



City of Phoenix

To: Mario Paniagua
Deputy City Manager

Date: April 12, 2018

From: Alan Stephenson 
Planning & Development Department

Subject: REQUEST FOR ADD-ON TO THE APRIL 18, 2018 CITY COUNCIL FORMAL AGENDA – CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS – APPEAL OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION DECISION – 2330 NORTH 12TH STREET (LOT 11), CORONADO DISTRICT

The Planning & Development Department requests an add-on to the April 18, 2018 Formal Agenda for City Council approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness – Appeal of Historic Preservation Commission Decision – 2330 North 12th Street (Lot 11). A letter in support of this request was provided by the Phoenix Historic Neighborhood Coalition.

Approved: 
Mario Paniagua, Deputy City Manager

Attachment: Support Letter – Phoenix Historic Neighborhood Coalition

Phoenix Historic Neighborhoods Coalition



HISTORIC FRANKLIN SCHOOL

January 22, 2018

To: City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Commission
Via Email: michelle.dodds@phoenix.gov
Michelle Dodds- Historic Preservation Officer

Re: HPCA 1700451, 2330 N. 12th St., Phoenix, AZ

To: Chairman Horn, Vice Chair Rampy, and Members of the Historic Preservation Commission

I am writing to you on behalf of the Phoenix Historic Neighborhoods Coalition. We are a coalition of people who live throughout the historic neighborhoods within the City of Phoenix. We come together because we value the history of Phoenix and we seek to share our love of our City's historic neighborhoods to preserve not only the buildings but to help stabilize and build strong communities.

The General Guidelines for Historic Properties adopted by the City of Phoenix Historic Preservation Commission on February 26, 1996, pertaining to new construction on vacant land within a historic district, state: "... the design of new construction should be compatible with and respectful of its historic setting." (HP/DOC/00035, p. 13). Clearly, the project proposed for 2330 N. 12th St. fails to meet this guideline. The stark, black, monolithic appearance of this building with its lack of windows facing the street, absence of a front porch, glaringly different roofline and parking in the front yard could not be less compatible with or respectful of the Coronado Historic District, which largely consists of 1920's-30's bungalows and Spanish revival style homes, and 1940's transitional ranch-style homes.

The guidelines further state that "Building features, such as roof lines, window and door openings, porches, entrances, pergolas, porte-cocheres or carports should resemble those related forms found on adjacent or surrounding historic structures." (HP/DOC/00035, p. 13). Again, the proposed new-build home for 2330 N. 12th St. completely misses the mark. Its modernist, low-pitched roofline is conspicuously out of place among the bungalow gables and dormers, and Spanish-revival parapets of the neighborhood. The high, clerestory windows are incompatible with the graceful multi-paned double-hung and casement windows found throughout the neighborhood. While the historic homes have parking that is discreetly oriented

to the side and rear of each home, the proposed front-yard parking for this home will present an unwelcome departure and an eyesore. It is absent a front porch in this decidedly front-porch oriented neighborhood. In fact, the house has a suburban "back-yard" orientation and entrance that make it look very out of place, to the detriment of the character-defining features of the Coronado Historic District.

The historic neighborhoods led the way in the renaissance of downtown living by creating an appealing setting that homeowner's value. It is our wish that the Historic Preservation Commission will help secure the integrity of these economic assets to our City by maintaining the General Design Guidelines clearly defined for historic properties. To allow jarring anomalies such as the proposed one at 2330 N. 12th Street, destroys the ambiance of an entire street and is an unallowable interruption of the historic streetscape. The proposal appears to be a deliberate attempt to negate the historic guidelines.

For the above reasons, we urge you to support the appeal filed by Artie Vigil in this matter and deny the Certificate of Appropriateness for this project as approved by the hearing officer.

Sincerely,

Phoenix Historic Neighborhoods Coalition

/s/ G.G. George
President