



## Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary

### Z-41-18-4

<b>Date of VPC Meeting</b>	September 10, 2018
<b>Request From</b>	P-1 (Passenger Automobile Parking, Limited) (2.94 acres)
<b>Request To</b>	R-5 H-R (Multifamily Residence District, High-Rise and High-Density District) (2.94 acres)
<b>Proposed Use</b>	Multifamily High-Rise Residential Development
<b>Location</b>	Northeast corner of 7th Street and Thomas Road
<b>VPC Recommendation</b>	Denial
<b>VPC Vote</b>	13-2 (Paul Benjamin and Brent Kleinman nays, Ryan Harper recused)

### **VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDATION**

Hannah Bleam, staff, provided an overview of the request to R-5 H-R and noted that staff is recommending denial of the request as filed, but is recommending approval of R-5 with stipulations. She also noted that if the request was approved for R-5 H-R then an additional height regulating stipulation is recommended. Staff highlighted that the location is inappropriate for the height and intensity that is proposed for the following reasons:

- The location is outside of the Midtown TOD District.
- Site outside of the Central Avenue light rail corridor where the high-rise developments exists and are encouraged.
- The proposal is not consistent with the TOD Strategic Framework which notes that greater heights and intensities are encouraged along the light rail with less intense development moving further away from the light rail corridor.

With the future bus rapid transit (BRT) route proposed on Thomas Road, additional intensification beyond P-1 is appropriate. Therefore, staff is recommending approval of R-5 which would allow a height up to 4 stories or 48 feet and a maximum density of 52.20 dwelling units per acre. There were also 18 stipulations that were presented, which are outlined in the staff report. Many of these stipulations recommend measures of the development in order to engage with the sidewalk and street to avoid isolating the development within the Country Club.

The applicant's representative, Larry Lazarus, presented on their request. He noted that the proposal is for 125 luxury condominiums with a height of 164 feet. The development will not be owned by the Phoenix Country Club but it will be integrated

with the Country Club. Mr. Lazarus stated that this site is unique as it is within the Country Club area and directly adjacent to the Midtown TOD Policy District. He noted that development on this corner will help to encourage redevelopment within the Thomas Road/7th Street intersection and within the area.

Mr. Lazarus presented the elevations of the development and noted that the corner of 7th Street and Thomas Road will be a focal point with design features to engage the corner.



Mr. Lazarus noted that the enhanced landscaping and a 6-foot sidewalk on 7th Street and Thomas Road will provide shade and a better pedestrian experience than what currently exists. In addition, landscaping and foliage is proposed on the parking garage building that runs along 7th Street and Thomas Road, which will help soften that façade. He also noted they are using a number of Walkable Urban Code standards in the development, particularly those related to streetscape enhancements and shading.

He identified that the existing bus routes on 7th Street and Thomas Road are heavily used and the light rail is just over ½ mile away from the site, therefore this intensity of development is appropriate in the location.

Mr. Lazarus highlighted that there are a number of examples of historic districts and high-rise development existing together, such as Willo, Roosevelt and others. Portland in the Park is a development that is 175 feet in height and is near the Roosevelt Historic District. He also provided drone shot images of what one would see from the top of the building. The area around the proposed site has a number of trees and vegetation that blocks view from residences located in the area.

He also noted that the developer is not interested in building a wood frame structure and would prefer to build a high-quality high-rise structure that is on a unique site.

Chairman James opened up the floor for committee questions.

The committee had questions/comments on the following items:

- Where is the country club parking going to occur with existing parking lot gone?
- Parking ratios for the units?
- There is little relationship to the building in the street with the wall of the parking garage along 7th Street and Thomas Road.
- Will the Phoenix Country Club own the building?
- Disappointed there is no ground floor retail and no relationship to the street.
- Why did they not propose a PUD on the site?
- What sustainable construction elements will be included?
- Has the site plan changed since feedback from neighborhood meetings?
- Concerns with design of the building being shut off from the street and looking like a “fortress”.
- What is the price of the proposed condos?
- Why is there no mixed use proposed on the site?

Chairman James noted that there were 67 speaker cards in opposition and 4 in favor.

Robert Warnicke spoke in opposition of the item. He noted that the location is greater than .5 miles from Central Avenue and the light rail. Many people will not walk to the light rail with the distance. Mr. Warnicke noted a number of General Plan land use and design principles that he stated were not met with the proposed development. The corner of the project and streetscape is not walkable because the building ignores the street. He also stated the intent of the H-R District which is not met with this request. Mr. Warnicke also notes that this should not be supported only the save the golf course. In addition, this corner is identified as blighted by the applicant, but the Phoenix Country Club has maintained that parcel for years.

Tom Chauncey spoke in opposition of the item. He noted that Larry Lazarus is a respected land use attorney and this is not personal to him. However, this development is not good for Phoenix and it sets a precedent for high rises in the Country Club area which should not happen.

Katie Reifman spoke in opposition. She mentioned that she has several deep concerns and that she received information from sales people that was not factual and there were bribes with gas cards. She mentioned that the proposal would change the historic character of the Coronado neighborhood.

Bill White spoke in opposition. He noted that his home is located just north of the Country Club property and he has concerns regarding the traffic that would occur with this kind of intense development. Traffic along 7th Street and Thomas Road is very heavy and this development could make it worse. He also asked for a statistical study of the traffic.

Jeanne Yawger spoke in opposition. She presented a board that showed what the scale of the development would be compared to what is existing in the area.

Matthew Kohn spoke in opposition. He noted that they could do a lot more with that corner with architecture and design and what was proposed missed that opportunity.

Michael Curtis spoke in opposition. He lives within the Country Club and noted that there is no economic need for the Phoenix Country Club to develop this property. It is not supported by the General Plan and is spot zoning.

Jack Evans Jr. played a video showed the Country Club parking lot with cars in it.

Donna Reiner spoke in opposition. She noted there are people that walk in this area and pedestrian safety is very important.

Mary Zulli spoke in opposition. She stated that the Country Club should be incorporated into the City of Phoenix and that should be in the CC+R for the property.

Jim Shea spoke in opposition. He noted concerns regarding traffic in the area with the development.

David Zacharia spoke in opposition and noted that the Phoenix Country Club is losing parking spots with the development and he had concerns about that.

Dan Carrol spoke in opposition. He noted he was the Chair of the Midtown TOD steering committee and this development would not be appropriate in this location outside of the boundary.

Craig Lambert spoke in favor of the item. He noted he loves the height of the building in this location and would like to see more of that kind of development.

Chairman James gave the applicant time to respond to the public comments.

Larry Lazarus responded that according to the traffic study that was conducted that the traffic is an existing issue on 7th Street and Thomas Road and this development will not add much to the existing traffic patterns. Dawn Cartier, who analyzed the traffic patterns and compiled the traffic study, was introduced. She noted that the traffic patterns on 7th Street and Thomas Road are very heavy and the development will not have a major impact to the traffic patterns.

Larry Lazarus noted that this development is not being done to save the Phoenix Country Club, but is proposed because that this is a unique location for a high-quality development. In addition, he noted that there are solid neighborhoods that exist next to high-rise developments.

Chairman James opened up the floor for questions from the committee.

Celina Brun asked Ms. Cartier about the data that was used and the time of the counts, which she responded that traffic counts were used during peak traffic hours.

Nicole Rodriguez comments that there has been a lot of engagement and civil discourse on this case, which is a positive thing. She noted that even art along the façade on 7th Street and Thomas Road would not fully activate the space. In addition, she does not feel that the Country Club has been a good neighborhood to the surrounding neighborhoods.

Mr. Lazarus responded that there will be indirect retail within the area because of this residential development. In addition, he believes that to say that the Phoenix Country Club has not interacted in the community is wrong.

G.G. George commented that she has looked through the staff report and the proposal and cannot give support for even the R-5 zoning designation on this location.

**Motion:**

G.G. George made a motion to deny Z-41-18-4. Matthew Jewett seconded the motion.

Rebecca Wininger noted that she spent the afternoon and research what has been approved in the area inside and outside the TOD district and the highest that was approved is 75 feet. The development would be an eye sore in the community with a 15 story building and she will not be supporting the request.

Drew Bryck appreciates the passion from the neighbors and noted that there is little policy to support this height and intensity at this location.

**Vote:**

13-2 (Ryan Harper recused because he is a member of the Phoenix Country Club)

Roll Call:

Yays:

Abraham James  
Jake Adams  
Celina Brun  
Drew Bryck  
Ann Cothron  
Andrea del Galdo  
G.G. George  
Matthew Jewett  
Steve Procaccini  
Layla Ressler

Nicole Rodriquez  
Aaron Searles  
Rebecca Wininger

Nays:  
Paul Benjamin  
Brent Kleinman

**STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:**

None.