

# Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

## **Phoenix City Council Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning (TIP) Subcommittee Draft Summary Minutes December 17, 2025**

City Council Chambers  
200 W. Jefferson St.  
Phoenix, Arizona

### Subcommittee Members Present

Councilwoman Debra Stark, Chair  
Councilman Jim Waring  
Councilwoman Kesh Hodge Washington  
Councilman Kevin Robinson

### Subcommittee Members Absent

### **CALL TO ORDER**

Chairwoman Stark called the Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning (TIP) Subcommittee meeting to order at 10:01 a.m. with Councilmembers Kevin Robinson and Kesha Hodge Washington present. Councilman Waring joined the meeting in person at 10:02 a.m.

### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

None.

### **MINUTES OF MEETINGS**

#### **1. Minutes of the Transportation Infrastructure and Planning Subcommittee Meeting**

Councilman Robinson made a motion to approve the minutes of the November 19, 2025, Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning Subcommittee meeting. Councilman Waring seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

#### **CONSENT ACTION (ITEMS 2-5)**

Items 2-5 were for consent action. No presentations were planned, but staff were available to answer questions.

Councilman Robinson made a motion to approve consent items 2-5. Councilwoman Hodge Washington seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

#### **2. New Cargo Facility Lease Alvest Equipment Services (USA) LLC at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport**

#### **3. Executive Hangar Lease Agreement with Jackson Jet Center, LLC at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport**

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

### **4. Taxicab Services at Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport Contract – Request for Award**

### **5. Phoenix Main Line Transit Oriented Development Contract – Request for Award**

### **INFORMATION ONLY (ITEM 6)**

### **6. Freeway Program Update**

No presentations were planned, but staff were available to answer questions.

### **DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION (ITEM 7)**

### **7. Capitol Extension and 1-10 West Light Rail Project Update and Options**

Light Rail Administrator Markus Coleman, Valley Metro Chief Executive Officer Jessica Mefford-Miller, and Valley Metro Chief of Capital Development Trevor Collon presented this item.

Deputy City Manager Amber Williamson gave an overview of two Options for the light rail extension. Deputy City Manager Williamson shared that Option 1 was to adopt an updated Capitol Extension (CAPEX) locally preferred alternative route and Option 2 was to re-evaluate high-capacity transit options to serve West Phoenix.

Jessica Mefford-Miller with Valley Metro shared information on light rail ridership, development, and return on investment, and the partnership with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA).

Trevor Collon from Valley Metro gave an overview of CAPEX and 10WEST project history, including feedback gathered through community outreach regarding possible routes along 15<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue. Mr. Collon also presented detailed information regarding the CAPEX route alternatives presented for consideration: 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue North, 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue South, and 7<sup>th</sup> Ave North. He then presented an economic development analysis and shared next steps for each route option.

Jessica Mefford-Miller from Valley Metro spoke on cost considerations and construction trends in Arizona and the Phoenix Metropolitan area.

Light Rail Administrator Markus Coleman shared a financial analysis for CAPEX and 10WEST, including federal funding from the Capital Investment Grant (CIG) program. He provided an in-depth comparison between the two options presented for consideration and the steps needed to advance either option. Mr. Coleman shared Option 1 would mean moving forward with CAPEX and City Council would need to adopt a new locally preferred alternative light rail route from one of the following routes: 16<sup>th</sup> Ave. North, 16<sup>th</sup> Ave. South, or 7<sup>th</sup> Ave. North. He shared Option 2 would mean a reevaluation of other high-capacity transit alternatives with or without the CAPEX project to provide service to West Phoenix. He stated Option 2 would require updates to the

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

Transportation 2050 program, informing partners and community members of Council's direction, and would result in exiting the current federal CIG program. Mr. Coleman highlighted community engagement outreach and summarized feedback received to date. He discussed the pros and cons for Option 1 and Option 2 and concluded by requesting the Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning Subcommittee recommend to City Council to either adopt an updated CAPEX locally preferred alternative route (Option 1) or reevaluate high-capacity transit options to serve West Phoenix (Option 2).

Patti Serrano, District 7 staff member, read a statement from Councilwoman Anna Hernandez in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions, asking the subcommittee recommend to City Council moving forward with the light rail project development through the Capitol Mall area by adopting Option 1.

Chairwoman Stark stated for the record that she received a letter from State Representative David Livingston and Senator John Kavanagh stating that they stand with the Speaker of the House in opposition to the light rail extension through the Capitol Mall area. However, they indicated they would be amenable to a modification to the route that goes along Madison Avenue and 15<sup>th</sup> Ave, rather than 16<sup>th</sup> Ave.

David Bickford shared that he is neutral to either Option 1 or 2 because he believed the light rail should be extended to the Capitol but didn't believe it should go along I-10.

Jairo Gonzalez spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail expansion because of voter support and concern for the potential loss of federal funding if Option 1 was not chosen.

Suzanne Johnsen spoke in opposition to the light rail potentially going down Indian School Road due to concern for her business.

Ellen Frisby spoke in opposition to the light rail because of potential impact on her business if the light rail went down Indian School Road.

Andie Abkarian spoke in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions on behalf of Downtown Voices Coalition.

Laura Wickham spoke in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions on behalf of the Southwest Energy Efficiency Project.

Sterling Sourk PH spoke in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions.

Vanessa Y expressed concern about the light rail going along Indian School Road and was in opposition to this potential route.

Andrew Parker spoke in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions.

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

Errin Khav clarified that Indian School Road is not being formally considered currently and so therefore is not applicable to either option. Errin spoke in support of Option 1 and against Option 2 because he believed the delay would jeopardize the light rail expansion.

Jonathan Shewell spoke in support of Option 1 for the CAPEX and 10WEST light rail extensions and against Option 2 due to concern for increased project costs if the light rail extension is delayed and the possibility of jeopardizing federal funding.

Kyle Foxcroft spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail expansion.

Jared Kluge explained his understanding that the discussion was around CAPEX and I-10WEST and did not involve Indian School Road. Mr. Kluge spoke in support of Option 1 and against Option 2, however, he believed the route should have been slightly modified to go along McClintock. He also requested for trees to be planted.

Patricia Jimenez spoke in support of the light rail expansion, but in opposition of the light rail going along Indian School Road, due to lack of community engagement along Indian School Road.

Ventura Herrera clarified that Indian School Road was not a part of this agenda item and spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST extension.

Chairwoman Stark clarified that Indian School Road is not currently being formally considered and had only been discussed in other public meetings as a potential alternative to explore if needed.

Ziyad Abdulmunem spoke in opposition of the light rail extension along Indian School Road due to potential negative impacts on his business.

Michelle McCormick spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail expansion, specifically a route along 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue.

Ismail Abushanab spoke against the consideration to alter the route to go along Indian School Road.

Nicole Sanderson spoke in support of the light rail expansion westward and expressed concern about relying on future federal grants for the light rail.

Rosalba Alcaraz shared her concern that the light rail expansion may negatively impact her business if it goes along Indian School Road.

Simon Isaac spoke against the consideration of light rail going along Indian School Road in the Maryvale area due to concern for how it may impact business.

Luis Ixmata spoke in opposition to a route along Indian School Road for the light rail expansion due to potential negative impacts on businesses along Indian School Road.

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

Faustino Bustamante expressed concern for business, loss of jobs, and people moving due to light rail construction.

Chairwoman Stark further clarified that the Indian School Road route had been in discussion at some public meetings, however, it had not been officially considered yet. Chairwoman Stark asked community members to focus on the Capitol Mall area for the item in their comments.

Omar Saghir spoke against the light rail expansion going along Indian School Road due to concern for his business.

Vania Guevara spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST extension and spoke in opposition to Option 2 which she believed may jeopardize the expansion.

Abusada Saliba spoke against the light rail going along Indian School Road due to concern for businesses along this potential future route.

Kaitlyn Wright spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST expansion due to access to jobs, education, healthcare, and services that she believes the light rail would bring and expressed concern if Option 2 were selected it could delay the light rail.

Jose Hernandez spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST expansion and expressed support for public transit as it had allowed him to go to school, work, and participate in sports.

Isai Lopez spoke against a potential route along Indian School Road for the light rail due to concern for businesses and potential construction delays.

Adriana Brito spoke against the light rail going along Indian School Road due to concern for businesses and safety.

David Schwartz spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST expansion due to the support from voters for the light rail throughout its history.

Maribel Molina spoke against a potential route along Indian School Road for the light rail due to concern for her business and construction that may have a negative impact.

Norman Sharak spoke against a potential route along Indian School Road for the light rail due to concern for businesses and a potential increase in homeless individuals in the area with the addition of the light rail along Indian School Road.

Julian Zepeda spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST expansion due to its ability to meet transportation needs for disabled individuals and working-class individuals.

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

William Kubenka spoke in support of the light rail expansion and emphasized his belief in the need to start the expansion project promptly with a route that would meet the needs for expansion.

Hannah Langmade spoke in support of Option 1 for the light rail CAPEX and I-10WEST and expressed concern for a potential route through Indian School Road.

Chairwoman Stark asked about any conversations staff may have had with the Diamondbacks or the Phoenix Suns.

Light Rail Administrator Markus Coleman answered that the Diamondbacks had reached out to staff to request a meeting.

Chairwoman Stark shared that the Diamondbacks had expressed concern about a double track along Jefferson Street for the light rail. Chairwoman Stark asked if the Arizona Joint Legislative Budget Committee (JLBC) had yet approved the station locations for either of the 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue locations.

Ms. Mefford-Miller answered that staff had been in communication with JLBC leadership about preliminary station locations but that JLBC had not yet been presented with more official station locations since City staff awaited direction from City Council between the three corridor options for light rail.

Chairwoman Stark shared that the Arizona Senate President and Speaker of the House are opposed to the light rail expanding within the Capitol Mall area. Chairwoman Stark asked whether staff had heard if legislation may be introduced to prohibit the light rail expansion along I-10.

Deputy City Manager Amber Williamson shared that a staff member from Office of Governmental Relations could provide further information.

Federal Relations Manager Eric Gudino from the Government Relations Office shared that no legislation had been introduced at that time prohibiting light rail expansion along I-10.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington asked what the next steps were for the Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning Subcommittee.

Light Rail Administrator Markus Coleman shared once TIP Subcommittee Councilmembers made a decision, the light rail expansion item would be available for all Councilmembers to vote on at the January 27, 2026 Policy Session.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington asked what work would be done before the January 27 Policy Session.

Mr. Coleman shared there would be continued community engagement, pop-up events, virtual and in-person meetings, and that the community feedback form would continue

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

to be available. Mr. Coleman also shared that the Valley Metro website would continue to provide access to information on the light rail expansion.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington asked whether staff have had the chance to review the letter from Arizona Representative Livingston and Arizona Senator Kavanaugh to evaluate if it would have an impact on the Options for the light rail expansion.

Ms. Mefford-Miller shared that they just received the letter during this meeting and stated there had been multiple meetings with Representative Livingston and Senator Kavanaugh focusing on the 16<sup>th</sup> Avenue south option. She stated that the letter from Representative Livingston now requests consideration for a south alignment along 15th Avenue instead of 16th Avenue. Ms. Mefford-Miller stated this alignment, along with others, had previously been reviewed, and staff will need to revisit and evaluate these options again.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington requested that staff perform outreach to business owners along Indian School Road. Councilwoman Hodge Washington also noted resources potentially available to business owners that are located along the light rail's path.

Deputy City Manager Amber Williamson shared City Council approved a locally preferred alternative light rail route for the West Line along Indian School Road in May 2024, which was then approved by the Valley Metro Board in June 2024. Deputy City Manager Williamson stated staff have not received direction from City Council to evaluate advancing the West Line but stated if directed by Council at the January 27 meeting then staff would begin the evaluation process. She further clarified that, although the West Line has been mentioned because it is a City Council approved locally preferred alternative route, it is not included specifically in Option 1 or 2. Deputy City Manager Williamson advised if the City Council were to take action for Option 2, Council could then give City staff direction to advance that route, which would involve engaging with community members and business owners along Indian School to ensure their feedback were reflected before making final decisions.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington thanked staff for the clarification to ensure business owners' concerns were addressed.

Chairwoman Stark asked for clarification that Option 2 did not mean the CAPEX project would be terminated, and that it just meant that it may be delayed.

Light Rail Administrator Coleman clarified that Option 2 would give City Council an opportunity to give staff direction on what routes to evaluate with or without the CAPEX project.

Councilman Robinson thanked community members for speaking at the meeting. Councilman Robinson asked what federal funding impacts could be expected.

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

Federal Relations Manager Eric Gudino shared that while discretionary funding is usually uncertain and the federal government had been somewhat unpredictable, it had been supportive of transportation and transit grant funds. Mr. Gudino highlighted \$2.2 billion in the federal government's FY2026 proposed budget for the Capital Investment Grants (CIG) program.

Councilman Robinson inquired what roadblocks the City may encounter if Option 1 is pursued without any changes considering that some Arizona state legislators are unsupportive of aspects of the light rail expansion.

Government Relations Director Frank McCune noted that it is generally hard to predict what the Arizona State Legislature may do, however he has not seen legislation yet on it, although he had heard that legislation may be introduced to limit the City's light rail routes. Director McCune highlighted the Governor's support of the light rail, which may help prevent legislation being passed that would limit the project.

Councilman Robinson highlighted the importance of addressing the light rail extension sooner rather than later in order to serve current and future residents and thanked staff for the presentation.

Chairwoman Stark asked if the Arizona State Legislature would still have the ability to influence the light rail route or stations if the City purchased property along the route near the Capitol.

Director McCune clarified that the state legislature would still have influence so long as the light rail is within the designated boundary, regardless of whether the City owned property or the right-of-way within that boundary.

Councilman Waring encouraged the exploration of alternative route options that would minimize jeopardizing the project considering Arizona State Legislature opposition to CAPEX.

Chairwoman Stark expressed concern with moving forward with Option 1 which may jeopardize the overall project due to opposition to CAPEX by some members of the Arizona State Legislature. Chairwoman Stark shared that there are two potential routes that are being considered, along 19<sup>th</sup> Ave and Camelback and one around Metro Center.

Councilman Waring noted that the ultimate decision for the light rail extension will be made by the City Council, not just the Transportation, Infrastructure, and Planning Subcommittee members.

Chairwoman Stark expressed a desire to give City Council a recommendation.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington expressed her perspective that this item warrants including other Councilmembers whose districts will be impacted by the decision.

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

Chairwoman Stark shared that delaying a vote until January may allow City staff to get a better idea of what bills may be proposed by the Arizona State Legislature.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington expressed support for delaying a decision on CAPEX until January in the hopes that this may open up dialogue with the Arizona State Legislature. Councilwoman Hodge Washington further shared that she is in favor of light rail and she is in favor of connectivity to West Phoenix.

Chairwoman Stark inquired if more time would allow staff to consider the feasibility of alternative routes around 19<sup>th</sup> Avenue and Camelback and near the Metro Center area.

Ms. Mefford Miller shared that staff could conduct more research on alternative routes, however, she explained that staff would not be able to share an in-depth explanation of alternative routes in a month's time, such as cost, ridership, preliminary designs, etc.

Chairwoman Stark asked if a timeline and a budget could be provided to study alternative routes and right-of-way.

Councilman Waring sought clarification that Option 1 would prevent other options from being considered and that going with Option 2 may allow the City to consider alternative Options.

Councilman Waring made a motion to approve the item for Option 2. Councilman Robinson seconded the motion. Councilwoman Stark voted yes for Option 2. Councilwoman Hodge Washington abstained from the vote. *[Note: Per City Charter, Chapter IV, Section 23: A failure to vote shall be entered in the minutes as an affirmative vote.]*

Chairwoman Stark further clarified that Option 2 will allow City Council to receive a timeline and some background information on alternative routes to contribute to the discussion in January.

Councilwoman Hodge Washington explained that she abstained from the vote because she wanted to hear input from Councilmembers from District 4, 5, and 7, whose constituents would be more directly impacted by the westward light rail extension. *[Note: Per City Charter, Chapter IV, Section 23: A failure to vote shall be entered in the minutes as an affirmative vote.]*

Chairwoman Stark noted that she believed Option 2 would allow for a more robust discussion in January with City Council.

### **CALL TO THE PUBLIC**

Nicole Sanderson suggested that changes should be made to Request to Speak so that it is clearer what speakers are supporting versus opposing, when there are multiple Options. Ms. Sanderson suggested that the City consider what additional assistance

## Attachment F – December 17, 2025 Draft TIP Minutes

could be given to small businesses, such as waiving parking requirements during construction to help mitigate parking issues.

Jared Kluge expressed concern for vehicular safety and automotive incidents and highlighted his support for alternative transit Options to mitigate these issues and concern for delaying expansion of additional transit Options.

### **FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS**

None.

### **ADJOURNMENT**

Chairwoman Stark adjourned the meeting at 12:47 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Cecilia Alcantar-Chavez  
Management Fellow