

ATTACHMENT C

PHOENIX HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MONTHLY MEETING Final Meeting Minutes

Date: September 16, 2024
 Time: 4:30 p.m.
 Location: Virtual-only via Webex

Commission Members Present	Staff Present
Dan Garcia, Chair	Helana Ruter
Tricia Amato, Vice Chair <i>(virtual)</i>	Kevin Weight
Dan Klocke	Desiree Aranda
Taz Khatri <i>(virtual)</i>	Cletus Montoya
Christina Noble <i>(virtual)</i>	Emma Collins
Brenda Thomson	Bridget Collins
Chad Gestson <i>(virtual - late arrival)</i>	Jodey Elsner <i>(virtual)</i>
	Crystal Carrancho <i>(virtual)</i>
	Maura Jackson <i>(virtual)</i>
	Danny Inglese (Law Department)
Commission Members Absent	Staff Absent
Francesca Miller	
Keely Varvel Hartsell	

1.	<p>Call meeting to order</p> <p>Chair Garcia verified that a quorum was established and called the meeting to order at 4:39 p.m.</p>	Dan Garcia, HP Commission Chair
2.	<p>Introduction of Commission Members and Staff</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission members to introduce themselves followed by staff introductions.</p>	HP Commission and Staff
3.	<p>Review of meeting minutes from the annual work session and the monthly meeting held on August 19, 2024.</p> <p>Action Requested: Approval of minutes (separate actions for the two meetings).</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments about the draft minutes from the August 19th annual work session. None were posed.</p> <p>Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on the draft minutes from the August 19th annual work session.</p>	HP Commission

	<p>Commissioner Klocke made a motion to approve the minutes for the August 19, 2024, HP Commission annual work session.</p> <p>Vice Chair Amato seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Yes Commissioner Noble – Yes Commissioner Thomson - Abstained</p> <p>Approved 5 – 0 with 1 abstention.</p> <p>Next, Chair Garcia asked the Commission for questions or comments about the draft minutes from the August 19th monthly meeting. None were posed.</p> <p>Chair Garcia then asked the Commission for a motion on the draft minutes from the August 19th monthly meeting.</p> <p>Vice Chair Amato made a motion to approve the minutes for the August 19, 2024, HP Commission monthly meeting.</p> <p>Commissioner Khatri seconded the motion.</p> <p>The Commission voted, as follows: Chair Garcia – Yes Vice Chair Amato – Yes Commissioner Khatri – Yes Commissioner Klocke – Abstained Commissioner Noble – Yes Commissioner Thomson - Abstained</p> <p>Approved 4 – 0 with 2 abstentions.</p> <p>Chair Garcia asked Mr. Inglese for clarification whether the vote passed or if the item should be paused while the rules could be reviewed for confirmation.</p> <p>Mr. Inglese agreed to pause the second action regarding the August 19th monthly meeting minutes so that he could research the rules of procedure for the Commission and respond after agenda item four is completed.</p> <p>Next, Chair Garcia paused item three and moved on to item number four.</p>	
4.	<p>Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. Z-93-24-8, Mission Revival Residence, at 8252 South 15th Avenue.</p> <p>Action Requested: Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning</p>	Desiree Aranda, HP Staff

Chair Garcia invited Desiree Aranda to present this item.

Ms. Aranda said that Rezoning Application No. Z-93-24-8 is a request to establish Historic Preservation (HP) overlay zoning for the Mission Revival Residence property located at 8252 South 15th Avenue. She presented the following information in support of the request:

- **Background:**
 - 1989: Recommended eligible per South Mountain Agricultural Area Historic Resources Survey
 - 1992: HP Office attempted to list property on Phoenix Historic Property Register; effort was not successful due to lack of support from property owner
 - 2023:
 - SEP – Current owner requested historic designation
 - OCT – HP staff visited site and reaffirmed initial finding of eligibility
 - DEC – Property owner signed an Ownership Authorization Form and Waiver of Claims under Proposition 207
 - 2024:
 - APR – HP staff met with property owner to review designation process and effects
 - MAY – HP Commission initiated HP overlay zoning
 - JUN – HP Office filed Rezoning Case No. Z-93-24-8
- **Property Overview:**
 - Large lot, north of South Mountain and west of Western Canal
 - Open space including grassy areas, trees, and landscaped walking paths (added 2001)
 - Contains a main house, three non-original buildings, and a pool
- **Evaluation:**
 - Mission Revival Residence
 - Meets age requirement – Built circa 1916 (approximately 108 years old)
 - Meets significance requirement – Significant under Criterion C as a strong local example of the Mission Revival architectural style within a rural estate setting, a property type that distinguished the South Mountain agricultural area of Phoenix during the early 20th Century
 - Meets integrity requirements – Alterations and new additions to property do not compromise integrity of circa 1916 residence or its large lot setting
- **Boundary:**
 - Proposed boundary of HP overlay zoning
 - 3.52 gross acres
 - Includes entire subject parcel as well as the adjacent portions of the right of way
 - Contains the documented historic resources
 - Follows parcel lines as much as possible

In conclusion, Ms. Aranda stated that HP staff was recommending approval of the request for HP overlay zoning on the Mission Revival Residence, located at 8252 South 15th Avenue.

Chair Garcia thanked Ms. Aranda for the presentation. He then verified that there were no questions or comments from the Commission on this item.

Next, Chair Garcia verified that there was one request from John Jacquemart for public comment. He invited Mr. Jacquemart to the podium for his comment.

Mr. Jacquemart expressed his support for HP overlay zoning case Z-93-24-8. He mentioned that the *South Mountain Agricultural Survey* was initially presented to the City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Office on September 8, 1989. He said that he got to work on the initial survey and had a great time doing so, and this current month marks the 35th anniversary of the survey. Although a lot has changed since then, the subject property is still there. Of the 262 properties surveyed, 100 were considered eligible at the time. Sixteen of the 232 individual properties currently listed on the Phoenix Historic Property Register are from the South Mountain Agricultural Survey. He thinks the subject property should be the 17th eligible property.

Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Jacquemart. He also mentioned that he just finished reading that survey for an unrelated reason, and he said that the survey is an excellent document.

Mr. Jacquemart said that he no longer has a copy of the survey.

Chair Garcia asked staff to send a copy of the South Mountain Agricultural Survey to Mr. Jacquemart. Staff agreed to provide a copy.

Next, Chair Garcia verified that there were no further comments from the Commission. He then asked the Commission for a motion on this item.

Commissioner Klocke made a motion that the HP Commission recommend HP overlay zoning per the Rezoning Application No. Z-93-24-8 for the Mission Revival Residence at 8252 South 15th Avenue.

Commissioner Thomson seconded the motion.

The Commission voted, as follows:

Chair Garcia – Yes

Vice Chair Amato – Yes

Commissioner Khatri – Yes

Commissioner Klocke – Yes

Commissioner Noble – Yes

Commissioner Thomson – Yes

Approved 6 – 0.

	<p><i>(NOTE: After agenda item four completed, Chair Garcia returned to agenda item three and asked Mr. Inglese for an update on the paused outcome of the vote on the minutes for the August 19th HP Commission monthly meeting.</i></p> <p><i>Mr. Inglese stated that per the Commission’s rules of procedure, a quorum is required to conduct business. However, conducting business then only requires a majority of those present. Since there were six members present and four members voted, yes, the minutes did pass in this case. Also, he referenced the Robert’s Rules of Procedure, which state that abstentions are not required if a member was not present at a prior meeting – members are welcome to vote on minutes for any prior meeting that they did not attend.</i></p> <p><i>Chair Garcia thanked Mr. Inglese for confirming the vote of 4-0 with 2 abstentions for the August 19th HP Commission monthly meeting minutes. He also appreciated the clarification on abstentions not being required when voting on minutes from prior meetings that members may have missed.</i></p> <p><i>Following this confirmation of the vote on the second action item for agenda item three, Chair Garcia then moved the agenda forward to item five.)</i></p>	
5.	<p>Public Hearing for Rezoning Application No. Z-94-24-3, Thompson Rock Garden, at 10023 North 13th Place.</p> <p>Action Requested: Recommendation on Historic Preservation (HP) Overlay Zoning</p> <p>Chair Garcia invited Maura Jackson to present this item.</p> <p>Ms. Jackson said that Rezoning Application No. Z-94-24-3 is a request to establish Historic Preservation (HP) overlay zoning for the property located at 10023 North 13th Place, which is known historically as the Thompson Rock Garden or the Sunnyslope Rock Garden. She presented the following information in support of the request:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Background: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ 1979 Phoenix Historic Building Survey <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Although subject property was not yet 50 years old, it was identified as eligible for listing as a unique local example of folk art used in landscaping; ▪ Subject property, now substantially over 50 years in age, is recommended as eligible for listing on the Phoenix Historic Property Register (PHPR) under Criterion C as an exceptional example of a folk art environment ▪ Request for designation was initiated by the current property owner; and ▪ Designation was initiated by the HP Commission on June 17, 2024 ▪ HP overlay zoning application was filed by HP Office on June 26, 2024 • Property Overview: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Grover Cleveland Thompson purchased this property in 1954 	Maura Jackson, HP Staff