



Design Group, LLC

Architecture - Historic Preservation - Planning - Landscape Design

April 6, 2020

Michelle Dodds

Preservation Officer

City of Phoenix, Planning and Development/Historic Preservation

200 W. Washington St.

Phoenix, AZ 85003

RE: Historic Temple Beth Israel, Preservation Grant Project 2007
Permission to Alter under Preservation and Conservation Easement

Dear Ms. Dodds:

I am writing on behalf of the Arizona Jewish Historical Society (AZJHS) regarding the potential demolition of an addition made in 1957 and of a non-contributing house that lies within the area covered by the above referenced conservation easement.

The AZJHS is in the planning stages of a major expansion project that would replace the 1957 rear building addition with approximately 16,000 square feet of new museum space for the "Center for Hope, Humanity, and Holocaust Education." The 1957 addition was evaluated and is not suitable for the envisioned museum. Further, initial studies of site planning options indicate that the house located to the east of the main building, fronting on Second Street, is a serious impediment to effective and efficient use of the site, and difficult to incorporate into the new museum plans without serious compromise to its function. As a result, the AZJHS would like to know whether the demolition of the house and 1957 addition is permissible by the City of Phoenix in light of the easement it holds.

The Arizona State Historic Preservation Office, through the Arizona State Parks Board, holds a similar conservation easement due to a Heritage Fund grant being awarded to the project in 2007. The following justification for allowing demolition of was provided to them, and they have agreed that the demolition of the house and addition will be permissible under their easement. We attach a copy of their approval for your information.

The Temple Beth Israel property as a whole was nominated to the National Register (NR) in 2010. As a religious building, to satisfy NR Criteria Consideration A, the Temple was nominated under NR Criterion C as an excellent local example of Mission and Romanesque Revival architecture, and representing the works of the noted architects Lescher, Kibbey, & Mahoney. The Period of Significance was identified as being 1921-1926, the span of time that includes the construction of the initial building and the first addition.

The 1957 addition falls outside of the Period of Significance, but was counted as a part of the contributing synagogue and classroom building because it is attached. We are of the opinion that its removal would not affect the integrity of the Temple nor its eligibility. The house in question is a Bungalow style single family dwelling constructed in the 1920s. The house was noted in the nomination to be a non-contributing element within the property. While old, it is not related to the significance of the Temple. We likewise believe that its removal would not be detrimental to the integrity of the Temple.

The City of Phoenix designated the property in 2006 as the "Temple Beth Israel / First Chinese Baptist Church." (The City listing actually predates the National Register listing.) While I could not find a copy of the City's staff report, I assume from the property name that the City also recognizes the Chinese Baptist Church period of ownership to be significant. The Chinese Baptist Church acquired the property in 1949, constructing the rear addition and making major alterations to the interior, in 1957. The interior alterations were reversed in the 2007-9 Temple rehabilitation project. The rear addition would have been demolished and replaced at that time, but for a budget shortfall. The addition replacement had received a Certificate of Appropriateness at that time (HP-97-07-7) that included demolition of the addition. We trust that this position will continue.

The Bungalow House was purchased and added to the property in 1975, and is not related historically to either the Temple Beth Israel or the Chinese Baptist Church. For these reasons, as well as those provided to the SHPO, we request that demolition be allowed.

In order to facilitate our planning for the new museum expansion, we are requesting a determination on the part of the City as to whether the removal of the 1957 addition, and of the 1920s era Bungalow, would be allowable under the Conservation Easement.

Thank you for your consideration of this request.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'R. Graham', with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Robert Graham, AIA
Motley Design Group. LLC
Architects

on behalf of
The Arizona Jewish Historical Society



Doug Ducey
Governor

ARIZONA STATE PARKS & TRAILS

Robert Broscheid
Executive Director



April 6, 2020

Mr. Robert Graham, AIA
Motley Design Group, LLC, Architects
Phoenix, Arizona

RE: Historic Temple Beth Israel, Arizona State Parks Heritage Grant Project 640621
Permission to Alter under Preservation and Conservation Easement dated 6/7/07

Dear Mr. Graham,

We have reviewed your letter of request to remove the 1957 addition to the National Register-listed Temple Beth Israel, located at 122 E. Culver Street, Phoenix, Arizona; and the 1920s era Bungalow on the property.

In consideration of the requirements of the Conservation Easement (see attachment, Conservation Easement, dated 6/27/07), we have completed a Finding of Effect for the proposed action, and submitted our recommendation to the Director of Arizona State Parks and Trails for approval (as Proxy for the State Parks Board).

The SHPO recommendation to the Director of State Parks was a Finding of “no adverse effect” to the Temple Beth Israel property for the removal of the 1957 addition and the 1920s house. The addition has no architectural significance, and was constructed outside the Period of Significance (1921-1936); and the house is a non-contributor to the property in the National Register listing. The Director of State Parks, Robert Broscheid, concurred with the SHPO finding and provided a written consent per the Conservation Easement stipulation (see attachment, copy of email message, dated April 3, 2020).

We thank you for consulting with our office in conjunction with your planning for a potential future addition to the Temple Beth Israel.

Best regards,

Patricia Dahlen, Architect
Arizona State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO)

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Bob Broscheid** <rbroscheid@azstateparks.gov>

Date: Fri, Apr 3, 2020 at 10:13 AM

Subject: Re: Formal Letter Re: Temple Beth Israel

To: Kathryn Leonard <kleonard@azstateparks.gov>

Kathryn-

I have reviewed the letter, dated April 2, 2020, from Motley Design Group requesting a review of the enclosed proposed action at the Temple Beth Israel. I understand that the Arizona Jewish Historical Society received a Heritage Fund grant which necessitated the execution of a conservation easement, and that the work they are planning would demolish some elements of the campus. I also understand that the SHPO office has reviewed the work and believe that it would have "no adverse effect" on the National Register listed property. However, Stipulation IIB of the easement requires written consent of the Parks Board for the changes.

On behalf of the State Parks Board, I concur with your recommendations and the project as described in the above-referenced project document, and provide written consent to the project as required under Stipulation IIB.

Bob Broscheid
Executive Director
Arizona State Parks and Trails