

Attachment B

Planning Hearing Officer Summary of October 16, 2019
Application Z-SP-11-17-4
Page 1

REPORT OF PLANNING HEARING OFFICER ACTION

Adam Stranieri, Planner III, Hearing Officer
Julianna Pierre, Planner I, Assisting

October 16, 2019

ITEM 2

DISTRICT 4

SUBJECT:

Application #: Z-SP-11-17-4 (PHO-1-19)
Zoning: C-2 HGT/WVR SP
Location: Southwest corner of Black Canyon Highway and Mariposa Street
Acreage: 2.91
Request: 1) Modification of Stipulation No. 1 regarding general conformance to the elevations date stamped August 18, 2017.
Applicant: Benjamin Tate, Withey Morris
Owner: Black Canyon Self-Storage, LLC
Representative: Benjamin Tate, Withey Morris

ACTIONS

Planning Hearing Officer Recommendation: The Planning Hearing Officer recommended approval with an additional stipulation.

Village Planning Committee (VPC) Recommendation: The Alhambra Village Planning Committee chose not to hear this case.

DISCUSSION

Benjamin Tate, applicant and representative with Withey Morris, stated that Rezoning Case No. Z-SP-11-17-4 was approved in early 2018. He stated that the original proposal was for adaptive reuse of three buildings at the southwest corner of Black Canyon Highway and Mariposa Street for self-storage. He stated that the buildings north of Pierson Street are 4 stories and 49 feet and the building south of Pierson Street is 3 stories and 36 feet. He stated that the three existing buildings are on about three acres of land and were built in the 1970s. He stated that the area was rezoned from a mixture of zoning districts to C-2 HWT/WVR SP (Intermediate Commercial, Height Waiver, Special Permit for self-storage and all underlying C-2 uses). He stated that bringing the buildings into conformance with building and fire codes became cost prohibitive. He stated that his client determined that demolishing the existing buildings and replacing them with a new 36-foot 3 story building on the properties north of Pierson Street was financially feasible.

Mr. Tate stated that the new proposal would be less impactful on the surrounding area, specifically noting the loading area being internal to the building. Adam Stranieri asked if the white space on the elevations indicated the loading area. Mr. Tate stated that was

correct. He stated that this placement would reduce the noise and impact associated with unloading and eliminate a driveway along Black Canyon Highway. Mr. Stranieri asked how many vehicle spaces would be in the loading area. Mike Kucera, owner with Black Canyon Self Storage, stated that a building of this size would have 4 or 5 spaces. Mr. Tate stated that the building south of Pierson Street would also be demolished. He stated that despite police action, the properties have become an attractive nuisance, noting homeless encampments within the building and vandalism. Mr. Stranieri asked if all three buildings will be demolished at once. Mr. Tate stated that they would be, but he did not have a specific date for demolition. Mr. Kucera clarified that they hoped to begin demolition in early 2020.

Mr. Stranieri noted that the Alhambra Village Planning Committee (VPC) did not hear the request. Mr. Tate clarified that he did present the case as an information only item at the August 27, 2019 VPC meeting. Mr. Stranieri asked if there were any members of the public in attendance related to his case. Mr. Tate stated that there were not.

Mr. Stranieri stated that the elevations were very similar to the elevations stipulated in the original rezoning case, specifically noting the color scheme, types of materials, and overall aesthetic. He stated that the new elevations had positive enhancements over the stipulated elevations, noting the wraparound windows, brick façade towards the ground floor, and variations in the roofline. He stated that he was inclined to recommend approval of the request because the elevations captured the original intent of the case, but were also an improvement upon what was originally stipulated.

Mr. Stranieri stated that Rezoning Case No. Z-54-17, the companion case to Z-SP-11-17, approved the HGT/WVR on the site. He stated that the HGT/WVR allowed for 50 feet and the reduced height of the new elevations brought another positive element to the site.

Mr. Stranieri stated that he was concerned that the applicant's elevations only displayed the proposed building north of Pierson Street, when the elevations stipulated in Z-SP-11-17 displayed the proposed buildings both north and south of Pierson Street. He stated that the request to modify Stipulation 1 would remove the requirement for new development south of Pierson Street to be consistent in character or design. Mr. Tate suggested that any new proposed development could come back to the PHO. Mr. Stranieri stated that he felt an administrative review for consistency in character and design for new development south of Pierson Street would be adequate given that the elevations were very consistent and improved upon the original stipulated elevations and no public concerns were raised. Further, he noted that if a future developer could not comply with this requirement, they would require a PHO action to modify the stipulation regardless. He recommended that an additional stipulation be added requiring all buildings to be developed with a consistent design theme and character. Mr. Tate agreed with that recommendation.

FINDINGS

- 1) The original stipulated elevations in Z-SP-11-17 were intended to accommodate the adaptive reuse of three existing buildings on the site. The two northernmost

buildings were four stories and 49 feet in height. The southern building was 3 stories and 35 feet in height. The companion zoning case Z-54-17 applied a height waiver permitting up to 4 stories and 50 feet, consistent with the existing buildings. The buildings were developed under earlier versions of the C-O and C-1 zoning districts which permitted these building heights.

- 2) The applicant has indicated that the proposed adaptive reuse was determined to be too costly and they now propose a single building with a maximum building height of three stories and 36 feet in height. The applicant has obtained conditional approval for the abandonment of the existing alley located between Mariposa Street and Pierson Street. The new proposed building will span the subject property in the area between these streets.
- 3) The reduction in building height will further mitigate the impact of the development on existing single-family homes to the west. Additionally, the proposal to develop a single building on this portion of the site will allow the elimination of two driveways along the I-17 Freeway frontage road between Mariposa Street and Pierson Street.
- 4) The proposed elevations are similar to the stipulated elevations in colors, materials, architectural features, and general design theme. However, the proposed elevations also include enhancements including greater variation in the roofline, greater material diversity, introduction of brick elements along the ground floors, and an enhanced use of glazing with wrap-around window elements on the north and south elevations.
- 5) An additional stipulation is recommended to require consistency in design theme and character for all buildings on the subject property. The original stipulated elevations depicted buildings both north and south of Pierson Street. The proposed conceptual elevations only address the area north of Pierson Street. If the southern portion develops as an extension of the self-storage use, the buildings should be consistent. If an alternative use is proposed that is dissimilar, the future applicant may choose to modify this stipulation through the PHO process which would allow public input and discussion.

DECISION: The Planning Hearing Officer recommended approval with an additional stipulation.

STIPULATIONS

1.	The development shall be in general conformance with the elevations date stamped SEPTEMBER 5, 2019 August 17, 2017 with specific regard to the proposed stucco and paint finishes, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
2.	ALL BUILDINGS SHALL BE DEVELOPED WITH A CONSISTENT DESIGN THEME AND CHARACTER, AS APPROVED BY THE PLANNING AND

	DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT.
3. 2.	A minimum 12-foot landscape setback with minimum 2-inch caliper trees shall be placed 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings along the west property line between Mariposa Street and Pierson Street, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
4. 3.	A minimum of one inverted-U bicycle rack for employees shall be provided on site, located near an entrance to the office, and installed per the requirements of Section 1307.H.4 of the Zoning Ordinance, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.

Upon request, this publication will be made available within a reasonable length of time through appropriate auxiliary aids or services to accommodate an individual with a disability. This publication may be made available through the following auxiliary aids or services: large print, Braille, audiotape or computer diskette. Please contact the Planning and Development Department, Tamra Ingersoll at voice number 602-534-6648 or TTY use 7-1-1.