



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary
PHO-6-20—Z-50-08-5

Date of VPC Meeting	September 16, 2020
Planning Hearing Officer	October 21, 2020
Hearing Date	
Request	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Modification of Stipulation 1 regarding Planning Hearing Officer review of residential elevations.2) Modification of Stipulation 1.a regarding orientation of building entries.3) Modification of Stipulation 2 regarding general conformance to the site plan date stamped August 29, 2008.4) Modification of Stipulation 2.b regarding residential building design and a Tree Preservation Plan.5) Modification of Stipulation 2.c regarding a maximum of 11.12 dwellings per acre.6) Technical corrections to Stipulations 3, 5, 6, 7, and 8.
Location	Approximately 780 feet east of 23rd Avenue and Butler Drive
VPC Recommendation	Approved as filed
VPC Vote	14-0

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

Four virtual speaker cards were received, with two in support, with two in opposition, and all wishing to speak.

At this time Jaramillo and Barraza arrived bringing the quorum to 14 members.

STAFF BACKGROUND PRESENTATION

Klimek, staff, explained that Items 5 and 6 on the agenda both pertain to the eastern half of the former El Caro Golf Course near the northwest corner of 19th Avenue and Northern Avenue and that both items contain similar requests; therefore, the items can

be heard together but that each item will require independent actions. In 2008 / 2009, the former El Caro Golf Course was granted zoning entitlement to redevelop with elements of housing and commercial subject to a series of stipulations. Since that time, the original stipulations have been modified five times in response to different proposals and site configurations with the most recent being K. Hovnanian; Items 5 and 6 on this agenda reflect two additional requests to modify the original zoning stipulations.

The sites are within ¼ to ½ mile from the light rail station at 19th Avenue and Northern Avenue and broadly adhere to the original site plan; however, that the proposals still require adjustments and reviews to be fully in compliance with the zoning stipulations. The applicant is required to share building elevations with the Planning Hearing Officer and they are proposing to amend the stipulation to clarify the intent of the original stipulation. The applicant is required to develop the site in general conformance to original site plans and to adhere to conditions pertaining to density and tree preservation; the applicant is seeking to modify the stipulations for general conformance to their new site plan, to revise the tree preservation plan, and to increase the permitted density to meet their proposal.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Labonte, of Trillium Residential, provided an overview of their experience which includes more than 30 years in land development and the production of approximately 10,000 homes. He then provided an overview of their interest in the area which they view as a diamond in the rough with approximately 422,000 residents and 90,000 jobs with many in healthcare and insurance and with a proven demand for middle-high market housing through the Royal Palm neighborhood.

The proposal for the site is to bring their “Real Lifestyle” housing community to 19North. The model is for a highly amenitized neighborhood of single-family rental homes, in duplex configurations, centered around a clubhouse, chef’s kitchen, and hosting co-working spaces; this model provides an exceptional experience for tenants and has led to high rates of tenant retention. The community will cater to residents in the \$120,000 to \$150,000 annual incomes and that the additional of high-quality, high-income housing will bring sophisticated restaurants and retail to the area.

The proposal includes a wide landscape buffer to provide separation from the El Caro Villas and this space is further amenitized by a linear park that will be shared with the K. Hovnanian residents and the El Caro Villas. The structures will be energy efficient, modern in its treatment of architecture and the creation of its public spaces which will include shade and seating areas to create welcoming shared spaces.

Losch, of Trillium Residential, explained that they love the area and are investing heavily to help the community achieve its vision. He then highlighted two recent examples. Z-8-20 was recently approved by the City Council and the construction fences just went up for their adaptive reuse of the former Cabrillo office complex which will be transformed into 62 high-end rental homes with likelihood for an additional 24

homes; adjacent to the K. Hovnanian development on the former El Caro Golf Course, Trillium is committed to this area. Additionally, the Trillium offices are being moved to 1717 W. Northern Avenue to be closer to the 19North District. The first example of the “Real Lifestyle” community was called Venue and Edge at Greyhawk and it began as rental but then long-term residents began inquiring about how they could buy their units so the community shifted to a mix of renters and owners.

COMMITTEE QUESTIONS

Jaramillo noted that all referenced to price seem to suggest that everything proposed is high-income housing. Nothing the low incomes in the area, he asked if there will be any affordable housing provided on the site.

- **Losch** responded that there are 200,000 residents within a five-mile radius and that compared to the 65K annual income city-wide, residents in the area are closer to 41K annually and much of this can be attributed to older housing stock. The proposal will bring additional housing options that cater to healthcare and financial workers. Throughout their public outreach in the areas, multiple major employers such as BlueCross BlueShield and Abrazo noted that their employees do not have a good place to live in the area and that they are supportive of this project.

Jaramillo asked if the site plan creates any type of barrier that will keep area residents from easy access to the light rail. **Labonte** responded that the proposal will not create any physical barriers to prevent access toward light rail.

Jaramillo expressed concern regarding the addition of high-market rate housing in such close proximity to the light rail which is transportation infrastructure with the greatest benefit to low-to-moderate income populations. **Losch** responded that there are few opportunities for “renters by choice” and this project will bring a proven product to the 19North District and residents seeking an active and potentially transit-oriented lifestyle.

PUBLIC COMMENTS

Nelson introduced himself as a member of the 19North Board, as a resident of the area, and as a business owner in the area. He stated that this is exactly the type of development the area needs and that the plans look great. Housing is a problem in the area and throughout the city and therefore, the more the better. The proposal will improve the area by making it safer and more welcoming.

Colino introduced herself as representing 4-5 neighborhood leaders who are all in support. She stated that she had lived in the area for more than 50 years and while the area was once a potpourri of different people it had become blighted through the in-migration of homelessness and crime. She stated that this proposal will bring positive change, that she likes the design, and hopes that the project is gated.

Lerner introduced himself as the President of the El Caro Villas HOA. He stated that the original proposal was going to be assisted living. The board has developed a good relationship with K. Hovnanian and hopes for a good relationship with this development; he expressed concern over the development being a rental community without on-site management because it may inhibit the ability of the three developments to quickly resolve issues that arise such as maintenance of shared spaces. He expressed concern that the streets leading toward 19th Avenue are already congested. He also expressed concern over the density proposed and the potential for headlight pollution. He alluded to a recorded agreement between the previous owners and the El Caro Villas HOA that the development would not be rental housing. He expressed further concern about the design of the building and stated that he would prefer greater design continuity across the three developments.

Brown had submitted a virtual speaker card in opposition but was not present to speak.

APPLICANT RESPONSE

Labonte thanked the individuals who made public comments and responded that they are confident that they can overcome the issues raised by Mr. Lerner and noted they have actively been collaborating with the El Caro Villas HOA with two virtual meetings scheduled. Regarding the agreement regarding rental housing, he explained that this was a private agreement and that the content of the agreement focuses more on the form of the buildings than whether it is owner or renter.

Losch stated that the development team had been in touch with Mr. Lerner and are already confident the concern regarding headlights has already been resolved. Also, the presence of two full accesses, onto Butler and Northern, will ensure that no vehicle congestion occurs.

FLOOR/PUBLIC DISCUSSION CLOSED

McBride stated that she is a resident and renter in 19North and that she believes this is everything the area wants and needs. There have been five new affordable housing developments and the community was supportive of those also. This proposal brings housing diversity and responds to a need expressed by some of the district, and regions, largest employers – Abrazo and BlueCross BlueShield. Trillium has taken the time to collaborate with the community and will be a good neighbor.

Matthews stated that he is supportive of housing near light rail and that Shannon McBride's opinion carries a lot of weight in his view.

Jaramillo noted that there is a large population of low and extremely low income households and stated that it is inaccurate to attribute this exclusively to older housing stock. He asked the applicant to be more thoughtful about their approach and language pertaining to affordable housing.

Alauria stated that it is a great project and that community leaders are supportive.

MOTION:

Matthews motioned to approve the case as requested by the applicant. **Whitney** seconded the motion.

VOTE: 14-0-0, motion passes with Jaramillo, Magallanez, Argiro, Alauria, Viedmark, Barraza, O'Connor, Whitney, Wiedoff, O'Hara, McBride, Matthews, Krentz, and Carrell, in favor, none in abstention, and none in dissent.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:

None.