

Attachment A

**Phoenix City Council
Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee
Summary Minutes
Wednesday, March 4, 2020**

City Council Subcommittee Room
Phoenix City Hall, Assembly Rooms A, B and C
200 West Washington Street
Phoenix, Arizona

Subcommittee Members Present

Councilwoman Thelda Williams, Chair
Vice Mayor Betty Guardado
Councilwoman Debra Stark
Councilwoman Laura Pastor

Subcommittee Members Absent

Call to Order

Chairwoman Williams called the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee to order at 8:58 a.m. with Councilwoman Stark present and Councilwoman Pastor present telephonically.

Call to the Public

None.

1. For Approval or Correction, the Minutes of the Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee Meeting on Feb. 5, 2020

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve the minutes of the Feb. 5, 2020 Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 3-0.

Vice Mayor Guardado joined the meeting telephonically.

Items 2-5 were for consent action. No presentations were planned but staff was available to answer questions.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve consent items 2-5. Councilwoman Pastor seconded the motion which pass unanimously, 4-0.

2. Authorization to Enter into an Intergovernmental Agreement with Arizona State Land Department for the Paradise Ridge Flood Control Project

3. Apply for and Accept Funds and Enter into Intergovernmental Agreements with the Flood Control District of Maricopa County for the Paradise Ridge Flood Control Project Under the Capital Improvement Projects Prioritization Process

4. Enter into Agreement with RPTA for Regional Fare Collection System Upgrade Project Funding

5. Funding Agreement, Regional Transit Communications Project (Capital Project) – Contract Amendment 1

6. Metro, Regional Public Transportation Authority, and Maricopa Association of Government Meetings

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

7. Citizens Transportation Commission Meetings

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

8. Freeway Project Update

Information only. No Councilmember requested additional information.

9. Results of Bus Operations Control Center and Data Collection Services Request for Proposals

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Public Transit Director Jesus Sapien to present the results of the bus operations control center (OCC) and data collection services request for proposals (RFP). Mr. Sapien introduced Deputy Public Transit Director Albert Crespo to assist with the presentation.

Mr. Crespo outlined the OCC's functions and provided an overview of the RFP timeline. He also explained the evaluation criteria used to determine the contract awardee and stated the panel recommends awarding Transdev Services, Inc. due to their proposal receiving the highest overall score and providing \$1.4 million in savings over the next lowest cost proposal. The total proposed cost would be \$14,361,642 for a five-year base contract.

Chairwoman Williams asked if the awardee is the incumbent contractor. Mr. Crespo confirmed the recommended vendor is the incumbent contractor.

Mr. Crespo shared the Citizens Transportation Commission approved staff's recommendation at the Feb. 27, 2020 meeting. He concluded by stating staff requests the Subcommittee recommend Council approval to enter into an agreement with Transdev Services, Inc. to manage the OCC and data collection.

Chairwoman Williams asked how many passengers the City has per month. Mr. Sapien responded there are 30 to 40 million annual passenger boardings which equals roughly 67 percent of regional boardings. Chairwoman Williams also asked if vendors bid per mile. Mr. Sapien responded for this contract, the vendor does not bid per the mile.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve staff's recommendation. Vice Mayor Guardado seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

10. Results of Fare Collections System Request for Proposals

Public Transit Director Jesus Sapien introduced Deputy Public Transit Director Joe Bowar to present the regional fare collection system (FCS) contract award.

Mr. Bowar shared the current FCS was installed in 2005 with proprietary equipment and software, which has made it difficult to add features and make changes. Additionally, it is 13 years old and has exceeded its useful life.

Mr. Bowar stated the new system will have mobile ticketing, reloadable smart cards, fare capping, and web-based fare purchases and account management. Also, new validators and ticket vending machines (TVM) will be installed and be ADA compliant. Finally, he explained implementation will occur over two phases.

Mr. Bowar provided an overview of the proposed contract. The base contract will have a maximum cost of \$33.3 million, and the maximum operation and maintenance support cost will be \$28 million. Also, the initial agreement will be nine years with two optional three-year extensions.

Mr. Bowar spoke about the evaluation process and criteria for the RFP. He shared from the six submitted proposals, two vendors were invited to provide demonstrations. And as a result, the panel recommends Vix Technology be awarded the contract. The contract total will be \$61,228,625 and include a robust trip planner, TVM security features, and enhanced billing and cash payment features. Mr. Bowar shared the project will conclude with phase two commencing in January 2023.

Councilwoman Stark asked for more information about the robust trip planner. Mr. Bowar responded the trip planner provides routing options with real-time data on when the bus or train will arrive.

Mr. Bowar stated the Citizen Transportation Commission approved the recommendation at the Feb. 27, 2020 meeting. He concluded by stating staff requests the Subcommittee recommend Council approval to enter into an agreement with Vix Technology, Inc., for the implementation and long-term hosting, and maintenance of the new regional FCS.

Councilwoman Stark made a motion to approve staff's recommendation. Vice Mayor Guardado seconded the motion which passed unanimously, 4-0.

11. Procurement Methods for Goods and Services

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Chief Financial Officer Denise Olson to present on procurement strategies. Ms. Olson introduced Chief Procurement Officer T.J. Martin to assist with the presentation.

Ms. Olson explained the improvements that have been made to procurement processes since 2015 and shared the results and benefits of these improvements.

Councilwoman Pastor joined the meeting in-person.

Ms. Martin presented on competitive and non-competitive procurement methods. She then explained the price thresholds are used when determining which procurement method is used.

Chairwoman Williams asked if a vendor list is used in informal, non-competitive circumstances. Ms. Olson responded procurement staff encourages the use of small and local businesses in that circumstance.

Ms. Martin explained in the informal process, three quotes are gathered from registered vendors. The City utilizes the small business enterprise (SBE) program which includes asking those who have registered with ProcurePHX to bid on procurements under \$100,000. She shared the City currently has 85 contracts with SBEs and is working on outreach events to expand the vendor list.

Ms. Martin continued to explain competitive sealed bidding which is conducted through an Invitation for Bids (IFB). From IFB, award is determined solely on price.

Councilwoman Pastor inquired why price rather than quality is the top concern. Ms. Martin shared that price is the driver of the IFB process, but certain procedures can be implemented to indicate if vendors have provided poor quality or service in the past. Ms. Olson added requirements are included within the IFB to ensure the quality necessary is received.

Chairwoman Williams asked if procurement staff gathers feedback from departments on the procurement process. Ms. Olson shared staff conducts follow up, as well as communicates through the procurement liaison group.

Vice Mayor Guardado asked about local vendors included on the City's list and the plan to attract more local vendors. Ms. Olson responded the department is working on an outreach plan and presentation for the Workforce and Economic Development Subcommittee. Additionally, Ms. Martin shared the City is working with the Equal Opportunity, and Community and Economic Development Departments to participate in programs that spread awareness for small business opportunities.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if the City has programs that promote small business opportunities in west Phoenix and if there is one in Spanish. Ms. Olson shared staff could work on expanding these programs.

Councilwoman Stark asked if the City works with the local chambers of commerce. Ms. Martin shared staff works with Local First Arizona who works with the chambers. Additionally, it is a goal of the procurement office to reach out to these chambers.

Ms. Martin shared the most common method of procurement is an RFP. In this method, while pricing is included, the award is based on evaluation criteria specific to a need. She also explained Qualified Vendor Lists are determined from Requests for

Qualifications (RFQu) to develop a list of vendors that are used when specific licenses or expertise are needed.

Ms. Olson explained cooperatives combine the purchasing power of several public procurement agencies and are widely used. She shared benefits include price reductions, increased efficiencies and maximization of resources. Ms. Olson then compared the timeframes to complete each procurement method.

Ms. Olson explained state cooperatives and emphasized that the method conforms with the City's Procurement Code and has been reviewed by the Law Department. She emphasized the purpose of utilizing cooperatives is efficiency. Additionally, only 13 percent of 2,350 active contracts were awarded utilizing cooperatives.

Ms. Olson concluded by sharing procurement's goal is to be strategic, promote competition, save time and spend wisely to best serve the City.

Councilwoman Pastor stated she would like a break down of where money is being spent and why a vendor was chosen included in Council reports. Ms. Olson shared staff currently includes the procurement process in the Council packet, however she can speak with the Council to ensure all appropriate information is provided.

12. Wrong-Way Driving Update

Deputy City Manager Mario Paniagua introduced Street Transportation Director Kini Knudson and Assistant Street Transportation Director Briiana Velez to present a wrong-way driving update. Mr. Knudson stated while current stripping and signage meets national standards, the City can always implement additional safety features.

Ms. Velez shared this presentation focuses on wrong-way collisions between Washington and Jefferson Streets from 7th Avenue to 7th Street. She explained from 2014 to 2018, approximately 2 percent of all collisions were the result of wrong-way driving and there were no fatalities. However, in 2019, there were three wrong-way collisions and one fatality. As a result, staff evaluated existing one-way signage and it was determined it meets national standards.

Ms. Velez stated Street Transportation staff recommends a pilot program be implemented that installs additional directional pavement arrows and wrong-way signs. These will be installed at a cost of \$32,000 and take four to six months to complete. She concluded by stating the pilot would be evaluated annually to see if there is a reduction in wrong-way collisions. If there is a reduction, staff will propose the pilot be expanded.

Channel Powe, resident, spoke in support of the pilot program and thanked Vice Mayor Guardado for bringing this topic to the Subcommittee.

Councilwoman Williams spoke in support of the pilot program.

Dianne Barker, resident, spoke in support of the pilot program.

Councilwoman Stark stated her support for the pilot program, but also shared her concern for pedestrian safety throughout the entire City. Councilwoman Pastor requested dialogue begin on a comprehensive pedestrian safety plan. Chairwoman Williams also asked that the City work with sister cities.

Vice Mayor Guardado thanked Channel Powe for her advocacy and emphasized the importance of finding a Citywide pedestrian safety solution.

Councilwoman Stark emphasized the importance of educating drivers and residents. Councilwoman Williams asked staff to bring the presentation on comprehensive pedestrian safety efforts to this Subcommittee.

13. Downtown Transportation Plan Update

Street Transportation Director Kini Knudson introduced City Engineer Eric Froberg to present a downtown transportation plan update. Mr. Knudson shared the current plan was adopted in 2014 and needs to be updated due to forecasted growth.

Mr. Froberg stated three neighborhood meetings were completed in the summer 2019 to understand the community's concerns. At these meetings, staff collected nearly 400 comments that focused on auto safety and congestion, pedestrian and bicycle safety, and access to transit. These comments were incorporated in the development of area-specific plans. Mr. Froberg shared the next steps in the plan update and stated that once they are complete, staff will bring final recommendations to the Subcommittee.

Councilwoman Stark asked staff to evaluate scrambles, maximize sidewalks and install dedicated bike lanes. Mr. Knudson shared the downtown code requires enhanced pedestrian amenities in future development.

Councilwoman Pastor asked if the plan update is incorporating downtown festivals and major events, as well as asked staff to analyze the current barricade plan and fees for races or festivals. Mr. Knudson responded the right-of-way team is looking into how construction is affecting the ability to host downtown events.

Call to the Public

None.

Future Agenda Items

Chairwoman Williams reminded staff of the pedestrian safety presentation.

Adjournment

Chairwoman Williams adjourned the meeting at 10:26 a.m.

Respectfully submitted,
Jennifer Hackelman
Management Intern

PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL
 Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee
 Wednesday, March 4, 2020
 Assembly Rooms A, B, C

PLEASE SIGN-IN

	Name	Title	Department / Organization
1.	Naire Howard	MAH	OWD
2.	Brenda Gomez	PTD	COP PTD
3.	Roberto Valentin	PTD Transit Supervisor	COP PTD
4.	Lauren Siim	Qtrm	Mayor's Office
5.	Chanel Powe	Community	
6.	Tyler Olsen	Budget Mgr	Valley Metro
7.	Kat Heneking	CO. Treasurer	
8.	Colleen E. Turner	President	TURNER INT'L
9.	DAN MARUM	Assoc. Vice Pres.	Wilson & Company
10.	Vicki Ruder	SR PID	PWD
11.	Reissa Washy Smith	Asst. Public Works	Public Works
12.	Markus Geman	City Administrator	City
13.	Brandie Barritt	DPWD	LOP PWD
14.	Doreen Pless	CEO	DPI
15.	Kari Knudson	Director	COP / STREETS
16.	Alexandro Riccio	Sr. Civil Eng	ARECOM
17.	Amor Lucich	SR MANAGER	Kierockett
18.	Laurel Arnold	PM	Pingen Environment
19.	Darlene Barber	D Team	Uttera
20.	Derek Toups	Project Director	Vix Technology
21.	Annie Holdsworth	PIO	PDP
22.	Pat Barrett	Account Exec	High Ground
23.	Stella Pelt	STK	SKO
24.	Amy Haulte	STR	IAH

PHOENIX CITY COUNCIL
 Transportation, Infrastructure and Innovation Subcommittee
 Wednesday, March 4, 2020
 Assembly Rooms A, B, C
PLEASE SIGN-IN

	Name	Title	Department / Organization
25.	Joe Bonan	Deputy Director	Public Transit
26.	Kelby Hines	Jacobs consultant	Jacobs
27.	Albert Castro	Deputy Director	COP-PTD
28.	JESUS SAPIEN	DIRECTOR	←O-OTD
29.	Juli Krieger	Law - Chief Counsel	Law - COP
30.	Dolly Hayes	Project Manager	Trasdev
31.	Yvoni Brown	QC	Trasdev
32.	Karin Zinn	ES Compliance	COP - EOD
33.	JILL KAMRIZ	BEVP - EPLC	CPIC
34.	Christina Locke	CVC BD	CVC
35.	Chris Kocary	CAR - STD	STD
36.	Chris Moore	CE III	Public Works
37.	Osca Garcia	CVL	Stormwater
38.	Linda Smarte	Procurement Mgr	PWD
39.	ERIC FROBERG	CITY ENGR	STR
40.	Marcus Mahoney		Law
41.	Ken Kessler	Deputy Director	PTD
42.	PAUL MAGILLANER	DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITY ECONOMIC DEV	HOWARTH/PTD
43.	Robert Farnell	CEOP STR	CF
44.	Tim Maher	Project Engineer	ARTEC Engineering
45.	M. Colin Alexander	ASSISTANT CITY MANAGER IV	Law
46.			
47.			