sure the seniors living in the senior housing can get across Encanto Boulevard with a crosswalk.

Chair Gene Derie stated that there is currently a four-way stop at the intersection of 79th Avenue and Encanto Boulevard, and that he expects it won't remain that way after the Traffic Impact Study.

Ken DuBose shared that they have been waiting for a project like this and it is great to get affordable housing in the Village.

Chair Gene Derie shared that he remembers hearing about this project about a year ago, and that he remembers stressing the importance to conform to the Core Plan, and that neighborhood meetings historically are not well-attended.

Zeke Valenzuela stated that they have been trying to get a project like this on the site and it was well presented.

Motion:

Mike Weber motioned to recommend approval of Z-40-20 per the staff recommendation with modified stipulations. **Alvin Battle** seconded the motion.

Discussion:

Jeff O'Toole shared that this is a nice project that conforms to the Core Plan.

Vice Chair Viri Hernandez explained that she will be voting no because of her concerns with the level of community engagement in the process, the outcome of the Traffic Impact Study that is yet to be completed, and opportunities for additional community outreach regarding design. She added that the standards are high for this project as it is the first one in the Village Core to be developed.

Vote:

9-1, Motion to approve passes with committee members Battle, Cole, Demarest, DuBose, O'Toole, Sirochman, Valenzuela, Weber and Derie in favor and committee member Hernandez opposed.

STIPULATIONS:

1. An updated Development Narrative for the 79th Avenue and Encanto Boulevard PUD reflecting the changes approved through this request shall be submitted to the Planning and Development Department within 30 days of City Council approval of this request. The updated Development Narrative shall be consistent with the Development Narrative date stamped January 11, 2021, as modified by the following stipulations:
 - a. Front cover: Revise the date information on the cover page to the following:
2nd Submittal: November 17, 2020
Hearing Draft: January 11, 2021
City Council Adopted: [Add Adoption Date]
 - b. Page 22, Lot Standards, Maximum Density: Modify to 26 du/a
 - c. Page 25, Frontage Standards, Fence Standards: Modify to include "Primary Frontage and Secondary Frontage: 72 inches maximum height exclusive of column caps and a maximum of 36 inches of solid fence unless screening above grade utilities or trash enclosures. Columns caps to be no more than two feet wide."
2. The developer shall dedicate a minimum of 50 feet of right-of-way and a minimum 18-foot-wide public sidewalk easement along the east side of 79th Avenue, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
3. The developer shall dedicate a minimum of 50 feet of right-of-way AND A MINIMUM 2-FOOT-WIDE PUBLIC SIDEWALK EASEMENT along the north side of Encanto Boulevard ~~with an additional sidewalk easement~~ consistent with the Maryvale Village Core Plan, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
4. The developer shall construct ~~all improvements~~ A MINIMUM 2-FOOT-WIDE LANDSCAPE STRIP FROM THE EXISTING FACE OF CURB WITH AN ADJACENT AT-GRADE, CONCRETE, MINIMUM 6-FOOT-WIDE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PATH, AND AN ADJACENT MINIMUM 6-FOOT-WIDE LANDSCAPE STRIP BEHIND THE ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION PATH along the north side of Encanto Boulevard, CONSISTEN WITH ~~per the Bicycle Avenue Cross Section in the Maryvale Village Core Plan, as approved by the Planning and Development~~ STREET TRANSPORTATION Department. ~~Where on-street parking is provided, landscape bump-outs, planted with shade trees, shall be provided for every five parking spaces.~~
5. The applicant shall submit a Traffic Impact Study to the City for this development. No preliminary approval of plans shall be granted until the study is reviewed and approved by the City. Contact the Street Transportation Department to discuss the requirements of the statement/study. Upon completion of the TIS the developer shall submit the completed TIS to the

Planning and Development Department counter with instruction to forward the study to the Street Transportation Department.

6. The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping and other incidentals as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
7. In the event archaeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33-foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archaeologist, and allow time for the Archaeology Office to properly assess the materials.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION:

None.