



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary Z-8-20-5

Date of VPC Meeting	June 17, 2020
Request From	C-O
Request To	R-3A
Proposed Use	Multifamily Residence
Location	Approximately 220 feet north of the northeast corner of 23rd Avenue and West Royal Palm Road
VPC Recommendation	Approve per staff recommendation
VPC Vote	14-0-0 , motion passes with Carrell, Krentz, Jaramillo, Magallanez, O'Hara, Sommacampagna, Argiro, Alauria, Matthews, McBride, Larson, Viedmark, Ford, and Barraza in favor, and none in abstention or dissent..

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS:

Z-8-20-5: Presentation and discussion regarding a request to rezone approximately 3.24-acre site located approximately 220 feet north of the northeast corner of 23rd Avenue and West Royal Palm Road **from** C-O (Commercial Office) to R3-A (Multifamily Residence District) to allow multifamily residential. *The Planning Commission will hear this request on August 6, 2020*

No virtual speaker cards were received on this item.

At this time, Patricia Ford joined the meeting bringing the quorum to 14 members.

Staff Presentation

Nick Klimek, staff, provided an overview of the request including the site context, the proposal, planning guidance, findings, and the staff recommendation. The site is located within one-half mile of the light rail station. The proposal is consistent with the Phoenix General Plan Land Use Designation and consistent with adjacent zoning. The proposal to convert a low occupancy office building to multifamily residential with an option for a second phase of dwelling units oriented to 23rd Avenue is in line with the emerging policy plan for the 19North corridor.

Considering policy guidance and the character of the surrounding area, the staff recommendation is to approve subject to stipulations. The proposed stipulations focus on the following elements: the form of second phase to activate the 23rd Avenue

frontage; streetscape and shade enhancements along the public sidewalk; architectural embellishments; open space with enhanced landscape standards; bicycle infrastructure; and enhanced standards to promote compatibility with the multifamily community currently under construction.

Applicant Presentation

Jack Gilmore, of Gilmore Planning Consultants representing the applicant Trillium, introduced himself and the project. The developer agrees to all stipulations and is excited to work in this community. The developer, Trillium, has constructed approximately 10,000 residential units and has now created a management model called “lifestyle housing” focused on providing entertainment and recreation onsite to attract and retain tenants at higher market values; examples of programming include classes, events, and bike share program.

Some elements which attracted Trillium to the area include the higher than normal demographics within 5 miles such as 422,000 residents (about 150,000 would be expected in the market) and 88,000 jobs (about 40,000 would be expected). He outlined how the project will benefit the community through adaptive reuse of a low occupancy and deteriorating building, transit oriented development as prescribed by plans, and the inclusion of bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure. He opined that the reinvestment on this site would provide a new product to the market and help to “raise all ships.”

He noted that early in the process, the team held a community meeting which was well attended by community and business leaders. At this meeting the project was received with enthusiasm especially from an individual at Abrazo Hospital who indicated their workforce struggle to find quality housing in the area and that the proposed development would serve pent-up demand.

Kenneth Losch, of Trillium, expanded that the 19North Community has been incredible to work and that a variety of indicators suggest the project will serve a niche for significant pent-up demand in the area. One such indicator is the K. Hovnanian development on the west half of the former El Caro Golf Course which sold their first 5 units in 10 days through only banners on the site before any units were even developed.

He added that their interest in the area extends beyond this site and that Trillium has undertaken several additional projects in the area including the east 20 acres of the former El Caro Golf Course which is planned for 276 single family rental units and a project just north of Metrocenter Mall. If the zoning is approved, financing is in place to move forward quickly with construction of both phases. The office building is currently only 12% occupied and will be 100% vacant by the end of the month.

Questions from the Committee:

Vice Chair Krentz stated that he is excited for the proposal and likes the modern brownstone units that will be oriented to 23rd Avenue. He asked the applicant if they have a better site plan? **Jack Gilmore** responded that it is a work in progress.

Shannon McBride noted that the applicant has been thoughtful regarding their investment in the area and that the project is perfectly aligned with the community's vision for the area. From the community meeting, it was clear that constituents were excited for the project including their neighbor, BlueCross BlueShield located directly across 23rd Avenue

Public Comment: None

Applicant Response: None

MOTION:

Shannon McBride motioned to approve the request per staff recommendation. **Joshua Matthews** seconded the motion.

VOTE:

14-0-0, motion passes with Carrell, Krentz, Jaramillo, Magallanez, O'Hara, Sommacampagna, Argiro, Alauria, Matthews, McBride, Larson, Viedmark, Ford, and Barraza in favor, and none in abstention or dissent.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS:

1. For any subsequent phases of development beyond the adaptive reuse of the building depicted on the site plan date stamped March 27, 2020, the following stipulations shall apply, as approved or modified by the Planning and Development Department:
 - a. The stipulations contained in Stipulation Nos. 2 through 15 shall also apply to any subsequent phases of development.
 - b. All units adjacent to 23rd Avenue shall have an individual pedestrian entrance oriented to the public street and be connected to the public sidewalk by a direct pedestrian pathway.
 - c. All units adjacent to 23rd Avenue shall have a porch or patio, described as follows and as approved by the Planning and Development Department:

- d. All units adjacent to 23rd Avenue shall have a porch or patio, described as follows and as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
 - i. Porches shall have a minimum dimension of six feet in depth by a width of no less than 50 percent of the total unit; be oriented to the public right-of-way; have a unit entrance; and have a direct pedestrian connection to the public sidewalk.
 - ii. Patios shall have a minimum dimension of eight feet in depth by a width and a minimum size of 64 square feet; be enclosed on each side by a low wall or fence not to exceed 36 inches in height; be oriented to the public right-of-way; have a unit entrance; and have a direct pedestrian connection to the public sidewalk.
 - e. All garage doors shall be screened by buildings from the exterior of the site and have decorative embellishments such as window panels, color and added materials for the pillars surrounding the door.
- 2. All elevations of the buildings shall contain architectural embellishments and detailing, such as textural changes, pilasters, offsets, recesses, variation in window size and location, and/or overhang canopies.
 - 3. The public sidewalk along 23rd Avenue shall be detached with a minimum 5-foot-wide landscape area located between the sidewalk and back of curb and planted to the following standards, as approved by the Planning and Development Department. Where utility conflicts exist, the developer shall work with the Planning and Development Department on alternative design solutions consistent with a pedestrian environment.
 - a. Large canopy, single-trunk shade trees shall be placed 25 feet on center or in equivalent groupings. Twenty-five percent of the required trees shall be a minimum 4-inch caliper and 75 percent shall be a minimum 3-inch caliper.
 - b. At tree maturity, the trees shall shade the sidewalk to a minimum 75 percent
 - c. Drought tolerant shrubs and vegetative groundcovers with a maximum mature height of 24 inches to provide a minimum of 75 percent live coverage at maturity.
 - 4. The developer shall provide a pedestrian thoroughfare between the public sidewalk, and the required amenities contained in the first phase, as described below and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.

- a. A bollard light path or lighted art feature to accentuate the entrance of the pedestrian thoroughfare from the intersection with the public sidewalk.
 - b. The pedestrian thoroughfare shall be shaded to a minimum 75 percent by shade trees, vegetative trellis, and/or architectural shade. Trees shall be a minimum 2-inch caliper.
 - c. A minimum 5-foot-wide landscape area shall be provided along both sides of the pedestrian thoroughfare. In areas where the pedestrian thoroughfare passes between buildings, the landscape area may be reduced to 3 feet in width (or 6 feet on one side only)
 - d. A maximum of two drive aisle crossings shall be permitted and where crossings occur, the pathway shall be constructed to visually contrast with the parking and drive aisle surfaces.
- 5. Surface parking shall be setback a minimum of 30-feet or screened 100 percent by buildings from 23rd Avenue, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
- 6. Surface parking areas shall include the below, as approved by the Planning and Development Department:
 - a. A minimum 10 percent of the total surface parking and vehicular circulation area shall be vegetated.
 - b. Landscape planters located at the end of each row of parking and approximately every 100 linear feet.
 - c. Landscape planters shall be a minimum width of eight feet and a minimum 120 square feet for a single row of parking, and a minimum 240 square feet for a double row of parking.
 - d. Landscape planters shall be planted with minimum five-gallon drought tolerant shrubs to achieve 75 percent ground cover. If trees are to be included, they shall be minimum 2-inch caliper shade trees
- 7. No solid perimeter wall greater than 36 inches in height, situated between the plane of the buildings and the 23rd Avenue right of way, shall be permitted.
- 8. There shall be an average landscape setback of 25 feet measured from the east property line with the minimum setback being 5 feet. The landscape setback shall be planted with shade trees placed 20 feet on center or in equivalent groupings with 25 percent of the trees being a minimum 4-inch

caliper and 75 percent being a minimum 3-inch caliper, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.

9. The developer shall incorporate bicycle infrastructure as described below and as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
 - a. A bicycle repair station (“fix it station”) shall be provided and be maintained near the southern-most vehicular access in an area of high visibility, convenient pedestrian access, and available from the public sidewalk.
 - b. “Secure/Covered Facilities” and/or “Outdoor/Covered Facilities” shall be provided for residents at a rate of 0.25 spaces per dwelling unit, up to a maximum of 50 spaces. Appropriate facilities are defined in Appendix K or the Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan.
 - c. Artistic style bicycle racks with capacity for a minimum of six bicycles for guests shall be located near the primary entrance to the building depicted on the site plan date stamped March 27, 2020. The artistic racks shall adhere to the City of Phoenix Preferred Designs in Appendix K or the Comprehensive Bicycle Master Plan, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
10. A minimum of 10 percent of the gross project shall be retained as open space, exclusive of required landscape setbacks, which shall be shaded to a minimum 50 percent by minimum 2-inch caliper large canopy shade trees, as approved by the Planning and Development Department.
11. The developer shall construct all streets within and adjacent to the development with paving, curb, gutter, sidewalk, curb ramps, streetlights, median islands, landscaping and other incidentals, as per plans approved by the Planning and Development Department. All improvements shall comply with all ADA accessibility standards.
12. In the event archaeological materials are encountered during construction, the developer shall immediately cease all ground-disturbing activities within a 33-foot radius of the discovery, notify the City Archaeologist, and allow time for the Archaeology Office to properly assess the materials.