

ATTACHMENT C

REPORT OF PLANNING HEARING OFFICER ACTION
Byron Easton, Planner III, Hearing Officer
Logan Zappolo, Planner I, Assisting

May 20, 2026

ITEM NO: 6	
	DISTRICT NO. 8
SUBJECT:	
Application #:	PHO-1-26--Z-45-22-8
Location:	Southeast corner of 59th Avenue and Dobbins Road
Zoning:	C-2 HGT/WVR DNS/WVR
Acreage:	39.73
Request:	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Modification of Stipulation 1 regarding general conformance to the site plan and elevations.2) Modification of Stipulation 2 regarding the Town Square site plan and amenity features.3) Modification of Stipulation 20 regarding the minimum open space required for Lot 1.4) Modification of Stipulation 23 regarding the depicted site plan.5) Modification of Stipulation 25 regarding the maximum number of units for Lot 2.6) Modification of Stipulation 26 regarding the minimum open space required for Lot 2.7) Deletion of Stipulation 28 regarding district standards.8) Deletion of Stipulation 29 regarding the maximum number of units for Lot 3.9) Deletion of Stipulation 30 regarding the minimum open space required for Lot 3.10) Deletion of Stipulation 31 regarding required bicycle parking.
Applicant:	Wendy Riddell, Berry Riddell, LLC
Owner:	Larry Miller, Matrix at Dobbins LLC
Representative:	Wendy Riddell, Berry Riddell, LLC

ACTIONS:

Planning Hearing Officer Recommendation: The Planning Hearing Officer recommended approval with modifications.

Village Planning Committee (VPC) Recommendation: The Laveen Village Planning Committee heard the request on May 11, 2026 and recommended approval by a vote of 10-0.

DISCUSSION:

Wendy Riddell, representative of Berry Riddell LLC, presented the roughly 36-acre subject site located at the southeast corner of 59th Avenue and Dobbins Road. She overviewed the stipulated site plan from 2022, highlighting 14 acres of commercial, just over 8 acres of multifamily with 214 units, and 17 acres of horizontal multifamily with 181 units. Ms. Riddell explained the proposed site plan has eliminated the horizontal multifamily and added 7 acres of commercial uses including restaurants and retail. She noted the multifamily portion of the site will include a total of 360 units. She added the increase of commercial, reduction of units, and the intent to build to rent were well received by the Laveen Village Planning Committee. Ms. Riddell presented the proposed access points highlighting three along 59th Avenue, two along Dobbins Road and one access point on 57th Avenue for the multifamily and one possible future access point along 57th Avenue to service the commercial. She overviewed the request to modify Stipulation 1 to reflect the new site plan and elevations for the multifamily development. She explained the modification to Stipulation 2 is to update the date stamp on the site plan, to remove the reference to Lot 3 which no longer exists and to include the pickleball courts instead of an interactive water feature.

Mr. Easton asked if the open space would be open to the public or only to the residents within the multifamily.

Ms. Riddell replied that the open space is primarily for the residents within the multifamily development. She explained the open space modification is to reduce the minimum of 28 percent to 15 percent because of the increase of commercial development. She presented the proposed elevations highlighting modern farmhouse style architecture including varying roof lines, brick, stone, concrete veneer, and an aluminum storefront. She explained during the Village Planning Committee Meeting the committee members explained they are getting away from general conformance to elevations for retail shopping centers as this creates a limitation to getting commercial tenants in. Ms. Riddell added the multifamily development is significantly set back from 59th Avenue and Dobbins Road and stated all buildings within 150 feet of the east property line will be limited to two-stories in height. She presented renderings of the proposed amenities, elevations and materials. Ms. Riddell added the Laveen Village Planning Committee recommended unanimous approval of the request at their meeting on 5/11/2026.

Mr. Easton asked if the Village was against general conformance stipulations to both the site plan and the elevations.

Ms. Riddell explained there is a general conformance stipulation to the multifamily elevations and another stipulation that calls out the commercial elevations, but not general conformance to the commercial elevations. She noted

her staff has corrected her and stated the open space will be accessible to the commercial users through key access.

Mr. Easton reviewed the updated elevations including pitched roof elements. He asked if the applicant knew that increasing the commercial development would alter the Traffic Impact Analysis.

Ms. Sawyer stated she is aware and has already begun conversations with the Traffic Department.

Mr. Easton stated the Laveen Village Planning Committee Heard the case at their May 11, 2026 meeting and recommended approval of the request by vote of 10-0. Mr. Easton recommended approval of the requests with modifications.

FINDINGS:

- 1) The request to modify Stipulation 1 regarding general conformance to a site plan and elevations is recommended for approval with a modification to provide more standard conformance language. The original rezoning case established a mixed-use development consisting of commercial and residential lots, three distinct areas in total. Lot 1 was intended for commercial development, Lot 2 was intended to develop as traditional multifamily residential, and Lot 3 was intended to develop as a horizontal multifamily residential product. The applicant is now proposing to eliminate the horizontal multifamily (Lot 3) element, consolidating the site into a two-lot configuration, consisting of commercial (Lot 1) and traditional multifamily residential (Lot 2).

The stipulated site plan for this area depicted approximately 30,500 square feet of commercial buildings on roughly 8.5 acres of land located at the northwest corner of the site. The stipulated plan shows the traditional multifamily (Lot 2) situated at the northeast corner of the site and consisting of approximately 288,000 square feet with a maximum height of 33 feet. The plan shows Lot 3 covering the remainder of the site. The horizontal multifamily product covers the remaining 244,462 square feet of the site and does not exceed a height of 20 feet.

The proposed conceptual site plan depicts the commercial area (Lot 1) expanding from approximately 8.5 acres to approximately 24.5 acres. Due to the increase in commercial acreage, the ratio of open space to building and parking has decreased, requiring a reduction in the percentage of open space required. However, a centralized open space area between the commercial and residential site is still provided to create a focal point for the site. The multifamily proposed for Lot 2 will accommodate a maximum of three hundred sixty (360) dwelling units, designed to provide efficient building configurations that balance density

with open space and internal amenities. Although Lot 2 expands from 214 to 360 units, the project's total multifamily count decreases from the currently permitted 395 units. This reduction optimizes the site layout and aligns with current housing demand while maintaining compliance with R-3A zoning standards. Due to the increase of density of Lot 2, the ratio of open space and to building and parking has increased, permitting an increase to the percentage of open space required. To respect the single-family neighborhood across 57th Avenue, the proposed development features a deliberate height transition. All buildings within a minimum 150-foot setback from the 57th Avenue frontage are strictly limited to two stories.

No building elevations were stipulated for the proposed commercial or residential uses in the original case. The proposed conceptual elevations depict a unified architectural vision that harmonizes the site's commercial and multi-family components through a modern farmhouse design language. By utilizing a complementary palette of materials and structural forms, the development enhances local community character while establishing an integrated mixed-use destination. Final architectural execution and material specifications will be refined and approved during subsequent City design review.

The proposal is compatible with its location near the intersection of two arterial streets. The proposed density and height are below the maximum permitted by the current zoning and consistent with the original approval. The recommendation for general conformance will control for deviation from the proposed plans.

- 2) The request to modify Stipulation 2 regarding the Town Square site plan and amenity features is recommended to be approved to modify the stipulation to include the most recent date stamp reference. The modification will also remove references to Lot 3 and revise the listed amenities to reflect the current development plan, including the addition of pickleball courts. No changes to the overall intent of the stipulation are proposed.
- 3) The request to modify Stipulation 20 regarding the minimum open space required for Lot 1 is recommended to be approved. This modification requests a reduction in the required open space percentage to accommodate Lot 1's expanded commercial footprint. Because the larger commercial area increases building and parking coverage, the site's overall open space ratio is reduced. However, a functional central open space is maintained between Lot 1 and Lot 2, which will be enhanced by the addition of pickleball courts.

- 4) The request to modify Stipulation 23 regarding the depicted site plan is recommended to be approved. This modification is necessary to show conformance with the updated site plan.
- 5) The request to modify Stipulation 25 regarding the maximum number of units for Lot 2 is recommended to be approved. This modification requests an increase in the maximum allowable dwelling units for Lot 2 to reflect the updated site plan and development program. Although Lot 2's specific unit count increases, the overall multi-family count for the entire development decreases by 35 units compared to what is currently permitted.
- 6) The request to modify Stipulation 26 regarding the minimum open space required for Lot 2 is recommended to be approved. The applicant is formally requesting a modification to increase the minimum required open space percentage across the project area. This adjustment directly reflects the configurations of the revised site plan, which establishes an expanded and enhanced multi-family development envelope on Lot 2. This change ensures a higher-quality residential environment with ample green space and recreational areas for future residents.
- 7) The request to delete the entire section of the existing stipulations pertaining to Lot 3 is recommended to be approved. The applicant requests the removal of Stipulations 28, 29, 30, and 31. These specific stipulations are now obsolete due to a major structural refinement in the master plan: the complete elimination of Lot 3, which was previously designated for a horizontal multi-family product type.

STIPULATIONS:

1.	The development shall be in general conformance with the site plan date stamped APRIL 2, 2026 August 8, 2022 and elevations date stamped MAY 11, 2026 July 8, 2022 , as modified by the following stipulations and approved by the Planning and Development Department.
2.	Improvements for the Town Square, as identified on the site plan date stamped APRIL 2, 2026 August 8, 2022 , shall be completed prior to the issuance of any certificate of occupancy for the last phase of residential development (Lot 2 or Lot 3). Improvements shall include all streets and parking around the Town Square, all common landscape, walkway landscape furniture and common area features, and a minimum of three amenities (which may include, but is not limited to open seating, PICKLEBALL COURTS interactive water feature , and kids playground with shade structure), but excluding the two commercial buildings and their supporting features such as leased outdoor dining areas and their hardscape and landscape features, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.

3.	The primary entryway to Dobbins Road shall include a minimum of 250 square feet of enhanced landscaping, planted and maintained with a variety of at least three plant materials including a series of annuals that will each maintain a constant bloom throughout the year.
4.	A minimum of one milkweed shrub, or other native nectar species, shall be planted for every required tree in addition to the required shrubs, and shall be planted in groups of three or more, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
5.	The developer shall dedicate a 30-foot-wide multi-use trail easement (MUTE) along the east side of 59th Avenue and construct a minimum 10-foot-wide multi-use trail (MUT) within the easement in accordance with the MAG supplemental detail and as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where conflicts or restrictions exist, the developer shall work with the Site Planning section on an alternate design through the technical appeal process.
6.	The Developer should construct a minimum five-foot-wide sidewalk, a minimum five-foot-wide multi-use trail and a minimum 11-foot-wide landscape area located between the back of the curb and the sidewalk along the south side of Dobbins Road, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
a.	Minimum 3-inch caliper shade trees placed a minimum of 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings.
b.	Drought tolerant shrubs and vegetative groundcovers with a maximum mature height of 24 inches to provide a minimum of 75% live coverage at maturity.
c.	Where utility conflicts arise, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on an alternative design solution consistent with a pedestrian environment.
7.	The developer shall construct a minimum 5-foot-wide detached sidewalk along the west side of 57th Avenue with a minimum 5-foot-wide landscaped strip located between the sidewalk and back of curb and planted to the following standards, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
a.	Minimum 2-inch caliper shade trees placed a minimum of 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings.
b.	Drought tolerant shrubs and vegetative groundcovers with a

		maximum mature height of 24 inches to provide a minimum of 50% live coverage at maturity.
	c.	Where utility conflicts arise, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on an alternative design solution consistent with a pedestrian environment.
8.		The developer shall construct a minimum 5-foot-wide detached sidewalk along the east side of 59th Avenue with a minimum 11-foot-wide landscaped strip located between the sidewalk and back of curb and planted to the following standards, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
	a.	Minimum 3-inch caliper shade trees placed a minimum of 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings.
	b.	Drought tolerant shrubs and vegetative groundcovers with a maximum mature height of 24 inches to provide a minimum of 75% live coverage at maturity.
	c.	Where utility conflicts arise, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on an alternative design solution consistent with a pedestrian environment.
9.		The developer shall dedicate a minimum of 55-feet of right-of-way and construct the south side of Dobbins Road, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
10.		The developer shall dedicate a minimum of 30-feet of right-of-way and construct the west side of 57th Avenue connecting at the 56th Glen alignment, as approved by the Street Transportation Department.
11.		The developer shall dedicate a minimum of 55-feet of right-of-way and construct the east side of 59th Avenue, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
12.		The developer shall submit a Traffic Impact Study to the City for this development. No preliminary approval of plans shall be granted until the study is approved. Signal warrant analysis shall be included for 59th Avenue and Dobbins as part of the Study. The developer shall be required to provide a minimum 25% contribution towards future traffic signal if not warranted for construction by the TIA.
13.		Existing irrigation along Dobbins Road are to be undergrounded and relocated outside City of Phoenix right-of-way. Contact SRP to identify existing land rights and establish appropriate process to relocate facility.

	Relocations that require additional dedications or land transfer require completion prior to obtaining plat and/or civil plan review approval.
14.	The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping, and other incidentals, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
15.	The right-of-way shall be dedicated, and a bus stop pad (City of Phoenix Standard Details P1258 and P1260) constructed along eastbound Dobbins Road, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
16.	The right-of-way shall be dedicated, and a bus stop pad (City of Phoenix Standard Details P1258 and P1260) constructed along northbound 59th Avenue, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
17.	In the event archaeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33-foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archaeologist, and allow time for the Archaeology Office to properly assess the materials.
18.	Prior to preliminary site plan approval, the landowner shall execute a Proposition 207 waiver of claims form. The waiver shall be recorded with the Maricopa County Recorder's Office and delivered to the City to be included in the rezoning application file for record.
LOT 1 (TOWN CENTER AND RETAIL PLAZA)	
19.	The maximum building height shall be 30 feet.
20.	A minimum of 15% 28% of the gross area of Lot 1 shall be retained as open space, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
21.	All uncovered surface parking lot areas for employees and customers shall be landscaped with minimum 2-inch caliper size large canopy drought tolerant shade trees. Landscaping shall be dispersed throughout the parking area and achieve minimum 25% shade at maturity, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
22.	A minimum of 14 bicycle parking spaces shall be provided through Inverted U and/or artistic racks located near building entrances and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H. of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Artistic racks shall adhere to the City of Phoenix Preferred Designs in Appendix K of the Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan.

23.	Any future Planning Hearing Officer applications for Lot 1, as depicted on the site plan date stamped APRIL 2, 2026 August 8, 2022 , shall go to the Village Planning Committee for recommendation, and include enhanced notification to require notification of all property owners within 600 feet of the subject site and all neighborhood organizations registered with the City within one mile of the subject site.
LOT 2 (MULTIFAMILY APARTMENTS)	
24.	The development shall adhere to the R-3A zoning district standards, as modified by the following stipulations, and approved by the Planning and Development Department.
25.	Lot 2 shall be limited to a maximum of 360 214 units.
26.	A minimum of 20% 10% of the gross area of Lot 2 shall be retained as open space, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
27.	A minimum of 10 bicycle parking spaces shall be provided through Inverted U and/or artistic racks located near building entrances, amenities, and/or open space and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H. of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Artistic racks shall adhere to the City of Phoenix Preferred Designs in Appendix K of the Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan.
LOT 3 (HORIZONTAL MULTIFAMILY)	
28.	The development shall adhere to the R-3 zoning district standards, as modified by the following stipulations, and approved by the Planning and Development Department.
29.	Lot 3 shall be limited to a maximum of 181 units.
30.	A minimum of 11% of the gross area of Lot 3 shall be retained as open space, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
31.	A minimum of 10 bicycle parking spaces shall be provided through Inverted U and/or artistic racks located near building entrances, amenities, and/or open space and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H. of the Phoenix Zoning Ordinance, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Artistic racks shall adhere to the City of Phoenix Preferred Designs in Appendix K of the Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan.

Upon request, this publication will be made available within a reasonable length of time through appropriate auxiliary aids or services to accommodate an individual with a disability. This publication may be made available through the following auxiliary aids or services: large print, Braille, audiotape or computer diskette. To request a reasonable accommodation, please contact Saneeya Mir at saneeya.mir@phoenix.gov or (602) 686-6461 or TTY: 7-1-1.