



Village Planning Committee Meeting Summary Z-60-22-8

Date of VPC Meeting	December 13, 2022
Request From	C-1 BAOD
Request To	C-2 BAOD
Proposed Use	Automotive service facility
Location	Northwest corner of 25th Street and Baseline Road
VPC Recommendation	Denial
VPC Vote	9-5

VPC DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDED STIPULATIONS

STAFF PRESENTATION

Elias Valencia, staff, provided a presentation for rezoning case Z-60-22-8. **Mr. Valencia** presented the project location, General Plan, Zoning, and Baseline Area Master Plan designations, site plan and elevations for the site. **Mr. Valencia** stated that lot coverage for the site would be approximately 5 percent, parking would consist of 12 parking spaces and 4 bicycle spaces, and that circulation would be with a cross access easement accessed from Baseline at 25th Street. **Mr. Valencia** stated that the project would be single-story and would not exceed 26 feet in height. **Mr. Valencia** presented the stipulations indicating that the project would require general conformance to the date stamped site plan and elevations, as well as to provide enhanced landscaping and the multi-use trail along Baseline Road.

APPLICANT PRESENTATION

Cassandra Ayres, with Berry Riddell stated the rezoning request was to allow for a Valvoline oil change. Mrs. Ayres discussed the surrounding uses and the project history. The Valvoline site was part of an overall site plan date stamped May 26 of 2021 that was ratified by the Phoenix city council back in November of last year. In that original site plan, Valvoline was proposed on the immediate northwest corner of 25th Street and Baseline. Staff suggested a swap in parcels to be immediately adjacent to the commercial uses in the shopping center to the west rather than being an island in the middle of the overall development. Mrs. Ayres explained that they followed the suggestion and also that there were concerns about having sit down restaurants which isn't feasible given the size of the site but would be an allowable use if things were to become more feasible in the future. Mrs. Ayres explained that services on the site would take approximately 15 minutes to perform and that there would be a combination of

landscaping and berming to screen the service bays, as well as pedestrian connections to the sidewalk and a multi-use trail. Mrs. Ayres stated that the height and elevations would be consistent with the requirements of the Baseline Area Overlay District. Community outreach included door to door knocking, and 16 signatures from the community immediately to the residences on the east in support were obtained. A website was also published for the project which is no longer a City requirement. No comments were received at the community meeting or on the website. Mrs. Ayres shared that Valvoline and its employees raise money for charities and work with the local community, last year donating \$1million for the Children's Miracle Network and another \$1.5 million for other charities including disaster relief. Mrs. Ayres concluded by stating they had no objections to the stipulations staff proposed and that she was available for questions.

QUESTIONS FROM THE COMMITTEE

Committee member Francisca Montoya asked how many similar automobile services are available within a 1–2-mile radius. **Richard Gallegos** with Valvoline answered that he is not sure of the exact amount but that competition is a factor when selecting a site so there would be 1 or 2 within that radius.

Committee member Greg Brownell asked how many other sites were looked at that didn't require a zoning change. Mrs. Ayres responded that this site has been in consideration for at least 2 years **Mr. Brownell** restated the question and then said if the community asks for certain things that require a zoning change like movie theaters or sit-down restaurants then that's a change that has community support, and he's yet to hear the community requesting for an oil change place. **Mr. Brownell** added that in this case it's more appropriate to have the proposal where a zoning change isn't required. **Mr. Brownell** then stated that the reason there is less intense commercial uses as the distance gets closer to residential is so that there is a buffer and buffering is something that is both in the General Plan and the Baseline Area Master Plan.

Committee Member Lee Coleman agreed with Mr. Brownell and asked if there will be any other services offered other than oil changes, outdoor storage, or any hazardous waste because of the oil and if there would be community recycling. **Mrs. Ayres** replied that Valvoline does not provide overnight storage, and that oil and hazardous materials are stored in tanks and hauled off site, and that other services offered are tire rotations and general fluid replacements. **Mr. Gallegos** added that services are performed in about 15-20 minutes with customers in their cars, excepting tire rotations which require the customer not be in the vehicle. Waste byproducts are stored and collected 2-3 times a week and carried off site where they are recycled, and for environmental safety the basements are lined with special materials in the event of any spills so that the materials do not get into the soil.

Committee Member Darlene Jackson asked how the service station will impact the air quality in the area. **Ms. Jackson** stated that there are pros to having an oil change service available but also cons because of the need for sit down restaurants and building a family-oriented environment. **Ms. Jackson** also asked why a different area

wasn't selected for the site. **Mrs. Ayres** stated she had no empirical data regarding air quality to share and regarding site selection, the site was identified for over 2 years and believes there are no other oil change facilities within 3 miles of the site and reminded the Committee that there were signatures in support of the project gathered from the immediate residential neighbors to the east. **Ms. Jackson** expressed disappointment with the lack of information from the applicant pertaining to air quality and is bothered that the people in this area are being dismissed and disregarded.

Committee Member AJ Greathouse shared that Big O tires has been the only service center on Baseline for years and the service has gotten subpar over time and that even though it's not the shiniest project or a sit down restaurant, it does fill a need given there is not another location within 2-3 miles.

Vice Chair Trent Marchuk expressed his respect for the applicant and Valvoline and appreciated how they give back to the community. Mr. Marchuk explained that commercial use is appropriate for the site, it's intensity from C-1 to C-2 that may have implications due to more intense commercial uses that could also be permitted given the zoning designation. Mr. Marchuk stated there are more appropriate locations for the use elsewhere and felt the rezoning request was not appropriate as there is no guarantee that the Valvoline would develop and stay a Valvoline if granted. **Mr. Valencia** mentioned to the Committee that staff did stipulate general conformance to the site and elevations to ensure the proposal would develop as presented and that any changes not within general conformance would require another public hearing process. **Mrs. Ayres** agreed that what staff said was correct and that they had no objections to any of the stipulations. **Mr. Gallegos** provided an answer to Ms. Jackson's earlier question on air quality impacts and stated that a typical Valvoline sees about 45 cars a day compared to the 450 plus a sit-down restaurant would generate.

Committee Member Edward Aldama agreed with earlier comments regarding service wait times at the Big O Tire on Baseline and added that the community did indicate they wanted the project since there were signatures in support that were collected. **Mr. Aldama** added that the stipulations and analysis conducted by staff provide a safeguard and that when a developer wants to build on a site and provide a service to the community while agreeing to stipulations is worth something and concluded by saying the community wants services and oil changes are a service.

Committee Member Gene Holmerud asked if the facility would service semi-trucks. **Mrs. Ayres** believed they did not and deferred to Mr. Gallegos. **Mr. Gallegos** answered that they do not.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

APPLICANT RESPONSE TO PUBLIC COMMENT

None

COMMITTEE DISCUSSION

None

MOTION – Z-60-22-8

Lee Coleman motioned to deny Z-60-22-8.

Gene Holmerud seconded the motion.

VOTE – Z-60-22-8

9-5; committee members Alvarez, Brownell, Coleman, F. Daniels, Hare, Holmerud, Jackson, Marchuk, and T. Daniels in favor. Aldama, Busching, Greathouse, Montoya, and Shepard, opposed. Committee member Viera lost connection prior to voting. Committee member Brooks abstained.

Committee member Kassandra Alvarez stated that there should be more services like restaurants since it is close to a community college.

Committee member Fred Daniels said the proposal is not the highest and best use.

Vice Chair Marchuk said he welcomes Valvoline to the community, but this is not the right location for it.

Chair Daniels stated this is not the proper location for the request.

STAFF COMMENTS REGARDING VPC RECOMMENDATION & STIPULATIONS

None